

ISSN : 0973-855X

# **Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences**

Vol. 20

December 2015

No. 2

Chief Editor  
Nalini Rewadikar

Editor  
Yatindra Singh Sisodia

Associate Editors  
Manu Gautam  
Tapas Kumar Dalapati



**M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain**

## **Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences**

*Chief Editor*

**Professor Nalini Rewadikar**

*Editor*

**Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia**

*Associate Editors*

**Dr. Manu Gautam**

**Dr. Tapas Kumar Dalapati**

*Advisory Board*

- Professor Yogesh Atal** (Anthropology), Former Principal Director (UNESCO), Gurgaon (Haryana)
- Professor L.S. Rathore** (Political Science), Former Vice Chancellor, J.N. Vyas University, Jodhpur (Raj.)
- Professor I.S. Chauhan** (Sociology), Former High Commissioner of India in Fiji, Bhopal (M.P.)
- Professor U.S. Chaudhary** (Education), Former Vice Chancellor, Devi Ahilya Vishwavidyalaya, Indore (M.P.)
- Professor Sandeep Shastri** (Political Science), Pro Vice Chancellor, Jain University, Bengaluru (Karnataka)
- Professor M. Indira** (Economics), University of Mysore, Mysore (Karnataka)
- Professor G. Palanithurai** (Political Science), Gandhi Gram Rural Institute, Dindigul (Tamil Nadu)
- Professor Ganesh Kawadia** (Economics), School of Economics, Devi Ahilya University, Indore (M.P.)
- Professor D.K. Verma** (Sociology), Dr. Baba Sahab National Institute of Social Sciences, MHOW (M.P.)
- Professor S.N. Chaudhary** (Sociology), Barkatullah University, Bhopal (M.P.)
- Professor Sanjay Kumar** (Political Science), Centre for the Studies of Developing Societies, Delhi
- Professor Ashutosh Kumar** (Political Science), Punjab University, Chandigarh
- Professor Y.G. Joshi** (Geography), M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain (M.P.)
- Professor D.C. Sah** (Economics), M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain (M.P.)
- Professor Sandeep Joshi** (Commerce), M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain (M.P.)

ISSN: 0973-855X

# **MADHYA PRADESH JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**

Vol. 20

December 2015

No. 2

Chief Editor

**Nalini Rewadikar**

Editor

**Yatindra Singh Sisodia**

Associate Editors

**Manu Gautam**

**Tapas Kumar Dalapati**



**M.P. Institute of Social Science Research**

Autonomous Institute of ICSSR, Ministry of Human Resource Development, Govt. of India,  
New Delhi and Ministry of Higher Education, Govt. of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal

6, Ramsakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone

Ujjain - 456010 (INDIA)

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences* is a *peer-refereed* journal published biannually by M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain. It is devoted to research on social, cultural, economic, political, administrative and contemporary issues, problems and processes at the state, national and international levels. No conditions are imposed to limit the subject matter of the articles in any manner. The journal welcomes research papers, review articles, research notes, comments and book reviews on topics which broadly come under the purview of social sciences.

Manuscripts, subscriptions and other correspondence should be addressed to:

### **The Editor**

Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences  
M.P. Institute of Social Science Research  
6, Ramsakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
UJJAIN - 456 010 Madhya Pradesh (India)  
Phones: (0734) 2510978, Fax: (0734) 2512450  
E-mail: [mpjssujjain@gmail.com](mailto:mpjssujjain@gmail.com), Website: [www.mpissr.org](http://www.mpissr.org)

### **Subscription Rates**

<b>Annual</b>		
Institutes	Rs. 300.00	\$ 15
Individuals	Rs. 200.00	\$ 10
<b>Per Copy</b>		
Institutes	Rs. 150.00	\$ 10
Individuals	Rs. 100.00	\$ 05

The subscription of the journal may be sent through Demand Draft drawn in favour of the Director, MPISSR, Ujjain.

The MPISSR will appreciate receiving journals/periodicals/research publications from other Institutes/Organisations in exchange of the *Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*.

---

The views expressed in all the contributions which appear in the journal are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken representing the views of the Editor or of the MPISSR.

*We gratefully acknowledge the financial assistance received from the Indian Council of Social Science Research, New Delhi for the Publication of this Journal.*

ISSN: 0973-855X

**Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences**  
*A Biannual Journal of*  
M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain

---

Vol. 20

December 2014

No. 2

---

**CONTENTS**

<b>Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA: Participatory Analysis in Selected Villages of Mewat (Haryana)</b> Bindiya Narang and Zubair Meenai	<b>1</b>
<b>The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate</b> Sachna Arora	<b>15</b>
<b>Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study</b> Kuldeep Singh	<b>29</b>
<b>Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women: An Empirical Study in Assam</b> Mofidul Islam and Jayanta Krishna Sarmah	<b>49</b>
<b>Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India</b> Kiran Lamba	<b>60</b>
<b>Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh</b> Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt	<b>73</b>

<b>Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana State</b> Vijay Korra	85
<b>Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh</b> Uday Singh Rajput	101
<i>Book Review</i> <b>Indian Village: A Conceptual History (Manish Thakur)</b> Younis Ahmad Sheikh	113

---

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*  
(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)  
ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 1-14)

## **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA: Participatory Analysis in Selected Villages of Mewat (Haryana)**

**Bindiya Narang<sup>\*</sup> and Zubair Meenai<sup>†</sup>**

*The National Governments in India have tried to sustain people's livelihood strategies through skill building, provision of employment, creation of requisite infrastructure etc. by virtue of various development programmes and policy measures. Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA) was initiated, as an important policy to rejuvenate the rural edifice of the country through its multiple and carefully crafted objectives. After one decade of its implementation, the issues and shortfalls pertaining to the delivery of this public wage employment programme have been ardently raised and documented. However, it is equally significant to nurture optimism and highlight the possibilities that can be achieved through it, which is the basis of this paper. The present paper brings to fore the livelihood constraints in two selected villages of Mewat, a backward district in Haryana. The paper contends that MGNREGA has the potential to mediate rural people's livelihood strategies and access to resources. To facilitate this, appropriate and advance selection of works through people's participation and a careful scrutiny of local development needs and context are paramount.*

---

<sup>\*</sup>Research Scholar, Department of Social Work, Faculty of Social Sciences, Jamia Millia Islamia University, New Delhi. E-mail: bindiyababbar@yahoo.com

<sup>†</sup>Professor, Department of Social Work, Faculty of Social Sciences, Jamia Millia Islamia University, New Delhi

## **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA**

### **Introduction**

The current development mandate world over, places a greater emphasis on and commitment to livelihood security. The livelihoods can be simply comprehended as means by which households obtain and maintain access to resources necessary to ensure their immediate and long term survival (Carney, 1998) as also encompassing the wider context of governance, institutions and enabling environment for poverty alleviation (Ellis and Freeman, 2004). In the context of reducing poverty, the argument for ensuring livelihood security through productive employment opportunities is compelling. There is growing evidence that efficiently designed and implemented employment generation programmes provide a stable livelihoods platform for people to access assets and switch their resources into productive uses. In backward areas with high unemployment rates, and areas where the poor people rely mainly on the use of labour power to earn their livelihoods, transfer benefits from workfare programmes prevent poverty from worsening. The durable assets and requisite infrastructure that these programmes create also contribute to efforts towards pro-poor development.

In India, employment generation through public wage employment programmes is an important socio-economic issue and a pressing political concern. In conformity to the current thinking on development that recognises multi-dimensionality of poverty and promotion of sustainable livelihoods to deal with it, and rooted in the rights-based framework, Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (MGNREGA) was launched in February, 2006 as a demand driven, bottom-up and decentralised programme to provide livelihood security to the rural unemployed. The Act's efficacy is based on the logic of using the productive capacity of rural people to build and nurture assets, while simultaneously alleviating the problem of chronic unemployment and poverty (CSE, 2008). It provides an opportunity to build rural infrastructure through watershed development, restoration of water bodies such as tanks and canals, activities aimed at forestry, land development, soil erosion and flood control, and construction of roads and institutional facilities. MGNREGA was amended and revamped in 2011 with an expanded scope including 30 new works aligning with other development activities (MoRD, 2012).

Studies contesting the utility as well as futility of MGNREGA abound. On one hand, Shah (2004) acclaimed the Act as a historic opportunity for dramatic socio-economic transformation in rural India, while, Bhatia and Dreze (2006) find that much of the potential has been



### Narang and Meenai

wasted and raise doubts regarding commitment of this Act towards livelihood security. Similarly, Chakraborty (2007), Hirway (2008) and Kapur et al. (2008) raised concerns on the poor quality of assets created, questioning the long term sustainability. Jha et al. (2008) and Gill et al. (2012) highlighted that the provision of additional employment under MGNREGA aided the disadvantaged groups whereas Mehrotra (2008) and Ambasta et al. (2008) cited serious lapses in programme execution and reported issues related to the schedule of rates, wage rates, transparency in wage payments, lack of professionalism at the ground level and ineffectiveness of social audits etc. By and large, different reports and research studies on MGNREGA suggest that though the Act can transform rural livelihoods unlike its erstwhile counterparts, but much of this potential has been wasted or unutilised.

The Haryana Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme (HREGS) under NREG Act, 2005 came into force in January 2007. MGNREGA in this state was initially implemented in the two identified backward districts, Mahendragarh and Sirsa. Kaushil et al. (2010) in an evaluation study conducted in Phase I districts, hinted at the sluggishness of the authorities in implementing the programme. It was revealed that only 11.08 per cent of registered households completed 100 days of employment, the fund utilisation was to the tune of 77.18 per cent and only 59.62 per cent works were completed. The study also pointed out the shortage of trained personnel, Block Development Programme Officers, Junior Engineers and the *Gram Sachivs*, which impeded the smooth functioning of the programme. The CAG Report (2008) also highlighted how lack of planning and poor execution defied the well-intentioned scheme in Phase I districts of Haryana. The scheme was extended to Ambala and Mewat districts in the second phase in 2007-08 and from April 2008 it has been extended to all the remaining 17 districts. According to the MGNREGA MIS data, average work completion rate in Mewat is 88.29 per cent and around 5.53 lakh persondays have been generated from February, 2009 till January, 2015. Considering a large number of small and marginal farmers (around 1.75 lakh) as well as casual labourers (over 60,000) in this rural district coupled with negligent employment opportunities, the importance of and demand for work under MGNREGA is understandable.

Apart from the employment benefits it accrues and short term distress reduction it offers, it has been aptly argued that MGNREGA should rather be seen as a programme for facilitating a long-term impact by using the labour of people to build ecological assets and regenerate the local environment (CSE, 2008). It is researcher's conjecture that MGNREGA has given ample

## Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA

opportunity for infrastructure development at the community level, which needs to be tapped. The present paper nurtures this optimism and points out the possibilities that can be achieved through the Act, provided it is implemented well as per the envisaged objectives and guidelines.

### Study Locale and Design

The study was carried out in Mewat, a backward district in the state of Haryana. Mewat is in proximity to Gurgaon and NCR of Delhi and has a distinct topography of undulating lands bound by hillocks of Aravalli ranges. The district spans around 1500 sq.km., with predominantly rural population (88.6 per cent) in 491 inhabited villages (Census 2011). The Meo-Muslims, listed as a backward class community are the major population group (70.9 per cent) residing in this region (MDA, 2009). The paper presents the case of two villages, Beri Taoru and Lafuri, in Taoru and Punhana blocks respectively. The villages were selected through purposive sampling with the help of Sehgal Foundation, a locally functioning Non-Government Organisation (NGO). The data was primarily gathered through participatory field level appraisal methods (transect walk, community mapping, livelihood profiling, focused group discussions and key informant interviews). This methodology resulted in appreciative inquiry and information based on residents' subjective viewpoints. Relevant literature on the district was reviewed from various sources and MGNREGA data for the selected villages was sought through the Gram Panchayats and the official Government websites.

### Results and Discussion

The government of Haryana declared Mewat to be a socio-economically backward region with highly abysmal human development indices (Jatrana, 1999). The demographic summary of the two selected villages is presented in table 1. Village Lafuri was found to have more number of households and consequently a higher population. This village located in Punhana block, which also has a higher density of population as compared to other blocks in Mewat.

**Table 1**  
**Demographic Distribution of Households in the Selected Villages**

Village	Total Households	Muslim	Hindu	BPL	Women headed
Beri Taoru	280	260 (93)	20	22 (8)	8 (2.9)
Lafuri	468	452 (97)	16	153 (33)	15 (3.2)

Figures in parentheses are percentages.

Source: Field data

### Narang and Meenai

The average household size in Mewat is 7.6, with reportedly a high number of dependents; particularly children (Census 2011). A large family size with 6-8 members was also affirmed during discussions and despite resource crunch, preference for a large family with more children was found to be an intriguing phenomenon in both the villages. Predominance of Muslims is in line with the fact that in the state of Haryana, Mewat has the largest concentration of Muslim population (IIHD, 2008). Since, religion and caste have an important bearing on the socio-economic status of households, the high concentration of Meo-muslims, minorities classified as OBCs, also indicates a higher level of denied opportunities for socio-economic development. It has also been pointed out that almost 62 per cent of the rural Meo households in Mewat live at or below the national poverty level and the BPL families across the district are 27.69 per cent of the total population (IIHD, 2008). The percentage of BPL households was found to be greater than the district average in Lafuri (33 per cent) while relatively much lesser in Beri Taoru (8 per cent). This could be attributed to the availability of regular work due to proximity to Gurgaon and NCR Delhi, coupled with several real estate and land development projects proliferating in Beri Taoru's vicinity as reported by the people during discussions. The opportunities for employment and hence, supplementing the income were found to be much lesser in Lafuri. The women headed households in both the villages reportedly belonged to the widows who thrived on paltry amount of state pension and expressed dire need for labour work availability within the village boundaries.

It is widely acknowledged that access to resources is imminent to achieve livelihood security (Carney, 1998). In dire needs and periods of hardships, it is the entitlements and the assets that can be mobilised to ward off vulnerability. The physical infrastructure and services are most important in offering direct benefits and support to rural households. However, none of the selected villages have a post office branch, bank, primary health centre or public transport services. The villagers reported travelling 2-5 kms to avail these facilities. The Aanganwadi Centres and ration depots are present in both the villages but people cited many grudges against their functioning. The schools in both the villages were also till Middle level, consequent to which, most of the children reportedly dropped out of formal education. This was found particularly true for girls who were permitted limited mobility as per the prevailing socio-cultural Islamic norms. The children were preferably sent to *Madarasas* for *deeni taaleem* (religious education). Lack

### **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA**

of formal education and skill training opportunities limited the employment avenues for the local people.

In terms of general housing conditions, Beri Taoru had around 40 per cent kutchha to semi pucca dwellings with walls and floor made of compacted earth. There were lesser number of BPL and Indira Awas Yojana beneficiaries in this village, thus without government support, people continued to stay in dilapidated and kutchha dwellings. In Lafuri, almost 95 per cent households did not possess toilet facilities within premises and were forced to defecate in open. Even in Beri Taoru, just 18 per cent of the total households had in-house latrines. Further, most of the internal roads in both the villages were also kutchha and severed with poor drainage. This resulted in a grim state of sanitation also adversely affecting people's health and productivity.

Availability of potable water was also one of the most pressing problems, common to both the villages. Personal and community owned hand pumps were predominantly used in Beri Taoru, although many faucets were defunct due to receding water table. In Lafuri, the problem of excessively saline underground water was reported and people travelled up to three kms to the nearby villages to fetch water. Travelling along with the bickering at water sources wasted a lot of productive time of both men and women and added to the drudgery. Some households in this village were also forced to spend a large part of their earnings on purchasing water from private tankers for daily usage. Each tanker delivery reportedly costs Rs. 600-1100 and the capacity of the tankers ranges from 5,000-11,000 litres. Only few households could afford to construct an underground or above ground water storage tanks, which were observed during transect walk.

In Lafuri, there was a single pond and interaction with people revealed that it had saline water, which was altogether avoided for any usage and not even for bathing of livestock. It was observed to be full of filth and a breeding ground for disease causing vectors. On the other hand, Beri Taoru had four ponds and the Sarpanch disclosed that water in *Johads* increased in monsoons but lasted only for four-five months. It was during dry months of summer that ponds usually dried up and water needs of animals for drinking and bathing required an extra effort by the concerned households. Although, unlike Lafuri, piped water supply was available at Beri Taoru but it was cited as grossly inadequate and intermittent being available for few hours only.

Many land parcels in Lafuri were also observed to have been left fallow because of lack of water for irrigation or soils turning saline after

## Narang and Meenai

being irrigated with brackish water. The farmers in this village, who already owned small land holdings, thus asserted living in debt and penury. Overall, the status of community assets revealed the daily drudgery and impoverished living conditions in both the villages.

The best way to understand how people's livelihoods can be made more productive and sustainable is to first understand their current livelihood activities, assets and entitlements (Helmore and Singh, 2001). According to Scoones (1998), the sum of all livelihood strategies forms the livelihood portfolio. The local livelihood activities, as delineated through livelihood profiling and discussions, have been presented in table 2. The data reflects that a considerable number of households in Lafuri were engaged in farming. Land, being a vital indicator of the economic status of people, it was found that there was a majority of small and marginal farmers in this village, owning land ranging from 0.5 to 2 acres. A large number of these peasants also worked as casual labour for a major part of the year. There were two main reasons cited for this. One, their land was just enough to meet subsistence needs and not much yield was produced to be marketed to fetch income for sustenance. Secondly, the rising cost of farm inputs, particularly water for irrigation, being not readily available (all underground water in Lafuri being brackish and over exploited in Beri Taoru), pushed the farmers to look for alternate livelihoods. The peasants in both the villages were mainly engaged in wheat cultivation and very few of them diversified their farming into vegetable crops like brinjals, tomatoes, onions, chillies etc. The coarse grains bajra and jowar were also reportedly grown in the *khari* season.

**Table 2**  
**Distribution of Households by Livelihood Activities**

Village	Farming	Livestock	Casual Labour	Salaried	Self Employed	Migrant
Beri Taoru	125 (44.6)	250 (89.2)	180 (64)	3(0.01)	5 (1.7)	3-4
Lafuri	450 (96.1)	350 (74.8)	400 (85)	8(0.02)	4 (0.8)	50 - 60

Figures in parentheses are percentages.

Source: Field data.

Livestock keeping was also found to be serving as an important support enterprise in the villages. It was reported that the Meo community of Mewat has traditionally been agro-pastoralist and hence, livestock keeping comes naturally as an inter-generational familial occupation. The other prominent reasons offered during discussions for keeping livestock and rearing buffaloes were regular cash income through sale of milk and easy availability of dung as fuel. Some households affirmed that they

### **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA**

preferred dairying because of lack of knowledge on other activities coupled with familiarity with the vocation. The women largely cited that animal husbandry was less tedious than agricultural labour and allowed greater flexibility in working time. Though not very remunerative as an enterprise, despite inclusion of family labour and farm grown inputs as feed, dairying was the preferred source of livelihood. Dairying did ensure food security for the family and livestock was also viewed as an asset that could be sold off for cash in times of distress. The incremental employment generated through dairying was around 17-18 man-days per month since the activity continued for six-seven months and long inter-calving periods were reported. The milk was sold at prices ranging from Rs. 18-22 per litre, which was perceived as very less since the households incurred a lot of expenditure in upkeep of animals. The high cost of feed and fodder and lack of guaranteed price of milk were the major constraints cited by most of the respondents. This was also the reason that relative to other villages, less number of households in Lafuri (74.8 per cent) could afford to keep livestock. The poor households in Lafuri cited that they kept small ruminants like goats for meeting the family needs of milk. Some households also reportedly, had taken loans from milk vendors and the interest was paid in terms of milk. There was also a large and urgent unmet need for veterinary services and immunisation of livestock.

Although, farming and livestock keeping ruled the roost, the mosaic of off-farm and non-agricultural income sources was found to be pervasive in both the villages. It was revealed during Focussed Group Discussions (FGDs) that a great majority of small and marginal farmers and landless labourers worked as casual labour, particularly during lean agricultural period from March till June. Due to extreme weather conditions, shortage of water and seasonal nature of farming, the farmers reportedly keep the fields fallow for almost four-five months and are forced to resort to other labour work to survive. These labour opportunities are however, highly unreliable, irregular, subject to seasonal variance and often characterised by low wages. The number of casual labour came to be significantly higher in case of Lafuri (85 per cent), which also had a greater number of BPL families and small and marginal farmers.

In terms of wage rates, the Sarpanches reported that the agricultural wages varied from Rs 300-350 per day while MGNREGA wage payments at the time of data collection were on piece rate basis amounting to Rs 214 per day. In Lafuri, people showed a high inclination to work in MGNREGA and complained of unavailability of work adding to distress. In Beri Taoru, a

### Narang and Meenai

large number of casual labour was also engaged in construction work or in services like gardeners, guards, painters etc. in the Real Estate Projects being developed in the block. Beri Taoru apparently has a location benefit and thus, access to work opportunities was better and mostly achieved through social relations and contacts. The work opportunities being available locally, there were no significant migrant households in Beri Taoru, while in Lafuri, the number of migrants was more. When the reason for migration was probed, the respondents affirmed that most of the migrants in these villages were heavy vehicle (Trucks, Earth movers and JCB) drivers who migrated to far away states like Gujarat, Andhra Pradesh and Maharashtra for almost six-seven months and earned their livelihood. The families of these migrants stayed on in the village itself and apparently benefitted from the remittances received from them. Some families in Lafuri seasonally migrated to Punjab for a limited period of two-three months to provide labour during cotton harvest season.

The regularity of a certain income, its independence from seasonal variations, and a regular work schedule are favourable factors in the process of securing a livelihood and for overcoming poverty conditions. However, there were only a handful of salaried households in both the villages and the reason cited was lack of formal education and skill training. This is valid since the overall literacy rate in rural Mewat (54.01 per cent) is also very low (Census 2011), which limits people's chances of being employed in the organised sector jobs. The few salaried individuals reportedly worked as government school teachers, peons in block and district offices, safai karamcharis, army sepoy etc. These were secure and stable forms of employment and not subject to insecurity or inter-temporal fluctuation.

The number of self employed households was also very less, which to some extent is indicative of risk aversion, lack of capital and lack of entrepreneurial skills. These were primarily engaged in shop keeping (selling tobacco products, home-made foodstuffs or other easily tradable goods), street vending, pulling animal carts etc. Such groups also narrated irregular, fluctuating and low incomes and resort to take on casual wage labour, whenever available.

A report by Labour Bureau (2010) mentions that the transformative potential of MGNREGA lies in creating sustainable livelihoods through well targeted public investments in rural areas for creation of durable assets in priority works, thus easing the resource constraints faced by the poor, rural labour households. However, there was plenty of anecdotal evidence across both the villages, that people received their entitlements only partly.

## Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA

Table 3  
MGNREGA in Two Study Villages

Village	Total Registered Households	Registered BPL Households	Works Completed
Beri Taoru	63(22.5)	17(77.2)	13
Lafuri	213(45.5)	60(39.2)	15

Figures in parentheses are percentages.

Source: www.mgnrega.nic.in Accessed in Jan. 2015.

As evident from the data in table 3, almost half of all the village households registered for MGNREGA in Lafuri, as was also reported that no alternate employment opportunities exist in this area and more than a quarter of BPL families in Beri Taoru also got job cards made. Over a span of six years, from 2009 till 2015, 13 works were completed in Beri Taoru and 15 in Lafuri, mainly focusing on rural connectivity works. Leveling of school playgrounds was also undertaken at both the villages and was appreciated since these grounds not just enabled hassle free access to children but also served as community areas to hold public functions. Digging of two 'Johads' (ponds) was also commenced at Beri Taoru, however, many respondents revealed that earth movers and JCB were used for digging of earth, refuting the provisions of the Act. Not much had been accomplished in Lafuri, where residents suffered enormously owing to acute water scarcity. The effective implementation of the programme was marred by poor coordination, lack of accountability, lack of involvement of beneficiaries in decision making and a sheer lack of concern for local priorities.

The Sarpanches of Lafuri and Beri Taoru claimed that work was provided to workers only when available and not always on demand, which was contrary to the statutes of the Act. They also agreed readily that no receipts were ever issued and unemployment allowance was never given to anyone. In terms of keeping a record of workers' attendance, the muster rolls were being maintained but other records like application register, asset register etc. were not revealed when asked for. They further reported that the shelf of projects were chosen in consultation with the people and under the guidance of Block Level Programme Officers, which many people denied during discussions. There was no Vigilance and Monitoring Committee in any of the village and the Sarpanch himself or his kin, were reported to have supervised and monitored all the work.

These elected village chiefs also cited many grievances pertaining to obtaining work approval and timely funding for payment of wages, which often resulted in many workers discontinuing and dropping out from the scheme. Sarpanch of Beri Taoru cited that when funds are delayed, it also



### Narang and Meenai

adversely affects their credibility and reputation in the village, since people sometimes wrongly accuse them of guzzling the Government money. It was stated that irregular flow of funds from the district office and delayed measurements by the Junior Engineers, who are overworked, often resulted in discontinuation of work. Though none of the Sarpanches were fully satisfied with the performance of MGNREGA in their respective villages, however, both of them articulated that programme must continue and found it useful for development of their villages. When asked to give specific suggestions for improved implementation and performance of the programme, it was asserted that Block and District level officials must cooperate and more MGNREGA staff appointments at block and village levels, particularly of Junior Engineers, for smooth conduct of planning and measurement activities were suggested. Training in preparation of village perspective plans and cost estimation was also cited as a chief requirement.

The PRA exercise on 'Problems and Opportunities Analysis' further helped in highlighting the kind of ongoing and completed MGNREGA projects as well as possible interventions that could address specific livelihood constraints. Apart from provision of wage employment during lean season, which was desired in both the villages, there was a great scope to expedite several other community level and individual works. In Beri Taoru, the farmers reported undulating land levels and low productivity due to erratic rainfall and the Government imposed ban on boring due to over exploitation of ground water. It is noteworthy that Mewat as a region is not blessed with any perennial source of water. '*Johads*' are the native structures that capture the run off in a local area and were the major source of irrigation in the past. Breakdown of community maintenance and spread of borewell technology rendered them defunct on one hand, and also led to depletion of ground water on the other. This was particularly true for Beri Taoru, where ground water reserves showed severe depletion and no more digging of bore wells was allowed. Thus, deepening of existing ponds and creation of small to medium sized sunken ponds was deemed desirable to harvest rain water. Some small farmers also reported undulated land levels causing water stagnation in the fields, affecting productivity. Land levelling works on such individual lands were also suggested during interactions. In Lafuri, the farmers expressed agony over saline and sodic soils and suggested technological help for reclamation of such lands as well as inputs on salt tolerant varieties of crops. Other works related to vermi composting and farm bunding were also deemed desirable across both the villages.

### **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA**

For support to poor livestock keepers who reported expensive cattle feed, azolla cultivation was found suitable to meet fodder requirements. In addition, construction of pucca cattle sheds, goat shelters and poultry shelters were also mentioned in Lafuri. The general populace, particularly women articulated the urgent need for individual household latrines to safeguard their privacy and dignity. However, they were doubtful how the respective Sarpanches would get it done, as initially, it was assumed that only earth work was possible through the programme funds. The Block Level Programme Officer also conveyed the ongoing convergence efforts between MGNREGA and Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan to improve the sanitation situation in Mewat, which was seen as a good opportunity to embark upon.

During discussions, when convergence and newer works added to programme's ambit were discussed, people became more vocal on the kind of interventions and works they wanted to seek for their respective villages. It was vociferously put forward by the respondents that compacting of several earthen internal roads was required in Lafuri, which, particularly after rains, became puddles and breeding grounds for disease causing vectors. Malaria epidemicity being largely acknowledged during discussions, compacting roads and making of appropriate water drainage channels alongside, as well as construction of recharge pits could be taken up in Lafuri. Several other works like construction of chaupals, boundary walls of religious and funeral places, construction and repair/maintenance of public buildings like *baraat ghars*, community centres etc. were also identified by the people. Although, no exemplary case study was revealed regarding successful implementation of the programme, however, water harvesting, pisciculture, prawn culture and construction of individual household toilets were the prominent works that were deemed desirable and important in both the villages.

### **Conclusion**

The study clearly reflects on the demand and scope for MGNREGA work in the selected villages. It is also pertinent to note that people had many ideas pertaining to the infrastructure and community development required within their respective villages and showed concern. It was clear that programme interventions were not entirely related to the problems identified by the local people, nor did they contribute much to their livelihood security. It is also ironical that gram sabhas failed to perform their role as deliberation platforms for converting useful ideas and perspectives into shelf of projects. It can thus be inferred that there is a need for

## Narang and Meenai

appropriate and advance selection of MGNREGA projects through people's participation and a careful scrutiny of local development context, livelihood activities, assets and constraints at community level so that real needs of the people are addressed. Appendini (2001) also notes that it is important to look into people's livelihood concerns to search for more effective methods to support communities in ways that are more meaningful to their daily lives and needs, as opposed to ready-made, interventionist instruments. Thus, MGNREGA can help create an enabling environment for sustainable livelihood patterns, provided its delivery mechanisms are capacitated and cognizant of the various risks and opportunities faced by communities and individuals.

### References

- Ambasta, P., Shankar, P. S., & Shah, M. (2008). Two Years of NREGA : The Road Ahead. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 43(8), 41-50.
- Appendini, K. (2001). Land and livelihood: what do we know and what are the issues? In Zoomers, A. (Ed.). *Land and Sustainable Livelihood in Latin America* (pp.23-38). Royal Tropical Institute, Amsterdam: KIT Publishers.
- Bhatia, B., & Dreze, J. (2006). Employment guarantee in Jharkhand: Ground realities. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 3198-3202. Retrieved from <http://epw.in/epw/uploads/articles/797.pdf>. (accessed on 21 August, 2012).
- Carney, D. (Ed.) (1998). *Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: What Contribution Can We Make?* London: Department for International Development (DFID). Retrieved from [povertyandconservation.info/en/biblio/b2064](http://povertyandconservation.info/en/biblio/b2064). (accessed on 21 August, 2012).
- Census (2011). Census of India. District Profiles. Retrieved from <http://censusindia.gov.in/>. (accessed on 15 January, 2012).
- Chakraborty, P. (2007). Implementation of NREGA in India: spatial dimensions and fiscal implications (Working Paper No.505). New York: The Levy Economics Institute of Bard College. Retrieved from [www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/wp\\_505.pdf](http://www.levyinstitute.org/pubs/wp_505.pdf). (accessed on 8 November, 2012).
- CAG (2008). Comptroller and Auditor General. Performance Audit of Implementation of National Rural Employment Guarantee Act, 2005 (NREGA). Draft Report, New Delhi.
- CSE. (2008). NREGA: Opportunities and Challenges. Centre for Science and Environment, New Delhi. Retrieved from [http://www.world-governance.org/IMG/pdf\\_572\\_NREGA\\_Briefing\\_CSE.pdf](http://www.world-governance.org/IMG/pdf_572_NREGA_Briefing_CSE.pdf).
- Ellis, F., & Freeman, H. A. (2004). Rural Livelihoods and Poverty Reduction Strategies in Four African Countries. *The Journal of Development Studies*, 40 (4), 19.
- Gill, S.S., Singh, S., & Brar, S. (2012). Functioning of NREGS in Punjab (Paper 20). Commissioned Study under CDS-ASSR Project on Social Security. HIVOS Knowledge Programme, Netherlands.; University of Amsterdam and Centre for Development Studies, Trivandrum.
- Government of India, 2011. [www.nrega.nic.in](http://www.nrega.nic.in) (accessed on 20 January, 2015)
- Helmores, K., & Singh, N. (2001). *Sustainable Livelihoods: Building on the Wealth of the Poor*. Bloomfield, CT: Kumarian Press.
- Hirway, I. (2008, February 2). Plan for Long Term. *Indian Express*.

### **Livelihood Concerns and Opportunities for MGNREGA**

- Indian Institute For Human Development. (2008). A baseline survey of minority concentration Districts of India - Mewat (Haryana). Retrieved from [http://www.icssr.org/Mewat\[1\].pdf](http://www.icssr.org/Mewat[1].pdf)
- Jatrana, S. (1999). Determinants and differentials of infant mortality in Mewat region of Haryana State, India. Unpublished Ph.D Thesis, Demography Program, Research School of Social Sciences, Canberra, The Australian National University. Retrieved from [adsri.anu.edu.au](http://adsri.anu.edu.au)
- Jha, R., Gaiha, R., & Shankar, S. (2008). Reviewing the National Rural Employment Guarantee Programme, *Economic and Political Weekly*, 43(11), 44-48.
- Kapur, D., Mukhopadhyay P., & Subramanian, A. (2008). More on Direct Cash Transfers. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 43 (47), 85-87.
- Kaushil, S., Yadav, S.M.S., & Durgaprasad, P. (2010). Planning and Implementation of National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme in Haryana: A Process Study. (Monograph Series 5). Haryana: Institute of Rural development, Haryana and Hyderabad: National Institute of Rural Development
- Labour Bureau. (2010). *Report on Employment and Unemployment Survey (2009-10)*. Chandigarh: Labour Bureau, Ministry of Labour and Employment, Government of India.
- MDA (Mewat Development Agency). (2009). Available at <http://mda.nic.in/Mewat-Glance.htm>. Accessed in November 2011.
- Mehrotra, S. (2008). NREG Two Years On: Where Do We Go From Here? *Economic and Political Weekly*, 43(31), 27-35.
- MoRD (Ministry of Rural Development). (2012). *MGNREGS Sameeksha: An Anthology of Research Studies on the Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Act, 2005*. Government of India.
- Scoones, I. (1998). Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: A framework for analysis. Institute of Development Studies (Working Paper 72). Brighton, UK: University of Sussex.
- Shah, M. (2004). National Rural Employment Guarantee Act: A Historic Opportunity. *Economic and Political Weekly*, December 11.

## The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate

Sachna Arora<sup>\*</sup>

*Climate change is the biggest challenge before the policy planners today. The question is to whether we witness widespread climate change is beyond doubt and discussion. The question we are witnessing today is how far we will be impacted by climate change, how much time do we have and what can we possibly do to save ourselves. This is more so in the case of developing countries as IPCC clearly mentioned in its various assessment reports that developing countries are doubly vulnerable because of the impacts and secondly due to their lack of capacity to deal with it. So focusing alone on climate change will be highly misleading especially in the case of rising economies of Asia and also when 21st century is being looked upon as an Asian century. This paper discusses the discourse of rise of Asia in detail including present state of literature on the discourse of rise of Asia. In the end, this paper reflects on the points of fossil fuel based development model and the resultant environmental pollution in the countries of rise of Asia which put the rise of Asia at risk.*

### Introduction

It is a truism that 21<sup>st</sup> century is in many ways Asia's century and the growth stories of countries like India, China, Japan, South Korea, Taiwan and Singapore are causing remarkable shifts in global geo-political equations. The forecast is continued strong growth at a rate of 5.4 per cent,

---

<sup>\*</sup>Senior Research Scholar (Ph.D.), Department of Political Science, Panjab University, Chandigarh. E-mail: sachna1822@gmail.com

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

owing to the presence of economies with enormous markets such as China, the Association of South-East Asian Nations (ASEAN), and India. To maintain this growth rate these countries are highly dependent on energy resources. World primary energy consumption is projected to expand at an average annual growth rate of 2.1 per cent by 2020. About 70 per cent of the increase would be accounted for by non-OECD member economies, two-thirds of which are from the Asian region (Ito, K. et al, 2005). Ensuring energy security would therefore turn out to be a vital task. Besides this each of these countries is trying to balance the three E's (economic development, energy security, and environmental preservation) which need to deal by all the countries collectively. This goal of common interest should lead to a region wide cooperation.

The process of globalisation, industrialisation, increasing pace of their economic activities, increasing foreign direct investment all led to the overall high growth rate of Asian economies. These high growth rates have turned this region into a growth centre as well as a market centre for the whole world economy. This will not be wrong to say that their rise will take a heavy toll on the energy demand and supply. Various national as well as international reports in their medium to long-term outlook for global energy supply and demand have envisioned continued strong economic growth in Asia and a rapid rise in its energy demand. So the need of the hour is to make efforts to assure energy supply and demand stability and at the same time addressing energy and environmental problems, but not just at the individual country level alone but at the collective level of all the countries in Asia.

With the rise in Asia a new narrative of 'Growing East and Slowing West' (Ganguly, 2014) is also emerging which represented Asia as the largest consumer of hydrocarbons today. However, unlike the west it does not have the advantage of taking the oil resources from West Asia on the pretext of cold war so Asia's strategies to deal with their energy security issue are different. This power shift led US Secretary of State Hillary Clinton to assert that "We are a resident power in Asia - not only a diplomatic or military power, but a resident economic power", in her remarks on 'Principles for Prosperity in ASIA-PACIFIC' in July 2011 (Philling, D., 2011).

The multi-polarity of Asia and the changing political economy can prove to be a hindrance for effective management of energy security as Asia represents more of a geographic unit than as an economic or the formal market regimes or a regional security mechanism. Its unity as such is nowhere visible. It is still an aggregation of nations. "Asia is in the midst of a

## Arora

truly historic transformation. If it continues to grow on its recent trajectory, it could, by 2050, account for more than half of Gross Domestic Product, trade and investment, and enjoy widespread affluence" (Kohli, H et al, 2011).

World primary energy consumption is forecast to increase at an average annual rate of 2.1 per cent over the period (2000-2020) much higher than the corresponding rate of 1.7 per cent over the preceding two decades (1980-2000). About 70 per cent of the increase in energy consumption over the forecast period would derive from the non-OECD countries (mainly developing ones). The non-OECD Asian countries should account for about two-thirds of the total, and China, for about 30 per cent. China is now the world's biggest energy consumer after the US, and it should near the US consumption level by 2020. Ninety percent of the increase in primary energy consumption over the years 2000-20 is expected to come from fossil fuels i.e. coal oil and natural gas. These will continue to dominate the energy sector in the near future. By region Asia should account for about 50 per cent of this increase. The share of the primary energy consumption in Asia including China is forecast to expand from 38 per cent in 2000 to 45 per cent in 2020. In Asia, fossil fuels (coal, natural gas, oil) will continue to dominate as the major source of energy in almost all the countries but specifically in India and china. By region, it is estimated that China will account for about 50 per cent of the increase, and India, about 20 per cent (Kohli, H. et al, 2011).

In Asia, this increase in growth rates is mainly because of the rising middle class in these countries, increasing urbanisation modernisation increase in standard of living in major economies of the Asia. It has led to increase in power consumption which increased at an average annual rate of 5.9 per cent from 1980 to 2000, and is forecast to increase at 4.1 per cent by 2020. By region, China has the highest corresponding rate at 5.5 per cent, followed by India at 5.2 per cent. More and more use of private vehicles show a considerable increase in the standard of living in these countries which also led to the increase in use of petroleum products and this is bound to deepen. The share of the final energy demand occupied by petroleum products is forecast to expand from 50 per cent in 2000 to 52 per cent in 2020 (Kohli, H. et al, 2011).

It is expected that in the next few years there will be a shift towards use of natural gas than petroleum products. But at the same time coal fired power plants will continue to dominate the energy scene in the Asian region because of the good availability of coal in the reserves of these countries. This is more so in case of India and China and the details of their energy

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

reserves, growing energy demands and its implications will be discussed later.

Among the developed countries, the demand for gasoline oil and other transportation products is expected to decrease as the process of modernisation has reached to a saturation point and demand is more or less stagnant. But in developing countries, it is expected to increase as more and more people are entering into the middle class, their purchasing power is also increasing and it is expected to gather momentum in the coming years. The expanded consumption of oil associated with motorisation in Asia should be a major factor characterising the structure of energy supply and demand in the region over the medium and long-term and it will impact on the traditional oil market too.

If India and China are one of the biggest markets for energy resources then the West Asian region is the biggest supplier of the energy resources. Not only are these two countries in fact most of the countries of the world dependent on this region for their energy security. All this makes it important for West Asia region to develop that much capacity to supply. In the same way the market economies of the region should try to develop a best mix of energy sources in accordance with their domestic reserves, economic development, level of technological development and geographical conditions because there is also a possibility that excessive pursuit of the national interest by any single country could damage the energy security of the rest of the region.

It is expected that energy security should be treated as a common goal for all the countries where all the countries have a stake. To this end, it is imperative for the Asian countries that are net consumers of energy to collaborate with each other. Coal scenario in Asian region explains this point effectively. No doubt most of the countries in the Asian region are having coal reserves so they will try to use it as much as possible so as to reduce their dependence on the other countries. But this will also lead to increase in carbon emissions so in this case Japan can play a major role as it is technologically quite advanced and it can help in harnessing high efficiency technology for the environment friendly utilisation of coal. In the same way Japan's domestic efforts to reduce carbon emissions will not yield much result as these will be over shadowed by the continuous increase in carbon emissions by countries like India and China as they rely on their domestic coal reserves as they do not have the technology to increase their energy efficiency and move to the low carbon economy. Japan which is way ahead in energy conservation and environmental sustainability can support these



### Arora

countries with its undepletable resource- its technology as these countries have immense potential for energy conservation through transfer of technology and the Clean Development Mechanisms (CDM).

Coming to the non-renewable sources of energy scenario in Asia, it is expected that there will be increase in the installed capacity of almost all the non-renewable sources of energy but its share in overall energy scenario is still subject of debate. It is expected that in the coming decade Asia will be hub of all types of nuclear plants as the demand in the developed countries of North America and Europe has decreased and is expected to decline further. Nuclear power has been projected as a remedy for uninterrupted supply of energy resources and the environmental sustainability.

Due to increasing use of natural gas by power sectors of developed countries in North America and Europe and low potential for construction of nuclear plants in these countries the share of nuclear power in primary energy consumption will decline from 8 per cent in 2006 to 6 per cent in 2020. The low interest in nuclear in developed countries will be balanced by the high interest in nuclear power in developing countries but to low extent as it will remain a high priority in East Asian countries like Japan, South Korea and Taiwan which have few domestic energy resources.

In spite of increase in their share, fossil fuels will continue to dominate the energy scene of most of the Asian countries because of the high cost of the supply and supply instability of these renewable sources of energy. 'The share occupied by oil in primary energy consumption is forecast to decline slightly, from 39 per cent in 2000 to 37 per cent in 2020, but oil would nevertheless remain the single largest energy source. Consumption of natural gas is forecast to increase at the rate of 2.6 per cent, the highest among fossil fuels. About 60 per cent natural gas consumption will go towards power sector which is expected to drive an increase in the natural gas share of primary consumption, from 23 per cent in 2000 to 26 per cent in 2020' (Kohli, H. et al, 2011).

Now the traditional energy consumers called the OECD group is being challenged by rising economies group of Asia which primarily includes India and China. In the same way OPEC dominance is being challenged by non-member suppliers like Russia and countries in Central Asia, Africa and Latin America. An IEA forecast asserts that two thirds of the rising energy demands between 2002 and 2030 will come from developing countries in the midst of industrialisation and urbanisation with their consumption ratio climbing up from 38 per cent to 48 per cent and that for

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

OECD members dropping from 52 per cent to 43 per cent (Fengying and Jiejun, 2008).

The High level of imports in Asia is the result to disproportionate population energy reserves ratio. Asian region has only 4 per cent of the world's proven reserves and 50 per cent of the world's population. Among these India and China will be at the top positions with their energy demand to increase by 50 per cent by 2020. So it becomes important to analyse their energy strategies in terms of their rising energy demands, domestic energy reserves, increasing imports as well as energy deals overseas.

### **Contemporary Literature on the Discourse of Rise of Asia**

Møller (2011) provides an incisive, insightful, interdisciplinary and futuristic analysis of *How Asia Can Shape the World* over the next 25 years, when global economic growth, he says, will certainly be lower and commodity prices, including those of energy and food will be higher. He reveals how and why the Asian states and societies find themselves at the crossroads today. Møller shows how one path could take Asia further down the road marked by uncontrolled neo-liberal market forces, unsustainable megacities, deeply entrenched ecological irrationalities and grave economic injustices. With 'public services being run as a private enterprise', scarce social capital fails to generate the much needed trust for reconciling basic freedoms to express 'identity' with the self discipline required for creating and sustaining group solidarity. The culture of sharing creativity and knowledge as 'public goods' as well as values such as mutual tolerance and burden sharing that 'ecological' productivity (characterised by much less materialistic consumption) demands, are further compromised as Asian nation-states and societies become oblivious of their civilisational moorings and rich cultural traditions.

Møller argues that the second path could take Asia towards an ecologically sustainable, socially just and culturally appropriate development. The world view that dictates and drives Asia away from money-oriented society towards a societal development more rooted in values and ethics is anchored in ancient Asian religions and philosophies (i.e. Hinduism, Buddhism, Jainism, and Confucianism) and nourished by indigenous knowledge systems; both emphasising harmony between humans and nature. Firmly placed at the heart of persuasive arguments of Møller for much needed paradigm shift from 'carboniferous capitalism' to 'ecological economics' are the concepts of human-social capital/intelligence, burden sharing, knowledge commons, family values, basic education

## Arora

reforms (possibly against the backdrop of 'mergers and acquisitions among universities'), and gender justice. Under this scenario the threats such as news wars anchored in the economy of organised violence, terrorism, pandemics, loss of biodiversity, corporate power, disinformation, failed states, cyber warfare, and warfare in space continue to pose challenge to the legitimacy, authority and effectiveness of governance in Asia. But these threats and challenges are addressed largely through the rule of law and 'persuasive power' both within and between states. The prospects of China and India starting to perceive 'regional' and 'global' interests in their 'national interest', and there by opening new windows of opportunity for regional and sub-regional cooperation need to be explored.

Mahbubani (2008) in his widely cited work argues and illustrates that rising Asia will transform the world in as significant a manner as the West did during the course of its rise. He shows how Asia is rising and why there is a resistance to it from the West. He does not rule out the possibility that rise of new powers could cause tensions and conflict, but is more inclined to take a rather optimistic of the changes taking place in the world. In his view, on the whole these trends remain positive and provide the opportunity for the emergence of a new, peaceful, stable, and more inclusive world order. However, the West must take a pragmatic view of the shifting geopolitical tectonic plates and be prepared to share power with the rising powers. Even though Mahbubani focuses on the rise of both China and India (especially China) and is rather liberal in showering praise on both, his evaluation of China's domestic and foreign policies falls rather short of being critical. To take the rise of China and India for granted is rather problematic especially in view of many internal problems to contend with: growing social inequalities within and across regions or provinces, environmental degradation to mention a few. A critique of both climate-security nexus in China and India and the principle of 'common but differentiated responsibility' in complex domestic context of the two countries is also missing.

Fiddler (2005) and Chin Lim (2007) have focused on the rise of Asia, predicting that the 21<sup>st</sup> century will be Asia's century. Asia is a rising leader in international geo-political economy. Japan plus the four Asian dragons (South Korea, Taiwan, Singapore and Hong Kong) and five tigers of newly industrialised economies (Thailand, Malaysia, Philippines, Indonesia and Vietnam) and the emerging giants India and China have the potential of becoming world economic powers with continental size markets. Hyun's article also suggests an alternative development paradigm for globalising

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

Asia i.e. the stakeholder's development model for capitalism in which NGOs play a central role in promoting the principle of common public good.

Eichengreen, Gupta and Kumar (2010) choose to focus on the surge of interest in the nature and implications of China and India's economic growth and place these issues in a comparative perspective. While both India and China are increasingly regarded as success stories, both confront serious challenges to sustaining economic growth, especially the challenge of sustainable development. While some of these challenges overlap, the two economies are likely to remain a study in contrast.

The studies by Christophe Jafferlot and Peter Van Der Veer (2008) and Kharas Homi (2010) are primarily concerned with today's middle classes in India and China and examine the extent to which they follow a similar route in both countries. After all, it is these middle classes which have the largest carbon footprint while being widely perceived as the indicator of 'growing' and 'rising' economies. It is precisely from the point of view of consumption that the middle class of India and China present the most striking affinities.

Homi (2010) too is of the view that the size of the middle class could increase and almost all of this growth will come from Asia. Equally striking, in his view is the growth in purchasing power of the middle class. By far the most important countries in driving the trend towards higher middle class consumption in Asia are China and India. In this context, it is worth noting that Americans (counting for 4.5% of world's population) spend US\$ 10 trillion in 2008, whereas China and India account for nearly 40% of world's population, which taken together, spent US\$ 2.5 trillion in the same year (*China Daily*, 21 February 2013).

Rise of China has been examined at length in the works of Lampton (2008) and Gilley (2011). Lampton investigates the military, economic and intellectual dimensions of Chinese growing influence in the world whereas Gilley shows in his article that China's rise is a reality and as China's power rises, there would be wide-ranging consequences at both regional and global levels. In his view, there is a need for proper analytical framework which could capture the broader dimensions of rise of China. Both the authors remain interested in finding out whether the rise of China will be disruptive for the world or it will be a peaceful rise.

Robert and Feng (2008) have tried to apply IR theory to understand the dynamics brought on by the rise of China and the resulting US-China power transition. But it is assumed that the combined participation of US and China in global institutions and regimes can help in mitigating the

### Arora

inherent competition in the U.S.-China power transition. Bergsten, Freeman, Lardy and Mitchell (2008) have examined the impact of China's rise on the world scene in general and on the US in particular. No doubt China has made tremendous progress in the last few years but it also faces significant domestic challenges. China's unbalanced economic growth, especially its energy intensive heavy industries and investment led growth, have aggravated income inequality and contributed to serious environmental problems. The authors argue that China's integration with the rest of the world should be encouraged as it has the potential to contribute to the resolution of a broad range of issues. This in turn could help China in rise as a responsible stakeholder in the world system.

The issue of India's rise has also been examined in depth by Mistry (2004), Lavay (2007) and Scott (2009). Scott argues that India's efforts to enhance its influence in its extended neighbourhood shows the rising aspiration of India as a regional power so as to balance the Chinese growing influence in Asia and to break out of the 'claustrophobic' confines of south Asia. The key focus of Lavay's article is on the various steps taken by India to develop its economy and improve its standing abroad. Indian policymakers have exhibited new measures of confidence, creativity and assertiveness in trying to enhance Indian interests in various strategic contexts that matter most to Delhi. Dinshaw Mistry underscores India's role as an emerging world power. He makes a reference to India's substantial military apparatus, its growing economy with world class sectors and democratic political institutions, all of which in his view point towards the growing status of India in world affairs. He concludes on the note that attaining world peace and stability, peaceful integration of India into major power system should be encouraged.

Mansingh (2007) while analysing various issues troubling Indo-China relations shows that there is a low risk of military conflict between India and China and a high desirability of international cooperation between the two in tackling many facets of human security in the 21<sup>st</sup> century. Analysts also point that with their spectacular performance in the last few decades, China and India have become a centre of attraction both regionally and globally. The increasing level of China's and India's integration with the global economy, combined with sustained high growth, is likely to further cement their position as an important engine of global development.

## **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

### **Rise of Asia: Rhetoric or Reality**

With all the positive facts and figures reflecting rise of Asia but in no case and by no means this growth of Asia should be preordained. Because the path ahead is not that easy as it is fraught with so many problems and challenges some of which are rising inequality within the countries which could be a source of tension and instability, increasing competition for finite natural resources as more and more people are entering into middle class with their increasing aspirations for better standard of life, rising income disparities across the region which may destabilise the region, weak governance structure and lack of institutional capacity in almost all the countries of the region to deal with problems and then threat of climate change and global warming which could have tremendous adverse impacts on these economies thus affecting their growth rates to a great extent.

The framing of growth story of Asian economies within that rise in GDP perspective hides the real picture of the growth within these countries. The deficiency of GDP as a measure of social progress or development has come to fore front. So efforts are being made to make it more inclusive and include their aspects such as education health and sustainable environment and other amenities. This has been beautifully explained by Amartya Sen's 'Capabilities Approach' which stress on counting non-monetary aspects of the quality of life. It also focuses on the fact that people must fulfill all their needs for their overall development as human beings and this may include many other aspects which have been mentioned above. Thus, the capabilities approach emphasise on adding these aspects like literacy, health, income disparities and environmental well being while measuring social well being of the nation. As this is also contingent upon the monetary resources one has at his disposal so again the focus shifts to raising the GDP rates of the economy (Kohli, H. et al, 2011).

But the efforts should be made that this growth is percolating down to the ground level and reaching to those who need it most rising income disparities can disturb the social and political fabric of the nation and which in turn may disturb the growth rate of the country. This is what happening in India and China as these countries are facing the massive challenge of minimising income and other inequalities within their countries. For example cities and coastal areas have benefitted the most while interior regions have lagged behind. Skilled force has got the big pie of the development pushing unskilled workers way behind them. Differences between coastal and western provinces in PRC and differences between southern eastern and western regions of India clearly reflects this point.

### Arora

This disparity will be aggravated by the fact that the competition for the finite natural resources will increase as some three billion additional Asians will become increasingly affluent, especially if they will continue to emulate the ways of the Western culture. There will be huge gap in demand and supply especially of non-renewable sources of energy and its related products. This will lead to a kind of zero sum game. One country's gain will be another country's loss. This is more prominent in the case of India and China as they are already concerned as how to secure their energy needs to meet the growing aspirations of its rising middle class simultaneously balancing the demands of international community to change their energy strategy to reduce carbon emissions on their level. The question is how their growing energy needs with finite natural resources will be met? How India and China will sustain its rapid growth with limits on carbon emissions?

Not just there is shortage of energy resources but the pattern of their current use is leading to huge environmental problem and global warming which in turn is leading towards lot of climate related changes. Climate change is perhaps the biggest challenge being faced by humanity this century, affecting almost all the persons irrespective of the country or the income so climate change knows no boundaries. Asians have more at stake because of two reasons one is the adverse impacts of climate change on its population and economy which is quite huge and the second is the lack of institutional capacity of these countries to deal with the problem of climate change thus making them doubly vulnerable to climate change. It is high time for all Asian economies to realise that their reluctance to move ahead on taking actions on climate change will go against them as the climate change with its far reaching consequences will disturb the very development on whose pretext they are saying no to any binding commitments for reducing carbon emissions. They should act not because of the pressure of the international community but because action goes in their favour. It should act more decisively on global commons by working on all the aspects of the economy and way of life of all the Asians like moving away from fossil fuels to low carbon economy, to design more compact and eco friendly cities, to care about forests and green areas, change in the mode of transportation to mass transit rather than private vehicles and more importantly changing the lifestyles to curtail the pressure on finite natural resources.

The main agenda of India and China have been inclusive growth but the facts and figures available clearly show that their progress is far from being inclusive. Inclusive growth recognises that economic policy and social policy cannot be treated separately so growth should include benefit sharing

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

as well as full participation in the process. Because growth without benefit sharing makes growth unjust and growth without participation prevents it from being a truly welfare and inclusive outcome.

The rapid growth of these economies disguises the true picture of these countries i.e. the rising inequalities within these countries. On one side are the rich who are moving ahead at a breakneck speed with all the comforts and luxuries at their disposal leaving behind the poor who are lacking even in the basic amenities of life such as education, water, sanitation and health services, thus giving two faces to their growth stories. One showing the magnificent towers and malls and complexes in Shanghai and Mumbai while the other showing the gloom covering the slums of these same cities. There can not be two faces if these countries have to emerge as the responsible world powers of the world. These countries should try their best to deal with economic dualism which poses a threat to the growth and development in these countries. To bridge this gap between rich and poor, between various regions within their countries, they need to focus on their economic as well as inclusive growth.

But the danger of climate change is unequivocal but its impacts will be far more visible on the poorer regions and poorer people. This will be particularly true for the least developed countries particularly the tropical and sub-tropical regions of Asia (IPCC 2001). It has the potential to undo the decades of development efforts which is already taking its toll as these countries have witnessed increase in extreme weather events and related damage and destruction. This is a kind of vicious circle. The rising development needs of these countries are dependent on use of fossil fuels based energy resources supply which in turn is leading towards contamination of air and water and increase in carbon emissions in the atmosphere thus leading to the warming of the atmosphere and climate change. This in turn is affecting the development of these countries from where the problem started. So this vicious circle is preventing any solid action from being taken in this regard.

### **Conclusion**

All these positive facts and figures about rise of Asia highlight just one side of the story. The other side of the story is really horrible, sad and full of pessimism. So in no case rise of Asia should be pre-ordained. Because its future is fraught with so many difficulties and problems like increasing competition over limited energy resources as rise of middle class brings with its rise in demands of goods and services, rising inequality leading to



## Arora

tensions and conflicts, regional disparities leading regional imbalance thus disturbing the stability of the polity and economy of the country, weak governance structure, lack of institutional capacity in almost all the countries of the region and most importantly the threat of climate change and global warming which will have tremendous adverse impacts on these economies thus in turn impacting their growth rates too.

The very energy resources which led these countries to the path of success and prosperity are creating problems like environmental pollution, loss of biodiversity etc. Focusing only on GDP in the context of rise of Asia will be a big mistake as it does not reflect the true picture. Many countries have realised the problem with adopting only GDP as the measure of progress. So efforts are being made to make it more comprehensively inclusive to include other non-monetary aspects also which are important for overall development of human beings such as education health and sustainable environment and other amenities. So the efforts should be made for the complete decentralisation of this growth i.e. it should come from below and its fruits should reach to lowest level of the hierarchy. This growth should percolate down to the ground level thus filling the huge gap which exists between haves and have-nots.

## References

- Bergsten, F.C. Freeman, C., Lardy, R. N and Mitchell, J. D. (2008). *China's Rise: Challenges and Opportunities*. Washington: Peterson Institute for International Economy.
- Bussolo, M. (2012). *Global Growth and Distribution: China, India, and The Emergence of a Global Middle Class*, *Journal of Globalisation and Development*, 2 (2); 1948-1847.
- Chin Lim, Hyun. (2007). Globalising Asia: Towards a New Development Paradigm", *Globality Studies Journal, Global History, Society and Civilisation*, .12 (9):56-71.
- Christoff, Peter. (2010). Cold Climate in Copenhagen; China and the United states at Cop 15. *Environmental Politics*, 19 (4), 635-656.
- Fiddler, David. P. (2005). The Asian century: Implications for International Law. *Singapore year book of International Law and Governance*, 9 (8),19-35
- Eichengreen, B. et al. (2010). *Emerging Giants: China and India in the World Economy*, Oxford University Press, New York.
- Fengying, C. and Jieyun, N. (2008). Asia's energy security: The Role of China and India. *Strategic Analysis*, 32(1), 1-27.
- Ganguli. S.(2014): "Strategising Energy: An Asian Perspective", *Maulana Abul Kalam Azad Institute of Asian Studies and Indian Foreign Policy Institute*, KW Publishers, New Delhi.
- Gilley, Bruce. (2011). Beyond the Four Percent Solution: Explaining the Consequences of China's Rise. *Journal of Contemporary China*, 20(72), 795-811.
- Gupta, A. (2008). Understanding The rise of Asia in The new Asian hemisphere: The Irresistible shift of Global Power to the East by Kishore Mahubabani. *Strategic Analysis*, 32(5), 913-916.

### **The Discourse of Rise of Asia: Analysing through the Lens of Climate Change Debate**

- IPCC (2001). IPCC Third Assessment Report, [https://www.ipcc.ch/publications\\_and\\_data/publications\\_and\\_data\\_reports.shtml](https://www.ipcc.ch/publications_and_data/publications_and_data_reports.shtml), (accessed on 24<sup>th</sup> July, 2013).
- Ito, K. et al. (2005). Energy Scenarios in India and China: Asian Energy Outlook Up to 2020. *Economic and Political Weekly*, 40(36), 3953-3959.
- Jaffrelot, C.; Van der Veer, P. (2008). *Patterns of Middle Class Consumption in India and China*, Centre for International Studies and Research, Utrecht University, Paris.
- Kharas, Homi (2010): *The Emerging Middle Class in Developing Countries*, Working paper no. 285, Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development.
- Kohli, H. et al. (2011): *Asia 2050: Realising the Asian century*, Asian Development Bank, Manila, Sage Publications India Private Limited, New Delhi.
- Lampton, M.D. (2008). *The Three Faces of Chinese power: Might Money and Minds*. California: University of California.
- Lavay, Peter R. (2007). India in 2006: A New Emphasis on Engagement. *Asian Survey*, 47(1), 113-124.
- Mahbubani, K. (2009). *The New Asian Hemisphere: The Irresistible Shift of Global Power to the East*. New York: Public Affairs.
- Mansingh, S (2007). Rising China and Emergent India in the 21<sup>st</sup> century: friends or rivals? *Korean Journal of Defense Analysis*, 19 (4), 117-142.
- Mistry, Dinshaw. (2004). A Theoretical and Empirical Assessment of India as an Emerging world power. *India Review*, 3 (1), 64-87.
- Moller, O. J. (2011). *How Asia can shape the world*. Singapore: Institute of Southeast Asian Studies
- Pilling, D. (2011). Hillary's Charm Offensive in China's backyard, *Columnists*. (<http://www.ft.com/cms/s/0/211105fa-b883-11e0-8206-00144feabdc0.html>)
- Roach, S. 2013. "Time to Act on Reform", *China Daily*, 21 February, p.8
- Robert, R. S. and Feng, Z. (2008). *China's Ascent: Power, Security and the future of International Politics*. USA: Cornell University Press.
- Scott, D. (2009). India's Extended Neighborhood Concept: Power Projection for a Rising Power. *India Review*, 8 (2), 107-143.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 29-48)

## **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

**Kuldeep Singh \***

*In last two decades India had experienced a trend of cancellation of recruitments. Political parties seemed to politicise employment and recruitments by influencing the recruitment processes. Making and cancellation of recruitments became a political weapon, which politicians used to benefit party supporters and subjugate others. This became a fatal tradition particularly in Haryana, which had bitterly influenced youth particularly meritorious ones.*

### **Introduction**

Employment is one of the basic needs of human beings in a modern era as it helps them to earn their living. It facilitates them to fulfil their fundamental and other necessities. Employment brings a life full of respect and dignity. A person having employment seems tension-free and delighted in comparison to an unemployed individual. Therefore, in a democracy, state plays a significant role to provide better and equal opportunities of employment to its citizens. State is expected to ensure employment by providing better education and training to youths. In this connection, state endeavours to provide employment by establishing better educational and training institutes, making government recruitments and granting financial

---

\*Lecturer (Political Science), GSSS, Chandawali, (FBD.) under Haryana Education Department. E-mail ID: dhanotarkd74@yahoo.com

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

aid like loan, subsidy etc. This paper discusses the growing trend of politicisation of recruitment making agencies and partisan influence on government jobs in India focusing Haryana in particular.

#### **Unemployment: A Burning Issue in Indian Politics**

For last few decades, it has been noticed that unemployment has become a burning issue in India and it has been hijacked by the politicians. Unemployment became a political issue, which political parties use during electoral campaign to gain political and electoral mileage. They highly toss this issue in air to garner electoral benefit, as youths collectively make a strong vote bank having a decisive role in the electoral politics. In this way, political parties and politicians politicise the recruitment process in connection of government jobs.

#### **Recruitment: A Means of Employment**

Each organisation, public or private, needs to arrange an adequate supply of qualified and able personnel to do different tasks necessary for realisation of its goals. Recruitment and selection are the methods, which make available a pool of functionaries to an organisation. Various intellectuals defined the term recruitment in their own ways. Out of them, D.E. Klinger says, "Recruitment is the process of attracting qualified applicants (job seekers) for job". In simpler sense, recruitment means "securing the right people for particular jobs, and it may take the form of advertising for large groups of employees or tracking out a highly skilled individual for special work".<sup>1</sup> In other words, recruitment and selection constitute a process which is of vital importance to the administrative system as a whole, for it determines the tone and calibre of the public services, and on it rests the usefulness and relevance of the machinery of the government to the society. Thus, the process of the recruitment and selection is the key to a strong public service. Stahl puts it as "the cornerstone of the whole public personnel structure" (Avasthi and Shriram Maheshwari, 2012).

#### **Criteria of Recruitment**

It has been the serious problem of the recruitment process that is discussed in public administration. How to make recruitments? What process should be adopted to make a sound and faultless recruitment? What criteria and qualifications should be basis of recruitment? These are complex questions faced by recruitment process and recruitment making agencies. Generally, recruitment and selection for most of the departments is based on

## Singh

two kind of qualifications-general and special. General qualifications include citizenship, domicile/residence, sex, and age. Special qualifications deal with education, technical knowledge, experience and personal traits. Hence, to assess the special qualifications for the civil services, recruitment and selection process constitute two methods-written examination/test and interview. In defense and police services, physical test is also conducted. Here, it is necessary to see that the criteria of recruitment should not only be fare but also reliable and merit based. Any method that compromises merit should be prevented as early as possible. For a long, recruitment processes in Haryana have been doubtful, yet the government neither learnt any lesson nor took any concrete step to avert faulty recruitments.

### **Genesis of Merit-based Recruitment and Selection Policy**

Throughout the world, recruitment and selection system differed from country to country. In past, most of the societies had faulty and biased recruitment policies based on patronage and heredity. The need for a sound recruitment and selection policy was first realised by China centuries ago, and this recognition found reflection in adoption of merit principle, based on competitive examinations. In modern times, Prussia was the first country to have evolved a sound recruitment system. It was 1847, when competitive examination based on merit began in France. Britain adopted merit based recruitment system in 1857. U.S.A, which had the spoils system, introduced merit in 1883. The merit principle replaced the spoils system through Civil Service Act of 1883. This Act also called the Pendleton Act set up the Civil Service Commission in U.S.A. for the first time. This development occurred immediately after the assassination of President Garfield by a disappointed job seeker.

As far as India is concerned, in past, Indian administrative apparatus was based on patronage and heredity in nature. The merit principle was provoked by British East India Company regime through the Charter Act of 1853. The Charter Act wound up the long-standing practice of patronage and revolutionised the system of recruitment of the Civil Servants by introducing the system of open competition for the purpose. A Civil Services Commission was created in 1854 to hold the first open competitive examination in London for the recruitment of civil servants within a framework of norms relating to age, qualification, syllabus of examination, and so on (Chakrabarty and Pandey, 2012). Hence, it is needful to have a healthy and impartial system of recruitment and selection so that competent, meritorious, unbiased or impartial and dedicated personnel can be

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

appointed. An unsound recruitment and selection policy causes a permanent weakness upon the administration and it becomes a heaven for the dull and the incompetent. Thus, the need for a sound recruitment policy has been stressed upon from time to time and it is still needed. Report of the Commission of Inquiry on Public Service Personnel appointed by the Social Science Research Council of the U.S.A. focused that no element of the service is more important than the recruitment policy. Pfiffner and Presthus observed, "Personnel recruitment for the second half of the twentieth century will have to be geared to a nuclear physical world in which the solutions of human problems will demand the utmost in human competence. The emphasis will be not only on finding, but on building men who are capable of performing the complex tasks of coordinating institutions growing ever more complex. Clearly, in such a world, emphasis will fall not so much upon keeping the rascals out but on how to induce the best to serve the state and how to assess their abilities to ensure that each will be placed where he belongs".<sup>2</sup>

#### **Politicisation of Recruitment Making Agencies**

Article 315 of the Constitution of India lays down that there shall be a Public Service Commission for the Union and a Public Service Commission for each state. The Public Service Commissions are envisaged as independent constitutional institutions not subject to governmental or political interference or control and charged with the responsibility of recruitment and management of public services (Kashyap, 2010). But it is unfortunate to see that the constitutional agencies (State Public Service Commissions) and other recruitment making agencies seemed not to perform their duties in a fair and unbiased way. They seemed to function under governmental or political interference or control. In the states like Haryana, Punjab, Uttar Pradesh, Bihar etc., a fatal trend of politicisation of recruitment-making agencies and recruitment processes emerged alarmingly. State governments politicised recruitment making agencies by appointing loyal persons as members and chair-person of these agencies. Recruitment making agencies like Punjab Civil Service Commission, Haryana Public Service Commission (HPSC), and Staff Selection Commission (S.S.C.) etc. were politicised by the ruling parties with a view to influence the process of recruitments and promotions. By doing so, the Chief Ministers tried to fulfill their motive, which was to pack the government machinery (Bureaucracy) with their own supporters. Randeep Singh Surjewala's complaint to the Election Commission that the state government

### **Singh**

was finalising lists of recruitments through Haryana Public Service Commission and Haryana Staff Selection Commission and that orders for the appointments were likely to be issued backdated threw some light on misusing of government machinery in connection with recruitments by politicians of Haryana.

Recently, an Honourable Justice of the Supreme Court of India, Singhvi had demonstrated his grouse over politicisation of recruitment making agencies. According to Justice Singhvi, State Public Service Commissions that make recruitment of runners of administration, turned into the fiefdoms of the Chief Ministers, where tainted persons have been made chair-person and members. Addressing an all India seminar of CAT (Central Administrative Tribunal), Justice Singhvi had said that matters one by one were coming in this regard. These included the states like Punjab, Haryana, Rajasthan, Bihar, Maharashtra etc., where the chair-persons had been charged with serious allegations. He had emphasised on developing an internal machinery to escape of the flood like situation concerning matters of jobs. Union Law Minister, Virappa Moilli, present in seminar, insisted upon reforms in functioning of CAT and state tribunals. He had stated that video conferencing should be started to prevent delay in disposal of petitions.<sup>3</sup>

### **Government Recruitments and Politics**

Political parties made wholehearted efforts to influence youths promising employment for them. Welfare of youths by providing government jobs was one of the dominant issues during the election campaigns. Political parties and politicians have seemed to be indulged in blame game regarding irregularities and scams in government recruitments. The remark of the Supreme Court that the Chief Minister need not see the record and he has to do what is told, is enough to assess the role of the politicians particularly the Chief Ministers regarding the irregularities in the recruitments in Haryana. This statement of the Apex Court came on July 17, 2007 during the hearing of the petition of Patwaris for Bhajan Lal, who was the Chief Minister of Haryana when 1248 Patwaris were recruited. The allegations by the politicians against each other revealed much more about the degeneration of politics and politicians of Haryana in connection with government recruitments. Randeep Singh Surjewala, in his complaint to the Election Commission had alleged that the state government was finalising lists of recruitments through Haryana Public Service Commission and Haryana Staff Selection Commission and that orders for the appointments were likely to be issued backdated. He said the state exchequer's money was

### Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study

being squandered away by the ruling party through the populist announcements of the Chautala regime.<sup>4</sup> Bhartiya Janata Party's former state president, Rattan Lal Kataria, had aired similar apprehensions saying that the party would approach the Election Commission with a formal complaint if the government did any wrong after the imposition of the model code of conduct.<sup>5</sup> Bhajan Lal, then Haryana Congress president, while welcoming the announcement of the polls had said that it was a welcome step. "People want Chautala out. He has been making senseless announcements and desperate moves to stick to power. All that should come to an end now," he said.<sup>6</sup>

Congress MP from Karnal Lok Sabha constituency, Arvind Sharma, accused Bhupinder Singh Hooda-led Government of doing discrimination in government recruitments on the regional basis. He alleged in a public meeting, "*Naukriyon maen bhi bhedbhao ho raha hai. Mukhyamantri apne chahete vidhayakon ko pulis va anya bhartiyaon maen 200-200 ka kota de rahe hain jabki anyon ko 5-5 seeton ke liye bhi tarsaya ja raha hai. Haryana pulis ki do hazar bhartiyaon maen se Karnal sansadiya kshetra ke nau vidhan Sabha kshetron maen se kul 28 yuvak liye gaye hain aur yah bhedbhao ka muh bolta praman hai*".<sup>7</sup> It meant that discrimination was being made in government services. Chief Minister was offering quota of 200 seats each to his closest MLAs in recruitments of police and others, while, others (MLAs & MPs) were being denied for five seats each too. In 2000 recruits of Haryana Police, only 28 candidates had been appointed from nine legislative constituencies of Karnal Parliamentary Constituency, which was an example of discrimination.

Alleging of the irregularities in the recruitment of HCS (civil) in 2002, Karan Singh Dalal, a Congress leader, also had filed a petition in the High Court. According to his advocates, nepotism based favour was given preference in the recruitment process.<sup>8</sup> Dr. K.C. Bangad, former Chairman of HPSC, was alleged of making frauds in recruitment of HCS and claimed that he was ready to be punished till the life if charges slapped by Karan Dalal proved. He challenged Karan Dalal for making CBI investigation in this regard. He asked Karan Dalal not to disturb his family by targeting him due to jealousy. He also rejected the allegations that his son-in-law was given marks for five questions while he answered only four. He accused Karan Dalal of tempering records. According to Bangad, all allegations were baseless and put due to political reasons. He argued that undoubtedly, O. P. Chautala was Chief Minister but Karan Singh Dalal was also Cabinet Minister and six of nine members of HPSC were appointed on recommendations of Congress-led governments. Thus, there was no



## Singh

question of pressure from Chautala government on the members. He emphatically said that Karan Dalal, who was demanding an apology from O.P. Chautala, should say sorry for his inferior politics.<sup>9</sup>

Recently, some influential leaders like Rao Inderjeet Singh, Chaudhary Birender Singh, Vinod Sharma etc. have quit Congress in Haryana alleging Bhupinder Singh Hooda led Congress government of regional favourism or bias and corruptions in public recruitments.

### **Recruitments, Irregularities and Political Influence**

The recruitments had been made to reap political benefit and for this purpose, the politicians had not cared about norms and principles. Irregularities in government recruitments became simple things for the recruitment makers. Several court cases and decisions regarding recruitments proved political influence and interference in public recruitments. For illustration, Bhajan Lal government recruited 2395 candidates on the post of Patwari in spite of 1248 advertised vacancies in August 1994.<sup>10</sup> However, the government finally corrected its mistake recruiting 1248 Patwaris. This recruitment germinated controversies and consequently it was challenged in the Punjab and Haryana High Court. This case is known as Sh. Rajpal Vs. State of Haryana. In the petition, the charges were irregularities based on regionalism, nepotism, corruption, etc. The petitioners claimed to have a CD (Compact Disc), in which Bhajan Lal had been announcing that he, if came into power, would recruit Patwari from every household of Adampur, his constituency in Hissar district of Haryana. However, the announcement of Bhajan Lal was totally a political stunt made during election campaign to woo the voters but it became a big problem for the recruited Patwaris. Based on that CD, the Hon'ble High Court of Punjab and Haryana had cancelled the recruitment through a judgment on February 02, 2005.

The same government of Bhajan Lal made a recruitment of 1500 Police constables without making advertisement in any newspaper in the same year. It resulted into a blunder. The petitions were filed in the Punjab and Haryana High Court against these recruitments. It seemed clear that Bhajan Lal government misused its powers to gain political mileage through these recruitments. He wanted to widen his support base and ensure the votes in his favour in the next election. On the other hand, opposition parties mainly Indian National Lok Dal led by Om Prakash Chautala made political issue out of it. His target also was the coming election. If it was not, he had

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

not made some recruitment just before few months of the assembly elections scheduled to be held in 2005.

In the next election, the government changed and Late Bansi Lal's Haryana Vikas Party came into power. However, he did nothing about the recruitments made by his rival Bhajan Lal government. The recruited Patwaris and Police Constables continued their services to the state. On the other hand, during regime of Om Prakash Chautala, the Punjab and Haryana High Court dismissed 1500 Constables recruited by Bhajan Lal government, on the charge of fake recruitment in 1999 because this recruitment was made without making advertisements in the newspapers. In this way, the recruited constables had to face the termination after doing the service of the state for four years. They were punished but the wrongdoers or violators of law/norms were not touched.

In 1999, Bansi Lal made a recruitment of 1056 candidates on the post of the Patwari. For this post, HSSC demanded applications in 1997 under category number 01 of the advertisement number 4/97 and conducted a written test on November 29, 1998.<sup>11</sup> About 3200 (three times of the advertised posts as according to the instructions given by the Supreme Court of India) candidates were declared passed in the test. The eligible candidates were called for interviews. Interviews were held in April 1999. It was May 22, 1999 when the final-result for the post of Patwaris was declared and published in the various newspapers like Dainik Jagran dated May 29, 1999. The selection criterion was based on written test comprising 200 marks and interview pertaining 25 marks. The candidates securing 165 or above marks out of 225 marks were selected in the General category. Candidates securing 161 or above marks were selected in BC-A and BC-B categories. In the category of SC-A those candidates were selected who scored 149 or above marks. The selected candidates of SC-B scored 160 or more than it.<sup>12</sup>

The Haryana Staff Selection Commission requested unsuccessful candidates, if they were not satisfied with the result, to get information about their performance. Such candidates were asked to deposit the prescribed fee of Rs. 20 for the purpose.<sup>13</sup> This showed that the Haryana Staff Selection Commission made all necessary steps and formalities regarding the recruitment. However, some unsuccessful candidates challenged this recruitment and a petition was filed in the Punjab and Haryana High Court. The charges were regionalism, nepotism and corruption as about one-fourth of candidates recruited were from Bhiwani, constituency of the then Chief Minister, Bansi Lal.

### Singh

The same government recruited 414 candidates on the post of the Gram Sachiva in the same year. Before making final selection list, Haryana Staff Selection Commission (HSSC) went through all necessary procedures. It solicited applications from the eligible candidates by placing advertisements in various News Papers like *The Tribune* dated February 22, 1997. Later on, HSSC called the eligible candidates for the written test conducted on February 07, 1999. The result of the written test was declared and published in various newspapers on June 06, 1999. About 1250 candidates succeeded in the written test were called for interview. The interview process held from June 21, 1999. The result based on the written test and interview was published in the various newspapers on August 10, 1999 and displayed on the notice board of the HSSC. According to the result, 414 (219 from General, 44 from BC, 63 from ESM, 88 from SC categories respectively) candidates were finally selected on the post of the Gram Sachiva.<sup>14</sup> The Haryana Staff Selection Commission (HSSC) had asked the unsuccessful candidates, if interested, to get information of their performance by depositing a fee of Rs. 20 in the treasury of Haryana government.<sup>15</sup>

Selection was based on the marks secured in both written test and interview. The candidates securing minimum 157 marks out of 225 (200 in written test + 25 in interview) in written test and interview were declared selected in the general category. In backward category, those candidates were selected who scored 153 marks or more. For the ESM category candidates securing 127 marks or above were selected. As far as SC category was concerned, the candidates who scored minimum 147 marks were selected. It is necessary to reveal here that three candidates from SC (Scheduled Caste) category were selected against the general category.<sup>16</sup> In between, Bansi Lal government collapsed due to withdrawal of support by Bhartiya Janata Party. In addition, next government led by Om Prakash Chautala came into existence. This government proved a curse for the recruited as it did not executed the recruitments made by Bansi Lal government. Om Prakash Chautala dissolved the Haryana Staff Selection Commission (HSSC). Chautala government abolished the vacant posts of Patwaris merging and reducing the circles from three to two. The government led by Chautala called off the *chungi* (Octroi) department and adjusted its personnel on the posts of Gram-Sachivas. Possibly, it was done with the intention to make the recruitments made by Bansi Lal government meaningless. Change of the government sealed the future of the selected

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

Gram-Sachivas and Patwaris particularly those who were really recruited on the merit basis.

Government led by Bhupinder Singh Hooda had also cancelled the recruitment of about 1000 Police Constables recruited by Chautala government. It was done on the basis that the recruitment was made just before the Assembly Elections of 2005. However, Hooda government too was not spared of allegations of irregularities in connection with recruitments. Hooda government made a recruitment of 3700 Police Constables and Head Constables in the state. Like other recruitments, this one too faced charges of irregularities and favourism particularly based on region. The petition against the recruitments of the zones of Karnal/Panipat has been filed in the Punjab and Haryana High Court.<sup>17</sup>

The Bench of Justice Ashutosh Mohanta and Justice TPS Maan have issued notices to the Government of Haryana led by Bhupinder Singh Hooda, D.G.P. of Haryana and Chairman of the Board present their response on October 4, 2007. The charges in the petition are that the candidates belonging to the region of Chief Minister, Bhupinder Singh Hooda are preferred in recruitment of Panipat and Karnal zone. The petition filed by Kamal Rajput of Madhuban, Karnal reveals that there are irregularities in 181 recruitments of Karnal/Panipat zone. The candidates from Rohtak and Jhajjar were recruited against the Karnal/Panipat zone.<sup>18</sup> The petitioner claimed that the candidates belonging to the region of Chief Minister were preferred due to political influence. The petitioner had demanded that the recruitments of Karnal and Panipat zone should be cancelled and re-recruitment should be made so that the able candidates of the zone may be recruited.<sup>19</sup> This latest episode shows that the political game in the recruitments is still continuing and does not seem to end. Irregularity in recruitments was one of the big issues during the assembly elections of 2005 and it played crucial part in influencing the outcome of elections. The charges of corruption, nepotism and irregularities in the recruitments became instrumental in the erosion of Indian National Lok Dal's support base (Singh and Malik, 2006). It led the elections out of reach of ruling party, INLD and it had to face huge defeat in electoral arena.

Bhupinder Singh Hooda government, after coming into power, announced cancellation of Haryana Industrial Security Force Act, 2003, which was set up by Om Prakash Chautala. It led to the cancellation of 69 Sub Inspectors who were on training at that time. On August 7, SSC issued an advertisement of 80 posts of SI in Haryana Police, RRB, and Industrial Security Force. SSC conducted an examination on 19 September and declared

### Singh

result on 17 December. Up to 19 December, joining letters had been issued to 69 candidates. During that period, Election Commission imposed election Code of Conduct on 17 December in the state.

With issuing of joining letters, all candidates were sent for the training from January 3, 2005 by the government. However, Hooda Government ordered to remove all those SIs on July 5, 2005. Hooda government backed its decision arguing that the Assembly had dismissed Haryana Industrial Security Force Act and the recruitment of those SIs had been made in an improper way. A petitioner challenged the decision of Hooda government and argued that it was not clear at anywhere in the advertisement and during the selection that they were selected for the post of SIs of Industrial Security Force. According to them, advertisement was made for SIs, Haryana Police. Justice Ajay Tiwari of High Court dismissed the petition of removed SIs on February 3, 2009. The 43 SIs filed again a petition in the High Court against the decision of the Single Bench. On September 1, 2009, the Bench of Justice Adarsh Kumar Goyal and Justice Daya Chaudhary of High Court ordered in favour of the petitioners clearly stating that the duty of the all SIs would be counted from then when they were removed.<sup>20</sup>

The recruitment of HCS (Executive Branch) made in 2002, was also challenged in the Punjab and Haryana High Court with charges of irregularities, nepotism, corruption etc. P. Raghvendra, Principal Secretary, Political and Services Department of Haryana Government admitted irregularities and misconduct in the recruitment of HCS (Executive Branch) made in 2002 and submitted an affidavit in the Punjab and Haryana High Court in this regard disclosing that the HPSC did not conduct examination for the HCS (Executive Branch) impartially and transparently. He said in the affidavit that the State Vigilance Bureau had registered case against K.C. Bangad, then Chairman of HPSC, former Chief Minister O.P. Chautala, and others.

According to him, the Commission was not providing answer sheets of candidates called for interview in 2001, 2002 and 2003 after qualifying the written examination. HPSC has agreed to provide all those answer sheets. P. Raghvendra told the court that the State Vigilance Bureau had issued notices to 101 candidates whose answer sheets have been tampered with many discrepancies like increasing marks, overwriting, no signature of the examiner, etc. P. Raghvendra told that it has been found in the investigation that some candidates having low marks in the written examination were given high marks in the interview for selection. Instead, the low marks were

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

given to the candidates who obtained high marks in written examination. The State Vigilance Bureau has also demanded the High court to investigate the 78 answer sheets kept in the record room.<sup>21</sup>

Another instance of irregularities in HCS recruitments came in light, when Shailendra Singh R/O Panchkula filed an affidavit in connection with 65 HCS officers' recruitment made by HPSC in 2002. According to Shailendra Singh, he had obtained 565 marks in comparison with Ranjit Kaur who scored 493 marks in written examination. But he was not selected as he was given 17 marks in interview while Ranjit Kaur was given 90 marks in interview as she was wife of an Additional Session Judge, Ram Singh of Karnal and her brother was related to an IAS officer, Dr. Harbhakhsha Singh. 90 marks of interview led Ranjit Kaur's total to 583 against his (Shailendra Singh's) total score of 582 and she was selected due to difference of one mark between the petitioner's and her scores. He had been rejected. He further said in same affidavit that irregularities and frauds were made in those recruitments and able candidates should have been selected after making an investigation.<sup>22</sup>

In addition, politics was played in case of promotions also. Haryana and Punjab High Court issued an order to the Hooda government, questioning, what was the status of vacant posts of the HCS cadre, when some officers were promoted to the HCS post by Om Prakash Chautala government, to present an affidavit till 18<sup>th</sup> August, 2009 in this connection. High Court had given the order during the hearing on the argument of the government that there was no vacancy of HCS cadre when that promotion was made. Om Prakash Chautala government had promoted Devi Lal Sihag and other 19 on the post of HCS in 2004. However, the government of Bhupinder Singh Hooda just after coming into power had issued orders to demote the promoted officers. That move of Bhupinder Singh Hooda government was challenged by the affected officers in the Hon'ble High Court.<sup>23</sup>

The case in which the Hon'ble Supreme Court decided to remove Haryana Public Service Commission's chairman and members, seemed sufficient to prove that the HPSC had made irregularities as far as the government recruitments were concerned. Hon'ble Supreme Court had signalled green to remove Mehar Singh Saini, Chairman of HPSC and its members, Mrs. Santosh Singh and Ram Kumar Kashyap. The Court admitted, in answer to the reference sent by the President of India that charges of misuse of the posts had proved and it would be justiciable to dismiss them. Trio office-bearers had been suspended since August, 2008.

## **Singh**

Saini and Santosh Singh were appointed on December 1, 2004, whereas Ram Kumar Kashyap was appointed on December 15, 2004. Bhupinder Singh Hooda led Haryana government had requested the President of India for their removal charging them of abuse of post and irregularities in recruitment. As under the certain procedure, the President of India had sent a reference for investigation to the Apex Court. A Bench of Chief Justice, HS Kapadiya, Justice KS Radhakrishnan and Justice Swatantra Kumar had agreed with the recommendation of the President of India to remove trio officers in the perspective of charges laid against them. Hon'ble Supreme Court had emphatically said that the role of state Public Service Commission is significant. Its impartiality and honesty is obligatory for providing opportunity of job to all the citizens without favouritism.<sup>24</sup>

### **Recruitments and Role of Judiciary**

Issue of recruitments had been highly politicised in Haryana during the last one and half a decade. The opposition parties used to ask their supporters to file petitions against recruitments. It is difficult to find even a single recruitment in Haryana that was not challenged in the court since 1990s. There were several cases of recruitments, which went to the Hon'ble High Court and only recruited not recruitment makers, were punished. For example, the Hon'ble Punjab and Haryana High Court, on February 2, 2005, ordered to terminate the services of 1248 Patwaris recruited by the Bhajan Lal Government in August 1994.<sup>25</sup> In the same decision, the High Court had given time of two years till July 31, 2007, to the state government to make fresh recruitment for the said posts. The Hon'ble High Court in the same decision cancelled the recruitment of 1056 Patwaris made by Bansi Lal Government in May 1999.

The Hon'ble High Court favoured the petitioners and punished all the recruited persons in its decision of February 2, 2005. The decision of the High Court was mainly based on a CD presented by the petitioners. In CD, Bhajan Lal had been shown announcing, during an election rally, to appoint persons on the post of Patwari from every household of Adampur. The petitioners had claimed that about half of the recruited candidates belonged to the constituencies of Bhajan Lal and his son Chander Mohan, Adampur and Kalka respectively.

Then, 1248 Patwaris moved to the Supreme Court of India with the hope that the Apex Court would give them relief from the unnecessary tension. The Supreme Court hearing the case on July 17, 2007, had ordered Haryana Sub-ordinate Staff Selection Board to present complete record of the

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

recruitment of Patwaris on July 31, 2007. The Court became angry when the state government disclosed that it was not possible to present the record because the High Court also had demanded the concerned record but it was not presented to it due to burning of the record. The Apex Court admitted it as a very sensitive case indeed, and asked how the record was burnt out whereas, there was a dispute regarding the recruitment.<sup>26</sup> The affected Patwaris were in the Supreme Court with the hope that they would get relief and justice from the highest temple of the justice, which the Supreme Court had given them during the hearing on July 31, 2007 and August 1, 2007 reserving its decision and ordering stay on the termination of the services of the Patwaris. The Apex Court gave indications to send the case back to the Punjab and Haryana High Court to review it.

On February 2, 2005, the Hon'ble High Court of Punjab and Haryana had cancelled the recruitment of 1056 Patwaris made by Bansi Lal government in May 1999. However, politics was not done on the issue of written test. No political party and politician came to appreciate the move of the Chief Minister. The candidates who achieved success in the written test were called for interviews. After the process of interviews, the result was declared. As the result came, politics started to take precedence. It brought disappointment to the unsuccessful candidates and they decided to file a petition in Punjab and Haryana High Court against the recruitment. On the other hand, the Hon'ble High Court had decided on the petition known as Davinder Singh and others Vs. State of Haryana<sup>27</sup> on January 31, 2007 in favour of the petitioners (Gram-Sachivas) recruited by the same government of Bansi Lal in the same year. The Hon'ble High Court was satisfied with recruitment of Gram-Sachivas while, the Hon'ble High Court had cancelled the recruitment of 1056 Patwaris made by the same government of Bansi Lal, which made the recruitment of Gram-Sachivas with same procedure in the same year.

On January 22, 2012, Delhi's Rohini Court based special C.B.I. Court accepted irregularities in the recruitment of 3206 JBT teachers appointed by O.P. Chautala led government in Haryana in 2000. Hon'ble Court held 44 persons including O.P. Chautala and Ajay Chautala (son of former) guilty and awarded rigorous punishment to them.<sup>28</sup> Recently, on September 30, 2013, double bench of Punjab and Haryana high court backed the decision of single bench of the same court in case of recruitment of 1983 P.T.Is. Bench of Justice Suryakant and Justice Surendra Gupta said in their decision that we are fully agreed with the grounds on which the single bench had cancelled that recruitment. Study of the record proves fraudulent in the recruitment.



## Singh

Raising questions on hurry in checking of documents and selection of over aged candidates, court warned the government of being alert in future. Court also fined the HSSC with Rs. 50,000 and government, and alleging candidates Rs. 10,000 each on every appeal.<sup>29</sup> Yet, some cases of fraudulent in recruitments out of which 65 HCS officers' recruitment made by HPSC in 2002 is significant, have to be decided by courts. The following table sheds light on some public recruitments that have been controversial and challenged in the courts.

**Table 1**  
**Some of the Faulty/Challenged Recruitments**  
**during last 20 years in Haryana**

Name of Post	No. of Vacancies	Year	During Regime of	Status
Patwari	1248	1994	Bhajan Lal	Proved faulty in High Court
Police Constables	1500	1994	Bhajan Lal	Proved faulty in High Court
Gram Sachiv	414	1999	Bansi Lal	Proved Unfaulty by High Court
J.B.T. Teachers	3206	2000	O.P. Chautala	Proved faulty in High Court
H.C.S. (Exe. Br.)	65	2002	O.P. Chautala	Under consideration in Sup. Court
H.C.S. (Exe.Br.) Nominated	20	2004	O.P. Chautala	Under consideration in High Court
G.R.P.	350	2004	O.P. Chautala	Under consideration in High Court
S.Is. (ISF)	80	2004-05	O.P. Chautala	-
Police Constables	1000	2004-05	O.P. Chautala	Cancelled by Hooda govt
Police Constables	3700	2007	B.S. Hooda	Challenged in High Court
P.T.I.	1983	2010	B.S. Hooda	Proved faulty in High Court
J.B.T. Teachers	9700	2012	B.S. Hooda	Under consideration
Guest Teachers	14000	-	O.P. Chautala	Under consideration
Lecturers (Sch. cadre)	-	2012	B.S. Hooda	Under consideration
PGT (Hindi)	-	2014	B.S. Hooda	Under consideration

Source: Table created by author compiling data from various sources.

### **Cancellation of Recruitments and its Impact**

The last few years witnessed the cancellation of recruitments, which highly influenced youths. It seems that this was done only to influence the elections in their own favour. This negative attitude of the politicians of Haryana towards unemployed youths had badly affected them. The recruited people, if recruited by the opposition party led government, became enemy in the sight of the opposition parties and they through their agents made all efforts to get the recruitment cancelled at any cost. Politicians of Haryana seemed extremely careless and irresponsible to play

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

with the future of youths, as far as government recruitments were concerned. Shift in the government caused shift in the future of the recruited persons. Governments after coming in power cancelled the selection of the candidates made by previous government led by opposition party/parties and did not appoint them. After recruitment too, the recruited ones were not sure about their career and future. At several times, the recruited had to face termination either by government or by judiciary particularly, by the Hon'ble High Court. One can notice cancellation of recruitments like Patwaris and Police Constables recruited in 1994, Line Men, Patwaris and Gram Sachivas in 1999, and recruitment of JBT teachers, etc. It shows that making faulty recruitments and canceling them became a culture in Haryana.

It was observed that politicians of the state played politics making announcements to recruit the affected youths. For instance, O.P. Chautala opposed the recruitments of 1500 Police Constables recruited by Bhajan Lal government in 1994. Congress leaders made full efforts to take political mileage out of it and used to make promise to recruit them if voted to power. It was another form of politicisation of government recruitments. Announcements of making recruitments were made for political reasons at public meetings, which immensely affected youths of the state and elections.

It seemed that the politicians generally considered the recruited ones as voters of the previous government, which recruited them. It seemed that the cancellation of recruitments was the medium of not only appeasing its own voters but also making money. For example, O.P. Chautala Government refused to issue appointment letters to the Patwaris (Land Recorder) and Gram Sachivas (Panchayat Secretaries at village level) recruited by Bansi Lal Government in 1999. The career and future of the youths became uncertain due to such activities of the politicians. There will be no exaggeration in stating that in Haryana, most of the political parties belonged to the same boat in connection with the recruitments. No party seemed serious in discussing this issue of youths and merely did politics on this issue.

#### **Interview: The Root of Faulty Recruitments**

Written test and interview have been basis of recruitment to evaluate the ability of the public servants. But in Haryana, during last few years, written test had not been given weightage and recruitments were made on interview basis. The candidates who scored more marks in written test were rejected in interview giving them less marks. It has been observed that two candidates scored 565 and 493 marks respectively in written examination.

### Singh

But former was not selected as he was given 17 marks in interview while latter was given 90 marks. 90 marks of interview led latter's total to 583 against former's total score of 582 and ultimately, latter was selected due to difference of one mark. In several recruitments, written test was conducted only for screening the candidates, which meant that a candidate scoring 80 per cent or more marks in written test was equally eligible with 50 per cent marks holder to face interview that will decide their final selection. Here, both the candidates have equal chance of selection, whereas written test showed that 80 per cent marks holder was much able than the later. It has been observed that in interview, 50 per cent marks holder was selected and 80 per cent marks holder was rejected. It shows that interview has been the real cause of fraud in public recruitments. Interview based recruitments have been faulty as these were based on political interference, partiality, favouritism, bribe etc. Decisions of Hon'ble Courts also have proved it that many of the recruitments were defective. Interview based recruitments seemed to crush merit.

Another type of case regarding interview has been that the recruitment making agencies adopted different criteria and regularly changed the marks of interview as according to their convenience. It was done to beneficiate the specific candidates. Neither recruitment making agencies nor the government willingly seemed serious to take a concrete step to check irregularities in the recruitments for public posts. They did not determine a reliable and merit searching method to recruit the most able ones. Recently Haryana School Teachers Selection Board (HSTSB) adopted a criterion of 100 marks for recruitment of PGT (Hindi) for which it called application forms in June 2012. Out of 100 marks, 67 marks were of educational qualification and 33 marks of interview. Nirmala Devi and others have filed a petition against the criteria adopted by HSTSB. According to the petitioners, HSTSB has violated the ruling of the Hon'ble Supreme Court which ordered on May 10, 1985 in case of Ashok Vs. Haryana Government that the marks of interview should not be more than 12.2 in the criterion of 100 marks. Despite this ruling, recruitment making agencies and Governments are giving more preference to interview than written test and educational ability. Such moves of the government give emergence to controversies regarding recruitments. This is why many intellectuals are echoing their voices against interview process and demanding to curb the role of interview in public recruitments. Some politicians and political parties are looking forward to take the political mileage by making interview an issue in the coming elections for Haryana Legislative Assembly.

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

According to Vinod Sharma of newly constructed party, Haryana Janachetna Party, there has been full possibility of fraudulence in interview during recruitments. Less deserving persons get recruited. Anil Vij of BJP is of opinion that after formation of BJP Government in Haryana, Gujarat system of recruitment shall be implemented. Smashing interview system, a merit list of every aspirant will be prepared on the basis of academic qualification.<sup>30</sup>

#### **Concluding Remarks**

The elaborate discussion is indicative of the fact that recruitment-making agencies seemed to be highly politicised in last decades. The reliable and loyal ones have been appointed as chairperson and members of these agencies and this all provoked irregularities in recruitments for public services. The allegations of politicians showed that there had been a quota system in the recruitments for the affluent party workers, ex-officials, MLAs, Ministers, and the Chief Ministers. They used recruitments as a medium of making money and expanding their political support base. The near and dear ones of the Chief Ministers and other key ministers were in beneficial positions as they got more seats in the recruitments. Comments of the dissident leaders of the ruling parties, politicians of different political parties and decisions of Hon'ble Punjab and Haryana High Court clearly show that irregularities were done in recruitments just for gaining political benefit by giving preference to the job seekers of particular regions or districts. However, it was interesting to see that such type of comments came from the politicians when they and their parties were not in power. When they came into power, they forgot everything and indulged in the same business. It showed double standards of the politicians. They made errors and breached norms for political reasons repeatedly but did not face any punishment. On the other hand, the innocent and unemployed youths had to pay for this dirty politics of the politicians. Based on the decision of the Hon'ble Punjab and Haryana High Court, it can be said that recruitments were biased and politically motivated. Moral downfall of State Public Service Commissions that had become the fiefdom of the Chief Ministers, according to Justice Singhvi of the Hon'ble Apex Court is not a healthy sign for meritorious ones and our democratic system as well.

The recruiters did not improve themselves, though the court had reversed their recruitments at several times. The reason for this is that they did not face punishment in many cases. At many times, the recruiters who made irregularities and frauds in recruitments escaped. But recent judgment of Rohini based C.B.I. Court, in which O.P. Chautala, former Chief Minister

## Singh

of Haryana with 44 other persons have been sentenced for 10 years imprisonment, is an eye opener and possibly, it will discourage the faulty recruitments in future.

There is a grave need to stop such fatal trend by making strong laws to curb culprits responsible for making irregularities in Government recruitments. Political interference in recruitment and selection should be discouraged. The criteria for selection should be of high standard and transparent so that the partiality or favouritism and corrupt attitude of the selectors and recruiters may be stopped. Interview that seems root cause of irregularities should come to an end or should be given minimum role in recruitment process. What is, therefore, needed is an effort to attract the qualified persons and the men of vision and ability towards the public services. In brief, recruitment policies and processes should be positive and designed to attract the best and competent and to keep the undeserving out. Merit, reliability and justification are basic standards in recruitment process of public services and maintaining these in all conditions is a bigger liability of the government.

### Notes

1. Marshall E. Dimock, *Public Administration*, p. 145.
2. Pfiffner & Presthus, *Public Administration*.
3. *Hindustan Times*, December, 12 2010.
4. *thetribune.com*
5. *thetribune.com*
6. *thetribune.com*
7. Vijay Sharma/Hamare Pratinidhi, "Arvind ne ki Hooda ke khilaf bagavat", *The Tribune*, New Delhi, September 15, 2008.
8. Chd. Jagran Samvaddata, 2009. "HCS padavanat mamle maen Sarkar se halfanama manga", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 11 August.
9. Ramesh Handa, 2008. "Aarop Sahi Hon To Saza Bhugatne Ko Taiyar: Bangad", Chandigarh, *Dainik Jagran*, February 20.
10. *Amar Ujala*, 2007. "Bhajan Lal par supreme court ki teekhi tippani", July 19.
11. Haryana karamchari Chayan Ayog, 1999. S.C.O. No. 80-81, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, May 29.
12. Haryana karamchari Chayan Ayog, 1999. S.C.O. No. 80-81, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, May 29.
13. Haryana karamchari Chayan Ayog, 1999. S.C.O. No. 80-81, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, May 29.
14. *Haryana karamchari Chayan Ayog*, 1999. S.C.O. No. 114-115, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, August 09.
15. *Haryana karamchari Chayan Ayog*, 1999. S.C.O. No. 114-115, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, August 09.

### **Employment, Government Recruitments and Politics: A Study**

16. *Haryana karamchhari Chayan Ayog*, 1999. S.C.O. No. 114-115, Chandigarh, Parinam, *Dainik Jagran*, August 09.
17. Vidhi Sanwaddata, 2007. "Sarkar Samet DGP va Bharati Chairman ko Notis", *Dainik Jagran*, July 20.
18. Vidhi Sanwaddata, 2007. "Sarkar Samet DGP va Bharati Chairman ko Notis", *Dainik Jagran*, July 20.
19. Vidhi Sanwaddata, 2007. "Sarkar Samet DGP va Bharati Chairman ko Notis", *Dainik Jagran*, July 20.
20. Daya Nand Sharma, 2009. "Hooda Sarkar ko Jhhataka", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, September 2.
21. Chd. Jagran Samvaddata, 2009. "Sarkar ne mana, HCS bharati maen ki gai dhandhali", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 29 July.
22. Chd. Vidhi Sanwaddata, 2008. "Ek Aur Ummidvar ne Uthaya Chayan Prakriya Par Sawal", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 12 February.
23. Chd. Jagran Samvaddata, 2009. "HCS padavanat mamle maen Sarkar se halfanama manga", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 11 August.
24. Jagran Bureau, 2010. "HPSC ke dagi Adhyaksha aur Sdasyon ko hatane ka rasta saaf", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 13 November.
25. *Amar Ujala*, op cit.
26. *Amar Ujala*, op cit.
27. *Order*, 2007. Hon'ble High Court of Punjab and Haryana, January 31.
28. Jagran Samvaddata, 2013. "Chautala Par Bhari Para Ghotala", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 17 January.
29. Jagran Samvaddata, 2013. "Pradesh Mae 1983 P.T.I. Ki Niyukti Rada", *Dainik Jagran*, New Delhi, 1 October.
30. Rajya Bureau, Chd., "sarkari naukriyon maen interview bana bada mudda", *Dainik Jagran*, September, 8 2014.

### **References**

- Avasthi, Amreshwar and Shriram Maheshwari (2012) *Public Administration*, Lakshmi Narain Agarwal, Agra, p. 349.
- Chakrabarty, Bidyut and R.K. Pandey (2012) *Indian Government and Politics*, Sage Publications India Pvt Ltd, New Delhi, 2012, p. 247.
- Kashyap, Subhash C. (2010) *Our Constitution: An Introduction to India's Constitution and Constitutional Laws*, National Book Trust, India, New Delhi, p. 301.
- Singh Ranbir and Saroj Malik (2006), "The 2004 Parliamentary Elections in Haryana: Continuity and Change", *Punjab Journal of Politics*, 30(1).

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 49-59)

## **Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women: An Empirical Study in Assam**

**Mofidul Islam<sup>\*</sup> and Jayanta Krishna Sarmah<sup>†</sup>**

*Due to lack of voice, power and social barriers, poor people especially women, are often unable to take advantage of opportunities to exercise their individual rights. Therefore, creating multiple opportunities for building social capital is a challenging task. They need assets and capabilities to increase their wellbeing and security, as well as their self-confidence. In this context, interventionist policies of states and intermediate civil society groups can play transformative role in supporting poor people's capabilities for their development. The SHG approach is basically a community development approach wherein the very poor members of a community are organised with a common objective for their socio-economic development and also for overall community development. So, the study has been designed empirically to focus on how Self Help Groups (SHGs) contribute in development of group behaviour and leadership of women. Multi stage purposive random sampling technique has been used for selecting the study area. Total 152 SHGs, registered under Swarnjayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY) scheme, have been taken as sample for the study by using systematic random sampling. The study has revealed that SHGs help in development of internal behaviour of members in terms of creating assets on personal level but failed to take leadership role in mobilising group behaviour in community and developmental issues.*

---

<sup>\*</sup>Research Scholar, Department of Political Science, Gauhati University.

E-mail: mofidulislam07@gmail.com

<sup>†</sup>Associate Professor, Department of Political Science, Gauhati University.

E-mail: jayanta1947@gmail.com

## **Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women**

### **Introduction**

For any country its people are the central assets and all round development and harmonious growth of a nation depends on the utilisation of human resources. Women are the most disadvantaged section of society especially in developing and under developed countries. The choices of women are extremely limited and they lack both assets and power to negotiate better institutions both formally and informally (Narayan et al, 2000). Therefore, poor people need assets and capabilities to increase their wellbeing and security, as well as their self-confidence. But, due to lack of voice, power and social barriers, poor people especially women, are often unable to take advantage of opportunities to exercise their individual rights. In this context, interventionist policies of states and intermediate civil society groups can play a transformative role in developmental prospects.

### **Theoretical Discourse on SHGs in Developmental Perspectives**

Since 1970s, with the emergence of feminist movement group approach has developed world wide as a major social phenomenon for poverty alleviation and women empowerment. As a result, Self Help Group (SHG) approach has become one of the new paradigms for combating poverty and community development with special emphasis on social mobility and livelihood security. The success of Self Employed Women's Association (SEWA), Mysore Resettlement and Development Agency (MYRADA) in India and Garmeen Bank in Bangladesh has induced most of the Third World countries to adopt group approach as a form of interventionist policy programme in their national policies for reducing poverty and social development. Consequently SHGs in India are used as a mission for 'Building poor people's institution' to provide economic help to weaker section of people especially to women (Fernandez, 2007). In 1999, Government of India has initiated the Swarnajayanti Gram Swarozgar Yojana (SGSY) policy by forming SHGs to develop the capacity of poor, especially women. SHGs are small informal associations created for the purpose of enabling members to reap economic benefit out of mutual help, solidarity, and joint responsibility (Anand, 2002). SHG is defined as a small group structures for mutual aid to accomplish a particular purpose. In this group, the members come together to share a common experience and eventually create an opportunity to mobilise resources in the pursuit of needs and interests (Kurtz, 1981). The SHG approach is important for social mobilisation. The process of social mobilisation is accompanied and complemented by economic security. As long as the disadvantaged groups



### **Islam and Sarmah**

suffer from economic deprivation and livelihood insecurity, they will not mobilise themselves. The SHG approach is basically a community development approach wherein the very poor members of a community are organised with a common objective for their socio-economic development and also for overall community development.

#### **Objectives and Research Questions**

The Self Help approach is a unique form of help that can lead to improvement in self esteem, capacity and skill development, leadership and collective mobilisation for social change. It becomes an integral part of the human services where one can find proper scope to re-examine their lives through collective efforts artistically. This paper intends to highlight how SHGs help in developing group behaviour and leadership quality of women. For this purpose present paper is guided by some research questions like how far SHG initiatives have been effective in continuing its functioning? How are the poor women organised into groups? Have SHGs been able to develop group behaviour and leadership among the rural people who are vulnerable and lack skills and capability? Are the groups efficient enough in organising group behaviour for community development?

#### **Methodology**

To fulfil the objectives and research questions, multi stage purposive random sampling has been used for selecting the study area and samples of this study. The present study was conducted in two Development Blocks i.e. Juria and Batadrawa of Nagaon District of Assam. Nagaon district is one of the 27 districts of Assam having highest population and the highest concentration of rural population (86.97 per cent) compared to the other districts of Assam. On the other hand, it has the second highest of total SHGs formed under SGSY in Assam. The universe of the study consists of SHGs registered under SGSY scheme from 1 August, 1999 to 31 March, 2012. On the basis of continuing the functioning of SHGs, Block Development office has provided data of 507 SHGs and out of it 30 per cent, that is 81 from Batadrawa and 71 from Juria, total 152 groups and one member from each group has been selected through systematic random sampling. In addition to this few focused group discussions (FGD) were conducted to understand the overall functioning of groups in developing their collective behaviour and leadership.

## **Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women**

### **Discussion and Analysis**

#### ***Socio-Economic Background of the Respondents***

To know the role of SHGs in developing group behaviour and leadership, it is important to study the socio-economic background of the members. Socio-economic background helps in deriving a comprehensive picture of the respondents and the society in which they live. In this study age, religion, marital status, level of education, occupations both primary and secondary etc. are considered as socio-economic variables.

In this study, 152 samples were selected where 44.7 per cent respondents render their services as presidents, 31.6 per cent as members and 23.7 per cent respondents as secretaries. Among them 63.8 per cent respondents are Muslims and 36.2 per cent respondents are Hindus. It also reveals that majority of the respondents that is (62.5 per cent) belong to the age group of 29-39 years and 34.9 per cent respondents belongs to the age group of 40-50 years, which indicates larger portion of respondents belong to responsible and matured women group. As far as educational qualifications are concerned majority (58.6 per cent) of the respondents are confined to primary level followed by 38.8 per cent of the respondents of high school level and 2.6 per cent of higher secondary level. Though, no respondent is found to be illiterate, it does not mean that there are no illiterate women in rural areas. It indicates that SHGs are formed by conscious people and illiterate families are not getting sufficient scope to include themselves as members of SHGs.

The occupational status reveals that majority (69.1 per cent) of the respondents' primary occupation is animal husbandry whereas 12.5 per cent respondents are petty business owners, 11.2 per cent are related with weaving and only 4.6 per cent are engaged in cultivation. Hence, it indicates that all the respondents are involved in traditional activities. Though, SGSY programme has a provision of skill development but members are not getting government provided facilities related with economic activities in order to improve their economic condition which can help women in generating additional resources and income in their family.

#### ***Group Behaviour***

Group behaviour is important in ensuring effectiveness of any organisation. It provides a forum for collective learning where people get friendly environment as compared to individual approach. It promotes democratic culture where rights and responsibilities are equally respected.

### Islam and Sarmah

The study stresses on the structural aspects of groups such as number of members, group meeting and collective activity performed by group which are used to assess the group process of respondents. Group meeting is very essential for the smooth functioning of group activities. The practice of group meeting creates the environment of solidarity, better understanding and develops co-operation and co-ordination among members. The study revealed that more than 90 per cent of group members are between 10 to 15 in number and group meetings are held regularly on fortnight and monthly basis, where 82.2 per cent members saw to it that all members attend meetings and 88.2 per cent respondents ensured that attendance registers, account books, minutes of meetings of the groups are up-to-date. It indicates the existence of internal transparency in accumulating their group behaviour.

**Table 1**  
**Collective Activities Performed by Group**

Variable	Activities performed by group		Participation				
	Yes	No	Full	Moderate	Low	Mean	SD
Social service activities	124 (81.6)	28 (18.4)	19 (15.3)	105 (84.7)		1.94	.555
Mobilisation of community for women issues	85 (55.9)	67 (44.1)	4 (4.7)	81 (95.3)		1.59	.545
Social problems and helping needy people	99 (65.1)	53 (34.9)	11 (11.1)	88 (88.9)		1.72	.589
Decision on political issues (local or village politics)	76 (50.0)	76 (50.0)	3 (3.9)	73 (96.1)		1.52	.539
Decision on vote in time of election	135 (88.8)	17 (11.2)	58 (43.0)	77 (57.0)		2.27	.651
Personal problems of group members	151 (99.3)	1 (.7)	132 (87.4)	19 (12.6)		2.86	.365
Involvement in development activities	9 (5.9)	143 (94.1)	3 (33.3)	6 (66.7)		1.08	.336
Activities of Panchayati Raj System	4 (2.6)	148 (97.4)		4 (100)		1.03	.161
Making non-members aware about the benefits of SHG	14 (9.2)	138 (90.8)	1 (7.1)	10 (71.4)	3 (21.4)	1.08	.294

Source: Field Study, 2013, figures in the brackets are in per centage

The above table shows collective activity performed by the groups and their participation. It reveals that 81.6 per cent of SHGs are undertaking social service activities. But, as far as the level of participation in social service of group members is concerned, only 15.3 per cent of the members participate in social service activities fully and 84.7 per cent of the

### **Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women**

respondents participated moderately. On the other hand, 55.9 per cent of the groups perform group activity in mobilising community for women's issues followed by 65.1 per cent in raising voice against social problems and helping needy people, 50 per cent in taking decisions about political issues at local or village level, 88.8 per cent takes collective decision on voting during election and 99.3 per cent of the respondents opined, groups undertake the activity on the level of personal problems of group members. But as far as participation of respondents is concerned, majority members moderately participated on all levels except for personal problems of group members where 87.4 per cent of the respondents fully participated.

It also clarifies that majority of the groups are not performing activities like involvement in development activities, activities of Panchayati Raj system and making non-members aware about the benefits of SHGs. It does not mean that members are not interested in performing and participating in these activities. Actually, the participation of members is negligible due to lack of proper supports from societal environment. The respondents opined that they are not treated well equally by the government officials.

The study indicates that group members accumulate only to solve their personal problems and to take decision on voting during election. Table 1 also depicts the mean scores of participation in collective activities of group members and it shows that highest score is 2.86 in personal problems of group members followed by 2.27 on voting decision. The lowest mean score is 1.03 in the activities of Panchayati Raj system and 1.08 for the involvement in development activities. Though SHGs are used as instrument for community development but this study reflects the ineffectiveness of SHGs in community development. It also reveals that majority of the respondents do not participate in the Panchayati Raj activities like gram sabha and other developmental activities. It is revealed from the opinions of the respondents that in rural areas, no public meeting of panchayat is organised in practice and there is no provision of SHG members to participate in Panchayati Raj activities. The respondents stressed on the importance of involving SHG members in the activities of panchayats for strengthening the process of grassroots democracy. They are very optimistic about engaging themselves in the panchayat's activities for proper implementation of government policy at the grassroots level, which will in turn help to reduce corruption and ensure development of rural areas.

**Table 2**  
**t-test on Block wise Distribution of Respondents on**  
**Participation in Group Activity**

Block	N	Mean	SD	t	df	Sig. (2-tailed)
Juria	71	14.86	2.764	-1.000	150	.319
Batadrawa	81	15.28	2.476			

Source: Field Study, 2013

The above table shows that there is no significant difference between two blocks regarding participation of group activity among members as the mean scores of Juria block is 14.86 and Batadrawa is 15.28 and  $t = 1.000$ . (Significance level calculated at  $P < 0.05$ ). It indicates that nature of group activity is same in both the blocks of the study area.

#### *Leadership Development*

SHGs can help the members to develop leadership qualities by involving various activities of SHGs. The presence of a strong and dynamic leadership is an important factor for the successful functioning of SHGs in organising collective process. The study reveals that group leader is selected by decision or consensus of all members where 48.7 per cent of the respondents expressed that selection of group leader is made on the basis of being educated and informed, followed by 39.5 per cent of being honest and active, and 11.8 per cent of having the ability to talk with government officials. Though these factors are preferred in selection of group leader but there is the provision of changing group leaders where 90.1 per cent respondents opine that they have a lot of influence in choosing their group leaders. The study also reveals that majority (97.4 per cent) of group leaders are accountable about their activities and decisions of the groups are taken on the basis of consensus of all members. This indicates the existence of internal accountability, leadership transparency and democratic values within the groups.

**Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women**

**Table 3**  
**Aspects for Improvement in Leadership Quality**

Variable	High	Moderate	Low	Mean	SD
Providing teaching facility to group members	39 (25.7)	113 (74.3)		2.26	.438
Giving facility in training programmes	9 (5.9)	141 (92.8)	2 (1.3)	2.05	.266
Finding innovative ideas	103 (67.8)	49 (32.2)		2.68	.469
Participation in social service activities	87 (57.2)	53 (34.9)	12 (7.9)	2.49	.641
Maintaining basic accounts of group fund	88 (57.9)	63 (41.4)	1 (.7)	2.57	.510
Provide facility to transact with bank	86 (56.6)	66 (43.4)		2.57	.497
Organising collective decision in election process	85 (55.9)	54 (35.5)	13 (8.6)	2.47	.650
Financially strong by accumulating savings	137 (90.1)	14 (9.2)	1 (.7)	2.89	.329
Acquiring new knowledge on income generating activity	3 (2.0)	140 (92.1)	9 (5.9)	1.96	.279

Source: Field Study, 2013, figures in the brackets are in per centage

The study also tries to assess the process of improving leadership and it reveals that majority of the respondents expressed their view moderately on provision of teaching facility to group members, giving facility to participate in training programmes and acquiring new knowledge on income generating activity. It also clears that majority of the members have high views about free discussion within the members to find out innovative ideas (67.8 per cent) followed by participating in social service activities (57.2 per cent), maintenance of basic accounts of group fund (57.9 per cent), providing facility to transact with bank (56.6 per cent), organising collective decision in election process (55.9 per cent) and providing financial strength through savings (90.1 per cent). The above table also illustrates the mean scores on the improvement of leadership quality acquired by members and it shows that highest score is 2.89 obtained through group in financial aspects by accumulation of saving and the lowest mean score is for financially strong satisfaction on group activities and it shows that highest score is 1.96 on acquiring new knowledge on income generating activity.

This indicates, SHGs help to improve personal capacity through the process of their interaction with other members. They have not only gained additional knowledge but have also acquired the skill to deal with various actors. Due to frequent interaction with their fellow members, the awareness and attitude of rural women have changed towards taking up of innovative

**Islam and Sarmah**

activities. Members are more confident in making decisions in household matters. But, SHGs failed to create good quality of leadership among members in taking up community issues where respondents opined that due to lack of managerial capacity and external collateral support, members are unable to develop such quality.

**Table 5**  
**Level of Satisfaction of Respondents**

S. No.	Variables	Highly Satisfied	Satisfied	Neutral	Dissatisfied	Mean	SD
1	Satisfaction with the functioning of SHG	77 (50.7)	38 (25.0)	12 (7.9)	25 (16.4)	3.10	1.114
2	Satisfaction with the performance of group leader		25 (16.4)	63 (41.4)	64 (42.1)	2.26	.723
3	Satisfaction with the initiatives of NGOs		25 (16.4)	63 (41.4)	64 (42.1)	2.26	.723
4	Satisfaction with the support of your family		115 (75.7)	12 (7.9)	25 (16.4)	2.59	.758
5	Satisfaction with community support (providing information and help)	115 (75.7)		12(7.9)	25 (16.4)	3.35	1.175
6	Satisfaction of the assistance/facilities given by Government regarding SHGs		25 (16.4)	51 (33.6)	76 (50.0)	2.34	.745
7	Satisfaction with the co-operation from other fellow member of your group	38 (25.0)	89 (58.6)	25 (16.4)		2.92	.953

Source: Field Study, 2013, figures in the brackets is in per centage

To substantiate group behaviour and leadership development through SHGs the study stressed on satisfaction of group members in group activities and it reveals that 50.7 per cent of respondents are highly satisfied followed by 25 per cent satisfied, 7.9 per cent neutral and 16.4 per cent dissatisfied with the functioning of SHGs. Similarly majority (75.7 per cent) of the respondents are highly satisfied with the community support followed by 25 per cent with the cooperation from fellow members of group where 58.6 per cent of the respondents feel high level of satisfaction. Again 75.7 per cent of the respondents are satisfied with the support of their family. The above table also shows the mean scores of the satisfaction on group activities and it shows that the highest score is 3.35 obtained on community support and the lowest mean scores are 2.26 and 2.34 on the performance of group leaders, role of NGOs and assistance of government on SHGs.

### **Role of Self Help Groups in Group Behaviour and Leadership Development of Women**

So, the above analysis indicates that members are not satisfied with the functioning of SHGs. Though, groups are performing some activities in accumulating their internal behaviour but the sustainability of such behaviour is very weak as group members do not get any external support in developing their capacity either from government or NGOs. On the other hand majority members are neutral about and dissatisfied with the performance of the group leader, initiative of NGOs and government facilities regarding group. From the above analysis, it is clear that government and NGOs are not taking proper initiatives regarding group management and empowering women. As the study covers the SHGs under SGSY scheme so it is not possible for unskilled members to retain their collective behaviour in empowerment process without the help from government.

### **Conclusion and Suggestions**

Though group approach is successful in developing group behaviour and leadership quality but it is clear that SHG initiative has not been fully successful in developing capacity and leadership process as the activities of groups are not properly monitored or evaluated by the government officials. It has been observed in the field experiences that indifferent attitudes of the government officials come to the fore as demotivating factor in effective functioning of the groups. Though women in rural areas have the ability to organise and perform their group activity but due to lack of collateral support and guidance members are not able to acquire skills in organising collective efforts in involving community activities. It is also evident that there is absence of motivation both from NGOs and other promoting institutions in organising strong group behaviour and leadership among women. So, it can be suggested that Government should appoint community resource person in every Panchayat for monitoring and providing guidance for the group activity. There is need for more training centres which should be established at every Panchayat level instead of district and block levels to develop the managerial skills and leadership qualities among members. Similarly, village wise, panchayat wise and block wise formation of SHG federation for mobilising strong group behaviour in community activity. Only concentrated efforts of state and society are required to sustain the group approach in developing group behaviour and leadership quality among women for their empowerment as well as community.



## **Islam and Sarmah**

### **References**

- Anand, S.J. (2002), *Self-Help Groups in Empowering Women: Case study of selected SHGs andNHGs*, Kerala Research Programme on Local Level Development, Centre for Development Studies, Discussion Paper, No. 38.
- Fernandez Aloysius P. (2007), *History and spread of the self-help affinity group movement in India*, The Asia and the Pacific Division, IFAD.
- Kurtz, H. A. (1981), *Self help and Mutual Aid: An Emerging social movement?* Annual Review of Sociology, Vol. 7.
- Narayan, D. & Patel, R. Schafft, K., Rademacher, A., Koch-Schulte, S. (2000), *Voices of the Poor, Can Anyone Hear Us?* Oxford University Press, World Bank.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 60-72)

## Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India

Kiran Lamba<sup>\*</sup>

*Indian labour force is increasing and more than 50 per cent population is young. This demographic dividend will be beneficial, only if young labour force of India is able to find gainful employment. But India's rapid growth is accompanied by declining trend in female labour force participation rates. Gender gap in employment has macro-economic implications thus it is a relevant issue to discuss for policy formulation. This paper is an attempt to analyse women work participation vis-à-vis men as obtained from various rounds of NSS (National Sample Survey) on employment and unemployment by NSSO.*

### Introduction

Indian labour force is increasing and more than 50 per cent population is below 30 years. Demographic dividend can be the most important determinant of economic growth in India. But India can reap benefits of demographic dividend only if its young labour force will be able to find gainful employment. However, most important feature of the whole story is the gender element as female labour force participation is consistently falling in India which has been noted by many scholars recently (Chandrasekhar and Ghosh, 2011); (Rangarajan et al., 2011); (Kannan and

---

<sup>\*</sup>Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, B.P.S.M.Vishwavidyalaya, Khanpur, Sonapat (Haryana). E-mail: kiran.lamba6@gmail.com.

Raveendran, 2012). The female population comprises half of total population in India and majority of them are young. India's female labour force participation rate is always lower than males but in the present scenario this rate for women fell from 37 per cent in 2004-05 to 29 per cent in 2009-10 and has been on declining pace for three subsequent decades, according to an ILO estimate. Out of 131 countries with available data India's rank 11<sup>th</sup> from the bottom in the female labour force participation. The economic boom unleashed by liberalisation, by passed many of India's women. Even worse with rapid economic development women are dropping out of work force in large number rather than joining up. Since gender gap in employment has macro-economic implications, it is very relevant issue to discuss for policy formulation. Based on data from 2000-2004, the United Nations Economic and Social Commission for Asia and Pacific estimates that if India's female labour force participation reached equal to United States (86 per cent) its gross domestic would increase by 4.2 per cent a year and growth rate by 1.08 per cent representing an annual gain of \$ 19 billion. A 10 per cent increase in female labour force participation would lead to increase in growth rate by 0.3 per cent . India have achieved a very high growth rate in last decades but its combination with a conservative and patriarchal society have different impact on female labour force participation rate. In India, it seems that economic growth does not have improved women's status especially employment scenario which has further implications for social and economic empowerment of women. Sex ratio can be used as a proxy for how society value its women, has declined from 927 to 914 between 2001 to 2011 (Census 2011). Investment in women's health has also been low with maternal mortality showing only a marginal improvement while anaemia has increased by 6 percentage point during first half of 2000s (Census 2011). A bill that seeks to provide one third representation to women in parliament could not have been passed due to opposition from several political parties. Increasing atrocities and crime against women shows the gender biasness of Indian society. Economic empowerment of women is related with employment and income level. Thus, the present paper aims to provide a descriptive statistical analysis of women's work participation vis-à-vis men as obtained from various rounds NSS on employment and unemployment by NSSO. This paper is an attempt to understand the real extent of decline in female labour force participation rate in India. In the next section, a discussion based on literature studies of female labour force participation and theoretical background of the topic to understand the empirical nature of problem is done. Whether all developing countries face the same trends in

### **Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India**

their female labour force participation rates or not. In third section participation rates of female labour force and comparison with rates of participation of their male counterparts based on various NSS rounds is explained. In fourth section some of the most accepted explanations of declining and low female labour force participation rates in India is analysed. In the final section, conclusion with some policy implications are provided.

### **Theory of Female Work Participation**

Female work participation has been much discussed topic in economic literature and significant attention has been paid towards the role played by female labour force in the economic development of nations. The structural changes in the economies from agriculture to industry and service sector reduce female labour force participation in developing nations. But the activity of female labour force increases in the later stages of economic development due to increase in education and dynamics of economic activity. The participation of women is desirable for equity and efficiency reasons. Women's participation in labour market ultimately improves their relative economic position and increase the overall economic efficiency by enhancing the development potential of the country. Moreover, the increasing integration of women in the economy helps in reducing gender disparities in education, improving maternal health, increasing sectoral share of female employment in the different sectors of the economy, demonstrating the hidden contribution of women as unpaid development. Economic development will bring about initial decline in the women's labour force participation because women in low income countries are largely confined to work in family enterprises, economic development that comes in the form of new manufacturing sector may improve economic opportunities for men compared to women. According to Schultz (1988) *"until women can acquire the requisite schooling and transferable skills to find suitable employment in firms in expanding sector of modern economy, the opportunity value of women's time relative to man's time may decline"*. According to Boser-up (1970), the idea that women's economic opportunities do not keep pace with men's early in development has led some to argue that women become marginalised with the development. Pampel and Tanaka (1986) postulate that high income and low income countries have highest female participation rate. However, their participation is lowest in middle income countries. Goldin (1994) revealed that the labour supply of married women is U-shaped as countries moves on path of development. Initially, the female labour force supply decrease as then later on increases. Also U-

### Lamba

shaped relationship between economic development and female labour force participation is supported by experience of many developed countries. Simple textbook models of women's labour specify that there are two main determinants of decisions of women's labour supply. First is the opportunity cost of her time which with competitive labour market will equal the prevailing wages for women for her education level and skill level. A higher wages has a substitution effect that makes working longer hours more attractive but also an income effect which may depress work hours. Second is the income earned or not earned by women. This includes the earning of her husband and other profit and transfer income of her family. Increase in unearned income of women through income effect reduces women's working hours and possible withdrawal from the labour force. Hence, labour markets do not work competitively in case of women. Supply side economists have long noted U-shaped relationship between female labour force participation rates. Indian case is fully reflecting this theory that in an agrarian economy female labour force participation is high and as manufacturing sector's role increases, female labour force participation declines and at very high level of development, female labour force participation rate increases with increase in education level and white collar jobs. To study the pattern of labour force participation of women the meaning of labour force participation rate should be clear.

#### **Definition of Labour Force Participation Rate (LFPR)**

The work force participation rate refers to the number of persons actually employed as a proportion of the population, whereas the labour force participation rate refers to the ratio of both the employed and the unemployed to the total population. The unemployed are those who are available for and seeking work but have not been able to find employment. Labour force refers to the population which supplies or offers to supply labour for pursuing economic activities for the production of goods and services and, therefore, includes both 'employed' and 'unemployed' persons/person-days. LFPR is defined as the proportion of persons/person-days in the labour-force to the total persons/person-days. These ratios are given in per 1000 of persons/person-days. The estimates of LFPR in different approaches provide information on the following aspects:

- (i) Number of persons in labour-force according to the *usual status (ps)* i.e. by considering usual principal activity only,
- (ii) ii) Number of persons in labour-force according to the *usual status (ps+ss)* i.e. by considering usual principal and subsidiary economic activity together,

### Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India

Theoretically, it is perceived that female labour force changes with the changing levels of development. It is found that female labour force participation is higher in low and high income countries and lower in middle income countries. There are various economic, social, cultural and biological reasons which determine the female labour participation rate. Social customs also play an important role which we can see from comparison of India, Pakistan and China. Pakistan have a much conservative society, even in all Muslim countries, female labour participation rate is low. An international comparison of the female labour force participation rates are given in Table 1. India's LFPR is much lower as compared to USA, Russia even from other developing countries like China and Brazil. But Pakistan's LFPR is much lower than India.

**Table 1**  
**International Comparisons:**  
**Female Labour Force Participation Rate (Age 15+) (in %)**

Year	India	China	Brazil	Russia	USA	Pakistan
1990	35	73	45	60	56	13
1995	36	72	54	53	58	13
2000	34	71	55	54	59	16
2005	37	67	59	56	58	19
2010	29	64	60	56	55	24

Source: World Development Indicators

Now if we look at labour participation rate of Indians of 15-59 age group, the interesting fact comes out of data from various NSS rounds is that female labour force participation is much lower than man and also has on a declining pace continuously. However, this ratio is also differing between rural and urban areas, which are much lower in urban area.

**Table 2**  
**Percentage of population in Labour force (% of 15-59)**

	1983	1993-94	1999	2004-05	2011-12
<b>All India</b>	<b>68.3</b>	<b>71.2</b>	<b>62.8</b>	<b>62.5</b>	<b>58</b>
Female	40	46.2	38.9	38.6	30
Male	90.5	90.2	85.6	85.5	82.5
<b>Rural India</b>	<b>70.5</b>	<b>75.5</b>	<b>66.3</b>	<b>65.9</b>	<b>61</b>
Females	45.1	53.1	45.2	44.7	38
Males	91.1	92	87	86.9	84
<b>Urban India</b>	<b>61.8</b>	<b>54.3</b>	<b>54.2</b>	<b>55</b>	<b>51.3</b>
Females	23.0	23	22.5	24.3	22
Males	88.6	82.5	82.4	82.7	81

NSS Report 68<sup>th</sup> Round

**Lamba**

**Table 3**  
**Labour Force in Millions**

	Rural Male		Rural Female		Urban Male		Urban Female		Total	
	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS
1983	150.7	154.8	66.7	90.5	47.8	48.6	16.2	12.6	275.4	306.6
1987-88	161.7	166.8	72.7	94.8	54.5	55.1	11.8	14.9	300.7	331.5
1993-94	185.5	189.6	75.3	165.1	66.6	66.7	14.5	18.2	342.0	379.6
1999-2000	198.5	207.2	82.7	106.3	77.9	78.3	16.4	19.1	375.5	404.9
2004-05	216.9	220.4	94.0	125.2	93.5	94.3	22.4	26.7	426.6	466.6
2009-10	230.4	233.7	82.8	105.5	104.8	105.3	22.2	25.4	440.2	469.9
2011-12	236.0	238.8	74.2	103.6	111.8	112.5	25.0	28.8	447.0	483.7

Source: Various NSS Rounds

Table 3 shows the total numbers of males and females in Indian labour force. In rural India, male labour force is more than triple of rural female labour force whereas in urban India male labour force is four times higher than female labour force.

**Table 4**  
**Compound Annual Growth Rates of**  
**Labour Force Participation Rates in India**

	Rural Male		Rural Female		Urban Male		Urban Female		Total	
	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS
1983 to 1993-94	2.10	2.05	1.22	1.51	3.37	3.22	3.55	3.70	2.19	2.16
1993-94 to 1999-2000	1.14	.99	1.58	0.18	2.65	0.81	0.60	0.25	1.57	1.08
1999-2000 to 2004-05	1.78	1.85	2.59	3.32	3.71	3.77	6.43	6.94	2.58	2.88
2004-05 to 2009-10	1.22	1.18	-2.50	-3.36	2.31	2.24	-0.11	-1.03	0.63	0.14
1999-2000 to 2009-10	1.50	1.51	0.01	-0.08	3.01	3.00	3.11	2.88	1.60	1.50
1993-94 to 2011-12	1.34	1.29	-0.08	-0.08	2.91	2.94	3.06	2.57	1.49	1.35

Source: Various NSS Rounds and Census of India.

In table 4, there are compound annual growth rates of labour force are given. Growth rate of male labour force is high in each period both for rural and urban area. The growth rate of female labour force is low and even negative in recent decade. For urban area also female labour force participation rate is negative for 2004-09 period. This is again reflected in labour force participation rates shown in table 5 which shows that female labour force participation rate for rural area is declined from 26 per cent to 18 per cent (PS) during 1977-78 to 2011-12 and for urban from 15 per cent to 13 per cent whereas male participation rate remains almost same in the

### Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India

whole time period. But decline in female labour participation rate is lower in rural India as compared to urban India.

**Table 5**  
**Labour Force Participation Rates (in %)**

Year	Rural Male		Rural Female		Urban Males		Urban Female	
	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS
1977-78	54.9	55.9	26.2	33.8	53.2	53.7	15	17.8
1983	54	55.5	25.2	34.2	53.1	54	12.9	15.9
1987-88	53.2	54.9	25.4	33.1	52.8	53.4	12.9	16.2
1993-94	54.9	56.1	23.7	33.1	54.2	54.3	13.2	16.5
1999-2000	53.3	54	23.5	30.2	53.9	54.2	12.6	14.7
2004-05	54.6	55.5	25	33.3	56.6	52.1	14.9	17.8
2009-10	54.8	55.6	20.8	26.5	55.0	55.9	12.8	14.6
2011-12	54.7	55.3	18.1	25.3	56.0	56.3	13.4	15.5

Source: Various NSS Rounds Reports

At the same time female labour as proportion of total labour force is declined for both urban and rural India which is shown by table 6. In 2011-12, female labour force is 23 per cent of total labour force in rural areas whereas 18 per cent in urban areas. In India females comprise less than 30 per cent of total labour force whereas they comprise half of the total population of the country.

**Table 6**  
**Female Labour Force as a Percentage of Total Labour Force**

Year	Rural Female		Urban Female		Total	
	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS	PS	PSSS
1977-78	31.20	36.48	19.6	22.5	28.94	33.84
1983	30.68	36.89	17.6	20.6	27.92	33.63
1987-88	31.03	36.24	17.8	21.3	28.13	33.06
1993-94	28.87	35.66	17.9	21.4	26.26	32.48
1999-2000	29.41	34.57	17.4	19.6	26.38	30.97
2004-05	30.23	36.23	19.3	22.1	27.26	32.55
2009-10	26.44	31.10	17.5	19.4	23.85	27.85
2011-12	23.92	30.25	18.3	20.4	22.19	27.37

Source: Various NSS Rounds Reports

Majority of female labour force is still employed in agriculture sector as shown in table 7. More than 70 per cent of female labour force is employed in agriculture sector and less than 9 per cent in tertiary sector in rural area.



Lamba

Table 7  
Percentage Contribution of Usual Status (PS+SS) Workers of  
All Ages by Industry of Work

Year	Rural		Urban		Total	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Agriculture	59.4	74.9	5.6	10.9	43.6	62.8
Industry	22.0	16.7	35.3	34.0	25.9	20.0
Tertiary	18.7	8.3	59.1	55.1	30.5	17.2

Source: 68<sup>th</sup> Round NSS report

However, it is argued that female labour force decline is due to declining importance of agriculture in national income and mechanisation of agriculture sector. In India, still 63 per cent females are engaged in agriculture employment and only 20 per cent in secondary and 17 per cent in tertiary sector whereas male participation is lower in agriculture sector as compared to industry and services sector.

It is beyond doubt that female labour force participation is declined both in absolute and percentage terms since 1983 to 2011-12. Most of the females are employed in agriculture sector. This is indicating that half of India's population is not able to participate in the dynamic sectors of the economy. Definitely, it will reduce the growth potential of Indian economy from demographic dividend and also leave behind half section of the society in development journey. Now it is important to have a brainstorming on the potential factors behind the decline of female labour force participation rates in India.

#### **Reasons of Declining Female Labour Force Participation in India**

Recent studies have focused on four explanations, increased education enrolment, income effect (as household incomes rise women are withdrawing from agriculture activities), lack of job opportunities and measurement as it is difficult to measure the participation in work because of nature of work they do. On the demand side employment opportunities for job typically occupied by educated women particularly white collar jobs in service industries including health, education and public service might have grown less than the supply of educated workers leading to fewer women entering the labour force. Following are the some other reasons due to which female labour force participation is lower in India.

#### ***Women Education and Declining Labour Force***

There seems to be an education effect that is putting increasing number of rural women out of farms and into school and colleges which is

### Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India

reflected in growing rural enrollment ratio which is a good sign. During the period 2004-05 to 2009-10, 313 million people opted out of labour force to study as against 267 million in the previous five years 1999-2000 to 2004-05. The rural women overtook her urban counterpart for education with former growing at 3.3 per cent as against 2.7 per cent for the latter (Rangarajan et al., 2011). Table 8 showing the work participation rate of population according to their education level. This is showing that work participation rate is declining with increasing level of education attainment. The work participation rate is lowest for females who have secondary level of education and it is evident that majority of Indian females have this education level.

**Table 8**  
**Work Participation Rates for Men and Women Age 15-59 Years (%)**

Education Level	Rural		Urban		Total	
	Males	Females	male	Female	male	Female
Illiterate	91	69	82	33	90	63
1-4 <sup>th</sup> std	88	59	84	27	87	51
5-9 <sup>th</sup> std	80	47	71	16	78	37
10-11 <sup>th</sup> std	76	37	66	11	72	25
12 <sup>th</sup> /some college	71	35	58	13	66	23
Graduate/Diploma	75	38	76	23	76	27

Source: IHDS-2004-05

In the decade of 2000s, the fall in labour force participation rates for both rural and urban women was more than double for those involved in education. Education is the main reason for the apparent withdrawal from labour force of rural girls in age group 15-19 years. But not for age group 20-24 years, because in India young women are permitted to participate in education up to a point, after they enter marriageable age, they have to withdraw from labour force (Chandrasekhar and Ghosh, 2011).

#### *Longer Working Hours and Low Wage Rate for Women*

Women work longer hours than man and carry a major share of household and community work that is unpaid and invisible. According to a pilot survey conducted in 18620 households of six selected states namely Haryana, Madhya Pradesh, Gujarat, Orissa, Tamil Nadu and Meghalaya during the period June 1998 to July 1999, women spent about 2.1 hours per day on cooking food and 1.1 hours on cleaning utensils. Men's participation in these activities was nominal. Taking care of children was one of the major responsibilities of women. There are fewer women in paid workforce than there are men. It has been estimated that women wage rates are on the

### Lamba

average, 75 per cent of men's wage rates and constitute only one fourth of the family income. In no state do women and men earn equal wages in agriculture. Also women generally work in the informal sector where wages are lower and not covered by labour laws (Women and Men in India, 2013). Both in urban and rural India and agriculture and non-agriculture sector women get lower wages than their male counterparts (Table 9). The supply of labour force depends on substitution and income effects. A person want to substitute his more time for work if he/she gets higher wages and at low wages they prefer leisure time. So substitution effect does not work for female labour force because they get lower wages so they prefer to remain at home.

**Table 9**  
**Daily Income in Rupee for Wage and Salary Workers Age 15-59 Years**

	Rural		Urban		Agriculture		Non-Agriculture	
	Males	Females	male	Female	male	Female	Male	Female
All India	79	42	173	118	50	33	76	43
Age-15-19	51	38	65	59	43	33	59	36
20-29	66	40	115	105	48	33	73	43
30-39	79	42	165	113	51	33	80	42
40-59	95	46	228	141	51	34	80	47

Source: IHDS-2004-05

#### *Income Effect*

The greater withdrawal of women from labour force occurred in rural areas and was largely in agriculture. The main factor turns to be an income effect that has raised average rural incomes and allowed many women to quit demanding farm jobs. This income might be earned or unearned by women because the increased income of their husbands also led to withdrawal of women from labour force, this is called income effect. Table 10 shows with increase in level of income women work participation rates declines.

**Table 10**  
**Work Participation Rates for Men and Women of Various Income Quintiles (%) (15-59 years)**

Income Level	Rural		Urban		Total	
	Males	Females	Male	Female	Male	Female
Lowest Quintile	82	64	60	30	80	61
2 <sup>nd</sup> Quintile	85	64	73	25	83	57
3 <sup>rd</sup> Quintile	85	60	75	25	83	52
4 <sup>th</sup> Quintile	81	53	73	21	78	42
Highest Quintile	78	46	70	16	74	30

Source: IHDS-2004-05

## **Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India**

### ***Lack of Attractive Non-farm Activities***

There seems to be a dearth of attractive non-farm work opportunities for rural women as most non-farm jobs have been generated in the construction sector. The mechanisation of agriculture sector and construction sector where more difficult work is now performed by machines where male workers replaced female workers. However, it does not mean that women are not able to drive tractors and operate construction machine but the patriarchal structure of the society does not let them to do that work.

### ***Social Status of Family and Patriarchy***

The underlying factor that derives women out of labour force, once the family income crosses a certain threshold, in the force of patriarchy they are not allowed to work outside household. It is the key reason why empirical evidence from developing countries including has a 'U' curve for female labour participation rates which drops after the family income crosses a certain threshold. This rises later as much higher levels of affluence. The amount of time a woman spent working outside her home is lower for higher income groups (Ramaswami 2011). The women of high income group families devote their time in caring for children and other activities which maintain the social status of family.

### ***Inter-State Variations***

The inter-state variation in female labour force participation rates seems to confirm the role of patriarchy as an important determinant of gender gaps in labour participation rates. There is a wide inter-state variation in the rates, state like Bihar, Delhi, Haryana and Uttar Pradesh have lowest female participation rates. The states are among those with the lowest sex ratio in the country, suggesting that women might perhaps be less valued in these states. State with higher female labour participation such as Sikkim, Meghalaya and Andhra Pradesh also tends to have high sex ratios favouring females.

### **Conclusion and Policy Implications**

There are very serious consequences of this continuous defeminisation of Indian labour force. Indian women are opting out of labour force continuously, because they are coming out of rural employment and going for education. But women with high education attainment are still participating less. Another factor is income effect, with rising income levels

## Lamba

of their family women are opting out of labour force. Since in higher income strata women are involved in caring children and maintaining social status of family. If women withdrawn from labour force when family income increases the consequence of this could be a 'Backward Bending Labour Supply Curve'. Another reason is that women get fewer wages for equal work than their men counterparts at the same time women share household responsibilities more and work for longer hours in household activities. The declining importance of agriculture sector in economic development and mechanisation of agriculture sector has also reduced female labour force participation rates in India. So finally we can say that there are various reasons of declining female labour force participation rates in India. There is need for effective policy formulation in this direction so that female labour force participation could be increased. But no step will be successful until or unless patriarchal set up of Indian society will be changed. No organ of government and society is outside of its dominance. The economic structure of India is changing from agrarian economy to industrial economy at a very fast rate but social structure is not changing from a patriarchal society to an egalitarian society. But if de-feminisation of labour force is allowed to happen, this will be a huge waste of human resource potential which a developing country like India could not afford. So there is need of indepth understanding of this problem and effective policy formulation to encourage female labour force participation in India.

## References

- Abraham Vinod (2013), "Missing Labour Force or Consistent De-Feminization?" *Economic and Political Weekly* August 3, Vol. xlvii 99-107.
- Boser-up, E. (1970), *Women's Role in Economic Development*. New York: St Martin's Press.
- Boser-up (2008), *Women's Role in Economic Development*, South Asian Edition Earth scan, London.
- Census of India, 1981 to 2011, *Primary Census Abstracts*.
- Chandrasekhar, C.P. and J. Ghosh (2011), "Latest Employment Trends from the NSSO", *Business Line*, 12 July.
- Dasgupta, P. (2005), "Female labours supply in rural India- an econometric analysis" Working Paper Series No. E/265/2005, *Institute of Economic Growth*, Delhi.
- Goldin, C. (1994), "The U-shaped Female Labour Force Function in Economic Development and Economic History", *NBER Working Paper* No. 4707.
- Eswaran, Mukesh, Bharat Ramaswami, and Wilima Wadhwa (2011), "Status, Caste, and the Time Allocation of Women in Rural India," Discussion Paper 11-12, *Indian Statistical Institute, Delhi*.
- Kannan, K.P and G. Reveendran (2012), "Counting and Profiling the Missing Labour Force," *Economic & Political Weekly*, February 11, Vol. xlvii, No. 6.
- Rangarajan, C, Padma Iyer Kaul, Seema (2011), "Where is the missing labour force", *Economic and Political Weekly*, Volume XLVI, No. (39).

### **Declining Trend of Female Labour Force Participation in India**

Schultz, T.P. (1988), International differences in labour force participation in families and firms.  
Economic Growth Center Working Paper, No. 634, New Haven: Yale University.

Women and Men in India (2011-2013), CSO Publications.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 73-84)

## **Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh**

**Tapas Kumar Dalapati\* and Ashish Bhatt†**

*The Kapildhara scheme initiated by Government of Madhya Pradesh is an important sub-scheme for wage employment and building of agricultural assets for greater agricultural productivity and economic sustainability of small and marginal farmer under MGNREGS. The paper is an empirical analysis of implementation of the sub-scheme in Madhya Pradesh. The paper inferred that the scheme has significantly altered the cropping intensity, agricultural income, food security and out migration from the beneficiary household and stress upon convergence of the sub-scheme with other income generating activities in rural Madhya Pradesh.*

### **Introduction**

Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Programme has completed a decade of its implementation which envisioned for providing employment to the rural people and creation of durable infrastructure to boost the rural economy. Since inception of MGNREGS, almost 51 per cent works related to water conservation, irrigation, drought proofing and allied activities related to agriculture (MGNREGA Sameeksha, 2012: 27). If we look

---

\*Assistant Professor, M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain.

E-mail: tapas273@gmail.com

†Associate Professor, M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain.

E-mail: drabhattach@yahoo.com

### **Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh**

in to the recent MGNREGS expenditure on the agriculture and allied activities, the data shows that almost 57 per cent of the total MGNREGS expenditure was invested in the water conservation, irrigation, drought proofing, land development and activities related to development of agriculture (MGNREGA Sameeksha, 2015: 41). Since the flagship development scheme primarily envisioned ameliorating the unemployment problem of the rural population, it is obvious that a sizeable chunk of its share is pumped into asset creation and allied activities related to agriculture.

After one decade of implementation of this scheme, scholars and studies by organisations like Verma (2011), Kareemullah et al (2009), WOTR (2010), IIFM (2010), Agarwal, Gupta and Kumar (2012), Sambodhi (2012-13) reported increased availability of water, productivity of crop output, diversification of cropping pattern due to the irrigation structure and water harvesting structure created under MGNREGS. Some studies also inferred that funds invested in MGNREGS has marred by corruption, poor quality of assets and poor performance of officials (Narayanan and Lokhande, 2013) which failed to revamp the agriculture sector and unable to help out the burgeoning small and marginal farmers of our rural economy. Therefore, they stressed upon a robust overhauling of the implementation of the MGNREGS.

In Madhya Pradesh, in last 10 years several new initiatives have been undertaken by Government of Madhya Pradesh within MGNREGS to provide employment security as well as a vibrant resource base, which can catapult the rural employment towards rural development. During the last decade, Madhya Pradesh Government introduced various sub-schemes namely *Kapildhara*, *Nandan Phalodhyan*, *Bhumi Shilp*, *Shail Pern*, *Vanya*, *Resham*, *Nirmal Neer*, *Nirmal Vatika*, *Meenakhi*, *Sahashra Dhara* etc. Among these sub-schemes Kapildhara is one of the most popular sub-schemes for agricultural development in dryland areas of Madhya Pradesh. Kapildhara sub-scheme inculcates construction of dug wells, stop dams, and small farm ponds for enhancement of agricultural productivity through providing irrigation facility in the land of small and marginal farmers belonging to marginalised section of society. This paper is an outcome of study which was done with the objectives - to analyse the nature of operationalisation of the Kapildhara Scheme in Madhya Pradesh and to study the impact of this sub-scheme on land use, area of operation, crop diversification, productivity in agriculture and livelihood pattern, migration of beneficiaries in the study villages. In this study 100 Kapildhara beneficiary households from 10



### **Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt**

villages were intensively surveyed from Shivpuri, Sidhi, Rajgarh, Jhabua and Betul districts of Madhya Pradesh. These villages were selected representing agro-climatic zones of Madhya Pradesh to comprehend nature of implementation of the scheme. For representative selection, Kapildhara beneficiary households were selected randomly from the MIS information provided at MGNREGA portal.

#### **Kapildhara Sub-Scheme**

Madhya Pradesh has the highest proportion of India's dry land district within its area (Shankar: 2005). At present only 24 per cent of the cropped area in Madhya Pradesh are irrigated. Even if the optimum irrigation potential from surface and ground water sources is realised, over 55 per cent of the cropped area of Madhya Pradesh still remain rain-fed. Against this background, importance of small dug well, tanks, farm ponds obviously remain important for small and marginal farmers of Madhya Pradesh. The Kapildhara programme initiated by Government of Madhya Pradesh is an important scheme for wage employment and building of agricultural assets for greater agricultural productivity and economic sustainability of poor small and marginal farmers.

The Kapildhara scheme is not a new sub-scheme under MGNREGS; there are various precursors of the programme in the history of rural development in India. The earlier such sub-schemes were Million Well Schemes (MWS), Jeevandhara Schemes which were implemented over the years under different rural development programmes. The MWS was launched as a sub-scheme of the National Rural Employment Programme (NREP) and the Rural Landless Employment Guarantee Programme (RLEGP) during the year 1988-89 and merged with JRY until 31 December, 1995. The scheme was primarily meant to provide open irrigation wells free of cost to individual poor, small and marginal farmers belonging to SC/ST and freed bonded labour. From 1993-94, the target group was extended to non SC/ST farmers also. Jeevandhara programme was also part of agricultural development programme for providing irrigation wells to the poor farmers; later the programme was merged with Swarna Jayanti Gram Swarajgar Yojana along with IRDP, TRYSEM, Improved Tool kit supply scheme, Ganga Kalyan Yojana and DWACRA. However, Kapildhara scheme is much broader than the aforesaid two schemes in relation to types of irrigation structures permissible under the scheme.

Kapildhara is an important sub-scheme under MGNREGA. It inculcates construction of dug wells, tank, and small farm ponds for

### Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh

enhancement of agricultural productivity through irrigation. In Madhya Pradesh, each year 25 beneficiaries from SC, ST, BPL, land reform and IAY beneficiaries can be selected from one Gram Panchayat under this sub-scheme.

The salient objective of the Kapildhara sub-scheme is to provide irrigation facility to ensure increase in agricultural productivity in the rain fed area. It is expected that due to support of Kapildhara irrigation structures, beneficiary's income will be enhanced leading to livelihood security of their household. The target group of Kapildhara sub-scheme are (i) Scheduled Caste and Scheduled Tribe households, (ii) BPL households, (iii) Land Reforms beneficiaries, (iv) Beneficiaries of Indira Aawas Yojana, and (v) Small and Marginal Farmers.

### Impact of Kapildhara Sub-scheme on Agriculture

In Madhya Pradesh, farmers produce their crops in three seasons, i.e. *kharif*, *rabi* and *jayad*. In *kharif* (rainy) season farmers use to produce rice, soybean, jowar, maize, bajra and cotton, which are mostly depended upon monsoon rainfall during the season. In *rabi* (winter) season farmers produce wheat, peas, mustard mostly irrigated by ground water through dug wells and tube wells. Cropping intensity in the *rabi* season depends upon the irrigation facility available in the land and availability of ground water during winter season. In *jayad* (summer) season farmers use to produce summer crops like pumpkin, watermelon, cucumber and other vegetables where ample irrigation facility available during the dry spell of the summer.

**Table 1**  
**Impact of Kapildhara on Agriculture**

Sl. No.	Parameters of Agriculture	Before Kapildhara Mean	After Kapildhara Mean	Change Proportion 1 : X
1	Total irrigated land (acre)	0.11	1.68	15.3*
2	Number of cultivation season (3) ( <i>Kharif, Rabi, Jayad</i> )	1.25	1.88	1.5*
3	Total cropped area <i>kharif</i> (acre)	2.80	2.88	1.01 <sup>@</sup>
4	Total cropped area <i>rabi</i> (acre)	0.62	1.98	3.2*
5	Total cropped area <i>jayad</i> (acre)	0	0.06	-.*
6	Total annual fertilizer use per household (kilogram)	80	158	1.9*

Paired sample t test (before Kapildhara/after Kapildhara)

\*statistically significant at 5 per cent level

<sup>@</sup>statistically insignificant at 5 per cent level

In this study different parameters of agriculture i.e., area under agriculture, intensity of crops, area under crops in the three seasons and

### Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt

changing pattern of fertiliser use is analysed before Kapildhara and after construction irrigation structure through MGNREGS. To compare the situation, mean value of these parameters, before Kapildhara and after Kapildhara have been analysed to comprehend the concomitant changes. In the table 1, paired sample t test has been administered and the statistical test confirmed that barring change in total cropped area during *kharif* season, all the above cited parameters have been changed significantly due to the Kapildhara irrigation structures. In the proportion change analysis, it was found that mean irrigated area increased 15.3 times in the beneficiary land. In the analysis of cropped areas across season, it was found that *kharif* cropped area has increased marginally and *rabi* cropped area has been increased significantly to 3.2 times after Kapildhara allocation. Earlier average land cultivated was nil during *jayad* season but 0.06 acres land has been brought under cultivation in the summer (*jayad*) season and farmer started (*jayad*) summer crops.

Irrigation facility has a significant impact over use of agricultural implements and new seed, fertiliser technology. In this study, it was found that due to Kapildhara irrigation structures farmers increased their fertiliser use to enhance the productivity of the crops. Before allocation of Kapildhara, 24 per cent farmers never used chemical fertiliser in their field, after Kapildhara allocation the percentage of fertiliser non-user is decreasing. Before allocation Kapildhara well only 6 per cent beneficiary households were using chemical fertiliser above 200 kilogram in their fields but after availability of irrigation facility through Kapildhara, the number of such users have increased to 20 per cent. Not only fertiliser, with the assured irrigation, it was found that farmers have acquired improved agricultural implements like diesel pump, sprayer pump and other mechanical agricultural implements for betterment of their agriculture process.

#### Impact on Agricultural Income

In the above analysis it was found that over all irrigated area has increased significantly due to Kapildhara. Cropping intensity has increased significantly during *rabi* and *jayad* season. In the *kharif* season cropped area increased marginally because in Madhya Pradesh almost all cultivable land are cultivated with monsoon rainfall in *kharif* season. However, the marginal increase shows that some of the uncultivable waste land has also come under cultivation with the Kapildhara allocation. It cannot be assumed that increase in cropped area leads to increase in agricultural income, to ascertain whether Kapildhara structure could be able to enhance agricultural income

### Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh

across the various season, paired sample t test was applied to analyse the impact of Kapildhara structures on mean agricultural income of the beneficiary households.

**Table 2**  
**Impact of Kapildhara on Agricultural Income**

Sl. No.	Parameters of Agricultural Income	Before Kapildhara Mean	After Kapildhara Mean	Change Proportion 1 : X
1	Total agricultural income <i>kharif</i> (Rs)	12104	15176	1.25 *
2	Total agricultural income <i>rabi</i> (Rs)	1146	11751	10.25*
3	Total agricultural income <i>jayad</i> (Rs)	0	186	- *
4	Total agricultural income (Rs)	13170	26543	2.02 *
5	Net income from agriculture (Rs)	1543	6974	4.5 *

Paired sample t test (before Kapildhara/after Kapildhara)

\*statistically significant at 5 per cent level

To test the impact of Kapildhara irrigation structure upon the agricultural income, in the table 2, paired sample t test has been administered and the statistical test confirmed that all the above mentioned parameters have been changed significantly due to the Kapildhara irrigation structures. It was found that mean *kharif* agricultural income enhanced 1.25 times and most significantly mean *rabi* agricultural income increased to the rate of 10.25 times after creation of Kapildhara irrigation structures for beneficiaries. Before creation of Kapildhara structures mean *jayad* income was nil, after allocation of Kapildhara an annual mean income of Rs.186 reported from the beneficiaries. Due to creation of Kapildhara irrigation structures, total average agricultural income enhanced 2.02 times and it was found that net average income increased 4.5 times due to intervention of Kapildhara irrigation scheme.

In this study analysis is undertaken to comprehend change in *kharif* income according to percentage of beneficiaries and it was found that before creation of Kapildhara 30 per cent beneficiaries were earning a *kharif* income upto Rs. 5000 and this percentage declined to 20 per cent and most significantly percentage income within the range of Rs. 20,001 to Rs. 40,000 increased to 24 per cent from pre-allocation stage of 12 per cent. It was evidently found that percentage of beneficiaries having lower range of income is declining and higher range of income increasing due to allocation of Kapildhara among the beneficiaries.

In case of per cent change in *rabi* income, it has come to evidence that before creation of Kapildhara 93 per cent of the beneficiaries were earning upto only Rs. 5000, after creation of Kapildhara the percentage under the

**Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt**

income range declined to 41 per cent and percentage of beneficiaries increased to 23 per cent from 6 per cent under the range of Rs. 5001 to 10,000. Percentage increased from 1 per cent to 20 per cent under the income range of Rs. 10,001 to 20,000 and to 13 per cent from nil under the income range of Rs. 20001 to 40,000. It was evident from the analysis that Kapildhara has enhanced the *rabi* agricultural income significantly as compared to *khari* agricultural income in the post allocation period of Kapildhara. This is only possible because, in pre-allocation period of Kapildhara farmers were not able to sow *rabi* crop due to lack of irrigation facility in their agricultural land. After the creation of Kapildhara both cropped area as well as income from *rabi* crop increased significantly.

Analysis of changes in total agricultural income depicts that beneficiaries percentage within the income range of upto Rs. 5000 and Rs. 5001 to 15,000 decreased and percentage of beneficiaries in the income range of Rs. 15,001 to 50,000 increased significantly after allocation of Kapildhara. Before allocation of Kapildhara highest agricultural income was confined to the income range of Rs. 50001 to 10,000, however due to allocation of Kapildhara 4 per cent beneficiaries crossed the agricultural income of Rs. 1,00,000 in a year.

**Impact on Migration/Labour Relations**

Distress migration due to lack of employment and lack of viable assets in rural areas is one of the main challenges faced by the planners of rural development. It is a fact that most of the marginal and small farmers are bound to migrate out from their villages due to lack of employment during the lean agricultural season. In the rain fed areas most of the farmers are unable to cultivate their land due to lack of assured irrigation facility in the *rabi* and *jayad* season. The salient objective of the Kapildhara sub-scheme is to provide irrigation structures to farmers that can enhance irrigation facility in their land across the seasons.

**Table 3**  
**Impact of Kapildhara on Household Migration**

SL No	Migration Details of Household	Before Kapildhara Mean	After Kapildhara Mean	Change Proportion 1 : X
1	Number of migrating member	1.6	1.1	0.68 *
2	Number of migration days	142	79	0.56 *

Paired sample t test (before Kapildhara/after Kapildhara)

\*statistically significant at 5 per cent level

### **Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh**

In order to analyse the impact of Kapildhara upon the migration pattern of beneficiary households, paired sample t test was applied to find out whether Kapildhara has an instrumental role in changing the migration pattern. In the table 3, it was found that Kapildhara structures have significantly decreased number of migrating member as well as migrating days per year in beneficiary households.

Kapildhara has reduced number of mean migrating members from 1.6 to 1.1 and mean migration days from 142 to 79, which is a significant decrease from the pre-allocation migration situation in the beneficiary's households.

Analysis of percentage change between pre-Kapildhara and post-Kapildhara migration situation among Kapildhara beneficiaries, it was found that before Kapildhara 29 per cent households members were not migrating out even for a day during a year, after creation of Kapildhara per cent of such families increased to 42 per cent. Earlier 20 per cent families migrating out for 101 to 200 days but after allocation of Kapildhara percentage of such families declined to 16 per cent. Before allocation of Kapildhara 16 per cent households migrating out for 201 to 300 days in a year but after allocation of Kapildhara the percentage declined to 8 per cent. Likewise, before allocation of Kapildhara 14 per cent of the beneficiary household migrating out for above 300 days in a year but after allocation of Kapildhara the percentage declined to 5 per cent households.

It is deciphered from the study that number of migration days of the Kapildhara families has declined significantly after creation of Kapildhara. It was also inferred from the study that before Kapildhara one to two members of 46 per cent families migrated out in search of work, after Kapildhara percentage of such families were declined to 40 per cent. Before Kapildhara three to four members of 23 per cent families migrated out of their village in search of work, after Kapildhara, such families declined to 17 per cent. Before Kapildhara four to five members from 2 per cent families migrated out, after Kapildhara creation only 1 per cent family migrating out in search of work in the same category.

Majority of beneficiaries of Kapildhara sub-scheme were marginal and small farmers. Generally farmers from these categories cultivate their land with family labour. As they have limited land resources for sustenance they use to work in other's land when they have no work in their field. Before allocation of Kapildhara, 38 per cent households never hired outside labour to work in their field, after creation of Kapildhara, percentage of such households are declining, due to enhanced irrigation facility, their

**Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt**

agricultural work has been increased and they are bound to employ outside labour for timely completion of the agricultural process. Before allocation of Kapildhara there were 23 per cent households who employed labour for one to 10 labour days during a year, after Kapildhara percentage of such households increased to 35 per cent. Before Kapildhara 29 per cent of the beneficiaries hired 11 to 22 labour days from fellow villagers, after Kapildhara percentage of such households increased to 31 per cent. Likewise before Kapildhara only 10 per cent beneficiaries employed above 20 days of labour from outsiders; after Kapildhara percentage of such households increased to 14 per cent. It is evident from this analysis that MGNREGS has not only provided direct public employment to rural people but it has also indirectly created avenues for employment in the agricultural sector.

**Impact on Food Security**

The most important challenge before rural development policy makers is to ensure food security to the rural population. In India, since the cultivable area is fixed and follows the principle of partible inheritance, the size of land holding in agricultural households has been steadily declining making it more difficult for households to subsist in agriculture. It is a fact that most of our marginal and small farmers find it difficult to arrange food for entire year from their agricultural production. The only way out to tackle this problem is to increase productivity of land and crop intensity so that rural households become self sustaining from their agricultural yield. Kapildhara sub-scheme under MGNREGS is a unique step towards enhancing productivity and ensuring food security among rural households.

**Table 4**  
**Impact of Kapildhara on Food Security**

SL No	Agricultural Yield Lasted for Self Consumption (months)	Before Kapildhara Mean	After Kapildhara Mean	Change Proportion 1 : X
1	Food lasted for self consumption	6.4	9.4	1.5*

Paired sample t test (before Kapildhara/after Kapildhara)

\*statistically significant at 5 per cent level

To analyse whether the sub-scheme under MGNREGS increased food security in a statistically significant manner or not, paired sample t test was applied for analysis. Table 4 depicts that it has improved the food security of the beneficiary's household in a significant manner. Before allocation of Kapildhara, beneficiary's food lasted only for 6.4 months and after allocation of Kapildhara it has lasted for an average of 9.4 months from their agricultural production.

### **Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh**

In this study, it is found that before allocation of Kapildhara, 13 per cent households' food lasted for only one to three months for self consumption, after Kapildhara percentage of such households has declined to 6 per cent. Before allocation of Kapildhara 48 per cent beneficiary's food lasted for four to six months, after creation of Kapildhara percentage of such households declined to 15 per cent. Before allocation of Kapildhara 22 per cent beneficiaries' food lasted for seven to nine months from self production, after allocation of Kapildhara irrigation structures percentage of such families declined to 19 per cent. Before allocation of Kapildhara only 17 per cent beneficiary's households consumed their agricultural yield for self consumption for 10 to 12 months, after allocation of Kapildhara, percentage of such household increased to 60 per cent among beneficiary households. It is evident from this analysis that Kapildhara has improved food security among the Kapildhara beneficiaries by enhancing yield from their food crops.

### **Issues Related to Implementation of Kapildhara Scheme**

Kapildhara sub-scheme provides dug well, masonry dam, micro tank, farm pond and stop dam to marginalised section of society to increase irrigation facility in their land individually or jointly. Though different kind of structures can be constructed under Kapildhara sub-scheme, dug wells account for 96 per cent of the irrigation structures. It is inferred in the study that estimates for preparation are undertaken by the Chief Engineer at the district level without taking into account the topographical conditions, hydrological formations and type of rocks prevalent at the village level. Under Kapildhara sub-scheme generally technical sanction are approved by sub-engineers at the block level, who have to follow the estimates prescribed for the district. When the actual digging of Kapildhara structures begin different kind of soils, rocks have to be dug out by the MGNREGS workers. In case of hard rock workers are not able to dig the rock and very often blasting has to be done with the expenses of Kapildhara sub-scheme. Once the work begins block functionaries are not in a position to reformulate the costing on different heads and they have to comply with the specification prescribed by the district. This leads to many compromises like lowering down the depth of the Kapildhara well/structure or asking the beneficiaries to bear the expenses of extra digging by workers. Therefore, to avoid discrepancies prior planning should be made by undertaking survey of ground water availability and there should be some flexibility to adjust cost like blasting in the Kapildhara digging process.



### **Tapas Kumar Dalapati and Ashish Bhatt**

It is found during the study that wage rate for working in Kapildhara is same as other general work undertaken under MGNREGS. Digging of earth cannot be equated with digging of rocks. Therefore, several tactics are invented by the Panchayat functionaries to comply the cost directives from district and they also have to give satisfactory wages to retain the workers for doing difficult work like breaking stones underneath the ground. The result is obvious, fund allocated for structures finished half way and the extra cost has to be borne by the beneficiaries. This factor is the decisive reason for incomplete Kapildhara structures in hard rock region, particularly those Kapildhara structures belong to poor farmers. Therefore, a special task rate should be formulated according to the special working condition like Kapildhara digging. For smooth implementation of this sub-scheme greater autonomy should be provided to assistant engineers and sub engineers to prepare technical sanction for a irrigation structure according to geological formation and water table availability in Kapildhara implementation village. To smoothen the process and to enhance efficacy of the programme block administration should tie up with Central Ground Water Board to locate ground water aquifers in different Gram Panchayats. This will ensure hundred per cent success of dug well. For value addition of the irrigation structures, Kapildhara beneficiaries should be encouraged to be covered under SGSY scheme for gaining access to water lifting devise to enhance the production undertaken in the Kapildhara irrigated land.

### **Conclusion**

In a nutshell, it is deciphered from the analysis that Kapildhara has enhanced irrigated area. It has significantly improved cropping intensity and the agricultural income across the seasons. Due to allocation of Kapildhara structure fertiliser use has been increased significantly among the beneficiary households. Farmers started hiring in labour for agricultural operations after allocation of the Kapildhara irrigation structures. The total agricultural income has been almost doubled after allocation of Kapildhara irrigation structure. Most importantly, the net agricultural income has increased almost four and half times due to Kapildhara. Before allocation of Kapildhara structures, an average farmer's agricultural yield lasted only about six month for consumption of the household but after Kapildhara, it has increased to nine months and above, thus food security has been increased to almost one and half time in a year due to Kapildhara. The most significant impact of Kapildhara irrigation structures is that they have been able to arrest migration from beneficiary households. Therefore, it is

### **Impact of Assets Created under MGNREGS on Rural Livelihood in Madhya Pradesh**

evidently found that Kapildhara irrigation structures have been able to provide ample self employment, income and food for the rural households. The sub-scheme involves expenses on manual labour, material and skilled labour. Therefore, for undeterred completion of the water harvesting structures, the cost estimation of the work should be made flexible at grassroots level keeping in view the local construction site. This will curtail the many existing compromises like lowering down the depth of the Kapildhara well/structure or asking the beneficiaries to bear the expenses of extra digging by workers. This important sub-scheme can be more successful if survey of ground water table is made in villages and structures are constructed as per the advice of the hydrologists. The impact of the scheme can be augmented by convergence of this scheme with horticulture, dairy development and activities like sericulture in Madhya Pradesh.

### **References**

- Agarwal Ankita, Ashish Gupta and Ankit Kumar (2012) Evaluation of NREGA Wells in Jharkhand, *Economic and Political Weekly*, XLVII No 35.
- Dalapati Tapas K. and Ashish Bhatt (2011) Assessment of the Effectiveness and Impact of Kapildhara Sub-Scheme under the National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme in Madhya Pradesh, Report submitted to Ministry of Rural Development/UNDP, Ujjain: MPISSR.
- Indian Institute of Forest Management (2010) Impact Assessment of MGNREGA's Activities for Ecological and Economic Security, Report submitted to Ministry of Rural Development/UNDP, Bhopal: IIFM.
- Kareemulla, K. et al. (2009) Soil and Water Conservation Works through National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme in Andhra Pradesh: An Analysis of Livelihood Impact, *Agricultural Economics Research Review*, Vo. 22, pp. 443-450.
- MGNREGA Sameeksha (2012) An Anthology of Research Studies on the MGNREGA, 2005-2012. Ministry of Rural Development, GoI, New Delhi: Orient Black Swan.
- MGNREGA Sameeksha II (2015) An Anthology of Research Studies, 2012-2014. New Delhi: United Nations Development Programme.
- Narayanan N.C. and Nitin Lokhande (2013) Design to Falter: MGNREGA Implementation in Maharashtra, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol 48 No 26-27.
- National Sample Survey Organisation (2011) Survey of MGNREGA 2010-11, New Delhi: NSSO.
- Sambodhi Research and Communication Pvt. Ltd. (2012-13) Impact Assessment of Assets Created on Individual Land under MGNREGA.
- Shankar P. Vijay (2005) Four Decades of Agricultural Development in MP: An Agro-Ecological Sub-Region Approach, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol 40 No 48.
- Watershed Organisation Trust (2010) Impact Appraisal of NREGA in Aurangabad and Ahmednagar Districts of Maharashtra Report submitted to Ministry of Rural Development/UNDP.

## Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana State

Vijay Korra\*

*The prime focus of the paper is to bring out the dynamics of seasonal labour migration from 'drought prone' Mahabubnagar district of Telangana State. This is essentially important when examined the process of seasonal labour migration within the district perspective than looking between the regions that differ either geologically or socio-economically. Seasonal migration is altering eventually hence this study aims at capturing the intra-dynamics of seasonal migration. The study reveals that the studied villages are increasingly becoming unemployable and therefore witnessed huge out flow of surplus workforce. Seasonal migration by labour seems to be no remedy for their long term economic backwardness.*

### Introduction

In spite of the rapid and lofty economic growth in recent decades seasonal economic labour migration in India is mounting without failing and seems to persevere at the same pace from economically backward regions to prosperous urban and/or rural areas. Governments in India both federal and state focus more on development of urban centres while the countryside gets neglected in planning and budget allocation. On the other hand, more than 65 per cent of rural populace depends on agriculture, animal husbandry and forest based activities for their living and employment purposes which is characterised by means of uncertainty, frequent natural shocks, high input

---

\*Assistant Professor, Centre for Economic and Social Studies (CESS), Hyderabad. E-mail: vijaykorra@gmail.com

### **Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana**

cost and inadequate yields. The not so impressive atmosphere in agriculture sector has indeed augmented labour migration which is chiefly characterised as seasonal in nature (Deshingkar et al., 2009). Seasonal exodus is either by cultivators or daily wage labourers or mostly occurs due to both during the lean agricultural season (Wey, 2003). Rural masses opt migration during the redundancy periods and more often not just for one time but year after year for multiple purposes. A significant number of workers in this migrant force are the landless wage seekers, small and marginal farmers chiefly from the Scheduled Castes (SCs) and Scheduled Tribe (STs) who are socio-economic and educationally bottom placed in the Indian society (Smita, 2007).

Globalisation, free and boundary less market players have contributed changes in the economy. In fact, the whole spectrum of labour migration distorted from bonded, contract and piece-rate mode of migration to more of individual and contract-free labour movements (Korra, 2011). At this juncture, question arises that in the current scenario what causes labour force to move-out more so seasonally and what are their socio-economic and other associated characteristics? How seasonal migration is distinct from other sort of migrations? Have the magnitude, pattern and features of seasonal migration changed over the years? Does seasonal migration vary within a specified district/region, if at all it varies why and how it differs within the district and between the households? These questions turn out to be extremely decisive as literature on seasonal migration talks much about migration between the districts/regions but nothing of migration within a specified district/region.

Wey (2003) argues that seasonal migration would depend on household land/asset ownership and income earning level on the one hand, and the profitability of agriculture and availability of wage employment in the origin on the other. Further, factors such as high input cost, lack of *Minimum Support Price* (MSP) for agriculture produces, inadequate credit, indebtedness, land alienation and frequent droughts are to be blamed for today's distress in Indian agriculture sector, as a result, cultivation has become impracticable for generating adequate income and employment. This constricts livelihood options and also creates joblessness in rural areas.

It is in this context, this paper aims at exploring the dynamics of seasonal labour migration such as determinants, characteristics, magnitude and patterns of seasonal labour migration. Besides, it explores employment and wage patterns of migrants at destination. It also, examines the implications of migrant earnings on their well being. This has been examined in the context of Mahabubnagar district of Telangana state. Second,

## Korra

households from different villages are examined to highlight the importance of inter and intra-dynamic factors which play key role in seasonal migration process. This aspect becomes important in the present analysis which has not been adequately explored so far in the field of migration studies. The study analysis is based on a field survey which was conducted in 2010 in the three randomly selected villages from three geographically different divisions/ taluks in Mahabubnagar district of Telangana state. The study applied simple random sampling technique in selecting the sample households. The quantitative data is supported by qualitative information that was collected along with quantitative survey. The paper comprises seven sections, including the introduction. The second section talks of magnitude of seasonal labour migration. Third section deals with the determinants, characteristics and pattern of seasonal labour migration. Fourth section is about patterns of employment and wages of seasonal labour migrants. The fifth section is concerned with the working and living conditions of seasonal migrants. Sixth section examines the patterns of remittances and income spending of seasonal migrants. The final section is conclusion and policy implications.

### Scale of Seasonal Labour Migration

The study area that is Mahabubnagar district of Telangana State is one of the most economically backward districts and, it is the major labour supplier not only in the state but in the country as well. Labour force from the district are recognised for their tireless, sincere hard work and known all over the country by the epithet of '*Palamuru Labours*'. At present, the district is witnessing high levels of labour migration particularly during the post-harvest agricultural season (Korra, 2011).

**Table 1**  
**Sex-wise Distribution of Individual Migrants in the Study Villages**

Akkaram		Chityala		Pata Kodangal		Grand Total	
Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
48 (53)	42 (47)	40 (60)	27 (40)	32 (53)	29 (47)	120 (55)	98 (45)

Source: Field Survey, 2010. Note: Parentheses indicates their respective percentages.

Given the setting, this section attempts to examine the magnitude and significance of seasonal labour migration in the randomly selected study villages in Mahabubnagar district of Telangana State. On the whole, the study divulged that out of total population (1004), 218 individuals or 22 per cent were migrants. Of them, 55 per cent were males and rest females.

### Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana

However, it differs across the villages wherein Akkaram witnessed massive migrations to other regions, with 53 per cent males and 47 per cent female migrants, followed by Chityala and Pata Kodangal villages with male migrants outnumbering female migrants (Table 1). Male members of a household are more inclined to migrate than their female members. Our field experience suggests that the day to day needs, willingness and flexibility to migrate-out any number of times to both nearby and far off places play a critical role in their migration process and male dominance is an example of that. In the case of female member, it could be argued that, societal norms and reluctance due to family responsibility restrict them either directly or indirectly.

**Table 2**  
**Distribution of Migrants according to**  
**Sub-Caste and Sex in the Study Villages**

Name of the Castes	Akkaram		Chityala		Pata Kodangal		Grand Total	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Boya	-	-	6 (60)	4 (40)	-	-	6 (60)	4 (40)
Golla	-	-	4 (67)	2 (33)	2 (40)	3 (60)	6 (55)	5 (45)
Kammari	-	-	3 (50)	3 (50)	-	-	3 (50)	3 (50)
Kummari	-	-	3 (60)	2 (40)	-	-	3 (60)	2 (40)
Lambadas	41 (53)	36 (47)	13 (62)	8 (38)	28 (54)	24 (46)	82 (55)	68 (45)
Madiga	7 (54)	6 (46)	11 (58)	8 (42)	-	-	18 (56)	14 (44)
Telugollu	-	-	-	-	2 (50)	2 (50)	2 (50)	2 (50)
Total	48 (53)	42 (47)	40 (60)	27 (40)	32 (53)	29 (47)	120 (55)	98 (45)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

There is a positive association between respondent's marriage status and migration. For instance, in the study region, most of the migrants were married (62 per cent), 36 per cent were unmarried and one per cent were widows/widowers, with male migrants leading their female counterparts. The number of unmarried male migrants outnumbered their male married counterparts in Akkaram village. On the contrary, number of married women was larger in number than that of their male counterparts. It is, time and again, ascertained that temporary seasonal migration is by and large adopted by unmarried youth and prime working age groups. Further, a large section of migrant working class belongs to the Lambada Tribe (STs) followed by Other Backward Classes (OBCs) and Schedule Castes (SCs) which accounted for 69 per cent, 16 per cent and 15 per cent respectively. But the same differs across the villages where STs primarily migrated from Akkaram and Pata Kodangal villages while OBCs and SCs from Chityala. The caste composition does not present any different portrayal as regards

### Korra

gender wherein male outnumbered female migrants (Table 2). STs are the most vulnerable and economically backward among the downtrodden communities.

The other trait which is associated with seasonal migration at least in the present study region is that majority of the migrants (31 per cent) travelled with four of their family members followed by 30 per cent and 26 per cent migrating together with two and three of their family members respectively. Incidentally, in all the categories male migrants accounted for a larger share than females. The migration process in the region is such that it differs from one village to another within the same socio-economical and geographical district. Such as, from Akkaram majority of the migrants migrated together with four and three of their family members, it was two and four from Chityala and two and three of family members from Pata Kodangal village. The preponderance of four and three person movements from the same household indicates not only the intensity of migration but also vulnerable economic condition of their households. Most of the existing studies on seasonal migration neglected this aspect and captured several other factors that too between two or more distinct districts/regions/states but not within a particular district.

The field survey experience apparently suggests that downtrodden social groups are more prone to witness greater-family out-migration from a household. In this respect a majority of the households belonging to SC community recorded three and four family member migration. While STs reported to have sent two of their family members and OBCs sent-out two and four of their family members. Here there is no uniformity rather it differs across the villages and among social groups. It is no wonder that the subjugated communities witness movements of more number of family members to other places. Ironically, such large-scale family migration is taking place at a time when governments are carving out new schemes and spending crores of rupees for the upliftment of the deprived communities. It looks as if social background and household resources play critical role in poverty ridden communities' lives apart from other factors like pecuniary problems and redundancy.

The age and gender facets further reveal an outsized amount of migrants in the age group of 31-40 and 11-20 years with 29% and 22% respectively. In most of the age groups, except for the 11-20, males outnumbered female migrants. Surprisingly, children aged between 0-10 migrated in modest number. Our interview with head of the surveyed households suggests that the under aged children essentially migrated either

### Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana

along with their parents or with other family members either for employment or for babysitting at the destinations (Table 3). It was also reported by respondents that child migrants drop-out from native village school and remained out of school at the destination. This would apparently deny them bright future in terms of employment prospects.

**Table 3**  
**Distribution of Migrants According to**  
**Age Groups and Sex in the Study Villages**

Age Groups	Akkaram		Chityala		Pata Kodangal		Grand Total	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
0-10 Years	8 (62)	5 (38)	9 (69)	4 (31)	7 (58)	5 (42)	24 (63)	14 (37)
11-20 Years	16 (57)	12 (43)	6 (46)	7 (54)	2 (25)	6 (75)	24 (49)	25 (51)
21-30 Years	5 (38)	8 (62)	11 (58)	8 (42)	8 (50)	8 (50)	24 (50)	24 (50)
31-40 Years	10 (48)	11 (52)	12 (63)	7 (37)	13 (57)	10 (43)	35 (56)	28 (44)
41-50 Years	7 (58)	5 (42)	2 (67)	1 (33)	2 (100)	-	11 (65)	6 (35)
50-60 Years	-	1 (100)	-	-	-	-	-	1 (100)
61-70 Years	2 (100)	-	-	-	-	-	2 (100)	-
Total	48 (53)	42 (47)	40 (60)	27 (40)	32 (52)	29 (48)	120 (55)	98 (45)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

### Features of Seasonal Labour Migrants

This study shows that 53 per cent of migrants are from farming background and rest are non-farm and agricultural daily wage labourers. Significantly, in all the occupational categories, male migrants outnumbered their female counterparts. It is pertinent to draw attention to the fact that most of the studies on migration demonstrate that land owning households are less likely to migrate out. And land ownership has different connotations for different households in different districts/regions/states/nations because of the geological nature and size of the land. Semi-arid district like Mahabubnagar is characterised by infertile land and majority of the households possess land at least from small to medium size. This dry region receives errant and inadequate rainfall hence crop output is normally marginal, erratic and most of the times insufficient. And depending only on agriculture is not sufficient to survive throughout the year and searching alternative means of survival is on the rise in the district. Hence, farming and labour force resort to temporary especially seasonal migration (Bedford et al., 2009).

This study exposed that 35 per cent of migrants from the SC community are in fact non-farm labourers, whereas it was 33% for STs and 32 per cent for OBCs. This is true even in the category of agricultural labour households. In contrast, 88 per cent of STs are cultivators and the SCs and OBCs accounted only for one per cent and 11 per cent, respectively.



## Korra

However, this fluctuates across the study villages (Table 4). The inference here suggests that most of the ST and OBC migrants are better off than that of SCs.

**Table 4**  
**Classification of Migrants' Occupation by Castes in the Study Villages**

Occupation By Castes	Akkaram		Chityala			Pata Kodangal		Grand Total		
	SC	ST	SC	ST	OBC	ST	OBC	SC	ST	OBC
Below 14 years	-	11 (100)	8 (53)	4 (27)	3 (20)	9 (75)	3 (25)	8 (21)	24 (63)	6 (16)
Agri-labour	-	6 (100)	6 (33)	5 (28)	7 (39)	-	-	6 (25)	11 (46)	7 (29)
Cultivators	1 (2)	54 (98)	-	11 (61)	7 (39)	37 (86)	6 (14)	1 (1)	102 (88)	13 (11)
Non-farm labour	12 (67)	6 (33)	2 (13)	1 (6)	13 (81)	6 (100)	-	14 (35)	13 (33)	13 (32)
Total	13 (14)	77 (86)	16 (24)	21 (31)	30 (45)	52 (85)	9 (15)	29 (13)	150 (69)	39 (18)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

It was found that there is an inverse relationship between lack of employment, occupational diversification and migration in the studied villages. Majority of the migrants are illiterates and very marginally educated with primary and secondary level of education. As expected female migrants were predominantly illiterate as compared to their male counterparts. This vindicates the argument that most of the seasonal labour force comprises of illiterates and manual workers with low level of skills.

### *Determinants and Patterns of Seasonal Migration*

Migration during post harvest time from the villages is chiefly a response to the changes in the native economy which emanated from the adverse effects of agricultural sector. It is revealed that majority of the workforce migrated to other destinations with the intention of daily wage earnings (30%). However, surprisingly a good amount of labourers travelled in an attempt to survive (28%), 26 per cent of them migrated for employment and nine per cent owing to debt burden and seven per cent as a result of crop failure. The one difference between survival and employment led migration is that worker who migrate in the absence of food grain and struggle to save his/her life at origin and thus leaves the village to other place to find work in order to endure from hunger and starvation death. Migrant's prime intent is to earn food through selling their labour in open labour market and rest is all secondary for them. In this, migrants from ST community outnumbered their SC and OBC counterparts. This differs again within the respective community. For example, STs moved out for earnings, employment and survival purposes respectively. Among the SCs, it was for survival and wage earnings while for the OBCs it was for employment and wage earnings (Table 5).

Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana

Table 5  
Classification of Individuals Reasons for  
Migration as per Castes in the Study Villages

Reasons	Akkaram		Chityala			Pata Kodangal		Grand Total		
Caste	SC	ST	SC	ST	OBC	ST	OBC	SC	ST	OBC
Survival	5 (17)	24 (83)	8 (30)	12 (44)	7 (26)	5 (100)	-	13 (21)	41 (67)	7 (12)
Employment	3 (9)	32 (91)	-	2 (25)	6 (75)	9 (69)	4 (31)	3 (5)	43 (77)	10 (18)
Earnings	3 (21)	11 (79)	8 (32)	7 (28)	10 (40)	27 (100)	-	11 (17)	45 (68)	10 (15)
Debts	2 (25)	6 (75)	-	-	5 (100)	4 (57)	3 (43)	2 (10)	10 (50)	8 (40)
Crop failure	-	4 (100)	-	-	2 (100)	7 (78)	2 (22)	-	11 (73)	4 (27)
Total	13 (14)	77 (86)	16 (24)	21 (31)	30 (45)	52 (85)	9 (15)	29 (13)	150 (69)	39 (18)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

'Survival migration' takes place in a tricky situation where people face food grain shortage on the one hand, and do not find employment in the origin on the other. They are thus left with no option except to leave their homes in order to survive and overcome the 'distress period' in the village. And the study defines survival seasonal labour migration as a situation where people move out of their homes when there is no wage employment available for them at the place of origin and at the same time face shortage of food grain, subsequently encountering great risk of semi-starvation and hunger. It is a very commonly faced problem and widespread among the economically deprived and indigent families in Mahabubnagar district of Telangana State (Korra, 2011). Such labour outflow takes place in the month of December (52 per cent) followed by in the month of November (35 per cent). It was also found marginal number of labourers who had migrated previous years (prior to survey year) and still continue to stay at the destinations. Interestingly, a significant portion of landless workers migrated prior to land-owning migrants.

The direction of migration from the study villages is to a great extent towards Hyderabad (33 per cent), Mumbai (24 per cent), Pattipadu (11 per cent) and Ahemadabad (10 per cent). In other words, of the total number of migrants, 62 per cent migrated to places within the Telangana State (Intra-state migration) and 38% migrated to places outside the State territory (Inter-state migration). There is no migration that took place within the district. The major intra-state destination is Hyderabad while for inter-state migration it is Mumbai. Rural migrants preferred not to travel outside state and thus remained confined only to Telangana state. This is due to the fact that most of the rural migrants are farmers therefore they decide not to travel far off places since they have to return to the village(s) before the monsoon season begins. It is the landless labourers who took long distance migrations. A

## Korra

significant number (74 per cent) of migrants travelled towards urban towns and cities across the country, while the remaining 26 per cent migrated to rural areas. It was learned from the field that the choice of destination would depend not just on better opportunities but migrant's household characteristics, family size, resource holdings and needs of the day (Bedford et al., 2009).

**Table 6**  
**Distribution of Migrants' Destinations**  
**according to Sex in the Study Villages**

Destinations	Akkaram		Chityala		Pata Kodangal		Grand Total	
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female
Aakaram	3 (60)	2 (40)	-	-	-	-	3 (60)	2 (40)
Ahmadabad	-	-	13 (62)	8 (38)	-	-	13 (62)	8 (38)
Bhainsa	3 (60)	2 (40)	-	-	-	-	3 (60)	2 (40)
Guntur	3 (50)	3 (50)	-	-	-	-	3 (50)	3 (50)
Hyderabad	18 (64)	10 (36)	23 (64)	13 (36)	4 (44)	5 (56)	45 (62)	28 (38)
Mumbai	-	-	-	-	28 (54)	24 (46)	28 (54)	24 (46)
Munugodu	5 (31)	11 (69)	-	-	-	-	5 (31)	11 (69)
Nakirekal	3 (100)	-	-	-	-	-	3 (100)	-
Pattipadu	12 (48)	13 (52)	-	-	-	-	12 (48)	13 (52)
Puttam Gandhi	1 (50)	1 (50)	-	-	-	-	1 (50)	1 (50)
Surat	-	-	3 (43)	4 (57)	-	-	3 (43)	4 (57)
Vadodara	-	-	1 (33)	2 (67)	-	-	1 (33)	2 (67)
Total	48 (53)	42 (47)	40 (60)	27 (40)	32 (53)	29 (47)	120 (55)	98 (45)

On the other hand, in rural stream of migration females were outnumbered by males while males outsized their female counterparts in urban destinations. This sort of dynamic changes are significant as migration represents diversity across the villages wherein Akkaram has witnessed both rural and urban out-migration whereas the other two villages reported only urban migration. Thus, a surprising 62 per cent of migrants from Akkaram moved towards rural destinations. From Chityala, a large proportion of males migrated to Hyderabad while females outnumbered their male counterparts in long distance destinations such as Surat and Vadodara. A major section of male migrants from Pata Kodangal went to Hyderabad while female migrants travelled to Mumbai (Table 6). This is somewhat novel pattern and is a result of multiple causes associated with poverty, landlessness, unemployment, agriculture distress and social backwardness.

### Employment and Wage Patterns of Seasonal Migrants

The main advantages of migrating to economically better-off destinations are that it can offer a variety of economic opportunities like

**Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana**

higher wage rates, higher income, better consumption and savings than that of backward origin places (EPC, 2010).

**Table 7**  
**Patterns of Migrants Employment by their Usual Occupation in the Study Villages**

Type of Employment	Non-workers	Agri-labourers	Cultivator	Non-farm labourers	Total
Under aged children	28 (85)	1 (3)	1 (3)	3 (9)	33 (100)
Agricultural labourers	4 (9)	3 (7)	29 (67)	7 (16)	43 (100)
Construction workers	-	11 (15)	46 (64)	15 (21)	72 (100)
Brick kiln workers	3 (27)	2 (18)	4 (36)	2 (18)	11 (100)
Poultry workers	2 (40)	-	3 (60)	-	5 (100)
Cable trench workers	1 (4)	6 (23)	16 (61)	3 (11)	26 (100)
Load and unload	-	1 (20)	2 (40)	2 (40)	5 (100)
Work in hotel/restaurant	-	-	10 (67)	5 (33)	15 (100)
Auto/taxi drivers	-	-	1 (100)	-	1 (100)
Workers in shops	-	-	1 (25)	3 (75)	4 (100)
Housemaids	-	-	3 (100)	-	3 (100)
Total	38 (17)	24 (11)	116 (53)	40 (18)	218 (100)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

This study exposed that 33 per cent of migrants got engaged in construction work, 20 per cent in agricultural activities, 12 per cent worked as cable and drainage digging workers, and seven per cent worked in hotels and restaurants. Significantly, 15 per cent of the migrant workers did not engage in any kind of economic labour activity and this was mainly owing to under-aged migrant population (below 14 years). Preceding literature on the region highlights two or three major activities in which migrants normally engage in all the destinations they migrate to. In most of the activities, migrants from the cultivator category outnumbered non-farm labourers and agricultural labourers. Interestingly, the category of workers in shops was primarily dominated by non-farm workers (Table 7).

It is found that female migrants were chiefly engaged in agricultural activities and brick-kilns whereas males largely in construction works. Significantly, seasonal migration is considerably characterised by child labour migrants. This is in contrast to the existing studies on seasonal migration, in fact, such studies highlighted child migrants' predominance in longer duration and long distanced migrations (UNICEF/UNFPA, 2009). Our interviews with respondents inform that most of the child migrants did not go to school at the destinations and stayed either at their dwellings or helping/working along with parents at work sites. Thus they remained out

## Korra

of school, not just at the destination, but also at the origin due to frequent seasonal out-migration by their parents (Smita, 2007).

### *Wage Rates of Seasonal Migrants*

With regard to wage rates at various destinations it was found that 17% of the migrants received Rs. 200 as wage per day, 16 per cent of them got Rs. 250, and 15 per cent received Rs. 180 as a daily wage. Shockingly, 18 per cent of the migrant workers received wages between Rs. 50 and Rs. 100 and 12 per cent of them obtained between Rs. 110 and Rs. 150. In contrast, there were few migrant workers who obtained wages up to Rs. 300 per day. The lowest wage rates prevail in rural areas while highest in Mumbai and Hyderabad cities. In most of the wage categories male migrants outnumbered their female counterparts. And, in few categories, females outnumbered males. This difference has to do with the kind of work and destinations that migrants are involved in.

The wage dynamics demonstrates that the lowest wage rates (between Rs. 50 to Rs. 110) were received by migrants from Akkaram while migrants from Chityala obtained medium level wages, i.e., between Rs. 110 to Rs. 200 whereas migrants from Pata Kodangal earned much higher wages - between Rs. 200 to Rs. 300. Significantly, in the rural destinations there was no wage difference between male female migrants whereas in the urban destinations, wage discrimination is widespread. Note that, in rural areas, migrants obtained wages based on the weight of cotton/chilli they picked on a particular working day, for that they received wages between Rs. 2.50 and Rs. 3.00 per one kilogram. During the peak season they get up to Rs. 3.50 per day. This depends on labour supply and extent of work. On an average cotton/chilli picking by a young migrant could vary between 25 to 30 kilograms per day. Thus, they earn lower wages than urban migrants.

The wage patterns of migrants according to rural and urban migration streams shows that 38 per cent of rural migrants earned wage of Rs. 90 followed by 25 per cent and 21 per cent of the migrants obtained Rs. 100 and Rs. 110. And four per cent of them earned Rs. 50 which is far below the current wages in the Indian countryside. On the contrary, in the urban destinations, 43 per cent of the migrants received wages between Rs. 180 and Rs. 200 and following 27 per cent obtained daily wages between Rs. 220 and Rs. 250. While the number of migrants who received daily wage up to Rs. 300 (3 per cent) were insignificant. However, nine per cent of migrants earned wages between Rs. 110 and Rs. 150 per day. This is highly inadequate in the context increasing prices of essentials goods in the country.

### Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana

The low wage rates are sign of the vulnerability that co-exist among poor migratory communities. However, village level dynamics show that migrants from better irrigated village i.e. Pata Kodangal earned better wages while lowest wage earners were from drought prone Akkaram village. One has to bear in mind that wage payments in kind form exist not only in the rural destinations but also in the urban areas.

The other significant facet in migrant's strategy is duration of stay at the destinations. Based on migrants' duration of stay one could define whether they are seasonal or other type of migrants. In this context, seasonal labour migrant could be defined as "a person who stayed less than one year at the destination either for employment or in search of employment or for means of income earning during the post-harvest agricultural season and intended to return to the origin village prior to the onset of the next agricultural season". In the study villages, 28 per cent of migrants stayed for around four months, 18 per cent stayed for about five months and 13 per cent stayed six months at various destinations. On the contrary, 21 per cent of migrants stayed from 7-12 months and 10 per cent of the migrants resided from 18-60 months at the destinations. The rest of them stayed for less than three months.

**Table 8**  
**Distribution of Migrants' Duration of Stay at Destinations**

Duration of stay in months	Akkaram		Chityala	Pata Kodangal	Grand Total	
	Rural	Urban	Urban	Urban	Rural	Urban
2 months	-	-	1 (100)	-	-	1 (100)
3 months	7 (47)	8 (53)	-	1 (100)	7 (44)	9 (56)
4 months	28 (88)	4 (12)	13 (100)	15 (100)	28 (47)	32 (53)
5 months	16 (89)	2 (11)	11 (100)	11 (100)	16 (40)	24 (60)
6 months	-	6 (100)	3 (100)	20 (100)	-	29 (100)
7 months	-	-	18 (100)	-	-	18 (100)
8 months	-	3 (100)	10 (100)	6 (100)	-	19 (100)
9 months	5 (100)	-	-	2 (100)	5 (71)	2 (29)
12 months	-	3 (100)	2 (100)	2 (100)	-	7 (100)
18 months	-	-	-	2 (100)	-	2 (100)
24 months	-	2 (100)	5 (100)	-	-	7 (100)
36 months	-	2 (100)	-	2 (100)	-	4 (100)
48 months	-	4 (100)	-	-	-	4 (100)
60 months	-	-	4 (100)	-	-	4 (100)
Total	56 (62)	34 (38)	67 (100)	61 (100)	56 (26)	162 (74)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

In short, greater amount of migrants (90 per cent) resided up to or below 12 months and only 10 per cent of them stayed from 18 to 60 months at the destination. It is noteworthy to mention that, though all the rural

## Korra

migrants stayed less than nine months but majority of them stayed less than six months at their respective destinations. In contrast, majority of the urban migrants stayed for less than 12 months (Table 8). It is also observed that the cycle of seasonal labour movements takes place from the studied villages every year during the lean agriculture season.

In this 12 per cent travelled twice and eight per cent of them migrated thrice a year. The vulnerable SC, ST groups were less likely to move more number of times than OBCs. The village that is to say agriculturally and economically backward witnesses more of multiple times of labour movements while others are less likely to do so. Migrants who moved to longer distances show a lesser number of movements. Migrants who belong to small and marginal farming communities make shorter trips for employment purposes while landless migrants seem to prefer to stay longer periods instead of moving out a higher number of times from their villages.

### **Migrants Conditions at the Destinations**

The present study shows that 35 per cent of migrant workforce worked nine hours per day, 33 per cent worked 10 hours and the remaining 17 per cent worked the statutory eight hours per day at the destinations. A higher number of urban migrants worked for longer hours than their rural counterparts in all the above-mentioned working hours' categories. Further, rural migrants worked 10 hours. As regards problems faced by migrants the study reveals that, 60% of migrants' opined problem free work while 12 per cent complained about heavy work, 10 per cent reported lack of sanitation and seven per cent stated long working hours as the major problems they faced at the destination.

### **Migrant's Earnings, Remittances and Spending**

The village wise migrants earnings show that the average earnings of rural migrants from Akkaram was Rs. 8,815 and maximum earnings was Rs. 22,000 (median - Rs. 8,100) whereas for urban migrants it is Rs. 19,269 and Rs. 38,000, (median earning - Rs. 20,325) respectively. In the case of Chityala, the average earnings of a migrant is Rs. 20,298 and maximum earning is Rs. 48,400 (median - Rs. 19,550), while in Pata Kodangal, the average earning of a migrant is Rs. 24,643 and the maximum earning, Rs. 69,000 [median - Rs. 23,750]. This suggests that urban migrants' earning capacity is much superior to that of rural migrants. A migrant from a backward village is less likely to earn well as compared to a migrants from

**Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana**

better off villages. The duration of stay at destinations is of course another critical element in deciding their wage income earnings and other aspects of well being.

**Table 9**  
**Classification of Migrants' Income Spending by their**  
**Castes in the Study Villages**

Spending pattern	Akkaram		Chityala			Pata Kodangal		Grand Total		
	SC	ST	SC	ST	OBC	ST	OBC	SC	ST	OBC
Below 14 years	1 (10)	9(90)	5 (46)	3 (27)	3 (27)	9 (82)	2 (18)	6 (19)	21 (59)	5 (16)
Consumption	5 (16)	27(84)	6 (21)	7 (25)	15 (54)	7 (78)	2 (22)	11(16)	41 (59)	17 (25)
Debts	4 (17)	19(83)	2 (18)	3 (27)	6 (55)	5 (71)	2 (29)	6 (15)	27 (66)	8 (20)
Agriculture	3 (20)	12(80)	1 (11)	3 (33)	5 (56)	4 (67)	2 (33)	4 (13)	19 (63)	7 (23)
House built	-	1(100)	-	2 (100)	-	23 (100)	-	-	26(100)	-
Health	-	4(100)	2 (50)	1 (25)	1 (25)	2 (67)	1 (33)	2 (18)	7 (64)	2 (18)
Cattle/implements	-	3(100)	-	-	-	2 (100)	-	-	5 (100)	-
Most of the above	-	1(100)	-	1 (100)	-	-	-	-	2 (100)	-
Others	-	1(100)	-	1 (100)	-	-	-	-	2 (100)	-
Total	13(14)	77(86)	16(24)	21(31)	30 (45)	52 (85)	9 (15)	29(13)	150(69)	39 (18)

Source and Note: Same as for Table 1.

Migrants' income spending reveals 32 per cent of the migrants spent their earnings on daily food consumption followed by 19 per cent spending on repayment of old debts, 14 per cent invested in agriculture, 12 per cent used up for house construction, and the remaining nine per cent spent on health, buying livestock or implements. It was found that migrants from the ST community predominately spent their earnings on daily food consumption followed by the OBCs and SC communities (Table 9). With regard to remittances, 94 per cent of the migrants did not send any remittances to their families back home and carry their earnings along with them when they return to the villages.

This study probed if they get work within their respective villages then will they migrate and 36 per cent of them expressed they want to migrate even if they get employment in the villages especially during the post-harvest agriculture season. However, 64 per cent expressed their unwillingness to migrate to other places if they got work/employment in their own villages. Migrants, who preferred to move out despite the availability of work locally, are primarily interested in earning more wage incomes by taking up urban oriented jobs. The key motivation for higher earnings indeed comes from a strong desire to accumulate income for construction of their own house, repair dwellings, buy land and livestock. But, during the monsoon season they engage in their own cultivation and



## Korra

afterwards, if work was available in the village labour market, they take up employment, although irregular, and thus stay back. This strategy in fact makes possible for them to prepare their arable land for the next agricultural season. Besides, by skipping migration they could also avoid risks involved in migration.

Second, it asked whether they plan to migrate again for the next agriculture season, after returning from the destinations and 70 per cent of them who expressed they would like to migrate again. Most of them supposed that '*their decision to migrate or not*' predominantly depends on various economic, household, crop/yield and climatic conditions in the place of origin. Since most of the migrant households possess arable land the magnitude of migration from these villages fairly depends on the monsoon conditions apart from other household factors.

### Concluding Remarks

The internal dynamics of seasonal labour migration is multifaceted and varies not just across the villages but also between the households within a village economy which played critical role in their decision to migrate out. Seasonal migration is not drastically changing their lives but providing mere by a relief during the adverse times. On the other side, poor and vulnerable migrant groups are exposed to multiple problems at destinations such as hazardous working conditions, labour exploitation, lack of shelter, absence of sanitation, and lack of protection and safety. Incidentally, Indian labour laws/regulations do not address the issues of seasonal migrants and remain ineffective. Thus, it is very important to implement and monitor the labour laws and regulations in order to safeguard the migrant workers. Furthermore, lack of welfare measures under the *Inter-State Work men Act - 1979* is palpable and the laws need to be amended in order to provide government welfare benefits for the migrant population.

### References

- Bedford, C., R. Bedford, et al. (2009), *The Social Impacts of Short Term Migration for Employment: A Review of Recent Literature*, Research report for NZAID, Population Studies Centre, University of Waikato, Hamilton.
- EPC (2010), *The Impact of Temporary and Circular Migration on Migrants, their Families and their Countries of Origin*, 12 October 2010 Workshop Report, European Policy Centre, Bonn.
- Korra, Vijay (2011), 'Labour Migration in Mahabubnagar: Nature and Characteristics', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. XLVI, No. 2, pp. 67-70, January 8.
- Wey, Leah K. Van (2003), 'Land Ownership as a Determinant of Temporary Migration in Nang Rong, Thailand', *European Journal of Population/Revue Européenne de Démographie*, Vol.

**Dynamics of Seasonal Labour Migration from Mahabubnagar District of Telangana**

19, No. 2 (2003), pp. 121-145 Published by: Springer Stable URL:  
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/20164221> Accessed: 02/12/2009; 07:09.

Deshingkar, Priya and Shaheen Akter (2009), 'Migration and Human Development in India', United Nations Development Programme, *Human Development Reports, Research Paper 2009/13*, April 2009.

Smita (2007), *Locked Homes Empty Schools: The Impact of Distress Seasonal Migration on the Rural Poor*, Zubaan Publication, New Delhi.

UNICEF/UNFPA, (2009), *A Rapid Assessment on the Impact of Internal Migration on Women and Children in Suriname*.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 101-112)

## **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

**Uday Singh Rajput\***

*The paper is concerned primarily with the development of the tribal groups residing in the Jhabua district of Western Madhya Pradesh. The paper is based on a study to enquire into the role of NGOs in terms of their performance on the development scale. The present study assesses the role of NGOs in the development of the tribals.*

### **Introduction**

The population of tribal communities scheduled in the Constitution of India which is known as Scheduled Tribe is 10.43 crore as per 2011 census and accounts for 8.6 per cent of the total population of the country. The tribals are spread all over the country residing mainly in the forest and hilly region. More than 70 per cent of the tribal population is inhabited in Madhya Pradesh, Maharashtra, Orissa, Jharkhand, Andhra Pradesh, West Bengal, Gujarat, Rajasthan and Chhattisgarh. The essential characteristics of these communities are primitive traits, geographical isolation, distinctive culture, shyness of contact with other communities and backwardness.

Before independence the colonial government had taken some major steps for their development, though all efforts were based on self-fulfillment. During the British period, tribal communities in India remained mostly

---

\*Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, Indira Gandhi National Tribal University, Amarkantak, District Anuppur (M.P.). E-mail: udayigntu@gmail.com

### **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

isolated from other communities in the country, and consequently, they remained backward and suffered from poverty, malnutrition, illiteracy, marginalisation, exploitation and ignorance in varying degrees (Thakur, 2011). The colonial government did not pay attention towards tribals and stressed upon revenue and natural resources available in tribal areas. After independence, the Government of India scheduled them for special privileges in the constitution. Besides the safeguards, many programmes, policies and laws have been introduced by the Central Government and State Governments for development of tribals. Even today, almost all the basic needs i.e., education, employment, health, sanitation, housing, drinking water, road and social security are not uniformly available in tribal areas. The Human Development Index (HDI) of the STs is much lower than the rest of population. The gap in the literacy rates of tribal and non-tribal is high. Their conditions are far worse from the rest of the population. They have not been able to reach the envisaged level of development despite different opportunities offered to them for their economic development. Their percentage in government jobs is not in proportion to their population, despite the provisions of reservation. Even in private sector, their representation is still dismal. The development process has displaced sizeable number of tribal people from their natural habitat and from the source of their livelihood in recent times. This is a worrisome point that we have spent almost six decades and also plenty of money for development of tribals but we could not achieve our destined aims. There are so many reasons and weaknesses, behind the failure of tribal development programmes such as - repetition of programmes, lack of coordination, lack of tribal participation in each and every programme, weak and poor delivery system, and framing of programmes not according to primary needs of tribal communities. It is a significant fact that no development programme can be successful without active participation of the local people. Active participation is much more important with respect to tribals, because participation is the best way for inculcating self respect and self confidence into tribal people.

The Balawant Roy Mehta committee was constituted by the Government of India for the evaluation of Community Development Programme (CDP) which was started in 1952. The committee pointed out that CDP did not succeed due to lack of appropriate participation of local people. Committee further pointed out that it is not possible only for government to work for their overall development. Therefore, some other agencies should also come forward for their development. The Non-

### **Rajput**

Government Organisations (NGOs) are the most suitable agency for the same. As a matter of fact, NGOs play a vital role in tribal development. They play an important role in developmental activities for the betterment and upliftment of tribals. They also act as a catalytic agent for socialisation of the people. The Government is a huge and complex formal organisation. It is bound up by bureaucratic norms and values. Its ideology is shaped by the ideology of ruling political party. On the other hand, NGOs are relatively less bureaucratic and therefore they are likely to have a free hand in promoting the welfare work (Mehta, 1994). Besides, it is argued that the NGOs have their roots among the masses. They frequently let their soldiers mix with the common man and therefore, it becomes easier for them to mobilise the masses for social reform and development.

The different modes of working processes of the NGOs are the basic reasons for their success. There are no such areas remaining in which NGOs are not working, especially some areas like rural development, environmental conservation, population control, tribal development, awareness, advocacy, where NGOs' achievement is more than that of the Government (Bhose, 2003). All the work which has been done by the NGOs is done keeping in view the public participation in centre. That is why, NGOs' reliability amidst the public is more positive than that of bureaucracy. The activists of NGOs reach among the public to know their culture, social tradition, problems and they try to win faith of the local people. The NGO activists start their major activities according to the project aims and objectives. All the capacity building programmes are very strong and these initial activities decide the NGOs' future work in the field. Besides the flexibility, taking rapid decision and change the policy according to grassroots field reality; are other characteristics of the working process of the NGOs (Sooryamoorthy and Gangrade, 2006). In other words the NGOs exhibit a high degree of flexibility in their functioning (Mehta, 1994). Humanistic approach and dedication are real assets of NGOs. They act quickly without waiting for orders. They can adapt their style of working to suit the changing rural conditions. Their employees hail from local areas and they are familiar with the local conditions and problems. Generally, bureaucracy wants people to come near them, but working process of the NGOs is just opposite to Government. They reach to the people and try to know their problems and provide solutions according to local needs. Another characteristic of working process of NGOs is that they evaluate and monitor all the programmes in different stages of the implementation. These all are the major differences in working process of the NGOs and

### **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

Government. The Government of India has also considered this fact and has been trying to increase participation of NGOs in development activities.

Keeping in mind all the above said traits of the working process of NGOs, the study was concerned with role of NGOs in tribal development. The study has focused on Jhabua district of the Madhya Pradesh. In this study effort has been made to assess the utility of the NGOs' functions, quality of functions, working process and role in development of the tribal population.

#### **The Field and Research Methodology**

The tribal communities are scattered throughout the state of Madhya Pradesh but the study has been conducted in Western part of the Madhya Pradesh where Bhil community is preponderant. According to the 2011 census the tribal population of Madhya Pradesh is 1,53,16,784 constituting 21.9 per cent of the total population of Madhya Pradesh. There are 43 recognised Scheduled Tribes and three of them have been identified as 'Particularly Vulnerable Tribal Group' in the State. The Bhil is the largest tribal community in Madhya Pradesh. The locale of the study is Bhil dominated Jhabua district of Madhya Pradesh.

Jhabua is a predominantly tribal district located in the Western part of Madhya Pradesh. The terrain of Jhabua district is hilly, undulating typically known as "Jhabua hills topography". The Jhabua is sparsely populated area with the total population of 10.2 lakh according to 2011 Census. The total area is 3782 Sq. Kms. About 87.0 per cent of Jhabua population is tribal. The literacy rate in the district is 44.25 per cent according to 2011 Census. Only 34.29 females in this district are literate.

The Bhil is the main tribal community of the Jhabua district but Bhilala, Barela and Pateliya are also living in these areas. Livelihood of Bhils depends on the forest product as well as on agriculture. Their agriculture is mainly rain-fed because they live in the hilly belt where irrigation facilities are not available and the water level is very low. They have small land holdings with less fertile land. Only 8.41 per cent land is irrigated out of the total agricultural land available in the district. In few areas like Petlawad irrigation facility is available for agriculture.

The locale of the study is Jhabua District of the Madhya Pradesh. This district is one of the most backward districts of the Madhya Pradesh. Thirty three NGO have been working in this district for long time. On the basis of nature of activities, locale, target group, working period of NGOs, six NGOs were purposively selected for this study. Secondary data were

## **Rajput**

collected from the offices of the NGOs, government departments connected with the subject. From each NGO two model villages totalling 12 model villages selected for the study. For primary data, two interview schedules, one for beneficiaries and another for NGO were administered to gather information. In this study six NGOs i.e., Sampark Gram Parisar, Action for Social Advancement (ASA), National Centre for Human Settlement and Environment (NCHSE), Prayas, Adiwasi Chetna Sikshan Seva Samiti (ACSSS) and Adivasi Sewashram Trust (AST) have been covered and information from 150 beneficiaries were collected on the impact of intervention undertaken through these NGOs.

### ***Major Intervention of NGOs***

Many activities have been undertaken by the NGOs in Jhabua district. Their intervention can be clubbed under (i) Natural resource management, watershed management and forest conservation, (ii) Agricultural development i.e., distribution of seeds and providing irrigation facility, agricultural tools as well as information for innovative agricultural production, (iii) Health activities i.e., mitigation of fluoride content in water, provide safe drinking water, regular checkup of pregnant women, spreading awareness of family planning and distribution of nutrition diet, (iv) Education extension i.e., child development, establishing *balwadi*, night school and asharam school and creating awareness on education among children, (v) Other activities - micro finance, formation of SHGs, income generating and, self employment activities etc. Thus, it can be said that most of the intervention by NGOs are replication of the government functions but it is true that their intervention process is different from government.

### ***Funding***

NGOs are depended on grants which were provided by government/semi government/foreign agencies or personal donations. They have no regular sources of income. Hence, they are purely dependent on the mercy of donors. Generally, NGOs key person and other execution officer do not want to discuss on expenditure or budget of their organisation.

### ***Need of Activities***

Regarding the efficacy and nesssessity of the intervention by NGOs 95 per cent beneficiaries answered that all the work done by NGOs were essential for village while very few denied the relevance of their

### **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

intervention. The fundamental reason behind this scenario is that the tribals face innumerable problems, so for each and every work they need help.

#### *Changes in Income of Beneficiaries*

The basic aim of the developmental activities done by the NGOs is to make the tribal community economically capable. The study envisaged to find out the impact of NGOs' activities on tribal community. Against this objective, it is inferred from majority of the respondents that their income is enhanced due to growth in agricultural yeilds, saving from agriculture. They also opined that due to NGOs interventions getting loan on the lowest interest from SHGs become possible. However, flower and vegetable agriculture and other minor income generating activities like cottage industries; on the other hand, remained devoid of increased income. The data revealed that those persons, who are connected directly to NGOs, benefited by the schemes and have agreed that income has enhanced due to intervention of the NGOs.

#### *Change in Migration Pattern*

Most of the tribals of Jhabua district migrate to Gujarat, Rajasthan for employment. The basic causes of migration among tribals are small landholding, unproductive land, lack of irrigation and lack of employment opportunity. The intensity of migration increases with bad mansoon. In adverse situation, almost 75 per cent population of the district leave their villages, family and homes and migrate to neighbouring states. This circle of the migration has been continuing for decades and at present it has become an essential part of the tribal's economic system (Sah and Bhatt, 2005). In Jhabua district, NGOs have been rendering so many activities to generate employment and for reducing the migration.

Inferences from the study state that one fourth of the beneficiaries opined that forced migration situation has changed after intervention of the NGOs. Now the intensity of migration, time and numbers of the migrated members per household has reduced as compared to previous years. While about two third beneficiaries have accepted that no changes have occurred in the migration situation.

It is evident from the field that NGOs' efforts are very limited towards reducing the outcome of migration process because each and every tribal family has about five to six needy members, who seek employment but it is difficult for NGOs to employment to give all of them. Besides this, tribal community requires six to seven month of employment and NGOs can not



## **Rajput**

provide them direct employment. That's why no significant changes are evident in migration. However, households who are directly connected with NGOs and involved in some income generating activities they witnessed decline in intensity of migration.

### ***Changes in Occupation***

In Jhabua district, it is envisaged that NGOs could become facilitator for ushering occupational mobility. The opinions of two third beneficiaries of NGOs intervention posit that no special change occurred in the occupational structure among the tribals. However, those respondents who have started vegetables production, floriculture and other cottage industries with the help of NGOs have been able to alter the earlier occupation.

### ***Impact on Standard of Living***

It is imperative that intervention from NGOs should have some positive impact on the everyday life of tribal facilitated by the NGOs. More than 50 per cent beneficiaries opined that with intervention of NGOs they are able to yeild two crops, earlier they are able to produce only once in a year. The NGOs have provided better seeds, irrigation facilities, agriculture tools and scientific information on agriculture to tribal farmer. It is notable that due to lack of irrigation facility in the past, the tribal people were busy in agriculture for only two to three months in a year and migrated out for six to seven months. In the remaining two to three months they used to engage in conflicts with each other. Engaging in quarrels, drinking alcohol and borrowing money from landlord on higher interest rate were common in the past. After capacity building intervention from NGOs, they are more involved in agriculture and conflicts among them have reduced signifiucantly.

One fourth beneficiaries of NGOs intervention are of the opinion that awareness has been generated in tribal viallges with the efforts of NGOs. Now, the tribal communities are concerned with importance of education, PRI, revival of the ancient tradition. About one fourth beneficiaries is of the opinion that due to better health facilities provided by the NGOs, pregnant women have been going to either Govt. hospital or health care centre run by NGOs. The tribal faith has increased in small family norm and they have started adopting means of family planning. Some beneficiaries reported that availability of fodder has been increased in villages for their animals. Only 12 per cent beneficiaries accepted that they are not gaining anything from NGO activities.

## **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

### ***Eradication of Social Evil***

Various social evils are found among Bhil community of Jhabua region. These evils are major constraints for their backwardness. Alcoholism is the biggest social evil and dowry system called '*dapa*' (bride price) preponderant in this community (Sampark, 2006). It is also very important to note that some positive rituals which were basic foundation of tribal society have been gradually forgotten by the Bhil community. 'Sampark' is working on eradication of social evil among Bhils. Sampark's efforts were outstanding in the initial stage, but after 45 years the speed and zeal of programme as well as faith of the community could not be sustained. However, significant achievement can be seen at the grassroots level awareness i.e., tribals are realising that lack of education and existing social evils are massive obstacles in the way of their development.

### ***Fluoride Mitigation Programmes***

Jhabua district is influenced by fluoride in ground water. Potable water is not available in some areas of the district. The public health and engineering department of the district has organised a survey and found that 1,275 hand pumps in the 453 villages of the district are the worst affected by fluoride and water is not safe for drinking. But due to lack of awareness and other option, villagers were usually drinking that unhygienic water. ACSSS (NGO) has started working on this problem. In the beginning, ACSSS mobilised the local people and shared a solution among the villagers. The villagers awakened and a family donated their land for construction of dam. With the support of villager pond, water tank, pipe line was constructed within six months with 20 per cent contribution of the villagers. Now, all the villagers are availing safe drinking water and they also irrigate their land through the newly constructed pond. It is indeed an outstanding achievement for ACSSS. Such type of innovative efforts are also been undertaken by NCHSE working in Jhabua district.

### ***Impact on Indebtedness***

Tribal communities in tribal areas are emerged with indebtedness and have exploited by the local *mahajans*. Low agriculture income, unemployment and time spent on social evil lead tribals to financial constraints. In this situation, the tribal borrow the money from local money lenders on high interest rate for fulfilment of their essential need. The money lenders obtain high interest and tribals cannot return the loan easily due to their low income. Thus, this process of exploitation carries on from

## Rajput

generation to generation. Bhil community of Jhabua district are exploited repeatedly due to their fragile resource base.

The NGOs working in Jhabua, at first take stock of problem of indebtedness and then tried to hit the roots of indebtedness. These NGOs have pinched a common conclusion that without social reforms the economic reforms are very difficult to bring in the Bhil society. The NGOs at first created awareness on demerits of indebtedness and started forming self help groups (SHGs). All the six NGOs covered in the study have formed SHGs in the tribal society. The Sampark and ASA have formed about 350 and 400 SHGs respectively. The NGOs tried to mobilise people, create faith among the locals and build a bank where the needy person can borrow money on low interest rate fixed by SHGs. NGOs' employees also build the capacity of these institution and ushered new income generating activities among the member of SHGs. The SHG members are the ambassadors of NGOs, because they are actively involved in each and every programme and also spread awareness in the village.

In the changing scenario SHGs are getting loan from SHGs for fulfilment of their essential requirement. Due to intervention of NGOs saving culture has been developed among tribal SHG members and SHGs are emerged as an alternative of money lenders in the tribal areas.

### *Empowerment of PRI*

After the enactment of 73<sup>rd</sup> Constitution Amendment, the PESA Act, 1996 has significantly altered the implementation of Panchayat Raj Institutions (PRIs) in Fifth Scheduled Areas (Sah and Sisodia, 2004). The gram panchayats play a significant role in the implementation of most of the rural development schemes. The tribal panchayats have more power in comparison to non-tribal panchayat under PESA. But ground reality suggests that all the power which is vested in tribal panchayat cannot be ushered without proper awareness of tribal community. NGOs play a vital role in the functioning of Panchayat Raj Institution in tribal areas. NGOs like Sampark, AST and Prayas have done significant work on empowerment of PRIs. They organised *Gram Sammelan*, *Gram Mahotsavs* and established *Soochna Kendra* (information centre) for spreading information regarding set-up, power and functions of PRI among the tribal people. They also organised many training programmes for providing information regarding the PESA Act, so that tribals could understand the importance of PESA and could manage the natural resources, conserve and protect their traditions and rituals. Along with these activities on efforts for women empowerment have

### **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

also been undertaken by these NGOs. These institutions have given training to facilitate and organise gram sabha meeting and informed the tribals about their rights, power and functions regarding new panchayat raj system.

#### **Limitation of Works**

The changes in all the aspects of tribal society are evident through the interventions of NGOs. However, when we evaluate the NGOs functions in terms of the sustainability of works, efficacy of works, selection of beneficiaries, it is inferred that there are some limitations in the NGOs interventions. The main limitations are (i) it is a fact that employee is the soul of any organisation. Efficiency, achievement and capacity of any organisation depend on the employee. Unskilled and untrained employees have been found in all NGOs and lack of leadership, planning and coordination among the employees has been witnessed during the study. (ii) As discussed earlier most of the NGOs have formed SHGs in the initial stage for the purpose of building capacity on the grassroots level so that strong relations can be developed between NGOs and target groups. At the grassroots level all the selected NGOs rapidly formed SHGs in initial stage but after four-five years, the number has decreased. The basic reason behind the disintegration of SHGs was lack of continuous care and guidance to SHG members. Lack of appropriate process of constitution of SHGs, transparency regarding finance and continuous guidance to the SHG members were also the problems in the way of SHGs' sustainability. (iii) Most of the NGOs were rendering their services in agricultural development but many limitations were observed in such activities. They have provided better seeds and many agricultural tools like pipe, diesel engine, thresher, bullock cart but on one hand their prices are high and on the other hand, the seeds and tools are not suitable for the undulating stony land of Jhabua. (iv) Most of the NGOs are trying to eradicate social evils which influence tribal economic status for several years but the achievement is very low regarding the same. The basic reason for the failure of such kind of activities is that the scope of the field and period were very limited for these activities. On the other hand, elite and influential people of the villages are not willing to eradicate social evils. Thus, after exit from the project the activities regarding eradication of social evils are not happening at ground level. (v) Two thirds of selected NGOs have been rendering their services for education and child development. For this purpose, they have opened the Asharam School and Balwadi, but there was lack of basic primary facilities like sanitation, sufficient space, necessary books, playground, safe drinking water, and also trained and committed

### **Rajput**

teachers. (vi) Almost all the NGOs have been handling watershed projects and these projects have more fund and long span of implementation. But some NGOs have not cared about significance of participation of local people. Local people have been continuously demanding that the water structures should be made bigger in size, though, number can be reduced. The NGOs have made many small water storage structures rather than big ones as demanded by people. It seems that NGOs have not given attention to local needs of the tribals. (vii) In addition, most of the NGOs have not done evaluation and monitoring of the project after the implementation or during implementation. The elite representatives and influential persons of the villages were benefited more from NGOs work while almost all the needy and poor people sidelined from NGOs' activities and schemes. It is a fact that any NGO who starts any activity on village level firstly has to meet *Tadavi Patel* (tribal head of the village), Sarpanch and other influential persons of the village to get their consent for the implementation of the scheme and these elites are continuously demanding to get individual benefits out of the scheme from that NGO. It is a grassroots reality that without the consent of local influential persons, NGO cannot work in that village. Consequently, the elite class of the village plays major role in selection of work, prioritisation and decision making process regarding the NGO's work.

### **Suggestion**

From the inferences of the study, it is suggested that (i) NGOs must emphasise to fulfilment of primary needs of tribals instead of fulfilment of project's aims and objectives. (ii) NGOs must try to eradicate superstition and social evils and also try to revive benevolent tribal traditions which have been forgotten by tribals. (iii) Another limitation NGO intervention is that there is no evaluation or monitoring system. The NGOs should give more attention towards social auditing and monitoring at local level which can reduce wastage of fund. (iv) The NGOs should not be influenced by dominant/elite people and their priority should be serving the poorest of the poor. (v) The NGOs should maintain cooperation with Gram Panchayat to curtail conflicts with local leadership. (vi) Overlapping of programme implementation must stop. It is suggested that NGOs should adopt new areas or villages for welfare activities. (vii) It is a worrisome fact that there is no linkage/coordination among the NGOs working in the same district even when some of them work for the same objectives and goal. It is suggested that coordination should be created among the NGOs, innovative strategy

### **Role of NGOs in Tribal Development in Jhabua District of Madhya Pradesh**

and knowledge should be shared among them for the development of tribal people.

#### **Conclusion**

In a nutshell, it could be stated that some NGOs are making extensive efforts for tribal development at Jhabua district of Madhya Pradesh. Most of them are trying to address the basic issues of tribal development through their intervention in education, microfinance and watershed development. Some loopholes are evident in their working procedure, it should be commensurate with need and just participation of the tribal people. The suggested issues mentioned above are very important for efficacy of NGOs specially those which are working at grassroots level. If the NGOs can bring in changes in their working process with equal just participation of the tribals, the NGOs will be proved themselves as the actual agents of social, economic and technological changes required in the Jhabua district of Madhya Pradesh.

#### **References**

- Bhose, Joel S.G.R. (2003), *NGOs and Rural Development: Theory and Practice*, Concept Publishing Company, New Delhi.
- Mehta, Prakash Chandra (1994), *Voluntary Organisation and Tribal Development*, Shiva publishers, Udaipur.
- Rajput, Uday Singh (2011), *Adivasi Vikas Evam Gair Sarkari Sanghathan*, Rawat Publication, Jaipur.
- Sah, D.C. and Bhatt, Ashish (2005), *Chronic Poverty in Western Tribal Belt of Madhya Pradesh*, Madhya Pradesh Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain.
- Sah, D.C. and Sisodia, Yatindra Singh (2004), *Tribal Issues in India*, Rawat Publication, Jaipur.
- Sampark (2006), *Lok Paramparao kai Raste Vikas Ki Yatra*, Sampark, Petlawad.
- Sooryamoorthy R. and Gangrade K.D. (2006), *NGOs in India: A Cross Sectional Study*, Rawat Publications, Jaipur.
- Thakur, Devendra (1997), *Role of Voluntary organisation in tribal development*, Deep Publications, New Delhi.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*  
(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)  
ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 20, No. 2, December 2015, pp. 113-116)

*Book Review*

**Indian Village: A Conceptual History**

Manish Thakur

Rawat Publications, Jaipur, 2014, Page 214, Rs. 650.00

**Younis Ahmad Sheikh\***

India is a land of villages. There are no fewer than six lakh villages in India. About 70 per cent people of India live in villages. So, it is rightly said that real India lives in villages. A typical Indian village lacks several facilities, particularly in backward states. Villages are the biggest support for India, from the past to future. They are the one, with which the world recognises India. Against this backdrop, Manish Thakur's book 'Indian Village: A Conceptual History' is a valuable contribution. Manish Thakur had explained the Indian village very beautifully. In the introduction part, he draws our attention towards the village, the most ubiquitous and intelligible human settlement. He explores the idea of the Indian villages in historical and contemporary context and examines the way in which this idea has ideologically interacted with the state. The first articulation of an idea of the Indian village took place with the British colonisation of the sub-continent and the introduction of British precepts of administration. He further pointed out that for long; village has been the basic units of agrarian organisation. The village occupied a pride of place in the official social morphology of the colonial state.

---

\*Maulana Azad National Fellow of UGC, M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain.  
E-mail: unisrashid@ymail.com

### Book Review

The second chapter of the book, titled 'Colonial Construction of the Village', discussed that settlement of land revenue was the first major administrative act of the British government. He pointed out that villages offer as an entry point to retrospectively assess the history and character of colonial forms of knowledge. The colonial state has had extraordinary effects on the basic structures of contemporary Indian life, and hence, the colonial construction of the village affords us a peep into our own past and present. This chapter places administrative practices in relation to the larger enterprise of colonial construction of Indian society and demonstrates how the village presents an interesting pretext to look into the British understanding of the Indian society and use within the colonial administration of what were considered to be the key units of the society. This chapter also tells us the specific meaning of the term 'Village' is seen here as part of the history of colonial knowledge about India and the use of that knowledge in the official projects. Manish Thakur pointed out that by the 19th century the village in India had become burdened with many meanings-an archaic and primary nucleus of Indian society, an autonomous political-administrative unit and an economically self-sufficient entity. Substance agriculture, low-technology crafts and services, timelessness of life styles and immobility of people, accompanied by their ideological integration to land, were projected as some of the essential attributes of an Indian village.

The third chapter, titled as 'The Indian Village and Western Social Theory and Historiography' explores the way in which the idea of the Indian Village came to inform the intellectual currents of the British society itself. According to Maine, India had a curious relationship with Europe in past. However, Maine's theory of the village did not arise from any intrinsic interest in the history of India as such but was inspired by the assumption that a local system could be found in the orient similar to that which existed in Europe's distant past. In the writings of both Marx and Maine, village is treated as a pretext to expound and delineate their larger theoretical concerns. Whereas, Maine's study of the village community in India was guided by 'a quest for our contemporary ancestors', Marx was driven by a desire to unlock the secret of Asian stagnation.

Baden-Powell argued two types of villages in India- the jointly held villages of the Aryans, and the ideal-typical Indian villages. Contrary to what Marx and Maine had said, for Baden-Powell, joint villages were not the widely distributed type; rather they were confined mostly to north India. What have been typical instead were the ryotwari (several) types of villages. Manish further throws light on the orientalist discourse and the production



### Sheikh

of the Indian village and the historiography of the Indian villages. Stokes (1959), Guha (1963) and more recently Matcalf (1998) and Mehta (1999) have convincingly shown that British rule in India was not a disconnected, separated and isolated fragment of English history. In this chapter, author highlighted that colonial rule over India has, in fact, held a mirror up to Great Britain reflecting the English character and mind. Ideas regarding India have been enmeshed with political and social doctrines of the day, and many of the ideational battles in England were waged on the Indian question and rested upon Indian experience. Thus, it was no one way traffic where current of ideas prevalent in England unilaterally found practical expression in Indian polity. This chapter also articulates a theoretical framework where the ideas of the colonisers and the colonised can be seen as belonging to a unitary field of analysis.

Chapter four presents competing connotation of the village amongst the nationalist intelligentsia, as witnessed in the heated disputes in the constituent assembly on the issue. It shows how the nationalist construction of the village got tied up with fierce struggles over the meanings and practises of state administration, traditional authority (social structure) and understanding of popular country's independence. This chapter endeavours to colonialist constructions of the village. This chapter also attempts to peep into the inherent fault lines of the nationalist project and also examine the changing context and conduct of the relationship between the nation and the village during the hey days of the Indian nationalism.

Chapter five, titled, 'The Village in Sociology/Social Anthropology' takes critical look at the village and tried to find out how the idea of the village came to occupy a pride of place in the colonial and nationalist construction of Indian society and tried to bring out their salient features. The objective here is not to reiterate what the earlier surveys of literature have already presented. Rather, made an attempt to glean from the enormous corpus of literature the particular ideas of the village that have shaped the research orientations of the practitioners of Sociology/Social Anthropology. The author in this chapter only seeks to probe the strengths and limitations of analytical approaches and methodological renderings that have dominated conventional village studies.

In Chapter six, Manish Thakur tried to highlight the issues which are interconnected between the concepts of the village and the discourse on rural development. Rural development aimed at improving the conditions of rural society. The conceptual joining of the village and development through the mediation of the state and its various kinds of agencies is discussed in this

### Book Review

chapter. This chapter also tried to find out whether the image of the village current in the discourse on rural development coverage with that of the dominant sociological and social anthropological writings or can one find a marked dissonance between the two? The chapter also tells us that the beginnings of the rural development were made during the British rule. However, from the beginning of the twentieth century, colonial policy makers showed increasing concern about agrarian stagnation and introduced various welfare services. After independence, much focus was given to the village. The villagers were seen like drought in the hands of planners and the government. Rural development programmes were implemented, democracy and development were taken to be cardinal principles of the post-colonial enterprise of nation-building. This chapter explores the argument that the developmental focus on the village helps the state in getting a renewed legitimacy as a crucial modernising agency. The state can justify its popular sovereignty as a modernising instrument in an underdeveloped society only by maintaining and sustaining a rural development discourse. The chapter problematises the 'village' of the rural development programmes because the focus is not on how the village processes rural developmental programmes but on how the village gets processed by these programmes.

Chapter seven presents the conclusion of the study in terms of the changing state-society relationship. Although the colonial state widened its dealings with Indian society and understand the colonialism in India in the same way as caste made Indian people amenable to British understanding. Caste view of Indian society seems to have overtaken the village view. This chapter argues that the colonial rule created the distance between the state and the society. It also argues that the knowledge of the 'village' has been a construct, in the sense that it is the result of a great number of decisions and selective incorporations of previous ideas, beliefs and images. Manish Thakur further highlighted the issue that village always remain an issue of development. Rural development becomes the medium in which the villagers also start expressing their location and the historical trajectory of the national development enterprise. In this concluding chapter, author also raised some important research questions about the implication of administrative categories in relation to social identities that is, how villagers conceptualise their social-cultural boundaries in the wake of administrative categorisation. Also it examines the essentialisation of identities that would have remained vacuous had the state not lent its all-pervasive legitimacy to the process.

## **Instructions to Authors**

### ***Communication***

The M.P. Institute of Social Science Research (MPISSR) welcomes articles of interest representing original work, analytical papers and papers based on review of extensive literature on any aspect of Social Sciences for publication in *Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*. All communication should be addressed to the Editor, MPJSS, M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, 6, Prof. Ram Sakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone, Ujjain - 456010.

### ***Manuscript***

Article should be double-spaced typewritten on one side of A4 size paper. The length of the article may be 5000 to 8000 words. Article must be accompanied by an abstract of 100 words. Articles should be submitted in softcopy through e-mail at [mpjssujain@gmail.com](mailto:mpjssujain@gmail.com) as well as in hardcopy.

### ***Review System***

Every article will be reviewed by a masked peer review by two referees. The criteria used for acceptance of articles are contemporary relevance, contribution to knowledge, clear and logical analysis, fairly good English and sound methodology of research articles. The Editor reserves the right to reject any manuscript as unsuitable in topic, style or form without requesting external review.

### ***Spellings***

Use British spellings in all cases instead of American (Concise Oxford Dictionary).

### ***Numbers***

Use figures to express all numbers 10 and above. Use words to express numbers lower than 10, and common fractions numbers that begin a sentence/title.

### ***Tables***

Type each table on a separate page. Insert a location note at the appropriate place in the text. Minimise the use of tables.

### ***References***

All notes and references should be at the end of the article first 'Notes' and then 'References'. Notes should be serially numbered in the text using superscript and the corresponding notes should be listed out separately at the end of the article. References listed at the end should be arranged alphabetically.

## **M.P. Institute of Social Science Research** **Ujjain - 456010 (M.P.)**

---

The M.P. Institute of Social Science Research (MPISSR) is an autonomous, multi-disciplinary centre for research and training of Indian Council of Social Science Research (ICSSR), New Delhi and Ministry of Higher Education, Government of Madhya Pradesh.

Research activities of MPISSR are concerned with issues relating to social, economic, political, cultural, administrative and civic aspects of India in general and Madhya Pradesh in particular. The Institute has been working for the last three decades with an unfettered spirit of exploration, rationality and enterprise to pursue research and training activities for generating understanding, knowledge and linkages between field realities and public policies.

The basic aim of MPISSR is to engage in research on relevant contemporary issues and disseminate the research findings for the enhancement of the existing knowledge and for the well being of the society through policy input. MPISSR has been working on following thematic areas: Panchayat Raj and Rural Development; Studies in Scheduled Tribes and Scheduled Castes; Democracy, Electoral Behaviour, Social Justice and Human Rights; Development and Deprivation; Studies in Education; Gender Studies; Studies in Environment; Information Technology and Society; and New Economic Policy and Society.

MPISSR caters to the needs of policy planners, academia, legislators, non-governmental organisations, researchers, research organisations and functionaries of international organisations. Dissemination of knowledge through research publication; collaborating in research; imparting research training; assisting and advising through policy research and evaluation studies are core activities of the Institute.

MPISSR is registered under section 6 (1) of the Foreign Contribution (Regulations) Act, 1976, Ministry of Home Affairs, Government of India, New Delhi. Donations made to MPISSR are qualified for exemption under section 80-G of the Income Tax Act, 1961.

---

Registered with Registrar of Newspapers for India under no. R.N. 66148/96.

Printed and Published by Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia  
on behalf of the M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain

Editor : Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia