

ISSN : 0973-855X

# Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences

Vol. 24

December 2019

No. 2

Chief Editor  
Nalini Rewadikar

Editor  
Yatindra Singh Sisodia

Associate Editors  
Manu Gautam  
Tapas Kumar Dalapati



**M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain**

# Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences

*Chief Editor*

**Professor Nalini Rewadikar**

*Editor*

**Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia**

*Associate Editors*

**Dr. Manu Gautam**

**Dr. Tapas Kumar Dalapati**

*Advisory Board*

**Professor L.S. Rathore** (Political Science), Former Vice Chancellor,  
J.N. Vyas University, Jodhpur (Raj.)

**Professor I.S. Chauhan** (Sociology), Former High Commissioner of  
India in Fiji, Bhopal (M.P.)

**Professor U.S. Chaudhary** (Education), Former Vice Chancellor,  
Devi Ahilya Vishwavidyalaya, Indore (M.P.)

**Professor Sandeep Shastri** (Political Science), Pro Vice Chancellor,  
Jain University, Bengaluru (Karnataka)

**Professor M. Indira** (Economics), University of Mysore, Mysore  
(Karnataka)

**Professor G. Palanithurai** (Political Science), Gandhi Gram Rural  
Institute, Dindigul (Tamil Nadu)

**Professor Ganesh Kawadia** (Economics), School of Economics, Devi  
Ahilya University, Indore (M.P.)

**Professor D.K. Verma** (Sociology), Dr. Baba Sahab National Institute  
of Social Sciences, MHOW (M.P.)

**Professor S.N. Chaudhary** (Sociology), Barkatullah University,  
Bhopal (M.P.)

**Professor Sanjay Kumar** (Political Science), Centre for the Studies of  
Developing Societies, Delhi

**Professor Ashutosh Kumar** (Political Science), Punjab University,  
Chandigarh

**Professor Y.G. Joshi** (Geography), M.P. Institute of Social Science  
Research, Ujjain (M.P.)

**Professor D.C. Sah** (Economics), M.P. Institute of Social Science  
Research, Ujjain (M.P.)

**Professor Sandeep Joshi** (Commerce), M.P. Institute of Social Science  
Research, Ujjain (M.P.)

ISSN: 0973-855X

# **MADHYA PRADESH JOURNAL OF SOCIAL SCIENCES**

Vol. 24

December 2019

No. 2

Chief Editor

**Nalini Rewadikar**

Editor

**Yatindra Singh Sisodia**

Associate Editors

**Manu Gautam**

**Tapas Kumar Dalapati**



**M.P. Institute of Social Science Research**

Autonomous Institute of Indian Council of Social Science Reserch, Ministry of HRD, Govt. of India,  
New Delhi and Ministry of Higher Education, Govt. of Madhya Pradesh, Bhopal  
6, Ramsakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
Ujjain - 456010 (Madhya Pradesh)

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences* is a *peer-refereed* journal published biannually by M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain. It is devoted to research on social, cultural, economic, political, administrative and contemporary issues, problems and processes at the state, national and international levels. No conditions are imposed to limit the subject matter of the articles in any manner. The journal welcomes research papers, review articles, research notes, comments and book reviews on topics which broadly come under the purview of social sciences.

Manuscripts, subscriptions and other correspondence should be addressed to:

### **The Editor**

Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences  
M.P. Institute of Social Science Research  
6, Ramsakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
UJJAIN - 456 010 Madhya Pradesh (India)  
Phones: (0734) 2510978, Fax: (0734) 2512450  
E-mail: [mpjssujain@gmail.com](mailto:mpjssujain@gmail.com), Website: [www.mpissr.org](http://www.mpissr.org)

### **Subscription Rates**

<b>Annual</b>	
Institutes	Rs. 500.00
Individuals	Rs. 400.00
<b>Per Copy</b>	
Institutes	Rs. 250.00
Individuals	Rs. 200.00

The subscription of the journal may be sent through Demand Draft drawn in favour of the Director, MPISSR, Ujjain.

The MPISSR will appreciate receiving journals/periodicals/research publications from other Institutes/Organisations in exchange of the *Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*.

---

The views expressed in all the contributions which appear in the journal are those of the individual authors and are not to be taken representing the views of the Editor or of the MPISSR.

*We gratefully acknowledge the financial assistance received from the Indian Council of Social Science Research, New Delhi for the Publication of this Journal.*

ISSN: 0973-855X

**Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences**  
*A Biannual Journal of*  
M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain

---

Vol. 24	December 2019	No. 2
---------	---------------	-------

---

**CONTENTS**

<b>The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades</b> S. Sharada and Sony Pellissery	<b>1</b>
<b>Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana</b> Brajaraaja Mishra and K. Hanumantha Rao	<b>16</b>
<b>Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing from Darjeeling and Kalimpong</b> Anup Shekhar Chakraborty	<b>27</b>
<b>Impact of Out-Migration from Utrakhand: Insights from the Field</b> Kavita Baliyan and G.S. Mehta	<b>45</b>
<b>Economic Impact on Displaced Women: A Study on Two Dam Projects in Jammu and Kashmir</b> Sudesh Kumar and A.J. Mishra	<b>67</b>
<b>Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal: A Case Study</b> Annweshha Chanda and Dilip Kumar Chanda	<b>85</b>

<b>Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism</b> Pareswar Sahu and Motilal Mahamallik	<b>94</b>
<b>Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes: An Analysis</b> Anurodh Godha, Aparna Sharma and Monika Talreja	<b>107</b>
<i>Book Review</i> <b>Labour Market Participation in India: A Region and Gender Specific Study (Arup Mitra and Aya Okada)</b> Vinod Sen	<b>119</b>

---

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 1-15)

## The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades

Sharada Srinivasan\* and Sony Pellissery†

*Planning Commission was an important creation to realise the dream of a distributive society for an independent nation like India amidst huge inequalities. Yet, this was not a Constitutional body. B. R. Ambedkar, the Chairman of the drafting committee of the Constitution of India, cautioned that a carefully drafted Constitution could be perverted through administrative arrangements. The story of the making and unmaking of the Planning Commission is one of the best illustrations of how Ambedkarite fears were true. This paper unravels the politics of planning in the Indian context through the case study of the Planning Commission and its transformation to NITI Aayog in 2014. The paper argues that where the idea of planning is not indigenous, what is done in the name of planning is more critical than planning itself.*

### Introduction

Is the idea of planning indigenous to Indian society and culture? If not, where are these ideas coming from? If yes, what segment of Indian society and culture understands and internalises the ideals of planning? If the idea of planning is not indigenous to India, what attempts are made to contextualise planning theory in India? If the attempt to contextualise planning theory has not taken place in India, what kind of planning

---

\* Doctoral Student, University of Pennsylvania, USA. E-mail: sharadas@law.upenn.edu.

† Professor, Institute of Public Policy, National Law School of India University, Bangalore.  
E-mail: sonyp@nls.ac.in

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

institutions and exercises could be expected? What are the likely outcomes of such non-contextualised planning exercises? What legitimacy is possible for the institutions of planning if the very idea of planning is divergent from cultural values and ethos? What interests are being served through planning exercise? Answers to these questions are at the heart of the politics of planning. These broad questions need to be answered not philosophically but through empirical cases. Historical discontinuity through termination of the Planning Commission and replacement of the same with NITI Aayog provides an excellent empirical case to seek answers to these questions. This paper analyses the discourses, how these discourses were divided and converged in the journey towards institutionalisation of NITI Aayog in 2014.

The politics of the making of the Planning Commission, and particularly the absence of Constitutional legitimacy, have been documented by many researchers (Frankel, Chatterjee, Guha). While the politics of making of the Planning Commission is overshadowed by depoliticisation of development (giving a prominent hand for technocracy over ideological debates), the politics of unmaking of the Planning Commission is primarily led by decreased space for politics in the context of economic liberalisation. Both types of politics have been an axe on the transformative Constitution that was envisioned by its founding fathers.

#### **Transformative Constitution and Deformative Planning**

At the heart of the transformative Constitutional vision is an aim to break away with “old forms of state, society, and culture (social formations) and inaugurating a new order of things” (Baxi, 2013). This was the dream of the founding fathers of the nation-state of India. The first prime minister of the country, Jawaharlal Nehru, viewed the objective of the Constitution as “the removal of all invidious social and customary barriers which come in the way of the full development of the individual as well as of any group” (Baxi, 2013). On the other hand, the architect of Indian Constitution, B. R. Ambedkar, viewed the Constitution of India as a tryst with destiny to live with contradictions: *“On the 26th of January 1950, we are going to enter into a life of contradictions. In politics, we will have equality and in social and economic life we will have inequality. In politics, we will be recognising the principle of one man one vote and one vote one value. In our social and economic life, we shall, by reason of our social and economic structure, continue to deny the principle of one man one value. How long shall we continue to live this life of contradictions? How long shall we continue to deny equality in our social and economic life? If we continue to deny it for long, we will do so only by putting our political democracy in peril. We must remove this contradiction at the earliest possible moment or else those*



### Srinivasan and Pellissery

*who suffer from inequality will blow up the structure of political democracy which this Assembly has so labouriously built up (Ambedkar, 1948)."*

Inking a Constitution alone could not reconcile the contradictions. At the same time, there was no unanimous approach among leaders, thinkers and policymakers as to what should be the path to achieve the vision of a transformative Constitution. Eventually, the same Constitution did not specify how this had to be achieved. It was left open. In this sense, Maoist violence could be justified saying, violence was one of the ways of achieving the Constitutional vision for society (Kannabiran, 2003). Such an argument is as equally powerful as saying Constitutional vision could be achieved through planning or relying on market forces. Though the Constitution did not specify, the executive arm of the state decided to adopt planning as the mechanism to implement the Constitutional vision.

In the context of Indian state being formed from erstwhile regional states, the Constituent Assembly did not endorse the idea of a centralised planning body as a part of the constitutional structure. On 3rd September 1949, the response of B. R. Ambedkar in the Constituent Assembly to the questions of planning power by the states is important to consider. Concerning the subject matter of planning, he said "What the State would not be entitled to plan would be 'religion'; everything else would be open to the State". On the one hand, concerning who should do the planning, he emphasised the active role for the regional state governments: "the State also would have the freedom to do its planning in its way. It is only when the Centre begins to have a plan and if that plan conflicts with the plan prepared by the State that the plan prepared by the State will have to give way and this is in no sense, an encroachment upon the planning power of the State". Because of this demand for autonomy by the regional states, the Constitution did not adopt centralised planning as a principle.

Though Ambedkar did not favour local planning, since he found the autonomy of villages was against the interests of minorities and marginalised sections within the village communities, Gandhian ideals of the village republic played a critical role in shaping the discourses on governance (Singh, 2003). Eventually, district planning was adopted in the Constitution through the 73rd Amendment. A history of community development and commissions that suggested governance changes since 1965 is instrumental to these changes. This idea comes from the belief in decentralised structures and Gandhian village republics.

Having failed to get a Constitutional backing for the idea of planning and planning institutions, Prime Minister Nehru had to create the

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

statutory body through a Cabinet Resolution, which set up the Planning Commission in March 1950. However, two earlier precedents, namely the National Planning Committee constituted by Indian National Congress in 1935, and separate Department of Planning and Development by the Government of India in 1944 exist on which Planning Commission relied its historical legacy. There is wide agreement that since there was no Constitutional provision the Planning Commission was an extra-constitutional body (Rao, 2014).

It is important to recognise the deep and clear connections between five-year plans prepared by the Planning Commission and the interests of the industrialist class. Eight very powerful industrialists had prepared what is known as the Bombay Plan in 1944. Bombay Plan charted a roadmap of state intervention once the British left the country. There were two key objectives to the Bombay Plan. First, the growth of agriculture by two-fold as well as growth of the industrial sector by five-fold. Second, the industrial class from the country be protected from the competition with foreign capital. The eight industrialists who were the architects of the Bombay plan had strong connections both within the country as well as global economic order.

The eight industrialists who gave shape to Bombay Plan were Jehangir Ratanji Dadabhoy Tata, Ghanshyam Das Birla, Ardeshir Dalal, Sri Ram, Kasturbhai Lalbhai, Ardeshir Darabshaw Shroff, Sir Purshottamdas Thakurdas and John Mathai. Ardeshir Shroff had attended United Nations Bretton Woods Conference. What is most interesting is the case of John Mathai. He went on to become the second Finance Minister of India (1949-1950) and eventually resigned in protest at the growing power of the Planning Commission. The press statement issued by John Mathai read: "I consider the Planning Commission not merely ill-timed but in its working and general set-up ill-conceived. The Planning Commission was tending to become a parallel cabinet...it would weaken the authority of the Finance Ministry and gradually reduce the Cabinet to practically a registering authority. The Planning Commission was unnecessary and in fact, hardly qualified for its work...there was a general tendency amongst the various Ministries to disregard the authority of the Standing Finance Committee and that some of the greatest offenders were the Ministers directly under the control of the Prime Minister. When departures from accepted practice were approved by the Prime Minister, it has a demoralising effect on other departments of Government."

The Planning Commission, with its mission of achieving the ideals of a transformative constitution, could not merely play to the hands of few

### **Srinivasan and Pellissery**

industrial capitalists. This was the dilemma that was faced by left-leaning economist K.N. Raj who shaped the first five-year plan. His advice to Jawaharlal Nehru was to achieve slow economic growth since the country was primarily agrarian (Kumar, 2004). However, planning exercise was soon captured by the few powerful capitalist lobbies. Many scholars (Chibber, 2003) have pointed out how the Bombay plan influenced the five-year plans of independent India.

The illness of deformative planning is not the result of the Constitution. Dr. Bhim Rao Ambedkar, an architect of Indian Constitution, during his speech on November 4, 1948, delivered in the Constituent Assembly in the process of drafting the constitution for modern India said: "The form of the administration must be appropriate to and in the same sense as the form of the Constitution ... [It] is perfectly possible to pervert the Constitution, without changing its form by merely changing the form of the administration and to make it inconsistent and opposed to the spirit of the Constitution ... Constitutional morality is not a natural sentiment. It has to be cultivated. We must realise that our people have yet to learn it." Dr. Ambedkar was saying this since the drafted Constitution of modern India had very little in common with Manusmriti or Dharmashashtras, traditional Indian scriptures and thus the spirit of India was distant to the spirit of the Constitution. Planning Commission as an administrative arrangement, to change the substantive value system in the country, was bound to deliver deformative planning because of the absence of Constitutional morality, which Ambedkar pointed out.

### **Planning in the Less-legitimate States**

Peter Hall surveying the history of planning theory cautions how the beautiful ideas of planners had to be subjected to the straight-jackets of the state: "When however the time, at last, came for their (planning theorists) ideals to be translated into bricks and mortar, the irony was that - more often than not - this happened through the agency of state bureaucracies, which they would have hated" (Hall, 1988). When the state, as a social construct, is defined by the dominant forces in society (or market forces) the prospect of upholding planning with 'public purpose' aim gets vitiated.

In the context of many Asian countries, the state could be termed as what Reno called the corrupt state of Sierra Leone: the 'shadow state' (Reno, 1995). As the state's arms are unable to control social and cultural forces, regulation becomes a near impossibility. It is the private contracts (often exploitative) and social identities that regulate this sector. Thus, there is hardly any distinction between state and market here.

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

When we look at the local state, the existing state below the levels of the state capital, as we follow policies down the hierarchy of levels, we soon find ourselves in an economy that is on the edge of - or frankly outside - the ambit of state regulation (despite what is laid down in official statements of intention, and in legislation and orders and institutions); that is, in the informal economy (Harris-White, 2003).

A host of new actors emerge here. Private armies (*goondas*) to enforce illegal contracts, fixers, intermediaries, gatekeepers, etc. are some of the numerous people who carry out the daily routines of the 'shadow state'. This political and economic disorder is deliberately used to enable collective and highly organised economic abuses and misappropriation of the state's assets by the local elites and leaders. Here, the state exists, but in such a way that the authority and legitimacy reside in the private social status of the individuals since following the rules of the shadow state is the route to get things done (Corbridge and Harris, 2000). As a result, the boundary between state and society is blurred. In this blurred-boundary situation, the winner is the leader or local elites since they can reduce the power of the bureaucrats and to accumulate that power as their power.

The issue becomes complex in 'prismatic societies' (Riggs, 1964) where opposing values (modern and traditional) are simultaneously in the operation of administration and state. Contestation about the nature of development planning is very high in prismatic societies, particularly Global south due to different value orientations. Thus, development against development is possible. In other words, what is considered as development for one group is considered as a disadvantage for another group. This dilemma has been beautifully captured by Myrdal, when he talks about the limitations of economic planning in countries in Asia. Without some intervention in the cultural sphere, economic intervention seems to be adversely affecting the culture (Myrdal, 1968).

What is at the question is the knowledge used in planning stages as technocratic understanding. This deception, that knowledge transcends diverse value systems and cultural conditionings, makes them attractive to a planner. Through these, the costs that different people bear are brought to a comparable level. Thus, a planner fails to see how "relationships and values are converted into figures and charts" (Shore and Wright, 1997) follow the logic of frames.

Several anthropological works have challenged developmental projects in the spirit of Seeing like a State (Scott, 1998). How policies imbibed the values of the State, and how society's aspirations were disconnected from such policies were successfully demonstrated by several

### **Srinivasan and Pellissery**

anthropologists. Illustrative is the following example: The works of Indian planners such as Sukhomoy Chakravarti and Yoginder Alagh (both extensively shaping various Five Year Plans through their work in Planning Commission), who have applied econometric tools to the problem solving or designing mega projects (in the case of Yoginder Alagh the key contributions to Sardar Sarovar Project in Gujarat,) have been criticised as 'technocrats' by scholars from the discipline of social anthropology (Aandahl, 2010) meaning that application of econometrics in solving human problems is insensitive, devoid and irresponsive to social stimuli.

Esha Shah has demonstrated, studying the field of biotechnology and genetic seeds, how such 'rational' decisions by the State actors often were influenced by the business interests (Shah, 2011). Similarly, Myron Weiner has shown how India's policies arose from fundamental beliefs, embedded in the culture, rather than from economic conditions. Identifying the specific values that elsewhere led educators, social activists, religious leaders, trade unionists, military officers, and government bureaucrats to make education compulsory and to end child labour; he explains why similar groups in India do not play the same role (Weiner, 2011).

As it has been seen in this section, there is ample evidence to conclude that planning had no roots in the cultural ethos in India. Rather, what was done in the name of planning was more important than planning itself. Having built on sands, the edifice was bound to fall.

### **Moving from Planning to Policy**

One important discourse that usurped during the controversy of the dismantling of the Planning Commission was the functional differentiation between planning and policy making. It was argued that earlier both the functions were vested with the Planning Commission. The critiques of the Planning Commission always argued that planning for a country as diverse as India would not be possible in a centralised fashion. Thus, in the proposal to dismantle Planning Commission, it was argued that the function of planning would be left to the states and policy making would be the focus of the Planning Commission. In this section, it will be argued about the Planning Commission was dismantling. There was little space left for planning since global models of policies had appropriated the planning capacities are nation-state level.

As early as 1968, the Administrative Reforms Commission's study team on the 'Machinery of the Government of India and its Procedures of Work' suggested the creation of an 'office of planning and policy' in each

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

ministry for over-all planning and also as the unit for the formulation of policy in the ministry in the strategic field (GoI, 1968). This suggestion was given in the context of creating an organ for detailed, interdisciplinary study necessary for policy making. It was also suggested that specialised personnel should be hired for such research and analysis work. Second Administrative Reforms Commission (2009) directly invoked measures of Citizen-Centric Governance through the Public Policy approach (SARC, 2009). It also argued for the separation of policy making and implementation through institutional changes.

These recommendations of Administrative Reform Commissions were indications of how the planning model was evaporating as India embraced globalisation and neo-liberal mode of governance since 1991 through a range of economic reforms. Impact of the same on governance is seen through the institutionalisation of a range of regulatory institutions (in the place of tribunals), application of information-based management systems to government programmes, public management approach to administration, Public-Private Partnership in social sector investments etc.

While these developments took place in the sphere of the reorganisation of the State, complementary changes took place in the sphere of civil society organisations and the market. Among civil society organisations, several 'policy think tanks' emerged (e.g. Centre for Policy Research, Delhi). Many of these think tanks were funded with international organisations (e.g. IDRC Canada supporting 43 Think Tanks in South Asia as part of its global strategy for eight years). These think tanks acted as a voice to provide policy advice to the government on sectoral issues. Among market players, significant development took place where consultancy firms made policy advice as to their part of the core business. Most of the consultancy firms such as KPMG, Ernst and Young, Deloitte, Pricewaterhouse Coopers all have specialised wings to work with governments to provide policy advice. Such market players provided policy advice to multiple countries. Thus, policy transfer between countries was hugely facilitated through such medium. Many bureaucrats have established 'working relationships' with the heads of such private firms. Some bureaucrats were entrepreneurial to set up such think tanks after their retirement since their established contacts within the government ensured successful tender bids.

What is important to take note is the fact that these changes are not driven by the political economy within the country. We need to take note of the developments elsewhere to establish this point. The study of the changes to five-year plans across the world can illuminate us. Five-Year Plans (FYPs)

### **Srinivasan and Pellissery**

were centralised and integrated national economic programmes. Joseph Stalin implemented the first FYP in the Soviet Union in the late 1920s. Most communist states and several capitalist countries subsequently have adopted them. India launched its First FYP in 1951, and China began its plan in 1953. Both countries are now in their Twelfth FYP. Just like the changes towards policy-making, as we noted above in this section, China renamed its Eleventh FYP (2006-2010), a guideline (*guihua*), rather than a plan (*jihua*), to signify the central government's more hands-off approach to development (Geall and Pellissery, 2012).

Both planning and policy deal with value questions. However, the way value is dealt with is different in both planning and policy. Plan is a political programme since the agency of planning is "a government bent on development and thus also on changing the valuation in the country" (Myrdal 1968). Compared to this, disagreement on 'value' is institutionally allowed within policy models. In the post-liberalisation period, the government is reduced to one of the players in the governance process, and value imposition without negotiation with other players is impossible. Policy scientists tend to agree with Amartya Sen on the limited use of transcendental institutionalism or the project of creating perfectly just institutions. Policy views that different valuations emerge from different interests and negotiation of actors are an essential component of the policy process. In this sense, policy opens up a new 'government by discussion' through a public exchange of reasons and 'open impartiality' (Sen, 2009).

### **Views of Chief Ministers on Dismantling Planning Commission**

The Constitution of India provided a legal basis for coordinated planning for the country as a whole by including "Economic and Social Planning" in the concurrent legislative list. In addition to the Planning Commission at the Union level, there were planning boards at the state level. While till 1964, the arrangement seemed to work fine because of the same party at the centre and most of the states, after 1964, there seemed to be friction between the centre and state relations as the political parties were different (Paranjape, 1990). In this section, the responses from Chief Ministers expressed on 7 December, 2014 at the gathering at Prime Minister's office, on the dismantling of the Planning Commission is analysed through categorising the responses by party affiliations.<sup>1</sup>

Four types of party affiliations are visible. First, the Chief Minister of the state belongs to BJP, i.e., the ruling party of the Central government when the Planning Commission was dismantled in 2014. Second, the Chief

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

Minister of the state belongs to Congress, i.e., the major opposition party in the Parliament. Third, the Chief Minister of the state belongs to the regional party and supports BJP. Fourth, the Chief Minister of the state belongs to the regional party and opposes BJP the ruling party of the Central government. The views are summarised in Table 1.

In South India, the Chief Ministers of Kerala and Karnataka (both states ruled by the Congress) strongly opposed the dissolution of the Planning Commission. Kerala's Chief Minister Oommen Chandy called the proposal "half-baked, unwarranted, and ignores the need for planned development". He also expressed his fear of the loss of perspective and a long-term outlook to development when NITI Aayog replaces the Planning Commission. Karnataka's Chief Minister Siddaramaiah, too, questioned the rationale behind replacing the Planning Commission, calling it a time-tested entity. These two views from the Chief Ministers belonging to Congress Party were in stark contrast, however, to the neighbouring states of Tamil Nadu and Andhra Pradesh. The newly formed state of Telengana (needing support from the Central government in the form of financial assistance) expressed confidence that NITI Aayog would give a democratic approach to planning, replacing the existing bureaucratic approach of the Planning Commission. He diametrically countered Oommen Chandy's allegation and said, NITI Aayog would bring perspective and strategic planning while conceding the mandate of the rationale behind funds allocation to the Finance Commission (Mission Telengana, 2014). It is useful to note that both the supporting view from Telengana and opposing view from Kerala are mere assertions and hope, rather than based on any evidence as to whether perspective planning was possible or within the mandate of NITI Aayog. Tamil Nadu was ruled by a regional party, which was supporting BJP in the Central government. Its Chief Minister O Paneerselvam<sup>2</sup> stressed the need for participation by states in the planning process, as opposed to the current status quo where the states were at the mercy of ministers at the centre (The Economic Times, 2014).

This trend of speaking in unison fashion is observable in table 1 where the views of chief ministers are summarised. Invariably seven chief ministers belonging to BJP supported the proposition to dismantle Planning Commission, while at the bottom of the table, we find chief ministers from nine states ruled by Congress unanimously opposing the proposal.



**Srinivasan and Pellissery**

**Table 1**  
**Views of Chief Ministers on Dismantling Planning Commission**

Political Party	Name	Allegiance to NDA (Ruling Coalition)	Category (Special or Non-special)	Chief Minister	Should the Planning Commission be Dissolved?
BJP	Rajasthan	Yes	Non-Special	Vasundhara Raje	Yes
BJP	Chhattisgarh	Yes	Non-Special	Raman Singh	Yes
BJP	Goa	Yes	Non-Special	Laxmikant Parsekar	Yes
BJP	Gujarat	Yes	Non-Special	Anandiben Patel	Yes
BJP	Maharashtra	Yes	Non-Special	Devendra Fadnavis	Yes
BJP	Madhya Pradesh	Yes	Non-Special	Shivraj Singh Chauhan	Yes
BJP	Haryana	Yes	Non-Special	Manohar Lal Khattar	Yes
SAD	Punjab	Yes	Non-Special	Parkash Singh Badal	Yes
NPF	Nagaland	Yes	Special Category	TR Zeliang	Yes
TDS	Andhra Pradesh	Yes	Non-Special	Chandrababu Naidu	Yes
TRS	Telangana	No	Non-Special	K Chandrashekar Rao	Yes
AIADMK	Tamil Nadu	No	Non-Special	O Paneerselvam	Yes
TC	West Bengal	No	Non-Special	Mamata Banerjee	Yes
BJD	Odisha	No	Non-Special	Naveen Patnaik	Yes
SP	Uttar Pradesh	No	Non-Special	Akhilesh Yadav	Yes
J D (U)	Bihar	No	Non-Special	Nitish Kumar	No
JMM	Jharkhand	No	Non-Special	Hemant Soren	No
J&KNC	Jammu and Kashmir	No	Special Category	Omar Abdullah	No
SDF	Sikkim	No	Special Category	Pawan Kumar Chamling	No
CPI(M)	Tripura	No	Special Category	Manik Sarkar	No
INC	Arunachal Pradesh	No	Special Category	NabamTuki	No
INC	Assam	No	Special Category	Tarun Kumar Gogoi	No
INC	Manipur	No	Special Category	Okram Ibobi Singh	No
INC	Meghalaya	No	Special Category	Mukul Sangma	No
INC	Mizoram	No	Special Category	Lal Thanhawla	No
INC	Uttarakhand	No	Special Category	Harish Rawat	No
INC	Himachal Pradesh	No	Special Category	Virbhadra Singh	No
INC	Karnataka	No	Non-Special	Siddaramaiah	No
INC	Kerala	No	Non-Special	Oommen Chandy	No

Source: Compiled by authors from press releases after Chief Ministers' meeting on 7 December 2014

During the chief ministers meeting, 15 out of the 29 states favoured dissolving the Planning Commission. Out of this, 14 were non-special category states, with Nagaland being the sole special category state in favour of the proposition. Seven of these 15 were BJP-led states, with three others (Punjab, Nagaland, Andhra Pradesh) being NDA allies. As it can be observed, there is unanimity among all NDA states and allies to the proposal being made to dissolve the Planning Commission, with all Congress-led States and allies in opposition. Trinamool Congress was an interesting anomaly, as it supports the proposal despite not being strongly in favour of the ruling party in power.

These polarised views on party lines do not help us in the analysis as to whether some evidence is overruled because of party affiliations. Most of the special category states were ruled by the Congress in 2014. Since they are

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

opposing the proposal of dismantling the Planning Commission, we cannot conclusively argue whether this is due to party affiliation or status of the state (as special or non-special). However, there are no special category states which are ruled by BJP. So, we have no evidence there. There are four special category states (Tripura, Sikkim, Jammu and Kashmir, and Nagaland) which are neither ruled by BJP nor Congress. Out of these, except Nagaland, all other three are ruled by parties that are allied to the Congress or opposing NDA. Therefore, naturally, the response from the chief ministers of these three states to oppose the proposal of dismantling the Planning Commission is on expected lines. The case of Nagaland is crucial. In Nagaland, Congress is the main opposition party. Yet, despite being a special category state its chief minister supports the dismantling of the Planning Commission from which it receives support from the existence of the Planning Commission.

### **Socio-Economic Basis that Shaped the Politics of NITI Aayog**

Articles 36-51 of the Constitution (Part IV) give a direction to the content of State Policies. This part compared to Part III, which is about the fundamental rights of citizens, is about the collective goals for the State. The key collective goal of “the welfare of the people” (Article 38[1]) was set to be achieved as articulated in Article 38 (2): “The State, shall in particular, strive to minimise the inequalities in income, and endeavour to eliminate inequalities in status, facilities and opportunities, not only amongst individuals but also amongst groups of people residing in different areas or engaged in different vocations.”<sup>3</sup> India being a federation of regional states and Central government, the Constitution has divided the responsibilities into State list, Central list and Concurrent list. Important welfare activities such as health, education and employment are the responsibility of regional state governments. However, resource raising capacity to fund such welfare activities is very limited for the regional state government. Therefore, assistance from the Central government becomes hugely important to deliver the development goals of the regional states. One of the key functions of the Planning Commission was to derive the mechanism of allocating central assistance to reduce regional disparity.

To reduce regional inequality, the Planning Commission was mandated to devise a formula for the allocation of funds to state governments. This is legitimised through Finance Commission transfers (articles 275-280) to bring equitable public services across the country. A formula, popularly known as Gadgil formula, was used since 1980. Later, this was revised in 1991 and was known as the Gadgil-Mukherjee formula. This formula considered

### **Srinivasan and Pellissery**

four dimensions: population (60 per cent weight), per capita income (25 per cent weight), fiscal management (7.5 per cent weight) and special problems (7.5 per cent weight). Using this formula, special category states were identified and a significant portion of central plan allocation was made available to these special category states. In table 1, the special category states refer to such states. It is in this context, the differences of views between special category states and ordinary states become important.

The Planning Commission model directly allocated funds to centrally sponsored schemes, which accounted for where the money was being spent. The new model looks at a system where the money is devolved to ministries instead, which does not have the same guarantee that the money so devolved will be used for development.

While the debate in the mainstream media has broadly focused on the political contours of opposition to the idea of the dissolution of the Planning Commission, the analysis in the previous section indicates that the responses from respective ruling parties of that state have a strong association with the current socio-economic conditions prevalent in those states. There were two dimensions to this. First, the ambition for special category status, concerning the political economy that prevailed in a particular state due to economic growth, second, increased centralisation by downplaying the autonomy of the states.

The absence of the Planning Commission's ability to influence plan expenditure and central assistance as per the Gadgil-Mukherjee formula will impact the current special category states adversely, a sentiment that was echoed by the Chief Ministers of almost all special category states. The first point of divergence is in terms of viewpoints towards development – while most small states and special category states viewed development as inherently a process aided by the centre due to the unique characteristics and disadvantages, larger states place a higher value on the ability to compete for resources with other states, as they claim that there exists the scope for competitive federalism. The absence of resource allocation by the Planning Commission would lead to a more competitive environment in terms of states vying for resources, which impact smaller states differentially than it will the bigger ones. Regional disparities will likely increase, at least in the short term, since certain regions like the states in the North-East do not share the same competencies or the same starting point as other regions. Southern states and large states that are already more advanced are likely to be able to work in a competitive environment. A key consensus that emerged was in terms of flexibility that states requested in terms of untied funds to pursue their developmental agendas.

### **The Idea of Planning: Turn of Discourses in Seven Decades**

The second point of note is the degree of centralisation that this new system would bring against the autonomy of the regional state governments. The federal structure of a healthy relationship between the state government and the Union government is one of the basic features of the Indian Constitution.<sup>4</sup> Therefore, it is important to balance these relationships through institutional spaces. The critics of the Planning Commission argue that a 'Delhi-centric' model of development is unsuited to specific states' needs, but this argument fails to see the comparative framework in which the political economy of planning operates. While planning functions may have been devolved to the states, and policy-making will be aided by NITI Aayog, the functions of resource allocation are now in the hands of the Finance Ministry. This increases the scope for political battles over expenditure, especially in states that have opposition parties in power that do not have the support of the centre. Another thing to note about the new model is the absence of transparency on a relative metric. The Planning Commission model directly allocated funds to centrally sponsored schemes, which accounted for where the money was being spent. The new model looks at a system where the money is devolved to ministries instead, which does not have the same guarantee that the money so devolved will be used for development.

#### **End Notes**

1. It is important to recognise these are responses from Chief Ministers, and not respective state. This raises the question of the legitimacy of elections, and right of the democratically elected representative to voice the views on behalf of the state. Particularly in societies where ideological polarisations exist, these questions are important.
2. He was asked to step into the shoe of Chief Minister when Jayalalita had to resign due to judgement on a corruption case; she came back to the position of Chief Minister when Supreme Court reversed the High Court decision.
3. Note that Cabinet Resolution dated 15 March 1950 which sets up the Planning Commission quotes this directive principle to argue the mandate for Planning Commission.
4. Kesavananda Bharati vs. State of Kerala, 1973.

#### **References**

- Aandahl, Guro (2010), *Technocratic Dreams and Troublesome Beneficiaries. The Sardar Sarovar (Narmada) Project in Gujarat*. Dissertation submitted for the Ph.D. degree, University of Oslo.
- Ambedkar, B.R. (1990), 'Draft Constitution' speech delivered in the Constitutional Assembly 1948, *The Constitution and the Constituent Assembly Debates*, New Delhi: Lok Sabha Secretariat, pp. 107-131 and pp. 171-183.
- Baxi, Upendra (2013), 'Priliminary Notes on Transformative Constitutionalism' in *Transformative Constitutionalism: Comparing the Apex courts of Brazil, India and South Africa* (eds) Oscar Vilhena, UpendraBaxi and FransViljoen. Pretoria: Pretoria University Law Press. pp. 19-47.

### Srinivasan and Pellissery

- Chibber, Vivek (2003), *Locked in Place: State-Building and Late Industrialisation in India*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Corbridge, Stuart and Harriss, John (2000), *Reinventing India: Liberalization, Hindu Nationalism and Popular Democracy*, Cambridge: Polity Press.
- Geall, S. and Pellissery, S. (2012), 'Five-Year Plans' in *Encyclopedia of Sustainability*, Vol. 7. pp. 453-55.
- GoI (1968), Report of the Study Team on the Machinery of Government of India and Procedures of its Work, Vol. 1, Part II.
- Hall, P. (1988), *Cities of Tomorrow: An Intellectual History of Urban Planning and Design in the 20th Century*, Oxford and New York: Basil Black Publication.
- Harriss-White, Barbara (2003), India's Socially Regulated Economy, Working Paper-133. Paper for the 7th International Conference on Institutional Economics, University of Hertfordshire, Institutions and Economic Development.
- Kannabiran, K.G. (2003), *Wages of Impunity: Power, Justice and Human Rights*. New Delhi: Orient Blackswan.
- Kumar Krishna R. (2004), 'The Man behind the Plan' *Frontline*, Vol. 22. No. 2.
- Mission Telangana (2014), CM KCR's speech at Meet on Planning Commission, (accessed from <http://missiontelangana.com/cm-kcrs-speech-at-meet-on-planning-commission/> on 15 June 2015)
- Myrdal, Gunnar (1968), *Asian Drama: An Inquiry into the Poverty of Nations*, New York: Pantheon Books.
- Paranjape H.K. (1990), 'Planning Commission as a Constitutional Body'. *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 25, No. 45, pp. 2479-82.
- Rao Bhaskar V. (2014), 'Planning and Centre-State Relations in India', *Indian Political Science Association*, Vol. 47, No. 2, pp. 214-28.
- Reno, William (1995), *Corruption and State Politics in Sierra Leone*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Riggs Fred W. (1964), *Administration in Developing Countries - The Theory of Prismatic Society*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company.
- SARC (2009), 'Citizen Centric Administration', 12th Report of Second Administrative Reforms Commission.
- SARC (2009), 'State and District Administration', 15th report of Second Administrative Reforms Commission.
- Scott, James C. (1999), *Seeing Like a State: How Certain Schemes to Improve the Human Condition Have Failed*. New Heaven: Yale University Press.
- Sen, Amartya (2009), *The Idea of Justice*. Cambridge, MA: Belknap Press.
- Shah, Esha (2011), 'Science in the Risk Politics of Brinjal' *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 56, No. 31, pp. 34-56.
- Shore, Cris and Wright, Susan (1997), *Anthropology of Policy: Perspectives on Governance and Power*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Singh, Vijandra (2003), 'Panchayat Raj and Gandhi'. *Panchayati Raj and Village Development: Volume 3, Perspectives on Panchayati Raj Administration*. Studies in public Administration, New Delhi: Sarup and Sons. pp. 84-90.
- The Economic Times (2014), Maharashtra Chief Minister Devendra Fadnavis Pitches for National Development and Reforms Commission (accessed from [http://articles.economicstimes.indiatimes.com/2014-12-07/news/56802910\\_1\\_fadnavis-prime-minister-narendra-modi-national-development](http://articles.economicstimes.indiatimes.com/2014-12-07/news/56802910_1_fadnavis-prime-minister-narendra-modi-national-development) on 18 June 2015)
- Weiner, M. (1991), *The Child and the state in India*, Princeton: Princeton University Press.

## Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana

Brajaraja Mishra\* and K. Hanumantha Rao†

*The improvements in the levels of living of socially disadvantaged such as scheduled tribes indicate the direction and pace of inclusive growth. The levels and shifts in the private consumption expenditure of these groups can be construed as proxy indicators and reveal their welfare status and future growth prospects. The shifts and pattern of consumption expenditure of tribes of Telangana in different rural locations/typologies during 2004-05 and 2011-12 were examined in this paper. The rate of decline of poverty and reducing expenditure inequality among STs and in tribal concentrated districts suggest that the state policies were effective in improving the living standards of STs. The intake of food items in quantitative terms by STs had gone up which was desirable from the nutrition point of view. The food expenditure pattern was getting more diversified in favour of quality food items in the process of economic growth. The perspective plans for the tribal welfare of Telangana should take cognisance of these findings and optimally use the Social Development Fund.*

### Introduction

One of the development goals of the country is to improve the living conditions of all people and in particular the socially and economically disadvantaged sections such as Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes. Since these communities could not gain much from the normal growth

---

\* Assistant Professor, Centre for Economic and Social Studies, Hyderabad.

E-mail: mishrabrajaraja@gmail.com

† Adjunct Professor, Centre for Economic and Social Studies, Hyderabad.

E-mail: raokh49@gmail.com

### Mishra and Rao

process, the inclusive growth strategy has been evolved. The SC special component plan and ST sub-plan have been launched to meet the specific needs of these groups. Further, the fund allocation for these projects has been made proportional to their share in the population. Any perspective plan to improve the levels of living should be based on scientific databases depicting the current status, prediction of likely changes in the consumption pattern with economic growth.

In the literature, scholars have employed multiple indicators to measure well-being/living standards such as GDP per capita and it was observed to be an inaccurate, inadequate and insufficient indicator. Research on the theme refined the concept as well as the indicators for measurement. The report of the United Nations provided a conceptual framework and considered indicators spanning 12 broad areas of levels of living which include food and nutrition, education, health and housing (United Nations, 1954). Some of these developments include the variants of GDP per capita adopted by the World Bank, Physical Quality of Life Index (PQLI) of Morris D Morris (Morris, 1979); Human Development Index (HDI) and Multi-Dimensional Poverty of UNDP (UNDP, 1991). The other set of researchers focused on the measurement of local-level progress (Drewnowski and Scott, 1966; Drewnowski, 1974; Granahan et al., 1972; Mishra, 2016; Rao et al., 1978) while a few studies have adopted development indicators framework for assessing the levels of living and the changes using secondary data (Rao, 1993; Rudra et al., 1987). Value judgments about the choice of indicators are inevitable. Some of the empirical studies established the link between socio-economic status (level of wealth, material possessions etc.) and standard of living. The commission constituted by the French President Nicholas Sarkozy has come out with some important dimensions of quality of life and its sustainability indicators which include: material living conditions, productive activity, health, education, leisure and social interactions and economic and physical safety (Stiglitz et al., 2009).

In the state of Telangana, the number of STs was 32 lakhs and they accounted for 9 per cent of the population in 2011. Almost 90 per cent of them live in rural areas. In the present paper, the levels of living these STs in rural Telangana were captured with a set of indicators viz., Monthly Per Capita Consumption Expenditure (MPCE), seasonal variations in MPCE, inequality in MPCE across different quartiles (measured by Coefficient of Variation (CoV)), poverty ratio, and expenditure pattern. The latter include consumption of a whole gamut of goods and services enjoyed by the household (including health and education) to meet the basic and non-basic

### **Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana**

needs. The share of food in total expenditure, increased consumption of quality food items such as milk, eggs, fish, fruits and vegetables, higher expenditure on health and education, expenditure on consumer durables are some of the indicators considered to ascertain the welfare levels of STs of the Telangana. The choice of the indicators is limited by the database. These statistical indicators are expected to help in designing policies for the socio-economic progress of tribal households of the state.

The present paper attempts to develop such databases based on the recent trends and also variations across spatial typologies concerning STs in Telangana state. Using multiple indicators framework, the changes in the levels of living of STs during 2004-05 and 2011-12 were analysed.

The salient objectives of this paper are: (i) to find out the increase in consumption expenditure of STs during 2004-05 to 2011-12 and delineate the consequent broad shifts in consumption expenditure in rural areas of Telangana; (ii) to estimate the poverty ratios and expenditure elasticity of selected commodities/groups; (iii) to analyse the expenditure pattern of tribal households in different typologies and study the implications of these shifts in consumption (quantitative) and consumer expenditure (values); and (iv) to find out whether the levels of living vary across locations, three typologies were considered and these are North and South Telangana<sup>1</sup>; Schedule V Areas and others<sup>2</sup>; districts with concentration of STs<sup>3</sup>. The unit record data of the National Sample Survey Organisation (61st and 68th rounds) on consumption expenditure were used to examine the above objectives.

### **Discussion**

To gauge the changes in levels of living of STs in Telangana, the average per capita monthly expenditure of tribal households in rural and urban areas and the shares of selected commodities/commodity groups in total expenditure were estimated and compared over seven years with 2004-05 as the base. The relevant data are shown in Table 1. The per capita monthly expenditure, a key indicator of living standard, grew at the rate of 1.53 per cent and 1.89 per cent during 2004-05 to 2011-12 respectively for all rural households and ST households. The consumption expenditure on selected food items also registered an impressive rise during this interregnum and more so in the case of tribal households of the state.

The expenditure elasticity of demand for cereals was low indicating that growth will not influence the demand much. The fall in the shares of cereal and food grain expenditure both for all and ST households confirm



Mishra and Rao

this view. The elasticity for pulses, milk and milk products and eggs, meat and fish are more than one revealing the economic growth enhances the demand for these items. The higher elasticity in the case of STs for these items emerging demand pattern. A disturbing feature is the decline in the share of health expenditure in these two categories since malnutrition levels of children and adults are higher. Further, the share of intoxicants showed an increase in respect of STs. These need to be corrected.

**Table 1**  
**Levels and Major Shifts in Consumption Expenditure of Tribal Households in Rural Telangana (TN)**

Item	Unit	TN		All Tribal Households		% Change		Expenditure Elasticity	
		2004-05	2011-12	2004-05	2011-12	TN	Tribal Households	TN	Tribal Households
MPCE	Rs/H	605.8	1533.2	485.6	1402.9	1.530	1.889		
MPCE*	Rs/H	605.8	851.8	485.6	779.4	0.406	0.605		
Cereals	PCPM	119.6	182.6	104.3	198.8	0.527	0.906	0.344	0.479
Pulses	PCPM	18.9	49.8	15.6	53.7	1.635	2.442	1.069	1.292
Edible oil	PCPM	29.0	61.5	25.3	58.3	1.121	1.304	0.732	0.690
Milk and milk products	PCPM	27.3	89.7	18.2	83.8	2.286	3.604	1.494	1.907
egg, meat and fish	PCPM	23.7	83.2	26.4	137.5	2.511	4.208	1.641	2.227
sh. of cereals	% inTE	19.75	11.91	21.47	14.17	-0.397	-0.340		
sh. of food grains	% inTE	22.88	15.16	24.68	18.00	-0.337	-0.271		
sh. of quality foods	% inTE	16.67	17.89	17.16	22.74	0.073	0.325		
sh. of food	% inTE	50.93	45.50	53.02	53.66	-0.107	0.012		
sh. of education	% inTE	2.75	4.61	2.05	2.14	0.676	0.044		
sh. of health	% inTE	7.03	3.47	6.81	3.76	-0.506	-0.448		
sh. of intoxicants	% inTE	6.43	4.44	5.64	6.93	-0.309	0.229		
sh. of cons. durables	% in TE	1.60	2.72	1.06	1.02	0.700	-0.038		

Quality foods include vegetables and fruits, fish, egg and meat, milk and milk products; % in TE: percentage in total expenditure; sh.: share; MPCE\*: per capita monthly expenditure in 2004-05 (=100) prices.

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data.

Poverty is an important indicator of well-being and it declined at the rate of 3 per cent per annum in the rural areas of Telangana state during 2004-05 to 2011-12 (Table 2).<sup>4</sup> In the case of STs, the poverty levels were very high in North Telangana, Non-Schedule V Area districts and Tribal dominated districts. The rate of decline of poverty among rural tribal households was more rapid and very high in tribal-dominated districts of Adilabad and Khammam. These trends lend support to the view that the growth strategy of the state is an inclusive one.

## Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana

**Table 2**  
**Poverty among Tribal Households of Rural Telangana (2011-12 and 2004-05)(%)**

Particulars	2004-05	2011-12	Decline PA
Telangana State	28.1	7.4	2.96
<b>Tribal Households</b>			
All	48.5	15.0	4.78
South Telangana	44.9	15.1	4.26
North Telangana	49.9	14.9	5.0
Scheduled Districts	47.5	12.1	5.06
Non-scheduled Districts	51.4	24.4	3.86
Tribal dominated districts	69.2	22.8	6.63

Note: PA: per annum.

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

To trace the trends in inequality of consumption expenditure, the average MPCE for each quartile was computed for the two periods and these are presented in Table 3. The ratio of MPCE of Q4 to that of Q1 was considered to ascertain the extent of inequality in each category. These ratios were high in 2004-05 and the inequalities were relatively lower among STs in different typologies. The ratios declined between the two periods indicating a reduction in consumption inequalities overtime except for South Telangana. To find out the inequality between social groups, the MPCE of each group was compared with that of all groups. It can be gleaned from the data that no clear pattern was emerging. The seasonal variations in MPCE were examined to find out the stability in consumption expenditure. The coefficient of variation was calculated and the results are shown in Table 4. Initially, the instability in MPCE was found to be high and it was higher for ST categories barring South Telangana and Schedule V Area districts. By 2011-12, the differences in expenditure level across the four quarters were reduced and drastically for all households put together. Again the results for STs of South Telangana were an exception. In fact, the high average MPCE and also MPCE in the second quarter (Q2) for STs of South Telangana need scrutiny.

The consumption levels and shifts with an increase in MPCE can be gleaned from Table 5 and 6. The share of cereals/food grains in total expenditure was higher when the MPCE level was lower and it declined with an increase in MPCE and particularly on cereals and its substitutes. Cereals being the main source of energy for the poor, a decline in demand for cereals could be attributable to shifts in nature of work i.e., from more dredgerous work to less dredgerous one and/or prefer more protein-rich food (pulses, egg, fish and meat, fruits and vegetables) even at the cost of failing to meet required calories (demonstration effect). This behaviour was conspicuous even among tribal households. Another observed feature is an increase in the share of expenditure on education, health and intoxicants.

Mishra and Rao

The rise in expenditure on health and intoxicants was more striking among STs. The decline in the share of expenditure on “consumer durables” in all categories over the period needs further probing.

**Table 3**  
**Estimated MPCE of Different Quartiles of Tribal Households of Rural Telangana\* 2004-05 and 2011-12 (Rs./HH)**

MPCE Quartiles	TN	Tribal households					
		All	North TN	South TN	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Q1 (<= 1185)	968.8	942.1	931.4	998.2	941.8	943.2	873.4
Q2 (1186-1495)	1324.4	1291.1	1290.4	1298.8	1298.6	1257.2	1311.1
Q3 (1496 - 1995)	1694.4	1619.1	1598.5	1671.9	1605.8	1668.6	1652.4
Q4 (1996+)	2796.6	2815.3	2328.1	3458.7	2897.7	2454.3	2148.0
All	1533.2	1402.9	1280.4	1876.7	1420.8	1334.8	1147.6
MPCE/ MPCE-All	1.00	0.92	0.84	0.84	1.22	0.93	0.87
Q4 / Q1	2.88	2.99	2.50	3.47	3.08	2.60	2.46
<b>2004-05</b>							
Q1 (<= 436)	352.8	332.7	322.2	362.9	325.8	348.4	311.3
Q2 (437-578)	504.0	496.2	491.2	505.8	490.5	511.1	477.4
Q3 (579-822)	678.4	694.5	694.9	693.6	702.9	680.8	678.6
Q4 (823+)	1229.5	1091.5	1075.0	1199.4	1052.0	1334.7	872.4
All	605.8	485.6	484.3	489.1	486.8	482.7	382.4
MPCE/ MPCE-All	1.00	0.89	0.87	0.97	0.86	1.09	0.71
Q4 / Q1	3.49	3.38	3.34	3.3	3.23	3.83	2.8

\* Based on Mixed Reference Period (MRP) Approach.

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

**Table 4**  
**Seasonal Variations in MPCE of Tribal Households of Rural Telangana (MRP)\***

Survey Quartile	Telangana	Tribal households					
		All	North Telangana	South Telangana	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Quarter 1	1480.0	1288.4	1226.9	1417.7	1279.8	1300.7	1242.6
Quarter 2	1653.0	1359.0	1326.0	1777.1	1358.3	1421.5	997.5
Quarter 3	1479.1	2130.4	1411.7	4783.4	2372.4	988.2	1477.3
Quarter 4	1510.4	1294.6	1226.0	1557.3	1237.3	1533.3	1142.2
All	1533.2	1402.9	1280.4	1876.7	1420.8	1334.8	1147.6
CV (%)	5.4	29.2	6.95	85.58	38.15	17.94	16.61
<b>2004-05</b>							
Quarter 1	437.4	294.8	257.8	400.9	255.2	384.3	244.4
Quarter 2	513.5	519.4	581.9	401.6	532.2	486.4	584.7
Quarter 3	681.4	691.6	696.4	680.0	715.6	652.2	667.1
Quarter 4	1026.5	1262.7	1209.1	1613.1	1287.5	1109.9	1883.7
All	605.8	485.6	484.3	489.1	486.8	482.7	382.4
CV (%)	43.1	85.2	81.6	19.4	47.6	31.7	58.6

\* MPCE of households in the four quarters of July 2011- June 12.

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

**Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana**

**Table 5**  
**Composition of Monthly Per capita Consumption Expenditure of Tribal Households in Telangana (TN)- 2011-12 and 2004-05 (Rs./hh), MRP**

	Telangana	Tribal households					
		All	North TN	South TN	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Cereals and cereal substitute	182.6	198.8	201.3	189.3	212.8	145.7	152.9
Pulses and products	49.8	53.7	51.2	63.1	54.4	51.0	45.9
Milk and milk products	89.7	83.8	78.6	103.9	81.2	93.6	66.4
Edible oil	61.5	58.3	55.8	68.1	57.8	60.5	55.5
Egg, fish and meat	83.2	137.5	91.2	316.2	145.3	107.5	74.7
Vegetables	74.1	73.9	72.1	80.8	75.4	68.2	79.5
Fruits	27.3	23.8	21.0	34.9	23.8	24.0	18.8
Total food	697.6	752.8	684.6	1016.7	775.2	667.7	595.6
House rent	18.6	0.5	0.7	-	0.2	1.9	0.3
Clothing	97.4	91.2	87.4	106.1	92.0	88.3	80.3
Education	70.7	30.0	18.9	73.0	20.9	64.7	14.8
Health	115.1	48.7	48.1	51.2	46.9	55.6	37.6
Entertainment	26.2	25.6	25.7	25.1	26.1	23.5	26.0
Intoxicants	68.0	97.2	85.8	141.7	101.1	82.5	78.9
Consumer durables	41.7	14.4	12.0	23.5	10.4	29.6	12.2
Total expenditure	1533.2	1402.9	1280.4	1876.7	1420.8	1334.8	1147.6
<b>2004-05</b>							
Cereals and cereal substitute	119.6	104.3	106.0	99.8	105.8	100.5	93.5
Pulses and products	18.9	15.6	16.2	14.0	16.3	14.0	17.2
Milk and milk products	27.3	18.2	18.4	17.7	17.0	21.0	11.2
Edible oil	29.0	25.3	26.7	21.6	26.1	23.4	23.7
Egg, fish and meat	23.7	26.4	26.6	26.1	27.9	22.9	12.9
Vegetables	34.8	28.2	27.2	30.8	27.6	29.5	23.2
Fruits	15.2	10.5	10.2	11.1	10.1	11.4	7.5
Total food	308.5	257.5	258.4	254.9	258.8	254.2	211.7
House rent	5.6	1.7	1.8	1.7	1.4	2.5	2.6
Clothing	40.0	30.6	29.3	34.0	28.2	36.2	33.3
Education	16.7	10.0	9.7	10.6	8.9	12.5	6.4
Health	42.6	33.1	33.8	31.3	33.8	31.4	16.1
Entertainment	7.5	2.8	3.2	1.9	2.6	3.2	1.4
Intoxicants	38.9	27.4	29.3	22.3	28.0	25.8	12.5
Consumer durables	9.7	5.1	5.7	3.7	5.9	3.3	2.9
Total expenditure	605.8	485.6	484.3	489.1	486.8	482.7	382.4

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

**Table 6**  
**Shares of Food and Non-Food Items in MPCE of**  
**Tribal Households in Telangana (TN) in Percentage**

	Telangana	Tribal households					
		All	North TN	South TN	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Cereals and cereal substitute	11.91	14.17	15.72	10.08	14.98	10.91	13.33
Pulses and products	3.25	3.83	4.00	3.36	3.83	3.82	4.00
Milk and milk products	5.85	5.97	6.14	5.54	5.72	7.01	5.78
Edible oil	4.01	4.16	4.36	3.63	4.07	4.54	4.83
Egg, fish and meat	5.43	9.80	7.13	16.85	10.23	8.05	6.51
Vegetables	4.83	5.27	5.63	4.31	5.30	5.11	6.93
Fruits	1.78	1.70	1.64	1.86	1.67	1.80	1.64
Total food	45.50	53.66	53.47	54.17	54.56	50.02	51.90
House rent	1.21	0.04	0.05	-	0.01	0.15	0.03
Clothing	6.36	6.50	6.82	5.65	6.47	6.62	7.00
Education	4.61	2.14	1.48	3.89	1.47	4.85	1.29
Health (total)	7.51	3.47	3.76	2.73	3.30	4.17	3.28
Entertainment	1.71	1.82	2.01	1.34	1.84	1.76	2.27
Intoxicants	4.44	6.93	6.70	7.55	7.12	6.18	6.88
Consumer durables	2.72	1.02	0.94	1.25	0.73	2.22	1.07
<b>2004-05</b>							
Cereals and cereal substitute	19.75	21.47	21.89	20.40	21.74	20.83	24.46
Pulses and products	3.13	3.21	3.35	2.86	3.34	2.90	4.49
Milk and milk products	4.51	3.75	3.80	3.62	3.50	4.35	2.92
Edible oil	4.79	5.21	5.51	4.42	5.35	4.85	6.21
Egg, fish and meat	3.91	5.45	5.49	5.33	5.74	4.74	3.36
Vegetables	5.74	5.80	5.61	6.29	5.67	6.11	6.06
Fruits	2.51	2.16	2.11	2.28	2.07	2.37	1.97
Total food	50.93	53.02	53.36	52.11	53.16	52.66	55.36
House rent	0.93	0.36	0.36	0.34	0.29	0.51	0.68
Clothing	6.60	6.29	6.04	6.94	5.80	7.49	8.72
Education	2.75	2.05	2.00	2.18	1.82	2.60	1.66
Health (total)	7.03	6.81	6.97	6.41	6.94	6.51	4.22
Entertainment	1.24	0.58	0.65	0.38	0.54	0.66	0.37
Intoxicants	6.43	5.64	6.06	4.56	5.76	5.35	3.27
Consumer durables	1.60	1.06	1.17	0.75	1.21	0.67	0.77

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

**Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana**

**Table 7  
Food Consumption Pattern among  
the Tribal Households in Telangana (kg/month)**

	Telangana	Tribal Households					
		All	North Telangana	South Telangana	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Cereals	12.132	13.056	12.994	13.296	13.540	11.219	11.396
Millets	0.492	1.436	1.386	1.630	1.615	0.756	0.498
Cereal substitutes	0.001	0.007	-	0.034	0.009	-	0.000
Pulses and pulse products	0.788	0.844	0.805	0.996	0.848	0.833	0.742
Food grains	13.413	15.343	15.185	15.956	16.012	12.808	12.138
Milk and milk products	3.378	3.466	3.478	3.418	3.451	3.522	2.797
Edible oil	0.794	0.831	0.799	0.952	0.836	0.810	0.788
Eggs (no.)	2.886	3.595	3.907	2.390	3.886	2.490	0.003
Fish and meat	0.463	0.752	0.584	1.402	0.795	0.588	0.430
Vegetables	4.114	4.168	3.991	4.854	4.259	3.824	4.264
Fruits	0.307	0.301	0.282	0.378	0.301	0.304	0.248
<b>2004-05</b>							
Cereals	12.992	12.837	13.028	12.334	13.181	12.014	11.954
Millets	0.978	1.991	1.923	2.170	2.130	1.661	2.043
Cereal substitutes	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000	0.000
Pulses and pulse products	0.700	0.587	0.615	0.513	0.619	0.510	0.658
Food grains	13.692	13.424	13.643	12.847	13.800	12.525	12.612
Milk and milk products	2.678	1.787	1.830	1.674	1.736	1.909	1.207
Edible oil	0.551	0.480	0.504	0.419	0.496	0.443	0.490
Eggs (no.)	2.139	2.434	2.660	1.839	2.816	1.520	1.498
Fish and meat	0.278	0.311	0.317	0.292	0.325	0.275	0.170
Vegetables	3.671	3.010	2.781	3.610	2.860	3.368	2.366
Fruits	0.249	0.190	0.217	0.120	0.224	0.109	0.080

To gauge the real increase in living standards, the trends and patterns of consumption of food items in quantitative terms were examined and the relevant data are presented in Table 7. The cereal consumption declined over the seven years in all categories and it was lesser for all classes compared to tribal households. The intake of pulses and pulse products registered an increase in all categories of STs. While consumption of pulses was higher for all classes in 2004-05, the reverse pattern was observed by 2011-12; intake was lesser in Non-Scheduled Areas. Consumption of milk and milk products improved but it was substantially higher among tribal households. Similar trends were discernible in the case of eggs, fish and meat, vegetables and fruits. These data indicate the changes likely to occur whenever the income/expenditure increases. Economic growth even among

the socially excluded would increase the demand for quality foods while cereals may tend to be an inferior commodity.

**Table 8**  
**Index of Diversification (IoD) of Food and**  
**Non-food Consumption Expenditure of Tribal Households (%)**

Category	Telangana	Tribal households					
		All	North Telangana	South Telangana	Scheduled Districts	Non Scheduled Districts	Tribal Concentrated Districts
<b>2011-12</b>							
Food	0.1250	0.1372	0.1417	0.1577	0.1424	0.1189	0.1275
Non-food	0.0504	0.0518	0.0520	0.0547	0.0530	0.0524	0.0497
Total	0.0408	0.0506	0.0518	0.0578	0.0533	0.0429	0.0459
<b>2004-05</b>							
Food	0.2404	0.2016	0.2103	0.1807	0.1996	0.2199	0.2663
Non-food	0.0494	0.0575	0.0590	0.0550	0.0582	0.0540	0.0469
Total	0.0254	0.0243	0.0250	0.0181	0.0242	0.0251	0.0228

IoD =  $\sum (a_i)^2$ , where  $a_i$  stands for a share of the  $i$ th item in total expenditure. Lower IoD value refers to diversification of expenditure.

Source: Computed from NSSO unit-level data

The index of diversification of consumption expenditure for food, non-food and all was computed and these indices were included in Table 8. It suggests that there was more diversification in food expenditure in 2011-12 compared to 2004-05.

### Conclusion

The levels of living of STs in rural Telangana were studied based on unit record 61st and 66th rounds of NSSO on consumption expenditure using multiple indicators. The STs in three typologies viz., geographical regions, Schedule V Areas and districts with a high concentration of STs were considered and the indicator values for these categories were compared with all rural households. The MPCE of STs grew significantly and this growth was accompanied by a reduction in inequalities. These led reduction in poverty. The growth in MPCE, reduction in inequalities in MPCE and decline in poverty ratio were more rapid for ST households. The seasonal variations in MPCE were diffused bringing more stability in the consumption expenditure. The absolute expenditure and share in the total expenditure of items suggest that cereals were losing their importance but food grains while pulses, milk and milk products, vegetables and fruits and eggs, meat and fish were getting priority in expenditure decisions. The expenditure elasticity of food items points out the emerging demand for

### **Levels of Living of Scheduled Tribes of Rural Telangana**

quality food items. The fall in budgetary allocations for health services and the rise in intoxicants warrant corrective action since malnutrition levels were high among STs of Telangana. Planning for socio-economic development of STs with general funds and social development funds should take cognisance of the findings of this and other studies.

#### **End Note**

1. North Telangana districts comprise erstwhile Adilabad, Karimnagar, Khammam, Warangal and the rest four are in South Telangana. The capital district Hyderabad was excluded from the analysis.
2. The scheduled districts include erstwhile Adilabad, Warangal, Khammam and Mahabubnagar. Scheduled areas cover 72 Mandals and 1174 villages. Of the Mandals fully covered are distributed as follows: 16 in Khammam, 1 in Warangal, 5 in Adilabad, partially covered Mandals are spread over these districts - 27 in Adilabad, 10 each in Khammam and Warangal and 3 in Mahaboobnagar.
3. Tribal concentrated districts are Khammam and Adilabad and together account for 38 per cent of the total tribal population of the state.
4. Poverty ratios were worked out using MPCE data and poverty lines (Rs pcm) based on mixed reference periods. These poverty lines are Rs 433.43/- and Rs 860/- respectively for rural Telangana in 2004-05 and 2011-12 respectively.

#### **References**

- Drewnowski, J. (1974), *On Measuring and Planning the Quality of Life*. Hague: Institute of Social Studies.
- Drewnowski, J., and Scott, W. (1966), *The Level of Living Index*. Geneva: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.
- Granahan Mc, D.V., Richard-Proust, C., Sovani, N.V. and Subramanian, M. (1972), *Contents and Measurement of Socio-Economic Development*. New York: United Nations Research Institute for Social Development.
- Mishra, B. (2016), 'Welfare and Conservation Implication of the Forest Rights Act in the Protected Areas of Odisha, India'. *Indian Economic Journal*, 64 (2), pp. 186-202.
- Morris, M.D. (1979), *Measuring the Conditions of the World's Poor: The Physical Quality of Life Index*, New York: Pergamon Press.
- Rao, K.H. (1993), *Levels of Living in Rural India: A State Wise Analysis*. Hyderabad: National Institute of Rural Development.
- Rao, M.V., Porwit, K. and Baster, N. (1978), *Indicators of Human and Social Development: Report on the State of the Art*. Tokyo: United Nations University.
- Stiglitz, J. E., Sen, A. and Jean-Paul, F. (2009), *Report by the Commission on the Measurement of Economic Performance and Social Progress*. Paris: Commission on the Measurement of Economic Performance and Social Progress.
- UNDP (1991), *Human Development Report*. New York: Oxford University Press.
- United Nations. (1954), *Report on International Definition and Measurement of Standards and Levels of Living*, New York: United Nations.



*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 27-44)

## **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing from Darjeeling and Kalimpong**

**Anup Shekhar Chakraborty\***

*Darjeeling district comprises the hill division and the plains division. The field study involved multi-locational interviews of individuals contacted through snowball sampling during the period 2005-2015; besides a diligent reading of the Nepali newspapers from the region. The fieldnotes glean into the webbed nature of migrations or mobility in the trans-Himalayan settings. The study complicates the very idea of domestic outsourcing and domestic insourcing and revisits the social imaginaries operative among the communities in the region of Darjeeling and amidst the protracted ethnolinguistic cartographic aspiration of a separate state of Gorkhaland in North Bengal.*

### **Introduction**

Darjeeling district comprises the hill division and the plains division. Darjeeling, Kurseong, Mirik and Kalimpong fall under the hills areas, while Siliguri, Matigara, Phansidewa, Bagdogra, Naxalbari fall under the plains areas. The foothills of Darjeeling which comes under the Siliguri subdivision is known as the Terai. The district is bounded on the north by Sikkim, on the south by Kishanganj district of Bihar state, on the east by Kalimpong (now a separate district) and the west by Nepal. Darjeeling district has a length from

---

\* Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science and Political Studies, Netaji Institute for Asian Studies, Kolkata. E-mail: anupshekharc@rediffmail.com

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing...**

north to south of 29 Kilometers and a breadth from east to west of 26 Kilometers. The entire hill region of the district comes under the Gorkhaland Territorial Administration (GTA), a semi-autonomous administrative body under the state government of West Bengal. As of 2011, it was the second least populous district of West Bengal after Dakshin Dinajpur. Post-2017, 14th February Kalimpong was carved as a separate district.

### **Methodology and Context**

The field study involved multi-locational interviews (some personal and some informal) and prolonged conversations with individuals contacted through snowball sampling. The interviews were conducted in parts to suit the timings and needs of both the interviewer and the interviewee during the period 2005-2015; besides a diligent reading of the Nepali newspapers from the region of North Bengal. Given the nature of the issues selected and identified to be investigated in this study the investigation took the form of a decadal enterprise; and rightly so in sync with migration studies, it showed trends in migrations both internal and external as well as overseas/over lands migrations to distant countries outside South Asia. The study brought to the fore the very webbed nature of migrations or mobility in the trans-Himalayan settings that circumvent and also at times reaffirms many of the existing understanding of human movements from rural to urban, urban to the centres of the metropole. The study in this sense complicates the very idea of mobility across time and space and revisits the social imaginaries operative among the communities in the region of Darjeeling and amidst the protracted ethnolinguistic cartographic aspiration of a separate state of Gorkhaland in North Bengal.

### **Contextualising Migrations in Darjeeling**

The region has witnessed migrations of all kinds from colonial times through the post-colonial times. Skewed infrastructural development, limited employment opportunities, growing 'graduates but unemployed', sick tea gardens, etc., have all contributed to the push and pull of population flow. This disgruntledness has also amplified itself in the form of ethnic unrest demanding 'self-determination', 'autonomy' and separate statehood movements in North Bengal. Thus, the limited possibilities of growth and the skewed infrastructural initiatives in the region naturally propelled the flow of exodus from the region into other destinations providing greater opportunities in terms of jobs, realisation of aspirations and political stability. 'Moving out' from the region into more secured spaces become the

### **Chakraborty**

lived realities of the region. However, 'moving out' is not as simple as it seems. Questions that loom large are 'why do individuals/people move?'; 'what compels them to choose to move?', or is moving out the result of no choice?', 'what is the direction of the social mind in terms of making the calculations towards moving?' and also 'what are the social imaginaries at play in making such decisions?' (Castoriadis, 1987; Zizek, 1991; Anderson, 1991; Shotter, 1993; Appadurai, 1996; Taylor, 2004).

The social imaginaries of 'moving out' is best summed up through what is locally referred to in the Nepali language as 'Taan-neh' ('to pull someone with a magnetic effect', denoting vertical mobility). 'Moving out' is also imagined as being rescued and placed at a socially elevated position. The image comes very close to the mercenary imagery of the 'Lahorey' (Lahore return Gorkha mercenaries of Maharana Ranjit Singh) which propelled the trend of recruitment of the Gorkha into the Army (British as well as Indian).

'Moving out' seems to be an easy engagement, however, celebrated as it is 'moving out' comes with its dynamics (Chakraborty, 2018, 30-61). The prominent focus on 'mobility' in the context of migrations of women over men arguably has links to assumptions about gender and, in particular, a generalised notion of female vulnerability. That is, "whereas men (who migrate) are viewed as active, adventurous, brave and deserving of admiration, for the same behaviour women are pictured as passive, foolish and naïve deserving either rescue or punishment". In discourse and practice about human mobility, these assumptions about gender, migration, and vulnerability seem to have been emphasised so those female migrants who are exploited are often conceptualised as trafficked, while male migrants are seen more commonly as irregular migrants when faced with the same violations and abuse. Importantly, this perspective not only unduly focuses on women but also leads to the omission of men from the larger migrations discourse and trafficking discussion, and by implication, prevention and assistance paradigms.

### **Migrations, Ethnic Fistedness and Questions of Economics**

The trend of outmigration to megacities, particularly in search of job opportunities has remained an indelible part of the people from the district of Darjeeling in West Bengal. For instance, the demand for Indian food and restaurants, chain of budget hotels such as Travelodge and the informal sector in the United Kingdom has opened up newer opportunities for the flow of the Gorkha/Nepali speaking population. The mobility of the

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing...**

Gorkha/Nepali speaking populations has increased over the years adding on to the diaspora community and feeding into the desire of retaining an authentic pristine 'home' back at the place of origin (Informal talks with British Gorkha and other Gorkha/Nepali speaking population, London 2012).

Reversely Darjeeling continues to attract large inflow of 'in-migrants' to occupy the 'labour vacuum' created by the outmigration of labour force both skilled and semi-skilled to greener pastures in other states and abroad. For instance, informal discussions with local residents, business families, hoteliers and hotel managers and construction workers etc., in Darjeeling town conducted through the years 2005 to 2015 brought to the fore that the children working in small tea stalls, restaurants, and domestic helpers in Darjeeling town in most cases are sourced out from areas closer to Islampur and the Duars and surrounding tea garden areas. These informal discussions also divulged that the construction labourers and adult male helpers in hotels have been sourced from Siliguri, Chopra, Islampur, Kishangunj etc. Mann Bahadur (Personal Interview, 2009) a porter and water carrier living and working in Darjeeling for the past 20 years mentioned that the 'Porters ('Coolies') and water carriers locally referred to as 'bhariya', 'namley' 'bharibokney' in most cases hail from Nepal and Indo-Nepal border areas'. 41-year-old Man Bahadur Tamang from Charali, Nepal has been working as a construction coolie since the early 90s. Currently, he is a regular coolie at Nivesh Hardware, Singamari. He earns about ₹ 400 a day during peak season. His father was also a porter back in Nepal. He has a wife and two kids to support. His son studies at Ramakrishna Siksha Parishad (RKSP) Boys' School and his daughter in St. Teresa's School. Man Bahadur says that 'he had no option but to become a 'bhariya' as he had almost no education'. 'Life in Nepal was tough and the problems of unemployment compelled him to move to Darjeeling with his wife and infant son back in the 90s'. 'Darjeeling provided him more prospects in terms of jobs- working in construction sites, grocery stores, water carriers, transport line coolie job etc.' 'Also earning in Indian rupee was always more satisfying than earning in Nepali currency. The conversion rates provided him and his family greater profits'. Man Bahadur Tamang interestingly has managed to get a ration card for his family and also LPG connection. 'Life in India is good but the frequent strikes for Gorkhaland called by the Gorkha Jana Mukti Morcha Party adversely affect daily wage earners like us', says Man Bahadur. All these further substantiate the understanding that 'in-migration' or 'in-

### **Chakraborty**

movers' have steadily increased from the peripheral areas to other megacities of India as well as abroad in the last few decades.

Post-Indian independence Darjeeling was merged with the state of West Bengal following which a separate district of Darjeeling was established consisting of the hill towns of Darjeeling, Kurseong, Kalimpong and some parts of the Terai region. The region of North Bengal ever since has remained ethnically sensitive with the hill population comprising the ethnic Nepali/Gorkha who mostly migrated during British times, and the plains occupied by communities such as Bengali, Santhal/Adivasi, Rajbansis (Cooch, Kamtapuri). Newspaper reports<sup>1</sup> suggested that a strong sense of discontent has emerged among the prominent contending communities in North Bengal reverberating itself in the form of demands for smaller states, autonomous territorial councils and certain other concessions from the Union and the State Government of West Bengal. Following a restive trend, the rationale for a separate state for prominent contending communities in the region has been put forward geared to protect linguistic and cultural identities and also facilitate rapid development. The rationale for 'development' is highly contested. Whether autonomy should precede development or development should precede autonomy or both should complement each other remains highly debatable. The Morcha supporters shouting: "We do not want development, we want Gorkhaland", during West Bengal CM Mamata Banerjee's visit to Darjeeling on 29 January 2013 well sums up these contestations and complexities (Gazmer, 2013).

#### **Trends in migrations in Darjeeling Hills and Darjeeling Plains**

Geographic mobility in the form of 'outmigration' has accelerated with economic development and technological opportunities (Nambodri, 1996) elsewhere. The push and pull factors (Lee, 1966) for outmigration from Darjeeling Hills can be identified as an additional reason for socio-political unrest in the region, which has affected economic development (Ravenstein, 1885), employment opportunities and educational system in the region (National Sample Survey Organisation, 2001; 2007). Employment opportunities are limited with few private sectors and non-governmental initiatives in the North-East region in general and Darjeeling District in particular. Government employment thus is highly coveted and only those with the 'right political connections' or money enjoy the benefits of 'authoritative allocation of values'. The region remains largely unexploited and untapped in terms of resource potential and consequently presents an unimpressive Human Development Index (HDI) (Radhakrishnan, 2008; Government of India, 1981; 1997; 2000; 2001a; 2001b; 2005a; 2005c; 2008).

### Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing...

#### Domestic Outsourcing: 'Saving there, Spending at home'

Domestic outsourcing just as a career in the Army (Indian and British Army) has been one of the prominent trends of outmigration in Darjeeling (Chakraborty, 2013). With changing times migration to serve in the army was replaced substantially by 'domestic outsourcing'. Domestic outsourcing as a trend cuts across the hills-plains community divide. The employment opportunity in urban centres within India and abroad has played the role of pull factor for this kind of outmigration. Domestic outsourcing precedes the call centre phenomenon. The local dailies are splashed with attractive sounding job opportunities in big cities and abroad:

*'Sunolo Mauka: Hongkong-Singapore Domestic Helper wa kamgarneichuk mahilaharu ko lagi Training shurubhairehe cha. Singapore experience laichaneimaukadeicha. Contact for more details: Darjeeling Gurkha Domestic Vocational Training, Mall Road, Chowrasta, Darjeeling.'* (Himalay Darpan, 22nd June 2011)

('Golden Opportunity: Seeking females for domestic helpers and workers in Hongkong-Singapore, Training going on. People with experience in Singapore preferred. Contact for more details: Darjeeling Gurkha Domestic Vocational Training, Mall Road, Chowrasta, Darjeeling.')

Most of these advertisements target the semi-educated male and female and offer jobs for baby sitters, domestic help, helpers in hotels, 'momo makers' etc. Domestic outsourcing has been and continues to be one of the more popular modes of outmigration in Darjeeling with almost every household having somebody or a close relative in working as pegs in the highly contested shrinking service sectors of metropolitan centres of Bangalore, Delhi, Kolkata, Mumbai or aboard in places like Singapore, Bangkok, Dubai etc.

Domestic workers are alternately referred to as nannies/ housekeepers, breadwinner maids, foreign domestics, or, concerning their status as mothers, remote mothers, substitute mothers, mobile mothers, transnational mothers, migrant mothers, or mother-domestics. Interestingly there is a feminisation of the work or labour in the trend of domestic outsourcing. For instance, the following advertisement in the local daily Himalay Darpan reads:

'Urgent Required For Kuwait. Job: Male House Maid.  
Required: 50 candidates. Location: Various in Kuwait.  
Salary: 90 Kuwait 'Dinars'. Food provided by the employer.'

### Chakraborty

Accommodation provided by the employer. Air Ticket provided by the employer. Leave and Holiday as per Labour Law. Required documents: 1. Passport colour scan copy front-last page; 2. One colour photo white background; 3. Medical Report (Himalaya Darpan, 23rd June 2011, 3).

The job description as 'Male House Maid' though very common and often overlooked as a typographical error, the description has strong underpinnings of patriarchal norms and feminisation of work intertwined in it. The domesticity of the job calls for the domestication of the workforce itself according to the dictates of patriarchy in a given situation. For instance, few of my interviewees both female and male mentioned that, 'the male members expected the domestic helpers to agree to the terms and conditions laid down by the father figure in the household.' (Personal Interview(s): Mala Kumari (name changed on request) 20th May 2011; Sawan Bahadur (name changed on request) 22nd May 2011; Reetu Kumari (name changed on request) 21st May 2011). In other words, patriarchy replicated and manifested itself even for the domestic helpers in an alien land. Sawan Bahadur (Personal Interview, 2011) for instance, mentioned that he had to do household work in a Sheikh's house and there were other 'male housemaids' from Malaysia and the Philippines. Sawan felt that his mongoloid features gave him an edge over others, 'the Sheikhs like clean-shaven, hairless male domestic helpers'. Sawan mentioned that his Sheikh was affluent and provided the domestic helpers with twin sharing room. Sawan mentioned that his friends from Darjeeling who had joined various households in Dubai were less fortunate and their mobility was restricted. Though initially they were promised return air tickets on holidays this was not as easy as mentioned in the newspaper advertisement and as promised by the recruiting agency back in Darjeeling, India. Life in Dubai was not simple and working there at the Sheikh's house even more difficult, but he aimed to save money and spend at 'Home' in Darjeeling.

The female migrants interviewed shared experiences of being humiliated, over-worked and poor health due to the nature and duration of the household work/task. Mala Kumari (Personal Interview, 2011) former Domestic helper at Qatar mentioned that 'one of the daily tasks assigned to her was to iron clothes at the Sheikh's house and sometimes she would iron and arrange the clothes for over three hours. She was expected to work fast and do her next task/work that was instructed or charted by the household on a day to day basis. Mala said she was like a robot or a mechanical slave'.

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing..**

Another Sawan Bahadur (Personal Interview, 2013) aged 25, working at Bahrain mentioned that savings and sending home remittances enabled his family back in India financial security. He could now afford to provide English education to his eight-year-old son in the best school North Point. Hailing from a small village below Sukhiapokhri, Sawan grew up looking at the lights in the distant town of Darjeeling and never had a chance to get English education. He was grateful to god that working in Bahrain, he can send his son to study in Darjeeling and possibly get government jobs for themselves when they finish college. His parents had migrated to Sukhiapokhri from Pashupati market, Nepal (on way to Mirik) in the early 70s. His father worked as a bhariya (porter) in the local Marwari shop in Sukhiapokhri bazaar. Sawan dropped-out from school and took to working in a garage in Garidhura in 2003. While working there he eloped with a girl from Salbari (a small village on way to Siliguri) and moved back to his parent's rented house at Sukhiapokhri. Becoming a parent at 16, Sawan was pressurised to look for options for better earning. It was then that he met an older acquaintance who helped Sawan to network his current job at Bahrain from Nepal in 2004. Working in Bahrain and earning 170 Bahraini Dinar a month has changed life for Sawan and his family. His father no longer works as a porter. Sawan repaid the loan that his father had taken for sending him abroad from the Marwari shopkeeper where he was working as a regular porter. The family has invested in an agricultural plot closer to Ghoom and constructed a concrete structure. Sawan mentioned that the only target that he has in mind every day while on work in Bahrain is 'earn here, spend back at home'. Sawan got his job through agencies in Kathmandu and flew via Kathmandu to Bahrain. He paid the agents Indian ₹ 25000 and the family at Bahrain took care of his airfare, visa and necessary documents. Food, lodging clothing, and medical expenses were borne by the family in Bahrain. Sawan could not give the details of the percentage of the 'cut' that the various agents took from him but did mention that two month's salary was received by the agency. Sawan is thankful he is earning good.

Mala like Sawan (Personal Interview, 2013) mentioned that what kept her resilient was the prospect of saving and investing back at 'Home'. Mala mentioned that back at her parental native village at Rangli, she installed a double door fridge and a huge wall-mounted TV and rebuilt the concrete house and a shop for her brother. Mala also mentioned that she refurbished her second husband's house in Chandmari, Darjeeling town. Back in 2002 Mala lived in Lebong with her first husband a sepoy in the Indian army who took voluntary retirement a year after their first child was



### Chakraborty

born in 2003. Her husband had brought a Sumo and became a taxi driver shuttling between Darjeeling and Siliguri. Soon after her husband had an extramarital affair with a college student and left her. Her in-laws could do little to help her and she went back to her parents at Rangli. Jobless and the child to her care she moved to Gurgaon to work as a domestic help at the house of a businessman earning ₹ 8000 a month in the year 2005. She befriended a man from Darjeeling working in a restaurant in Delhi, got remarried in 2006 and bore a child. They moved back to Darjeeling to live with the family of her second husband. Her husband made several failed attempts to get a government job through networks with the local political party. Her new husband had a history of substance abuse and wasted his money at the local beer shop run by a lady in the supermarket complex. Mala began working as a domestic helper in the neighbourhood earning just sufficient to make ends meet. She found it humiliating to be called a maidservant and her husband was unhappy with her cooking, washing and cleaning at people's houses. Through friends in Delhi and relatives in Siliguri she came to know of agencies seeking female domestic helpers in Qatar. She moved to Qatar in 2008 for three years and worked there till March 2011. She did not know exactly how much the agency charged for her paperwork as the Sheikh's family had contacted the recruiting agency's sister concern in Qatar and paid 6000 Qatari Rial to the agency; Mala paid a month's earning in Qatar to the agents. Mala mentioned that 'doing the domestic work in the Sheikh's household is more reputable and she earns monthly 1100 Qatari Rial, and free accommodation, clothing, food, and medical expenses, including return airfare; and that when she visits Darjeeling she can easily afford to take her two children and relatives to 'Park hotel' and buy the best of clothes without thinking about the cost.' while this interview was conducted she was applying to work in the UAE.

Reetu Kumari (Personal Interview) a baby sitter at Singapore mentioned that 'she underwent a Training Programme at Siliguri before moving to Singapore. The recruiting agency at Siliguri gave them training in hygiene, grooming, working in modular homes and using baby care products popular in South East Asia. She mentioned that the agency instructed the girls not to have unsafe/unprotected sex in India or Singapore or elsewhere as that could lead to termination of their work permits/contracts. Pregnancy was seen as a problem by the agencies and they encouraged the 'girls' to use contraceptives or take pills.'

Reetu mentioned during our conversations that the girls (married as well as unmarried) from Darjeeling were often handed packets of

### Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing..

contraceptives by the recruiting agencies while boarding the plane to their destinations. And on their return to India from South East Asia their mothers and mother-in-laws handed them contraceptives so that they do not get pregnant during their vacations at home. Reetu mentioned that the girls working abroad were 'dollar earning machines' and the families at home could not afford to have them married or enjoy normal conjugal life. These overseas female domestic helpers became the sole breadwinners for many households in Darjeeling and the remittances they sent were used to procure big flat televisions, refrigerators, building concrete houses, children's education, healthcare etc. Reetu also shared sad cases where the woman had to work abroad while her husband took a second wife and stayed at the house built by the overseas wife. There were also reciprocal cases where overseas married women took local partners at their workplaces abroad and lived together conveniently while maintaining contacts with 'legal husbands' and sending remittances to families in Darjeeling.

Srijana (name changed) (Personal Interview, 2013) a 23-year-old single mother from Dabaipani/ Mineral Spring tea garden area mentioned that like her many girls from the tea gardens have found jobs through multiple agencies to Thailand, Singapore, Hong Kong. They work as baby sitters, in beauty parlours, in spas, in shopping malls or as housemaids and send remittances back home to the remote areas of Darjeeling. Srijana mentioned that working through agencies was more respectable and more secured; the agencies provided some kind of protection and security in foreign lands. Srijana also mentioned that working abroad for a single woman is not easy and people back at home in the '*kaman basti*' (tea garden areas) talk ill of them as '*chari keti*' (loose women) and doubt their source of income. Contrarily they are also role models for other girls to take control of their agencies and become breadwinners in a rapidly dwindling local economy that is affected negatively with trade unionism, closure of tea gardens, and the never satiated Gorkhaland movement. Like Srijana, Manisha Ghisingh (Personal Interview, 2013) a 29-year-old widow mentioned that after losing her husband to substance abuse in the year 2000, she decided to move out of the tea garden area of Lamahatta and work in a beauty parlour in Siliguri. In 2011, she enrolled through an agency to work in a spa and moved to Kathmandu and then to Dubai.

Regardless of which terms are used by academics, states, recruitment agencies, employers, or the workers themselves, and regardless of often tremendous cultural differences and geographical distances between sending and receiving countries, the capitalist-patriarchal underbelly

### Chakraborty

provides the connective tissue of all paid or unpaid versions of similar kinds of labour. This labour has always supported a capitalist 'interior infrastructure' of service and servitude, one that has now gone global (Yeoh, 1996). Moreover, foreign domestics are aliens from a different culture whose citizenship status marks and regulates them as bonded or enslaved labourers desperate enough to put up with any kind of abuse (Mendez, 1998).

There exists a reverse flow of domestic insourcing from the tea garden areas of the Dooars into the houses of Darjeeling hills. Young girls from the tea gardens of the Dooars and as far as Assam can be seen working as maids and domestic help and also babysitting in many houses of Nepali speaking communities in Darjeeling hills. The social imaginary of the hardworking, sturdy '*kali keti*' (black girl) looms large in the everyday life of the hill people so much so that having a '*kali keti*' is seen as a status symbol among the Nepali speaking community. One can hear conversation revolving around the 'amount of work that a single '*kali keti*' can do as compared to local Nepali Speaking maids'. There is a tendency to beastify the '*kali keti*' as a beast of burden - hardworking, sturdy, submissive and non-argumentative. In most cases, these young girls are as young as eight years old. Having been either sold off or negotiated for as less as 300 Indian ₹ (2005 rate; by 2015 the rate shot up to ₹ 800) a month by their families or relatives to meet financial needs back at home or been sent 'to earn for those back at home', these young children especially girls remain entrapped for life. In rural agricultural areas of Kalimpong such as Bom Busty one can find even young boys from the Dooars and Assam living lives as domestic help. Popularly referred to as '*kali keti*' (black girl) or '*kale keta*' (black boy) by the Nepali community, these are in most cases tribals from the Dooars and Assam, mostly Santhals. The families provide them food and lodging, clothing and also school education. Urmila Topno (Informal discussions, Urmila Topno and the Chettri Family, 17th April 2015) a 10-year-old from Barpeta (Assam) has been working in the Chettri household as domestic help for the past one year. Her parents sent her to work in Bom Busty, Kalimpong and also educate herself. She says, she finds the place (Kalimpong) rather cold but she enjoys going to school. She has already picked up a good hold over spoken Nepali. She had to repeat the IV standard in a nearby school as she was weak in English and Nepali language. With an everlasting smile on her face, Urmila obediently cleans the dishes, feeds the pets in the Chettri household oblivious of her situation as migrant child labour. The male head of Chettri household mentioned that Urmila's family condition was very difficult ever since the ethnic out-lash between the Bodos and the outsiders

### Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing...

especially the tribals (Santhals in most cases) in the tea gardens occurred a few years back. Urmila's family found it suitable to send her to be a domestic help so that she could send some money back at home in Barpeta where she has three more siblings. Mrs. Chettri says 'Urmila is happy here, she gets to eat good food, wear good clothes and also go to school while learning to do household work'. Mrs. Chettri also mentions that she intends to get Urmila's eight-year-old younger brother from Assam (Barpeta). 'We need a male help to assist the work in the farm'. Her brother will be apt to do the work on the farm- clean the cowshed, weed the farm, feed the chickens etc.'

Like Urmila, 12-year-old Charu (Informal discussions, Charu and the Subedi family, 17th April 2015) has been working as a domestic help in Bom Busty, Kalimpong for the past three years. Charu had come to Kalimpong from Jalpaiguri where she was working in another Nepali speaking household. Her parents and sisters live in Jaigoan. Charu says she likes working in Kalimpong and enjoys it more as her brother also works in the same household. She studies in class V and helps out with the domestic work and fetches the little two kids (eight year olds) from school. Her 14-year-old brother Vijay goes to school and helps out with the farm work. The head of the Subedi family (Informal discussions, Vijay and the Subedi family, 17th April 2015) mentioned that 'the kids are rather hardworking and have adjusted to Kalimpong. They are obedient and parts of their earnings are regularly sent to their parents in Jaigoan.' Mrs. Subedi says, 'we intend to raise them as adults and arrange for their marriage when the time comes'. 'The previous *'kali keti'* stayed with us for 17 years. We had got her marriage fixed with a tribal (santhal) boy from Kalchini. She was the one who got us Charu and Vijay'. Vijay mentioned that coping with Nepali language was difficult. He mentioned that his classmates make fun of his Nepali. Recalling his brief stay in Assam, Vijay says: '*udhar (Assam) school mein Nepali bacchon ko chidhate they 'Pa li? Ne pali', yahan mujhe chidhate hai 'kale santhali'* (back in Assam we use to tease Nepali kids as '*Pa li? Ne pali'* (in Assamese: did you find anything, no nothing), here I get teased as 'Black Santhali'.

Eleven-year-old Pramila (Informal discussions, Pramila and the Kalikotey family, 08th February 2014) has been working in the Kalikotey household in the railway station, Darjeeling since the time she was a little over seven years. Her aunt had fixed her work in the Kalikotey household and since then she has been working in Darjeeling. Her family lives in Naxalbari. Pramila does not study as she could not cope with the pace of teaching and failed thrice in class I. Repeating the same class thrice made her opt out of school. She sends regular money to her family.

### **Chakraborty**

The case of domestic insourcing in Darjeeling signals larger issues of child labour, missing children, missing girls/women from tea gardens, bank transfer economies or ghost earners back at home. Seldom do these insourced domestic helpers make headway back to their families or their 'home' villages, in most cases, they become part of the never-ending mobile workers fleeing from one household in one town to another and sending remittances to either parental families at home or their husband's homes. Their absence from their 'home' villages are seldom reported and are often underplayed by families and relatives directly benefitting from their 'outmigration'. Their absence is substituted by the remittance that they send back, and my understanding is that these cases are reported only when there is a break or an end in the flow of remittance. The missing diaries are an outcome of missing remittances.

### **Concluding Observations**

Construing the trends of outmigration in Darjeeling hills what can be accentuated is that when migration is prompted mostly by pull factors at the destination those with the requisite qualities take advantage of those factors and become the 'out-movers'. Outmigration experience in Darjeeling substantiates Massey's debunking of the individualist assumptions of the most influential and widely used approach in migration, the individual cost-benefit model (Todaro, 1989). The case of 'Domestic outsourcing' in Darjeeling seems to add to Massey's arguments that social networks and the community connections have a ponderous effect on migrations and shape migration in two steps: (1) making migration less risky for individuals by circulating information among potential migrants, and (2) feeding subsequent migration since kinship networks allow migrants to send remittances home, making migration a viable household strategy for diversifying economic risk.

On the other, the Darjeeling experience of 'Outmigration' adds on to the understanding of the individual cost-benefit model (Harris and Todaro, 1970; Todaro, 1976) by accentuating that decisions in migration are based on the calculations of a rational individual who weighs his/her expected gains (e.g. employment or higher salary) against possible losses (e.g. deportation) (Stark, 1991). Furthermore, the trends of outmigration in Darjeeling also accentuates that outmigration from the region is influenced by the family and friends factor. In other words, the threats and dangers of migration are cushioned and made bearable by a social support network in the place of destination. People in one's network also offer needed assistance, such as

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing..**

helping one find a job or a place to live. This facilitates the choice to migrate, making migration progressively more likely, which is what Massey refers to as “circular and cumulative causation” (Massey, 1990). Because of this process, the profile of migrants shifts over time, from that of innovating, risk-taking youth to more typical individuals (Tacoli, 1995, 199-212). Just as potential migrants expect kin or friends, who have already migrated, to assist them, so households of origin expect migrants to “help out” financially, by remitting a portion of their salary. Because of these expectations, households encourage select family members to migrate (Personal Interviews: Mala Kumari; Sawan Bahadur; Reetu Kumari).

However, the trends of ‘outmigration’ from Darjeeling stand apart on the issue of remittance. In the case of ‘Domestic Outsourcing,’ the remittance depends entirely on the lifestyle in a developed country and savings of the individual; and that the remittance through small flows at a regular interval through bank transactions or annual visits (Personal Interviews: Mala Kumari; Sawan Bahadur; Reetu Kumari). In the case of the ‘Call Centres’ the ‘money order economy’ is discontinued and occasionally replaced by ‘bank transfers’. The remittance flow in domestic outsourcing is peculiarly interesting when contrasted with those working in ‘Call Centres’. The Call Centre workers find it difficult to ‘send money back home’ precisely because of the flamboyant lifestyle, high cost of living in cities and limited concern for savings. Ironically, it is the family back at ‘home’ that has to supply money to the youngsters working in the metropolis and sponsor their trips back home during festive seasons (Chakraborty in Roy, 2013). The complexities outlined in this paper, suggests that migrant networks can link economies of places of origin and destination so that they become inter-dependent. For instance, migration remittances have a strong impact on inequality in the place of origin (The World Bank, 2005; 2006; 2008).

Poorly developed migrant networks from places of origin increase income inequality in the place of origin, as few households have access to migrant income. However, this may change as migrant networks grow and more people have access to similar sources of income. The possibility of inequality dissipating depends on levels of inequality between places of destination and origin, and how structures of production change. Some of the effects of this kind of different result in privileging some households’ access to land and resources, transforming egalitarian places into places where the social context is characterised by a few with economic and social power. Besides, traditional relations of production also change under some contexts. Also, labour markets in the place of origin may change with

### Chakraborty

increasing migration such that the outflow of migrants raises local wages to the point that wage differentials no longer motivated to move. Beyond the 'economic remittance' migrations have 'social remittance' in the form of transfer home of some skills and attitudes which may support or accelerate the process of development at the home destination (Castles and Miller, 1993; The World Bank, 2005).

Thus, it seems crucial to reformulate and reconceptualise migration as a complex process in which economic, political, social and cultural factors work synchronously (Brettell and Hollifield, 2000). Concentration just on the push or pull factors is not just simplistic but also misleading. The decision to 'move out' is influenced by a wide range of conditions in both the sending and receiving destinations. These conditions are not static but in a process of constant flux, linked to the global conditions and the local historical and cultural rootedness (Kritz, Keely, and Tomasi, 1981). It is therefore, essential to analyse outmigration especially labour migration as a movement of workers propelled by the dynamics of the transnational capitalist economy which conditions both the push and pull. In other words, migrations in Darjeeling and in specific the phenomenon of 'moving out' or 'outmigration' needs be examined as subsystems of an increasingly global economic and political system (Zolberg, Suheke, and Aguao, 1989; Brettell and Hollifield, (Ed.) 2000).

### End Notes

1. Rajib Chatterjee, 'State to seek ₹ 150 crore Central fund for Hills', Siliguri: *The Statesman*, Kolkata. Monday 11 July, 2011, P. 5; The Statesman, 'Centre to provide ₹ 600 crore package. Monday date for Hills pact', Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Kolkata: Statesman News Service (SNS). Saturday 16 July, 2011, P. 1, 17; The Statesman, 'Rail Hill packages set to fulfil Didi's promise of development', Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Darjeeling: Statesman News Service (SNS), Saturday 9 July, 2011, P. 13; The Statesman, 'Unpaid taxes no longer tax Hills people,' Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Kurseong: Statesman News Service (SNS), Saturday 2 July, 2011; *The Telegraph*, 'PMO promises support for hills', Siliguri: *The Telegraph*, New Delhi. Saturday 2 July, 2011; Vivek Chhetri, 'Full and final consensus' reached on all issues except finances. ₹ 1500 crore Wish for hills', Siliguri: *The Telegraph*, Darjeeling. 12 July. Wednesday 13 July. 2011, P. 1; Vivek Chhetri, 'Hills get ₹ 30 crore from railways. Factory at Tindharia, ropeway and more', Siliguri: *The Telegraph North Bengal and Sikkim*, Darjeeling, Saturday 9 July, 2011, P. 8.

### References

- Anderson, Benedict. (1991), *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, London: Verso Press.
- Appadurai, Arjun. (1996), *Modernity at Large*, Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press.

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing..**

- Brettell, C.B., and J.F. Hollifield, (2000). *Migration Theory: Talking Across Disciplines* (Eds), New York: Routledge.
- Castles, Stephen and Mark J. Miller. (1993), 'Globalisation, Development and Migration' in *The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in The Modern World.* Houndsmills: Palgrave Macmillan.
- Castoriadis, Cornelius. (1987), *The Imaginary Institution of Society*, MA: MIT University Press.
- Chakraborty, Anup Shekhar. (2013), 'Domestic Outsourcing And Call Centres: Construing Outmigration In Darjeeling' in D.C. Roy (Ed.), *Economy Of North Bengal: A District Level Study*, Siliguri: National Library, pp. 452-460.
- Chakraborty, Anup Shekhar. (2018), 'Moving Out and the Social Imaginaries at Play: Construing the trends in Migrations in Darjeeling Hills and Plains' (2005-2015). *Refugee Watch: A South Asian Journal on Forced Migration*, Vol. 51-52. pp. 30-61.
- Chatterjee, Rajib. (2011), 'State to Seek Rs. 150 Cr Central Fund for Hills', Siliguri: *The Statesman*, Kolkata. Monday 11 July, P. 5.
- Gazmer, Deep. (2013), 'Mamta, Gurung Ties in Freezer over Statehood: CM Rules Out Split, GJM Cries Gorkhaland', Darjeeling. *Times of India*, Kolkata, 30 January 2013, pp. 1-5.
- Government of India (2000), *Report of Eleventh Finance Commission*. New Delhi: Ministry of Finance.
- Government of India (2001a), *Consultation Paper on Empowering and Strengthening Panchayati Raj Institutions/Autonomous District Councils/Traditional Tribal Governing Institutions in Northeast India*.(National Commission to Review the Working of the Constitution), New Delhi: Ministry of Law, Justice and Company Affairs.
- Government of India (2001b), *National Human Development Report 2001*. New Delhi: Planning Commission.
- Government of India (2005a), *Annual Report 2004-2005*, New Delhi: Ministry of Home Affairs/Ministry of Development of Northeastern Region.
- Government of India, (2005b), *Economic Survey 2004-2005*. New Delhi: Ministry of Finance.
- Government of India. (2008), *Eleventh Five Year Plan 2007-2012: Inclusive Growth*, Vol. I. New Delhi: Planning Commission/Oxford University Press.
- Harris, John, and Michael P. Todaro. (1970), 'Migration, Urbanisation And Development: A Two Sector Analysis', *American Economic Review*, Vol. 60. No. 1.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Sunolo Mauka: Hongkong-Singapore Domestic Helper,' Vol. IX, Issue 312, P. 3, Siliguri, 22 June, Wednesday.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Sunolo Mauka: Hongkong-Singapore Domestic Helper,' Vol. IX, Issue 314, P. 3, Siliguri, 24 June, Friday.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Sunolo Mauka: Hongkong-Singapore Domestic Helper,' Vol. IX, Issue 315, P. 3, Siliguri, 25 June, Saturday.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Sunolo Mauka: Hongkong-Singapore Domestic Helper,' Vol. IX, Issue 316, P. 3, Siliguri, 26 June, Sunday.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Urgent Required For Kuwait: Male House Maid.' Vol. IX, Issue 313, P. 3, Siliguri, 23 June, Thursday.
- Himalay Darpan (2011), 'Vacancy: Mount Everest Manpower Pvt. Ltd. Requires House Maid, Cooks and Waiters For Singapore,' Vol. 9, No. 309, P. 3, Siliguri, 19 June, Sunday.
- Informal Discussions (2011), With Families and Relatives of Persons Working in Call Centres in Bangalore, Kolkata, Delhi and elsewhere.
- Informal Discussions (2014), Pramila and the Kalikotey family, Railway Station, Darjeeling, 08 February.



### Chakraborty

- Informal Discussions (2015), Charu and the Subedi family, Bom Busty, Kalimpong, 17 April.
- Informal discussions (2015), Urmila Topno and the Chettri Family, Bom Busty, Kalimpong, 17 April.
- Informal discussions* (2015), Vijay and the Subedi family, Bom Busty, Kalimpong, 17 April.
- Informal talks* (2012), British Gorkha and other Gorkha/Nepali Speaking Population. London: January-March.
- Interview and Prolonged Discussions* (2009), Man Bahadur Tamang, Singamari, Darjeeling, July.
- Nambodri, Krishnan (1996), A Primer Of Population Dynamics. The Plenum Series On Demographic Methods and Population Analysis, in *Migration*. New York: Plenum Press, pp.135-170.
- Kritz, M., Keely, C., and S. Tomasi (1981), *Global Trends In Migration: Theory and Research On International Population Movements* (Eds), New York: Centre For Migration Studies.
- Lee, Everett S. (1966), 'A Theory Of Migration', *Demography*, Vol.3. No.1.
- Massey, Douglas. (1990), 'Social Structure, Household Strategies, and the Cumulative Causation of Migration,' *Population Index*, Vol. 56, No. 1, pp. 3-26.
- Mendez, J. Bickham. (1998), 'Of Mops and Maids: Contradictions and Continuities in Bureaucratized Domestic Work,' *Social Problems*, Vol. 45, No. 1.
- National Sample Survey Organisation (2001), *NSS 55<sup>th</sup> Round (July 1999 – June 2000)*, New Delhi: Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, Government of India.
- National Sample Survey Organisation (2007), *NSS 62<sup>nd</sup> Round (July, 2005 to June, 2006)*, New Delhi: Ministry of Statistics and Programme Implementation, Government of India.
- Personal Interview (2011), Mala Kumari (name changed on request) (Former Domestic Helper in Qatar), Darjeeling, 20 May.
- Personal Interview (2011). Reetu Kumari (name changed on request) Present Baby Sitter in Singapore, Darjeeling, 21 May.
- Personal Interview (2011). Sawan Bahadur (name changed on request) (Former Domestic Helper in Dubai) Darjeeling, 22 May.
- Personal Interview (2013), Manisha Ghisingh. (name changed). Bagdogra. 10 August.
- Personal Interview (2013), Sawan Bahadur. (working in Bahrain) Chowrasta, Darjeeling. 22 June.
- Radhakrishnan, R.(2008), *India Development Report 2008*, New Delhi: Oxford University Press/ IGIDR, Mumbai.
- Ravenstein, E.G. (1885), 'The Laws Of Migration', *Journal Of Royal Statistical Society*, Vol. 48. No. 2.
- Shotter, John. (1993), *Cultural Politics of Everyday Life: Social Construction, Rhetoric and Knowing of the Third Kind*, Buckingham: Open University Press.
- Personal Interview (2013), Srijana (name changed on request) Lebong.
- Stark, Oded (1991), *The Migration of Labor*, Cambridge, MA: Basil Blackwell.
- Tacoli, Cecilia (1995), 'Gender and International Survival Strategies: a Research Agenda with Reference to Filipina Labour Migrants in Italy,' *TWPR*, Vol. 17, No. 2, pp. 199-212.
- Taylor, Charles (2004), *Modern Social Imaginaries*, Duke University Press.
- The Statesman (2011), 'Centre to Provide Rs. 600 Crore Package. Monday Date for Hills pact', Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Kolkata: Statesman News Service (SNS). Saturday, 16 July, P. 1-17.

### **Fieldnotes on Domestic Outsourcing and Domestic Insourcing...**

- The Statesman (2011), 'Rail Hill packages set to fulfil Didi's promise of development', Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Darjeeling: Statesman News Service (SNS), Saturday, 9 July, P. 13.
- The Statesman (2011), 'Unpaid taxes no longer tax Hills people,' Siliguri: *The Statesman North Bengal and Sikkim Plus*, Kurseong: Statesman News Service (SNS), Saturday, 2 July.
- The Telegraph (2011), 'PMO Promises Support for Hills', Siliguri: *The Telegraph*, New Delhi. Saturday, 2 July.
- The World Bank (2005), *Global Economic Prospects 2006: Economic Implication Of Remittances and Migration*, Washington, DC: World Bank.
- The World Bank (2008), *Migration and Remittances Factbook 2008*, Washington, DC: The International Bank For Reconstruction and Development/ The World Bank.
- Todaro, Michael. P. (1976), *Internal Migration In Developing Countries*. Geneva: International Labour Organisation.
- Todaro, Michael. P. (1989), *Economic Development in the Third World*, New York: Longman Press.
- Vivek Chhetri (2011), 'Full and Final Consensus Reached on All Issues Except Finances. Rs. 1500 Cr. Wish for hills', Siliguri: *The Telegraph*, Darjeeling. 12 July. Wednesday, 13 July, P. 1.
- Vivek Chhetri (2011), 'Hills Get Rs. 30 Crore from Railways Factory at Tindharia, Ropeway and More', Siliguri: *The Telegraph North Bengal and Sikkim*, Darjeeling, Saturday, 9 July, P. 8.
- Yeoh, B.S.A. (2007), *Singapore: Hungry For Foreign Workers At All Skill Levels*, Washington, DC: Migration Information Source.
- Zizek, Slavoj (1991), *Looking Awry: An Introduction to Jacques Lacan Through Popular Culture*, Cambridge, MA: MIT University Press.
- Zolberg, A.R, Suheke, A. and S. Aguao. (1989), *Escape From Violence*, New York: Oxford University Press.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 45-66)

## **Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field**

**Kavita Baliyan\* and G.S. Mehta†**

*Uttarakhand is one of the states which is marked by a large number of populations residing in the rural hill areas. These rural hill areas offer the toughest living conditions for its inhabitants. More than three-fourths of the population in Uttarakhand depends on agriculture for their livelihood and the economy is predominantly dependent on mountain agriculture. As a result, the majority of the rural population in the hills either survives on subsistence agriculture or migrates to other parts of the country for employment. The study is based on a primary survey in four districts of Uttarakhand. The survey covered 960 migrant and 199 non-migrant households and envisaged to present the benefits of migration and the extent to which migrants have succeeded in increasing the economic conditions of their family members at the native place.*

### **Introduction**

The migration of the population from low opportunity areas to relatively high opportunity areas has been a natural process around the world. People move from one place to another with the intention of settling, permanently or temporarily in a new location. Further, no restriction is placed upon the distance of the move or on the voluntary or involuntary nature of the act, and also no distinction is made between external and

---

\* Assistant Professor, Giri Institute of Development Studies, Lucknow.  
E-mail: kavitauijwal.baliyan@gmail.com

† Former Professor, Giri Institute of Development Studies, Lucknow.

### **Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field**

internal migration (Lee, 1966). Theorists like A. Lewis and Fei, Ranis, H. Todaro argued that migration of labour from the primary sector (rural) to the secondary sector (urban) happens due to wage differences in two sectors and maximum utilisation of labour productivities (Lewis, 1954; Ranis and Fei, 1961; Todaro, 1969). But Stark, Stark and Bloom, Stark and Lucas who gave the 'Inter-temporal family contract models of migration', are of the view that migration flows and patterns can not be explained solely based on individual workers and their economic incentives, and that wider social entities must be considered as well (Stark, 1980; Stark and Bloom, 1985; Stark and Lucas, 1988). Moreover, the decision to migrate is not always taken by an individual and is a collective decision of all the household members. Sometimes it (migration) takes place to avail of several other facilities which are not found at their place. Besides, there are many push and pull factors (Lee, 1966) which are responsible for the migration of individuals or households. 'Income differentials' is seen as a major pull factor while seasonality, risk, market failures, erosion of assets, natural calamities and landlessness are seen as push factors (Mehta, 1987, 1991, 1999, Mamgain, 2004). Hence, both poverty and prosperity are equally interlinking responsible factors for inducing migration. In a developing country like India, both push and pull factors are responsible for migration. Migration occurs more due to regional disparity in the development process. The existence of significant regional disparities in India should not come as a surprise. The scale and growth of these disparities are, however, of concern (Srivastava and Shahsi Kumar, 2003).

There are many studies both in India and abroad highlighting the various facts and dimensions of migration i.e., process of migration, trends, direction, implication, the reason of migration, impact of in-migration etc. but only a few studies focused on the consequences of migration from the place of origin (Kumar et al., 1998, Korra, 2009, Stockdale, 2004) and in destination place (Singh and Kaur, 2007, Mehta, 1991). The pre-determined hypothesis and assumptions to understand the economic benefits of migration, with employment and economic considerations, may have both negative as well as positive effects at the native place. However, earlier studies reveal that the migration of the individuals was targeted to economic betterment. Although the number of benefits received by migrants could be low or negligible during the initial stages of migration it boosted after some period spent at the place of destination by migrants (Khanka, 1988).

According to Census 2001, the trends and patterns of migration illustrate that it varies across the Indian states. The migration pattern

### **Baliyan and Mehta**

recorded highest in (34.70 per cent) in the state of Uttarakhand to the lowest (16.75 per cent) in the state of Nagaland. The issue of increasing incidence of out-migration from Uttarakhand, particularly from its hill districts, remains a big policy challenge before the policymakers of the state. Apart from the earlier studies (Bora, 1996; IHD, 2006; Mamgain, 2004), the latest NSSO data on out-migration shows a very high percentage of out-migration from Uttarakhand in comparison to the national average but much lower in comparison to states such as Himachal Pradesh and Kerala. Out-migrants constitute nearly 17 per cent of males and 21 per cent of the female population in rural areas of Uttarakhand.

Uttarakhand is an abode of a large number of people residing in hilly areas. These rural hill areas offer the toughest living conditions for its inhabitants and do not provide conducive terrains for the development of industries and other sources of employment generation (Mehta, 1991; Papola, 1986). The absence of industries and other sources of income and employment generation in these areas has hooked its inhabitants towards agriculture and allied activities. More than three-fourths of the population in Uttarakhand depends upon agriculture for their livelihood and the economy is predominantly dependent on mountain agriculture. However, due to small and fragmented land holding and limited irrigation facilities, the scope for agriculture based on modern input-intensive agriculture is severely constrained in the hill regions. As a result, the majority of the rural population in the hills either survives on subsistence agriculture or migrates to other parts of the country in search of employment. This migration has been so substantial that the economy of the state is termed as a “money order economy” (Mehta, 1987). In Uttarakhand rapid migration of the youths for better living conditions, quality education, medical facilities have further made the development of agriculture as a major challenge. The problem of alcoholism, domestic violence and lack of contribution from males in the rural economy also has always posed major constraints for the state. Such a pattern of migration has resulted in declining actual population, labour supply, sex ratio and overall demographic structure in rural hills and an increase in the number of ghost villages. It has also resulted in underutilisation of cultivated fertile lands and a decline in overall crop production especially local pulses and off-season vegetables in the state (Papola, 1986; Mehta, 1987, 1991; Mamgain, 2004).

### **Objective and Methodology**

The main objective of this study was to examine the emerging impact and consequences of out-migration in changing the socio-economic

### **Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field**

condition in Uttarakhand. The study also comprehended the changing pattern of demographic, condition of employment and generation of incomes from different sources, living standards and lifestyle among migrating and non-migrating households. The study further attempted to highlight the benefits of migration and the extent to which migrants have succeeded in improving the economic conditions of their family members at the native place. Additionally, the study also focused to assess the variation in the contribution of income and change in per capita and household income of migrants in their households, before and after migration.

The primary data for the study was collected from four districts of Uttarakhand. For this study, two districts were selected having the lowest population growth (Almora and Pauri Garhwal) and another two hilly districts having the highest population growth namely (Champawat and Uttarkashi) during 2001-2011. For the collection of primary data, one block from each district based on the same criteria. Household information was collected through a sample of selected villages. The selection procedure of sample villages was based on population growth and the growth rate of households in the village. The next selection parameter of the villages was road connectivity. The actual sample frame has covered four districts, 58 villages, 960 migrant households and 200 non-migrant households.

### **Results and Discussion**

#### ***Pattern of Migration***

In this study, it is analysed that initially, 98 per cent migrants migrated alone, leaving their family at the places of their origin and only a marginal proportion of migrants moved with their families. A similar pattern was noticed in almost all the sample districts. However, after settling at the destination or getting married, around 25 per cent of migrants shifted their families from the places of their origin to the places of their current destination. However, the remaining 73 per cent migrants remained alone at the places of their destinations. Thus, altogether a total of 27 per cent of migrants from sample villages were presently living with their family at different places of migration.

The pattern of migration of people was dominated by individual migration leaving their family at their native places. Such pattern still continues even after 2010. Seventy three per cent migrants continue to live alone at different destinations of migration. But the trend of living alone of such migrants has been remarkably increasing accounting to 54 per cent for those migrated before 2000 to over 97 per cent that migrated after 2010. The

### Baliyan and Mehta

trend of living alone of such migrants is the consequence of decreasing trend of families (reduced from 21 per cent till 2000 to 9 per cent after 2010) who were joining their migrant family members later on over the years.

**Table 1**  
**Status of Migration from Sample Households**

Year of Migration	Initial Status		Current Status		Total
	Alone	With family	Family Joined Later	Still Alone	
Before 2000	244 (98.39)	4 (1.61)	51 (20.56)	133 (53.63)	248 (100.00)
2001-2005	239 (97.15)	7 (2.85)	86 (34.96)	106 (43.09)	246 (100.00)
2005-2010	232 (97.48)	6 (2.52)	84 (35.29)	237 (99.58)	238 (100.00)
2010+	224 (98.25)	4 (1.75)	20 (8.77)	222 (97.37)	228 (100.00)
Total	939 (97.81)	21 (2.19)	241 (25.10)	698 (72.71)	960 (100.00)

Note: Based on 960 sample migrant households

#### *Migration by Gender*

It is argued that migration from Uttarakhand has been dominated by male family members. However, over the years, the nature of migration has undergone a significant change due to the changing motives and purpose of migration. Earlier, the main purpose of migration was to seek employment rather than availing the facilities of education, health, amenities of life and also due to push factors like natural calamities. This study revealed that despite the high domination of males in the total volume of migration, the share of women migrants was also over 23 per cent, which was even higher in Pauri Garhwal followed by Almora.

**Table 2**  
**Gender-wise Distribution of Migrants**

Districts	Sex		Total
	Male	Female	
Champawat	342 (85.07)	60 (14.93)	402 (100.00)
Almora	385 (72.50)	146 (27.50)	531 (100.00)
Pauri Garhwal	354 (70.38)	149 (29.62)	503 (100.00)
Uttarkashi	324 (82.44)	69 (17.56)	393 (100.00)
Total	1405 (76.82)	424 (23.18)	1829 (100.00)

Note: Based on 960 sample migrant households

#### *Socio-economic Comparison of Migrants and Non-Migrants Households*

This section shows the comparative picture of migrants and non-migrant households in the four districts of Uttarakhand.

The total population of migrant and non-migrant households together was 5287. However, the size of children below 15 years of age was larger in non-migrant households than in migrant households. It can be due

### Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

to the result of a larger segment of children who have migrated with their migrant family members for availing better educational facilities. In the remaining age groups of the population, the proportion of the population in migrant households was seen still higher than in the case of non-migrant households. Such a pattern of population distribution reflected that the large size of the family could also be a determining factor of migration of people from the hilly villages. The facts also depict that proportion of retired age groups of the population was nearly two folds higher in migrant households over the non-migrants households which provide the impression that a larger proportion of people were returning to their native places after getting retirement from their past employment from the migration destinations.

**Table 3**  
**The Population of Migrant and Non-Migrant Households by Age**

Age Group	Migrants	Non-Migrants	Total
0-15	1178 (27.59)	372 (36.54)	1550 (29.32)
15-30	1122 (26.28)	214 (21.02)	1336 (25.27)
30-45	595 (13.94)	253 (24.85)	848 (16.04)
45-60	755 (17.69)	99 (9.72)	854 (16.15)
60 and Above	619 (14.50)	80 (7.86)	699 (13.22)
Total	4269 (100.00)	1018 (100.00)	5287 (100.00)

Source: Field survey

As a consequence of migration, the average size of the family of migrants has gone down to 4.36 as against 5.12 in the non-migrant households. But, the average size of the family together for migrant and non-migrant households consists of 4.75 persons. Due to a highly male-dominated migration of people from the villages of hilly areas, there has been a significant change in the composition of sex ratio in hilly areas of Uttarakhand. However, the sex-ratio in almost all the hilly districts continued to remain significantly higher than the plain districts of Uttarakhand.

As far as the level of educational attainment among the population of migrant and non-migrant households is concerned, the study found that the family members in non-migrant households were better educated than the migrant households. This was indicated by the arguments that the proportion of illiterates in migrant households was 25 per cent as against 18 per cent in non-migrant households. Despite, a high proportion of the population, both the categories of households have a below matric level of education. Even, the proportionate share of the population with this level of education was larger at 66 per cent in non-migrant households as against 56 per cent in migrant households.



**Table 4**  
**Distribution of Migrants and Non-Migrants Households**  
**by the Size of Family, Sex and Marital Status**

Type of House	Average Family Size	Sex Ratio	Level of education					Total
			Illiterate	Up to Metric	Intermediate	UG/PG	Professional	
Migrants	4.36	1320	1063 (24.90)	2386 (55.90)	470 (11.00)	320 (7.50)	30 (0.70)	4269 (100.00)
Non-Migrants	5.12	1078	181 (17.78)	675 (66.31)	95 (9.33)	66 (6.48)	1 (0.10)	1018 (100.00)
Total	4.74	1269	1244 (23.53)	3061 (57.90)	565 (10.68)	386 (7.30)	31 (0.58)	5287 (100.00)

Source: Field survey

A significant proportion of labour force migrated for seeking higher paid employment as compared to the employment in which they were engaged before migration at their native place. The work participation rate at present is still higher in migrant households than in non-migrant households. Further, the rate of unemployment in migrant households has been higher (0.84 per cent) than in non-migrant households (0.59 per cent). Moreover, the relatively higher work participation rate among migrant households over the non-migrant households even after the migration of a sizeable volume labour force suggests that the availability of surplus labour force in the family should also be accounted as one of the determinants of migration of people from such households.

**Table 5**  
**Activity Status of Family Members of**  
**Migrants and Non-Migrants Households**

Activity status	Migrants	Non-Migrants	Total
Working	1936 (45.35)	412 (40.17)	2348 (44.41)
Housewife	196 (4.59)	32 (3.14)	228 (4.31)
Unemployment	36 (0.84)	6 (0.59)	42 (0.79)
Student	1288 (30.17)	443 (43.52)	1731 (32.74)
Child	353 (8.27)	60 (5.89)	413 (7.81)
Pensioner	219 (5.13)	27 (2.65)	246 (4.65)
Aged person	222 (5.20)	36 (3.54)	258 (4.88)
Others(disabled/handicapped)	19 (0.45)	2 (0.20)	21 (0.40)
Total	4269 (100.00)	1018 (100.00)	5287 (100.00)

Source: Field survey

## Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

**Table 6**  
**Work Participation among Men and Women**  
**of Migrants and Non-Migrants Households**

Type of households	Worker (WPR in %)		
	Male	Female	Total
Migrants	702 (38.15)	1234 (50.80)	1936 (45.35)
Non-Migrants	205 (41.84)	207 (39.20)	412 (40.47)
Total	907 (38.93)	1441 (48.73)	2348 (44.41)

Source: Field survey

As a result of the migration of men labour force, the pressure/ responsibility in performing different livelihood based activities especially farming occupations increased remarkably on the women workforce of migrant households. By looking at the existing differences in work participation rates among different gender between migrant and non-migrant households, it was found that the work participation rate of women in migrant households constituted around 51 per cent as against 39 per cent among in non-migrant households. The situation was reversed in case of the work participation rate of men of migrant and non-migrant households.

### *Distribution of Land Holdings*

The poor economic condition of households has been universally recognised as the most important determinant of the out-migration of people from rural areas. The ownership pattern of cultivated land, its quality and productivity structure have been categorised as an equally important determinant for rural-urban migration. In hilly areas of Uttarakhand, inequality in the pattern of land distribution hardly exists as the majority of over 91 per cent holdings are in the category of marginal holdings. Due to this reason, 71 per cent households (74 per cent non-migrant and 70 per cent migrant households) owned less than one acre of land and the average size of holding per household has been estimated at 0.75 acre. The overall share of marginal farmers who owned below 2.5 acres of land was to the extent of 92 per cent among migrant households as against 75 per cent non-migrant households. Thus, due to the paucity of cultivated land in possession, the majority of migrant households have been forcing their family members to migrate outside their villages. Moreover, the unequal distribution of arable lands for cultivation among the households could be considered as another important determinant of migration from Uttarakhand. Apart from this, the quality of land especially the size of irrigated land owned by the households and access to other livelihood resources is equally responsible in determining the pattern of outmigration from hilly areas of Uttarakhand.

Baliyan and Mehta

Table 7

Distribution of Migrant and Non-migrant households by Size of Holdings

Size Holding (in acres)	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
Less than 1	675	(70.31)	147	(73.87)	822	(70.92)
1-2.5	209	(21.77)	22	(11.06)	231	(19.93)
2.5-5.00	40	(4.17)	3	(1.51)	43	(3.71)
5.00+	5	(0.52)	0	(0.00)	5	(0.43)
Landless	31	(3.23)	27	(13.57)	58	(5.00)
Total	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)
Average size of holdings	0.81		0.69		0.75	

Source: Field survey

Impact of Migration

*Economic Impact of Migration*

It is argued that the lack of sufficient income for maintaining the minimum requirement of household push its family members to migrate in search of livelihood opportunities.

Table 8

Contribution of Income in Migrant and Non-migrant Household By Its sources

Source as Income	Migrants	Non-migrants	Total
	Average Income (₹) % share	Average Income (₹) % share	Average Income (₹) % share
Agriculture	10482 (8.60)	9410 (9.60)	9946 (9.05)
Animal husbandry/Beekeeping Forestry	15846 (13.01)	15029 (15.34)	15437 (14.05)
Industry/Handicraft/ artisan	528 (0.43)	543 (0.55)	535 (0.49)
Business	6353 (5.21)	15962 (16.29)	11157 (10.15)
Agricultural wages	86 (0.07)	222 (0.23)	154(0.14)
Non-agricultural wages	8133 (6.68)	16650 (16.99)	12392 (11.27)
Government Services	15065 (12.36)	18304 (18.68)	16685 (15.18)
Personal services /doctor /lawyer/ other	14427 (11.84)	10774 (11.00)	12601 (11.46)
Interest/house and land rent	194 (0.16)	239 (0.24)	217 (0.20)
Income from migrants remittances	22585 (18.54)	0 (0.00)	11293 (10.27)
Pension	27422 (22.51)	10713(10.93)	19067 (17.35)
Other	717 (0.59)	141 (0.14)	429 (0.39)
Total	1,21,838 (100)	97,986 (100)	1,09,912 (100)

Source: Field survey

The study depicted that the contribution of income generated together as remittances received from migrant family members and the amount of pension of returned migrants alone was registered as higher as 41 per cent in the migrant households. Otherwise, the share of income

### Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

generated from remaining sources was estimated remarkably much higher in non-migrant households as compared in migrant households. Even the contribution of income generated from different non-farm employment was over 63 per cent in non-migrant households as against only 35 per cent in migrant households. At the same time, the share of agriculture and its allied activities has been estimated relatively larger at 25 per cent in the households of non-migrants as compared to 22 per cent in migrant households. Such findings suggest that the households which have the opportunity of generating adequate incomes from traditionally available resources, including income from their family farms for the past several generations, were less likely to migrate outside their villages. Thus, the overall impact of migration has been very positive as far as in improving the economic condition of households of migrants at their native place.

#### *Consumption Pattern*

Overall consumption expenditure of the family is expected to be largely determined by the size of the disposable income of the particular family. Similarly, the pattern of the available income of household (purchase of consumption and non-consumption commodities), utilisation of various amenities of life and other heads are generally governed by the size of income.

**Table 9**  
**Differences in Consumption Pattern among**  
**Migrant and Non-migrant Households**

Head of Expenditure	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	Average Exp. (Rs.)	% share	Average Exp. (Rs.)	% share	Average Exp. (Rs.)	% share
Cereals	20280.31	(25.93)	9941.48	(19.38)	18505.13	(25.15)
Pulses and Spices	6932.49	(8.86)	4527.50	(8.83)	6519.55	(8.86)
Vegetable	3682.62	(4.71)	3454.78	(6.74)	3643.50	(4.95)
Fruits	703.96	(0.90)	609.93	(1.19)	687.82	(0.93)
Oil/ Ghee	4816.23	(6.16)	4068.52	(7.93)	4687.85	(6.37)
Sugar / juggar (gur)/ Tea	4033.26	(5.16)	1847.23	(3.60)	3657.92	(4.97)
Tobacco / bidee/ Other	1637.70	(2.09)	1421.81	(2.77)	1600.63	(2.17)
Cloth	6628.33	(8.47)	5515.98	(10.76)	6437.34	(8.75)
Footwear	2243.02	(2.87)	2380.40	(4.64)	2266.61	(3.08)
Education	9686.54	(12.38)	7024.12	(13.70)	9229.40	(12.54)
Health	4294.58	(5.49)	2600.00	(5.07)	4003.62	(5.44)
Social Functions	5217.03	(6.67)	3031.66	(5.91)	4841.80	(6.58)
Telephone /mobile /others	1836.47	(2.35)	1536.48	(3.00)	1784.97	(2.43)
Interest Payment	1039.52	(1.33)	298.59	(0.58)	912.30	(1.24)
Others(Daily_use_item)	5184.92	(6.63)	3028.14	(5.90)	4814.60	(6.54)
Total	78216.99	(100.00)	51286.62	(100.00)	73593.05	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

### Baliyan and Mehta

A sizeable income received by migrant households as remittances and pension. The household consumption expenditure for migrant households was reported relatively higher at ₹ 78.22 thousand as compared to ₹ 51.29 thousand for non-migrant households. Even, the average amount of expenditure of migrant households in every consumption and non-consumption items was higher over the expenditure pattern of non-migrant households.

#### *Indebtedness*

Despite higher annual income, the proportion of indebted households was found higher in migrant households. However, the amount of average household primary as well as the outstanding loan was higher in non-migrant households. Considering the amount of loan undertaken by both types of households, it may be attributed that the problem of indebtedness of households is forcing at a minimal level to migrate family members from hilly areas of the Uttarakhand.

**Table 10**  
**Distribution of Indebted Migrant and**  
**Non-migrant Households by Size of Borrowings**

Details of Loan	Migrants %	Non-migrants%	Total %
Indebted households	140 (14.58)	19 (9.55)	159 (13.72)
The average duration of Loan (Year)	3	2.66	2.83
Per household Outstanding Amount (Rs)	5,97,259	8,90,200	743729
Primary Amount of Loan per hh. (Rs)	1,31,427	12,29,000	680213
Yearly Interest Rate	7.3	6	6.65
Sample	960	199	1159

Source: Field survey

Purchase of agricultural inputs such as fertilisers, seeds, agricultural tools and machinery etc. have been the main purpose of undertaking loans by a majority of sample households. The second most important reason in this context had been the celebration of marriages and other social ceremonies for non-migrant households and the construction of houses and the purchase of land for migrant households. However, none of the non-migrant households required borrowing for education of their children (as their children were mostly studying in public schools which were located in or nearby villages ) while 11 per cent households among the migrants were imparting education to their children from private schools.

**Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field**

**Table 11  
Distribution of Migrant and  
Non-migrant Households by Purpose of Borrowings**

Objective of loan	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
Construction of house/land purchase	32	(22.86)	0	(0.00)	32	(20.13)
Purchasing animals	26	(18.57)	8	(42.11)	34	(21.38)
Education	16	(11.43)	0	(0.00)	16	(10.06)
Marriage ceremony	22	(15.71)	4	(21.05)	26	(16.35)
Health	6	(4.29)	1	(5.26)	7	(4.40)
Purchasing durable goods	11	(7.86)	3	(15.79)	14	(8.81)
Purchase of agriculture inputs	39	(27.86)	3	(15.79)	42	(26.42)
Business	8	(5.71)	0	(0.00)	8	(5.03)
All	140	(100.00)	19	(100.00)	159	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

**Household Savings**

The saving pattern of households shows that the average amount of annual savings was ₹ 41.46 thousand and ₹ 35.14 thousand in migrant and non-migrant households respectively. Most of the households saving were less than ₹ 50 thousand in both types of households. However, a big amount of savings was reported from migrant households.

**Table 12  
The Pattern of Savings among Migrant and Non-migrant Households**

Saving of Household (in ₹. 000)	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
<50	584	(74.58)	128	(84.21)	712	(76.15)
50-100	98	(12.52)	14	(9.21)	112	(11.98)
100-150	44	(5.62)	2	(1.32)	46	(4.92)
150-200	25	(3.19)	3	(1.97)	28	(2.99)
200-300	22	(2.81)	4	(2.63)	26	(2.78)
300+	10	(1.28)	1	(0.66)	11	(1.18)
Total HH	783	(100.00)	152	(100.00)	935	(100.00)
Per HH	41463.86		35144.16		38304	

Source: Field survey

**Ownership of Durable Assets**

Increased income of migrant households as a result of significant amounts of remittances being sent by their migrant family members from different destinations has subsequently improved their condition of purchasing power. Its direct impact can be seen in the differences prevailing in the ownership pattern and possession of various durable assets (migrants and non-migrants households). However, the study did not find any large difference among both the categories of households involved in keeping

### Baliyan and Mehta

different animals, especially milch animals. Only the households keeping bullocks which were used for cultivation of land were relatively higher among the non-migrants than the migrants. Even the rearing of many other livestock and birds which are used for commercial purposes was reported in an almost similar proportion of households from both the categories of households. However, clear-cut differences appeared in the ownership pattern of various luxury goods between the migrant and non-migrant households.

**Table 13**  
**Distribution of Households by Availability of Different Durable Assets**

Name of Assets	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
<b>Livestock</b>						
Milch Buffalo	348	(36.25)	63	(31.66)	411	(35.46)
Draft Buffalo	37	(3.85)	8	(4.02)	45	(3.88)
Milch Cow	498	(51.88)	104	(52.26)	602	(51.94)
Bullock	231	(24.06)	56	(28.14)	287	(24.76)
Sheep/Goat	132	(13.75)	29	(14.57)	161	(13.89)
Hen etc	26	(2.71)	6	(3.02)	32	(2.76)
Horse, Pony etc.	303	(31.56)	61	(30.65)	364	(31.41)
<b>Household Durables</b>						
Fridge	215	(22.40)	32	(16.08)	247	(21.31)
Utensils	960	(100.00)	198	(99.50)	1158	(99.91)
Agricultural Tools	822	(85.63)	171	(85.93)	993	(85.68)
Car/Jeep/Taxi/ Bus/Truck	52	(5.42)	11	(5.53)	63	(5.44)
Flour/ rice machine	17	(1.77)	1	(0.50)	18	(1.55)
Furniture	928	(96.67)	190	(95.48)	1118	(96.46)
Radio/TV	821	(85.52)	139	(69.85)	960	(82.83)
Ornaments/Jewelry	926	(96.46)	188	(94.47)	1114	(96.12)
Computer	19	(1.98)	3	(1.51)	22	(1.90)
Gas	528	(55.00)	74	(37.19)	602	(52.08)
<b>Ownership of other assets</b>						
Own House	958	(99.79)	198	(99.50)	1156	(99.74)
Shops/other establishments	52	(5.42)	16	(8.04)	68	(5.87)
Others	7	(0.73)	21	(10.55)	28	(2.42)
Total	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

### *Status of Housing*

Almost all the households from both the groups had their own houses but extremely large differences existed in terms of occupancy pattern. Since a majority of 58 per cent non-migrant households as against 43 per cent migrant households were found living in one or two-room accommodation while the proportion of households having above five-room accommodation was more accessed by 17 per cent among migrants as compared to only 8 per

### Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

cent among non-migrant households. Thus, it may be attributed that the direct impact of migration was well evident in the status and size of accommodation owned by migrant households.

**Table 14**  
**Distribution of Migrant and Non-migrant Households by**  
**Number of Living Rooms in their Houses**

Number of Rooms	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
One	82	(8.54)	22	(11.06)	104	(8.97)
Two	332	(34.58)	94	(47.24)	426	(36.76)
Three	171	(17.81)	25	(12.56)	196	(16.91)
Four	212	(22.08)	42	(21.11)	254	(21.92)
Five	54	(5.63)	3	(1.51)	57	(4.92)
Five and above	109	(11.35)	13	(6.53)	122	(10.53)
Total	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)
per HH	3.17		2.85		3.01	

Source: Field survey

### *Availability of Infrastructure Facilities*

As far as differences in the availability of various infrastructural facilities between the houses owned by migrant and non-migrant households are concerned, the study found that the former group of households had the advantages over the latter group of households regarding access to toilet facilities inside the premises of their houses.

**Table 15**  
**The Facility of Toilets in the Houses of Migrant and Non-migrants**

Facility of Toilet	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
Yes	743	(77.40)	131	(65.83)	874	(75.41)
No	217	(22.60)	68	(34.17)	285	(24.59)
Total	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

The benefits of migration are further witnessed in matters of differences in the use of various means of cooking especially in possession of gas and solar energy for this purpose in favour of migrant households. Although, most of the migrant and non-migrant households were depending on locally available wood as the means of cooking without paying any cost for its procurement. Such households were comparatively larger among non-migrants. However, costly means of cooking in the form of gas and solar energy was adopted largely by migrant households.



**Table 16**  
**Means of Cooking of Migrant and Non-migrant Households**

Means of Cooking	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share	No. of HHs	% share
Wood	426	(44.38)	125	(62.81)	551	(47.54)
Gas	165	(17.19)	27	(13.57)	192	(16.57)
Solar	6	(0.63)	0	(0.00)	6	(0.52)
wood and gas	363	(37.81)	47	(23.62)	410	(35.38)
Total	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

Impact of migration also witnesses in terms of availability of drinking water facility inside the premises of houses. A larger proportion among migrants as compared to non-migrant households had the drinking water facility through tap water inside their houses. Nearly 57 per cent households altogether in sample villages were obtaining their drinking water from public sources locally known as dharas and springs. Even among them, the proportion of non-migrant households was leading over migrant households.

**Table 17**  
**The Facility of Drinking Water in Migrant and Non-migrant Houses**

Source of Water	Migrants		Non-migrants		Total	
	No. of HHs	% Share	No. of HHs	% Share	No. of HHs	% Share
Tap Water	369	(38.44)	39	(19.60)	408	(35.20)
River/Nala	18	(1.88)	5	(2.51)	23	(1.98)
Public sources	516	(53.75)	144	(72.36)	660	(56.94)
Public Hand Pump	15	(1.56)	3	(1.51)	18	(1.55)
Wells/ springs	42	(4.38)	8	(4.02)	50	(4.31)
Total HHs	960	(100.00)	199	(100.00)	1159	(100.00)

Source: Field survey

### **Impact of Migration at the Place of Destination**

The study also analysed the impact of migration in deriving various benefits such as quality of employment, earning opportunities (in case of migrants) and on some key subjects such as educational attainment of children, changes in work participation and work status of family members etc. at the places of migration. The perceptions derived were that migrant households were not only reaping the advantages of getting higher-paid employment opportunities as a result of taking the risk of migration outside their villages but they have also improved the living standard of their family, provided better educational opportunities to their children.

As indicated earlier, the total population which migrated alone and with family towards various destinations constituted to 1829. However, this

### Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

size of the population of migrant households at different places of migration together has currently increased to 2012 accounting for a growth of about 10 per cent. Initially, the average size of the family of migrants in terms of size of population per migrant moved outside hilly villages was estimated to 1.91 which has presently increased to 2.10 members. In case the population would not have migrated, the average size of the family of migrants at their native places would have been above six members now.

The outcome of such changes in the demographic pattern as a result of the migration of population has extended the lower rate of population growth, a decrease of population pressure on the exploitation of various natural resources, greater availability of employment opportunities and so on at the place of origin of migrants. Similarly, the outcome of migration is very beneficial for better utilisation of the productive ability that they hardly found at their native places. This resulted in the migrant population being able to generate manyfolds higher earnings at different destinations after migration as compared to what they were earning through undertaking very low paid occupations at their native places.

**Table 18**  
**Impact of Migration in Changes in Educational level of**  
**Migrant Family Members at the Destination**

Level of Education	Level of Education at the time of migration	Level of Education at Present	% change
Illiterate	142 (7.76)	95 (4.72)	-33.10
Literate	65 (3.55)	77 (3.83)	18.46
Primary	158 (8.64)	200 (9.94)	26.58
Middle	288 (15.75)	339 (16.85)	17.71
High school	418 (22.85)	422 (20.97)	0.96
Intermediate	504 (27.56)	455 (22.61)	-9.72
Graduation	177 (9.68)	253 (12.57)	42.94
PG	53 (2.90)	85 (4.22)	60.38
ITI	12 (0.66)	23 (1.14)	91.67
Professional	12 (0.66)	63 (3.13)	425.00
Total	1829 (100.00)	2012 (100.00)	10.01

Source: Field survey

It has been observed that the migrant population has been increasingly reaping the advantages of available quality educational facilities at the places of migration. The chances may also be attributed that the migrants themselves have improved their educational level after migrating to different destinations. However, we have not clear evidence in this regard. Only the perceptions are that a majority of the migrants had up to high school level of education and most of them being illiterate at the time of

**Baliyan and Mehta**

migration. Presently, the population of illiterates has declined drastically to over 33 per cent. The population of the above graduation level of the population has grown remarkably in the lowest range of 43 per cent for graduates to the extent of over four folds for a professional level of an educated population. In all, the migrant population has achieved a lot in finding a better and higher level of educational opportunity for themselves and their children at different migration destinations.

As a result of migration, the work participation rate has boosted up very remarkably from 16 per cent at the time of reaching migrants at a different destination to 59 per cent at present. Even, the proportion of the population facing the problems of unemployment has reduced from 24 per cent at initial periods to less than one per cent at present. Due to the increasing participation of family members in different types of employment, the proportion of school-going population has narrowed down at present as compared to their arrival in various places of migration.

**Table 19**  
**Working Status of Migrant Family Members at the Destination**

Total	Activity Status at migration		Activity Status at present		% Change
	Number	Percentage	Number	Percentage	
Working	297	(16.24)	1179	(58.60)	296.97
House-wives	245	(13.40)	251	(12.48)	2.45
Unemployed	435	(23.78)	13	(0.65)	-97.01
Student	684	(37.40)	474	(23.56)	-30.70
Child	165	(9.02)	93	(4.62)	-43.64
Pensioner	2	(0.11)	1	(0.05)	-50.00
Aged person	1	(0.05)	1	(0.05)	0.00
Total	1829	(100.00)	2012	(100.00)	10.01

Source: Field survey

In addition to the above benefits as a result of the migration of labour force from their households, the study further attempts to look into the actual economic benefits which the individual was deriving on the cost of leaving their employment in the native place and moving out from their villages. The study found that on average all employed migrants together were in a position to generate ₹ 14.31 thousand per annum earning from different employment at their native place before migration while their earnings increased to ₹ 58.55 thousand per annum from the first employment at their first place of migration.

**Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field**

**Table 20**  
**Average Annual Income of Migrants before**  
**Migration at the Native Place and After Migration at Destination**

District	Absolute Income (₹/Annum)			Indices in incremental changes in earnings		
	Income at native place	first income at destination	current income	Income at native place	first income at destination	current income
Champawat	15430	61669	134915	100	400	874
Almora	15766	61224	104312	100	388	662
Pauri	11413	49304	92498	100	432	810
Uttarkashi	13875	60222	107410	100	434	774
Total	14313	58552	112364	100	409	785

Source: Field survey

Currently, the average earning of migrants together at the various destination of migration has reached to the extent of ₹ 107.41 thousand per annum. In this manner, the incremental value of average income measured by estimates of indices was over four-fold more at the place of migration in comparison to the value of income at their native places. In other words, in comparison to the average income of migrants at their native places, their average income from first employment had increased to over four-folds and nearly eight-folds from the present employment. The highest benefit of migration in terms of getting better earning opportunity at the various destination of migration was noted in the case of migrants from Uttarkashi followed by Pauri Garhwal and least for those migrated from Almora district of Uttarakhand.

The study also attempted to investigate and present an answer to the question that to what extent the migration could impact in reducing the long-standing inequalities in the pattern of income distribution among the households in hilly areas of Uttarakhand. The pattern of the emerging situation in income generation with and without the share of income from migrants in their households and income of non-migrant households was analysed to answer the question.

The analysis presented in this regard revealed that in the lowest income group range of below ₹ 25 thousand, the proportion of migrant households without the contribution of income from their migrant family members was over 18 per cent while it was nearly 7 per cent among non-migrant households. However, after getting remittances income from migrants, the proportion of migrant households reduced to 3 per cent as against no change in the proportions of non-migrant households in this income group. Presently, the proportion of migrant households remained in the lowest income range remained only 3 per cent as against 7 per cent non-

### Baliyan and Mehta

migrant households. Similarly, in the highest income group range, the proportion of migrant households has increased from nearly 24 per cent to over 32 per cent after migration of their family members while the proportion of non-migrant households was only at 15 per cent in the same income group.

**Table 21**  
**Changes in the Pattern of Income Distribution among Households at the Native Places**

Income group (in ₹ 000)	Migrant Households		Non-migrant Households
	Without remittances	With remittances	
Less than 10	57 (5.94)	0 (0.00)	1 (0.50)
10-25	117 (12.19)	29 (3.02)	12 (6.03)
25-50	250 (26.04)	156 (16.25)	43 (21.61)
50-100	273 (28.44)	425 (44.27)	103 (51.76)
100-300	236 (24.58)	308 (32.08)	30 (15.08)
300 and above	27 (2.81)	42 (4.38)	10 (5.03)
Total HHs	960 (100.00)	960 (100.00)	199 (100.00)
Average income	94287	117473	93497

Source: Field survey

In this study, the perception of migrating families is analysed to comprehend the impact of out-migration. The impact of migration of family members was no way adversely affecting the family life of around 22 per cent households. However, the most adverse effects of migration were being realised in matters of a decrease in the supply of family labour for undertaking various household-based economic activities in 52 per cent households. Another 51 per cent households reported in terms of an increase in the burden of work among their female family members and compelling to engage their children in the family business and farming occupations after the migration of their male family members. Reduction in undertaking animal husbandry and mismanagement in looking after various household-related activities were the two other important adverse effects experienced by over one-third of the migrant households due to the migration of their family members.

**Table 22**  
**Impact of Migration at the Native Places**

Type of Impact	District				
	Almora	Champawat	Pauri	Uttarkashi	All
No effect on family life	51 (20.56)	81 (32.93)	32 (13.45)	45 (19.74)	209 (21.77)
No impact on occupation	47 (18.95)	14 (5.69)	19 (7.98)	19 (8.33)	99 (10.31)
Decrease in agriculture income	87 (35.08)	98 (39.84)	69 (28.99)	63 (27.63)	317 (33.02)
Decrease in labour supply	134 (54.03)	114 (46.34)	116 (48.74)	136 (59.65)	500 (52.08)
Reduction in crop area	39 (15.73)	49 (19.92)	81 (34.03)	25 (10.96)	194 (20.21)
Reduction in animal husbandry	89 (35.89)	80 (32.52)	89 (37.39)	101 (44.30)	359 (37.40)

### Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

Type of Impact	District				
	Almora	Champawat	Pauri	Uttarkashi	All
Work pressure on children and old	90 (36.29)	72 (29.27)	87 (36.55)	79 (34.65)	328 (34.17)
Extended work of women	126 (50.81)	109 (44.31)	120 (50.42)	131 (57.46)	486 (50.63)
Interruption on children education	58 (23.39)	46 (18.70)	52 (21.85)	41 (17.98)	197 (20.52)
Looking work management	101 (40.73)	70 (28.46)	86 (36.13)	90 (39.47)	347 (36.15)
Family insecurity	52 (20.97)	34 (13.82)	41 (17.23)	28 (12.28)	155 (16.15)
Others	1 (0.40)	4 (1.63)	5 (2.10)	1 (0.44)	11 (1.15)
Total	248 (100.00)	246 (100.00)	238 (100.00)	228 (100.00)	960 (100.00)

Source: Field survey

It has been generally been argued that male-dominated migration from hilly areas has been negatively affecting the condition of health, work pressure, social security and so on among the female family members of migrating households.

**Table 23**  
**Impact of Migration on the Condition of Women at the Natives Places**  
**(Multiple Responses)**

Districts	Adverse impact on Health	Increased workload	Positive impact on Taking Decision	Lack of Social Security	Total
Champawat	92 (31.08)	85 (28.72)	79 (26.69)	40 (13.51)	296 (100.00)
Almora	81 (32.27)	74 (29.48)	69 (27.49)	27 (10.76)	251 (100.00)
Pauri Garhwal	74 (25.17)	46 (15.65)	140 (47.62)	34 (11.56)	294 (100.00)
Uttarkashi	42 (25.45)	55 (33.33)	43 (26.06)	25 (15.15)	165 (100.00)
Total	289 (28.73)	260 (25.84)	331 (32.90)	126 (12.52)	1006 (100.00)

Source: Field survey

The findings of the state that the women were not only in a disadvantage position on account of social security, increased workload and health conditions but they were equally in an advantageous position in strengthening their capabilities basically on the subjects of decision-making process after the migration of their male counterparts. Since the women in nearly 33 per cent migrant households had the experience that they were fortunate to achieve the freedom of taking various decisions related to their household affairs. Even, such women were as larger as 48 per cent in Pauri Garhwal. Further, the adverse impact of migration on the condition of poor health and increase of workload of women in the family was reported in 29 per cent and 26 per cent cases of the households respectively.

### Conclusion

From this study, it may be concluded that migrant households had a slightly higher edge over the non-migrating groups of households in matters

### **Baliyan and Mehta**

of higher literacy rates and better educational status of their family members. The study analysed that the unemployment rate continued to be higher in migrant households in comparison to non-migrant households. Moreover, as a result of the sufficient amount of remittances available from migrant family members and the larger contribution of pension received by retired persons, the economic condition of migrant households was found sounder than the non-migrant households. The inadequacy of income in the family has been pushing its family members to migrate in search of livelihood opportunities outside their villages. Analysis of the contribution of income generated together as remittances received from migrant family members and the amount of pension of returned migrants alone was registered considerably higher in the migrant households. Otherwise, the share of income generated from remaining sources was estimated to be higher in non-migrant households as compared to migrant households.

The impact of migration reflected both positive and negative outcomes on migrating households. The income received by migrant households as remittances and the contribution of pension amount from the retired migrants has increased the per-household consumption expenditure in migrant households. The status and size of accommodation of the migrant households have enhanced and fully equipped with drinking water facility through taps along with toilets inside the premises of houses, solar energy and gas for cooking. However, the migration has been adversely affected the family life, shortage of family labour for undertaking various household-based economic activities, increase in the burden of work among female family members especially children in the family business and farming occupations, reduction in undertaking animal husbandry occupation along with mismanagement in looking after various household related activities in the migrant households. Due to the migration of males, their women counterparts were in a disadvantage position relating to social security, an increase in workload and health conditions.

However, migration motivated for seeking better employment opportunities and the village labour force has positively contributed towards increasing the income level of their households. Thus, the migration has positively contributed to increasing the income level of their households and played a tangible role in reducing income inequalities at the places of their origin. The positive effects of migration in terms of equalisation of income distribution pattern can be attributed more in favour of lower-income groups of households as compared to households that have already reached higher income group ranges.

## Impact of Out Migration from Uttarakhand: Insights from the Field

### References

- Bora, R.S. (1996), *Himalayan Outmigration*, New Delhi: Sage Publications.
- IHD (2006), *Employment Generation in Uttarakhand: Constraints and Opportunities*, study sponsored by Planning Commission, Institute for Human Development, New Delhi (Mimeo).
- Khanka, S.S. (1988), *Labour Force, Employment and Unemployment in a Backward Economy*, New Delhi: Himalaya Publishing House.
- Korra, Vijay (2009), 'Can Seasonal Labour Migration Alter the Household Resource Structure? A Micro Level Analysis in Andhra Pradesh', *IASSI Quarterly*, Special Issue, pp. 110-125.
- Kumar, Bipin, Singh B.P and Singh, Rita (1998), 'Out- Migration from Rural Bihar: A Case Study', *The Indian Journal of Labour Economics*, Vol. 41, No. 4, pp. 729- 735.
- Lee, E.S. (1966), 'A Theory of Migration', *Demography*, Vol. 3, No. 1.
- Lewis, Arthur (1954), 'Economic Development with Unlimited Supplies of Labour', *Manchester School of Economic and Social Studies*.
- Mamgain, Rajendra P. (2004), *Employment, Migration and Livelihoods in the Hill Economy of Uttaranchal*, Ph.D. Thesis, Centre for the Study of Regional Development, New Delhi: Jawaharlal Nehru University.
- Mehta G. S. (1999), *Development of Uttarakhand, Issues and Perspectives*, New Delhi: Ashis Publishing House.
- Mehta G.S. (1991), 'Characteristics and Economic Implications of Migration', *Journal of Rural Development*, Vol. 10, No. 6. pp. 731-44.
- Mehta G.S. (1991), *Socio-economic Characteristics of Migration*, New Delhi: Deep and Deep Publication.
- Mehta G.S.(1987), *Consequences of Migration from Uttarakhand*, Lucknow: Giri Institute of Development Studies Lucknow (mimeo).
- Papola, T.S. (1986), Rural-Urban Migration, Problem of Socio-Demographic Regulations, *Indian Journal of Industrial Relations*, Vol. 24, No. 2.
- Ranis, G. and Fei, J.C.H. (1961), 'A Theory of Economic Development', *American Economic Review*, Vol. 51, No. 4, pp. 533-565.
- Singh, Sukhdev and Kaur, Amandeep (2007), 'Causes and Consequences of Migrant Labour in Ludhiana City: A Case Study', *Social Action*, Vol. 57, No. 1, pp. 56-64.
- Srivastava, R. and Sasikumar S.K. (2003), An Overview of Migration in India, its Impacts and Key Issues", Paper presented in the Regional Conference on *Migration, Development and Pro-Poor Policy Choices in Asia*. 22-24 June, Dhaka, Bangladesh.
- Stark, Odded (1980), 'On the Role of Urban-to-Rural Remittances in Rural Development', *The Journal of Development Studies*, Vol. 16, No. 3, pp. 369-74.
- Stark, Odded and Bloom, David E. (1985), 'The New Economics of Labour Migration', *American Economic Review*, Vo. 75, No. 2, pp. 173-78.
- Stark, Odded and Lucas, Robert E. B. (1988), 'Migration, Remittances and the Family', *Economic Development and Cultural Change*, Vol. 36, No. 3.
- Stockdale, A. (2002), Towards a Typology of Out-Migration from Peripheral Areas: A Scottish Case Study, *International Journal of Population Geography*, Vol. 8, pp. 345-364.
- Stockdale, A. (2004), 'Rural Out-Migration: Community Consequences and Individual Migrant Experiences', *Sociologia Ruralis*, Vol. 44, No. 2, pp. 167-194.
- Todaro M.P (1969), 'A Model of Labour Migration and Urban Unemployment in Less Developed Countries', *American Economic Review*, Vol. 59, No. 1, pp. 138-148.



*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 67-84)

## **Economic Impact on Displaced Women: A Study on Two Dam Projects in Jammu and Kashmir**

**Sudesh Kumar\* and Anindya J. Mishra†**

*Displacement is a phenomenon which affects every section of the society equally. However, it is the women who are the worse sufferers. The resettlement and rehabilitation policy further aggravates the suffering of women as it is gender-biased. Under the resettlement and rehabilitation policy, the displaced women are not considered as part of the policy. They are always ignored by the policymakers. Thus, there is a special need to focus on displacement from women's perspectives. The locale of the present study is Jammu and Kashmir where women are displaced by the dam projects. It inferred from the study that after forced displacement, the women faced a lot of economic hardship due to the loss of a regular source of income, loss of traditional occupations, loss of self-help group activities, loss of livestock, and aggravates diseases due to unfavourable environment and psychological pressures.*

### **Introduction**

The present study is an attempt to understand how dam displacement has created an economic burden among displaced women in the state of Jammu and Kashmir. Every year in the name of development, the lives and livelihood of millions of people across the world get affected due to

---

\* Senior Research Fellow, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Indian Institute of Technology, Roorkee. E-mail: aryanudesh@yahoo.com

† Associate Professor, Department of Humanities and Social Sciences, Indian Institute of Technology, Roorkee. E-mail: anindya.mishra@gmail.com

### **Economic Impact on Displaced Women...**

forced displacement. The worst affected ones are the backward, tribal, and developing regions. Large scale extraction of natural resources has resulted in induced displacement which has become one of the emerging issues in the world today (Binodini and Das, 2013). Development projects mostly resulted in land acquisitions and involuntary displacement of millions of people all over the world. This process continued for several years together and vulnerable groups such as marginalised sections of the society like as STs, SCs and OBCs, etc. are the ones who suffer the most. Family and household are considered as a small unit and compensation are given to the whole family. The irony is that, the women are the ones who are neglected by both policymakers and family members. They are the one who hardly gets any benefit of such development projects although they suffer the most (Thukral, 1996). The role of women cannot be ignored in any society with regard to social and economic aspects. Women play an important role in the socialisation of children and always contribute towards economic growth through domestic chores throughout their life. Women in the mountains are not dependent upon the family income but they manage to earn their money for personal consumption and also contribute towards the family income. In the hills, rural women have been responsible for the collection of water, forest products, fuel, fodder, thereby contributing to the family income. Women have also been involved in animal husbandry, which is also an important supplementary activity that contributes to household income (Rawat, 2012).

The existing literature revealed that little work has been done on displaced women and their socio-economic issues. The present study has thus, focused especially on displaced women and their economic impact on their social life.

### **Objective and Methodology**

The present paper is focused on the economic impact on displaced women by dam projects. For this purpose, we selected the Pul Doda and Kathua region where the displaced women are resettled. Data is collected from the field in Pul Doda and Kathua region of Jammu and Kashmir following a purposive sampling method and snowball technique. In purposive sampling method, the researcher purposely chooses the person who, in this judgment about some appropriate characteristic required of the sample members, are thought to be relevant to the research topic and are easily available to him and in snowball technique where the researcher begins the research with the few respondents who are known and available

to him. Subsequently, these respondents give other names who meet the criteria of research, who in turn give more new names (Ahuja, 2014). In the present study, the semi-structured interview schedule was used to collect relevant data and responses from the respondents. The main objective of the research conducted was to examine the living condition of displaced women after the displacement. In the affected district, most of the displaced women were scattered in different places. So, it was difficult to cover the maximum number of respondents. The study took 120 respondents from Pul Doda and 120 respondents from Kathua which was 240 respondents out of 700 for conducting the research which is 35 per cent of the target population.

### **Finding and Observation**

#### ***Economic Impact on Displaced Women in J&K***

In the present study, it has been seen that most of the women before displacement were not dependent upon their husbands' income. They were self-dependent. It has been seen that rural women would easily manage everything due to the availability of resources. The displaced women were economically independent before the displacement, but the situation has been changed after displacement as they lost their regular source of income. The study has also found that displaced women were not given any kind of compensation for the loss of income sources due to development projects. In the resettlement and rehabilitation policy, displaced women are also denied their rights. The displaced women are the worst affected as they are not considered in compensation, resettlement and rehabilitation policy. The policymakers do not pay adequate attention to displaced women.

The study has also found that in India and specifically in Jammu and Kashmir, there is no uniform policy through which the displaced women can get benefits from the government. They are always harassed by the family as well as outsiders. Women face lots of problems after displacement, particularly when they lost their income and occupations. In Basohali village (submerged area) of Jammu and Kashmir, women actively participated in agricultural activities throughout the year. From morning to evening, they were engaged with domesticated animals and in the agriculture field. The majority of women earned their livelihood through natural resources and cattle rearing. The displaced women faced more economic burdens than men because they were not given any kind of compensation, though they have been working for ages.

## Economic Impact on Displaced Women...

**Table 1**  
**Occupation and Income of Women Before and After**  
**Displacement in Kathua**

Before Displacement			After Displacement		
Occupation	Income Rs.	Respondents (%)	Occupation	Income Rs.	Respondents (%)
Cattle rearing, agricultural activities and selling milk	5000	68 (56.66)	Housewives	Nil	70 (58.34)
Selling vegetables and medicinal plants	2500	29 (24.17)	Petty business	2000	27 (22.50)
Tailoring	2500	23 (19.17)	Private job	1500	23 (19.16)
Total		120 (100)			120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

Petty business: tailoring and small kirana shop; Private Job: working in schools.

From the above table, it was found that before the displacement, 68 (56.66 per cent) the displaced women earned ₹ 5,000 through cattle rearing and selling milk, and 29 (24.17 per cent) women earned ₹ 2500 by selling vegetables, medicinal plants. The study has also shown that 23 (19.17 per cent) women working as tailors and earned ₹ 2500 per month for personal expenses. Displaced women were not dependent upon their husband's income, every woman was self-dependent before the displacement, but after the displacement, the situation has changed. It has been seen that after the displacement 70 (58.34 per cent) of the displaced women became a housewife and they are now totally dependent upon their husband's income. The study has reiterated that 27 (22.50 per cent) women opened their petty business at the new place and earned ₹ 2,000 per month for their family and 23 (19.16 per cent) women working in private schools and earn ₹ 1500 rupees per month.

*One of the displaced women narrated: "the natural resources are part of our life in the village. In our ancestral village, we are dependent on natural resources. It was part of our life. Our social life was completely interwoven with the natural resources. We would get up early in the morning and go to the forest to collect fodder, fuel, grass, water from spring, etc. throughout the day. We used natural resources for domestic purposes also. These natural resources helped us economically because we do not pay for them".*

*She further added that "at the time of medical emergency we used medicinal plants for fever, cough, back pain, etc. which we got from the forest at free of cost. We were not dependent upon the doctor. We used traditional knowledge to cure diseases. But due to displacement, we lost our natural resources, traditional knowledge,*

### **Kumar and Mishra**

*and economic resources. At the new resettlement site, most of the families face economic hardship due to the high cost of medical treatment. We were closely attached with natural resources but as of now, we have lost everything” (Kamlesha Sharma, 53 years old women).*

The study also found that most of the displaced women face economic hardship, particularly when they lost their occupation and income sources. Those women who were self-dependent are now dependent upon their husband's income, which create problems between husband and wife for sharing the family income.

One of the displaced women revealed that before displacement she was self-dependent as she earns her income through various traditional activities like selling milk. She was free to buy whatever she wanted for herself and her children. Her monthly income was ₹ 4000-5000. But now after displacement, she is dependent upon her husband's income. She cannot buy even small things for herself without her husband's permission. The desire to buy any expensive thing for her usually results in a quarrel between both of them. She further reported that conflict at verbal abuse had become quite common between both of them after displacement. All this had adversely affected her health and she had been living under psychological depression. Frequent quarrel with the husband had also a bad effect and their children (Rani Devi, 45 years old)

The displaced women faced a lot of economic hardship as they did not receive any compensation money from the government. From the above discussion, the study has posited that before the displacement, the majority of women were self-dependent as they earned their livelihood through different sources. They were never dependent upon their husband's income. However, after the displacement majority of women faced economic problems in their families.

### **Economic Impact on Displaced Women in Pul Doda**

The study has found that in Pul Doda of Jammu and Kashmir, the situation is not similar as compared to Basohali village (Kathua district). In Basohali village most of the displaced women belong to a farmer's family and in Pul Doda, most of the displaced women belong to a business family. In Pul Doda displaced women were engaged in different fields to earn their livelihoods, such as cattle rearing and business activities. Due to the backwardness of the area, women were not able to work in other sectors. Their social values and family norms did not give them permission to go

### Economic Impact on Displaced Women...

outside the home and earn their livelihood. They earned their livelihood within the village and also at home. The majority of women followed traditional norms and values. It has been seen that the economic status has tremendously declined among displaced women after the displacement from their native place. The study has found that in Pul Doda of Jammu and Kashmir, displaced women were the worst affected by forced displacement. They did not get any compensation from the government as they were considered as dependent family members.

**Table 2**  
**Occupation and Income of Women in Pul Doda**

Before Displacement			After Displacement		
Occupation	Income	Respondents (%)	Occupation	Income	Respondents (%)
Tailoring	5000	24 (20.00)	Tailoring	1000	10 (8.33)
Sweater making	1500	22 (18.00)	Work in private clinic	1500	10 (8.33)
Rearing cattle and selling milk	15000	42 (35.00)	Maid worker	2000	22 (18.34)
Beauty salon	8000	18 (15.00)	House wives	-	78 (65.00)
House wives	-	14 (12.00)	-	-	-
Total		120 (100)			120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

Table 2 shows that before the displacement most of the women were self-reliant. It has been observed that 24 respondents, (20 per cent) women earned ₹ 5000 per month by stitching clothes, followed by 22 respondents (18 per cent) who earned ₹ 1500 per month by making garments for the little baby and 42 respondents (35 per cent) earned ₹ 15000 by selling their cattle and milk. Further 18 respondents (15 per cent) earned ₹ 8000 per month from a beauty salon, and 14 (12 per cent) of displaced women working as housewives. But after displacement, most of the displaced women got affected due to their loss of regular income and about 65 per cent of the women turned in to housewives who are now dependent upon their husband's income. Only 35 per cent women were able to earn ₹ 1000-2000 per month by tailoring, working as a maid, and private jobs in the clinic. It has been found that the social status among displaced women declined because of the loss of their source of regular income. Domestic violence was also found to be on the rise among displaced families for spending the husband's income for personal expenses.

One of the displaced women from Pul Doda reported that before the displacement she was earning ₹ 5000 and she enjoyed her personal life as she was self-dependent. Even her husband took her help during financial crises.

### **Kumar and Mishra**

She never felt deprived and hesitated to buy costly items for personal use. When she went to her mother's home, she used to bring many things for her brother's children and her mother and father. She enjoyed her status among the family members as well as in neighbours and relatives. After the displacement, she lost her social status which she had achieved in her life. Now she is dependent upon her husband's income, sometimes she quarrels with her husband for financial matters. Whenever she needs money for her expenses, her husband directly refuses her and then conflict begins between husband and wife (Meena Devi, 35 years).

*A woman revealed that: "before the displacement, I used to get up early in the morning and go to the forest for collecting the fodder and fuel. I had two cows and used to sell 30 kg of milk in the market. I earned about ₹ 12,000 per month from my cows. I used to make extra money for my children and also for my expenses from this business. But after the displacement, I have not only lost my home but also lost my source of income for my children. Today I am dependent upon my husband's income. I cannot spend money without his wish. I and my children are living under the impoverished condition and no one came to help us for the last decade" (Babli Devi, 39 years).*

The study has found that after the displacement most of the women have lost their income and social status. It is very difficult for the displaced women to regain their social status because at the new place there is less scope for them to earn their livelihood. It has been observed that displaced women faced economic hardships since the time they were forced to move from their native place where they were earning their livelihood. The living conditions of displaced women decline below the standard and they started living under poor conditions. The additional workload and family responsibility also increased due to declining family income. Similarly, health status has also gone down due to psychological depression.

### **Economic Impact on Self Help Group among Displaced Women**

Self-Help Group (SHG) refers to a self-governed, peer controlled, informal group of people with the same socio-economic background and having a desire to collectively perform common purposes. Here poor people voluntarily come together to save whatever amount they can save conveniently out of their earnings, to mutually agree to contribute to a common fund and to lend to the members for meeting their productive and emergent needs. It is a group formed by the community women, which has a

### Economic Impact on Displaced Women...

specific number of members like 15 or 20. In such a group the poorest women would come together for emergency, disaster, social reasons, economic support to each other to have ease of conversation, social interaction and economic interaction.

The present study highlighted the SHG as an economic issue, among displaced women in Pul Doda. The displaced women ran four to five SHGs which was their source of income. The study highlighted the economic problems among displaced women concerning their loss of SHG.

**Table 3**  
**Member of Self Help Group**

Response	Respondents (%)
Yes	76 (63.34)
No	44 (36.66)
Total	120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

The study found that 76 (63.34 per cent) of the displaced women were active members of the self-help group and the remaining 44 (36.66 per cent) were not members of any self-help group. The study has observed that in Pul Doda of Jammu and Kashmir, there were four to five self-help groups in different places in which the displaced women actively participated. But after the displacement, the self-help group no longer exists in the lives of displaced women. It has been observed that due to the loss of SHG, most of the women lost their economic activities. One of the displaced women stated that:

*“Self-Help Groups (SHG) were very important for our life because they were helpful at the time of the financial crisis. In our self-help group, we were about 25 members and every month we were collecting ₹ 1,000 from each member (about ₹ 25,000 per month) and provided it to those who were in need. We were meeting weekly or fortnightly to discuss our problems and share information and to find the solution to our problems. Group members used to rectify their economic and social problems through mutual assistance. After the displacement, we have lost the self-help group and it engendered the economic burden in our family. The SHG is a big loss for me because I was doing business with the help of SHG. We used to solve our financial problems through SHG, every member was always ready to help each other in the time of need” (Shakuntla Devi, 52 years).*



### Kumar and Mishra

Another displaced woman also reported that:

*“Self Help Group (SHG) was one of the biggest financial supports for me and my family. I ran a small business with the help of SHG and earned ₹10,000 per month. We were 20 members in the group and we collected ₹1,000 per month and gave to those women who were in more need at the time of financial crises. Every member was supportive and always ready to help each other. But after displacement, we have lost our financial support, because most of our SHG members migrated to a different place and we lost our social contact. At the new place, we are unable to rebuild their lost SHG. We cannot trust anyone in the new place. The attitude of the host community is not good, they always quarrel with us in one way or another. Now we have become helpless and we do not have any financial support” (Skhina Begum, 38 years).*

**Table 4**  
**Use of Self Help Group Money by Displaced Women**

Use SHG Money	Respondents (%)
Personal expenses ( jewelers, and clothes)	18 (23.69)
Business purposes and personal expenses	33 (43.42)
Saving for daughter marriage	25 (32.89)
Total	76 (100)

Source: Field Survey

The Study has observed that 18 (23.60 per cent) of the displaced women used SHG money for personal expenses such as buying jewellery and clothes and 33 (43.42 per cent) of women used SHG money for business and personal expenses. It has been also seen that 25 (32.89 per cent) of displaced women saving their money which they got from the SHG. From the above data, it has been clearly seen that majority of displaced women were dependent upon their SHG from which they earned their livelihood and also maintained their livelihood and social status.

The study observed that the SHG has not only affected the displaced women but directly or indirectly it also affected their social life and status. After the displacement, most of the women are not in the position to continue their SHG, due to the loss of neighbourhood relations, friend circles, and relatives.

One of the displaced women reported that:

*“Before the displacement, I was saving ₹25,000 every year for my daughter's marriage with the help of SHG. I was engaged with SHG for the last 10 years. I deposited ₹1,000 every month and*

### **Economic Impact on Displaced Women...**

*when I faced any financial problem regarding health issues, child education or social functions, I used that saved money to solve problems. I never faced any economic burden before displacement. Now after displacement, my family faced a lot of economic hardship as we lost all income sources. My children also left their education in the 10th class, because I was not able to finance their studies in higher education. My husband is working in a factory in Jammu; he hardly earns ₹ 10,000 which is not enough for our family. I am living in a rented house for the last 10 years and it is difficult for me to educate our children due to low economic conditions" (Alka Bala, 42 years).*

From the above discussion it has been observed that in Pul Doda of Jammu and Kashmir, the displaced women face a lot of economic hardship. The standard of living has declined among women as they lost their income and occupations. Besides occupation, the dismantling of the Self Help Group (SHG) also affected their economic status.

### **Loss of Livestock and Economic Impact on Displaced Women**

Livestock is an essential part of village economic life. It is one of the methods of establishing the property of a village community. In urban areas; cars, house and other luxury items are indicators of one's social status. Whereas in villages; livestock and land determine the social status of a villager. Livestock is the backbone of the village economy. A farmer cannot imagine his life without livestock and it fulfills the basic needs of the farmers such as milk, fuel, fodder, agriculture and transportation. Displacement resulted in the loss of a large portion of land as such farmers were not in a position to support their livestock. People living in rural areas are dependent for livelihood on several natural resources besides land. They keep cattle for milk and dung. Dung has multiple uses, such as manure for farmland and fuel for cooking. Agriculture depends on live-stock to a great extent. Bulls are very necessary for ploughing. Cow-dung is helpful in manuring the fields. Livestock consists of cattle, sheep and goats and their life depends on the availability of fodder.

In Basohali village, people used to sell their sheep and goats at the emergency time and fulfill their needs. But it was found that after displacement there was a significant reduction in the possession of livestock. Displaced families had to reduce their livestock due to the non-availability of land and uncertainty of their livelihood. To cultivate their land, and for the daily consumption of milk, meat, ghee, butter, etc. People used to

### Kumar and Mishra

domesticate livestock according to their own needs. With the decrease in the size of agricultural land, it becomes difficult to maintain the animals and there is a significant decline in their livestock. In Kathua, it has been seen that major change could be noticed in possession of cows, bulls, buffaloes, sheep, and goats whose numbers decreased significantly. On the whole, there is a marked decline in the number of animals helpful for the income of the affected households. Livestock was one of the main income resources among displaced people.

**Table 5**  
**Assets Holding Before and After Displacement**

Assets	(Kathua)	
	Before displacement	After displacement
Cow, Bulls	02 (1.67)	-
Cow, Buffalo, Bulls	05 (4.17)	-
Cow, Buffalo, Bulls, Sheeps and Goats	113 (94.16)	-
Cow	-	15 (12.50)
Buffalo	-	04 (3.33)
Nil	120 (100)	101 (84.17)
Total	120 (100)	120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

From the above table, it can be observed that in Kathua district before the displacement 113 (94.16 per cent) of the respondents had cow, buffaloes, bulls, sheep and goats. Most of the respondents were dependent on agriculture and they use these animals for agricultural activities, like cultivation, and source of good nutritional food. The data also shows that only a few respondents had only cows, bulls and buffalo viz., two (1.67 per cent) and five (4.17 per cent) respectively. But after the displacement, it was observed that 101 (84.17 per cent) of the respondents had no animals because of the loss of agricultural land and natural resources. Data also shows that only 15 (12.50 per cent) of the respondents have cows in their house after displacement and four (3.33 per cent) of the respondents have buffaloes at the new site. The table shows the asset holding status of people after displacement indicates significant changes in the domestication of animal resources. The table shows that the maximum concentration of responses is within the 'nil' category. Because of the invasion of the locality by project authorities and forced acquisition of agricultural land, the agriculture mode of production of the people has been shattered. On the issue of livestock, it was found that the majority of the households practice animal husbandry, but in the new location, it has declined. In Basohali village 100 per cent of the families had livestock such as cows, buffaloes, bulls, sheep and goats etc. but

### Economic Impact on Displaced Women...

after displacement, the possession of livestock is negligible in the resettlement area.

One of the displaced women says that:

*“It is difficult to afford the burden of survival without agricultural land and forest resources, then how we could domesticate the livestock in the new setting. At the new place, we can just manage two meals a day. In our native place, we had more than 20 sheeps and goats. There was a large area of grazing land, and we did not face any problems with grazing our animals. At the time of the financial emergency, we used to sell our animals to fulfill our needs. Cattle were our ancestral property, we used our cattle in many ways such as for consumption purposes, economic purposes, wool was used for making blankets etc. At my native place, cattle reduced our economic burden and we never bought so many things from the market. Everything was available in our homes, such as milk, cheese, curd, mutton (meat) and woolen blankets and clothes. But in the new place we are dependent upon the market which has become a financial burden for our life” (Rekha Devi, 45 years).*

It is analysed that most of the displaced families were sold their livestock because of the scarcity of fodder, grazing land, at the new site. Livestock does not have much role to play in the new urban economy. As a result, the presence of livestock has reduced from the region. The agricultural use of livestock was negligible after displacement because of the landlessness. It was found that the presence of cattle has reduced in Kathua. On the issue of occupational mobility, it has been revealed that the displaced women have opted for the new occupations at the new resettlement sites. The displaced women have changed their traditional occupations such as agriculture to various non-agricultural activities.

**Table 6**  
**Monthly Income of Family from the Livestock**

Monthly Income (₹)	No. of Respondents (%)
3,000-5,000	34 (28.33)
6,000-8,000	47 (39.17)
9,000-10,000	39 (32.50)
Total	120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

Livestock played an important role in family income in the rural village. People earned their livelihood through agriculture and domesticated

### Kumar and Mishra

animals. Rural life revolved around the livestock through which the rural people earned their income for the family.

From the table, it is found that 34 (28.33 per cent) of the respondents earned about ₹ 3,000-5,000 per month from the livestock (which included selling milk and goats and sheeps) and 47 (39.17 per cent) of the respondents earned about ₹ 6,000-8,000 per month. They sold cattle's milk, cattle and woolen blankets. The study further found that 39 (32.50 per cent) of the respondents earned ₹ 9,000-10,000 by selling cattle, milk, cattle, desi ghee, and cheese and blankets in the market and neighbouring villages.

It is observed that the rural economy always revolved around agricultural activities and cattle rearing. People were totally dependent on livestock. The economic burden has tremendously increased among displaced people after the loss of their livestock. The study has indicated that after the loss of livestock, the majority of displaced families were facing economic hardship at new places. At the resettlement site people were not able to rear cattle due to the lack of natural resources such as grazing land, fodder, space for cattle etc., people forcibly left their traditional occupation and joined other jobs. It has been seen that the decline of livestock among displaced families directly affected their family income.

One of the displaced women reported that:

*"Animal husbandry, which was another important economic practice of the original villagers, has been reduced owing to lack of space and non-availability of fodder. After the loss of land, those animals which were deployed on the farm are rendered superfluous. Loss of land also means less crop residue or waste as a fodder to feed. Loss of forest and shrinkage of common grazing land and the enclosure of the forest made it impossible to graze cattle. Most of the displaced people have sold their cattle due to the lack of space, grazing land, lack of fodder. Among the animals; goats, sheeps seem to be the most preferred due to their high commercial value and high survival capacity. Fuel and fodder are the two biggest problems faced by the people in the new sites. Unavailability of fodder and common grazing land means that rural people have to sell most of their cattle (bulls, cows, goats, sheeps, etc.). Cattles are very important for rural people. It is also one of the main indicators of wealth in society. Livestock is a valuable possession of the rural man; they are like his own children but after displacement, we have lost all animal resources and now are not able to rear them again. Due to the loss of livestock and grazing land, and the agricultural activities, we have faced a lot of*

### Economic Impact on Displaced Women...

*economic burden at the new resettlement site. Livestock was one of the economic resources in our life. But, we have lost everything as we were displaced from our ancestral land” (Shakumtal Devi, 46 years).*

**Table 7**  
**Additional Income Generated from Livestock Before Displacement**

Income generated per year (₹)	No. of respondents (%)
Below 10,000	29 (24.00)
11,000-15,000	44 (37.00)
16,000 to 20,000	28 (23.00)
21,000 to 25,000	19 (16.00)
Total	120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

From the above table, it can be analysed that how livestock has directly affected on family income. The study has found that in Kathua district, before the displacement 29 (24 per cent) of the respondents earned additional income below ₹ 10,000 annually, and 44 (37 per cent) respondents earned between ₹ 11,000 to ₹ 15,000 every year. The study further revealed that 28 (23 per cent) of the respondents earned ₹ 16,000 to 20,000 and 19 (16 per cent) of the respondents earned ₹ 21,000 to 25,000 in a year. The study has further analysed that in the rural village people used livestock for economic and consumption purposes. It is also that the displaced people used additional income at the time of financial crises and also during social and cultural functions. But after the displacement, most of the people lost their additional income which they earned throughout the year. At the new place; displaced people shifted their occupation from the agriculture sector to the non-agriculture sector. One of the respondents stated that:

*“Livestock was one of the additional sources of income after agriculture. We used livestock for many purposes such as economic, consumption, social, cultural and religious. In our socio-religious functions, we sacrificed our animal which was a part of our culture, i.e. during childbirth, marriage ceremonies, sacrifices at religious shrine etc. From our animals, we got good nutritional food such as milk, butter, ghee, cheese, meat etc. We were never dependent upon the market. Due to the animals, we saved enough money for other social functions. She further said that we got woolen clothes, and blankets from our domestic animals. I used cattle’s wool for making clothes and blankets. I earned about ₹ 5,000 per month from my blankets. She also said,*

### Kumar and Mishra

*that in our village, most people used cattle wool for personal use and also for the market. But after the displacement, we lost everything and felt the pinch of economic burden throughout life”*  
(Sivita Devi, 57 years).

The study has clearly indicated that displaced women have lost an additional income of about ₹ 10,000 to 25,000 rupees per year which they earned through livestock. The additional income declined in the resettlement site due to occupational changes. In new places, the majority of people are not able to rear cattle due to lack of grazing land, fodder, lack of space, lack of family members. Most of the family members left their traditional occupations from the agriculture sector to the non-agriculture sector.

### Increase of Health Disease

Apart from economic status, mental and physical health is a major indicator of the standard of living and well-being of people (Mahapatra, 1999). Studies revealed that there has been an increase in water-borne diseases like malaria, diarrhoea, and dysentery at the resettlement site (Ibid).

The present study has found that there has been a tremendous increase in the health problems among displaced families after displacement mainly due to psychological depression, economic insecurity, unfavourable environment, industrial pollution, and waterborne diseases, etc.

**Table 8**  
**Increased Health Disease among Displaced Women**

Response	Kathua Respondent (%)	Pul Doda Respondent (%)
Yes	63 (52.50)	88 (73.34)
No	57 (47.50)	32 (26.66)
Total	120 (100)	120 (100)

Source: Field Survey

In the table above, it is observed that in Kathua 63 (52.50 per cent) of the respondents reported that displaced women faced health problems after displacement, 57 (47.50 per cent) of the respondents reported that they did not face any health problems after displacement. In Kathua, the resettlement site, displaced women suffered from diabetes, thyroid, skin allergy, and asthma. It has been seen that most of the displaced women are affected by the disease. Kathua is an industrial and hot region, displaced women mostly belonged to hilly areas. It was very difficult for them to adopt the hot climate region at the resettlement site. It has also been found that in the initial 3-5 years of displacement, the women faced more health problems, due to the

### **Economic Impact on Displaced Women...**

lack of health facilities in the resettlement site. They used to travel more than 60 km. to reach medical college in Jammu for treatment.

On the other hand, in Pul Doda, health condition among displaced women is worst as compared to Kathua people. The study has found that 88 (73.34 per cent) of the respondents reported that their health problems tremendously increased among women after forcibly displaced from their native place. And 32 (26.66 per cent) reported that they are not facing any health issues after displacement. It has been seen that in Pul Doda, the displaced women were living near the river Chenab and they are facing more health issues due to the unsafe environment. Displaced women who were living near river Chenab, they used river water for cooking and drinking purposes and sometimes they used spring water but the spring water was also affected due to the rising of river Chenab. The study has found that the majority of displaced women are suffering from malaria, typhoid, psychological depression, skin disease, etc. women faced psychological depression, regular headaches, and back pain. The study has found that the majority of displaced women are living in rented houses, for the last 10 years and they are facing a lot of health issues due to unsafe environment, lack of health facilities, and depression. The disease tremendously increased among displaced women in Pul Doda as compare to displaced women in Kathua. The study has put some case studies for better understanding, how the displaced women are facing health and other issues.

One displaced woman revealed that:

*“Displacement is associated with psychological stress that emerges out of fear of relocation or insecurity, also emotional stress is aggravated by the feeling of helplessness that may result in increased sickness, grief or even death. She further said that we are living under fear of eviction and are very insecure about our livelihood. She also said that their stress has increased very much because they are worried about their next meal because of livelihood insecurity. She revealed that they have displaced in 2007-08 and the State Government did not provide us any R&R policy to date. She has three sons and all are married and they have migrated to other places for earning their livelihood, only one son is living with her with his children. Her husband is suffering from diabetes and she is also suffering from heart disease. Due to the depression, health problems are increasing day by day. Due to the lack of land and house, we are living near the river Chenab in a rented house. Due to impurities in drinking water, our children are also suffering from malaria and typhoid. My grandson is also suffering from*



### **Kumar and Mishra**

*malnutrition and infectious disease due to the impurity in drinking water and lack of proper diet. In Pul Doda there are no health facilities and drinking water facility so health-related diseases are increasing day by day. We have lost everything due to displacement” (Shibeena Begum, 54 years).*

In another case of Pul Doda, a 60 year old lady was found in Pul Doda. She said that she did not face any kind of problem in her life. She used to get up early in the morning and start working in the field. She collected medicinal plants from the forest and sold them in the market. Her husband was a businessman, and they were earning ₹ 30,000 per month, they never faced any kind of health problem. But after the loss of ancestral home and business her husband faced psychological depression and he died after a long illness. Nobody came forward to help them; in fact the government also did not help them for the last 10 years. She also faced health problems like back pain, joint pain, and is also suffering from diabetes. She is living with her younger son in a rented house. He has his own family, sometimes it is very difficult for him to arrange ₹ 2000 per month for her health. He is running a small business near the bus stand. Due to the psychological depression her health is getting deteriorated day by day, it all happened because of forced displacement and concomitant poverty. There was a time when they earned ₹ 30,000 per month and now they are earning ₹ 5000. She said that displacement not only affected her health but also the livelihood of her family.

### **Conclusion**

Displacement by dams has become a serious issue across the world. Every year large number of developmental projects are undertaken without proper rehabilitation and resettlement. In the name of development, millions of people are forcibly displaced from their ancestral land and traditional occupations. Forced displacements affect every section of the society. However, it is the women who are the worse sufferers. The resettlement and rehabilitation policy further aggravates the suffering of women as it is harsher with the second gender. Under the resettlement and rehabilitation policy, the displaced women are not considered part of the policy. They are always ignored by the policymakers. It has been seen that after forced displacement, the displaced women faced a lot of economic hardship due to the loss of a regular source of income, loss of traditional occupation, loss of self-help group, loss of livestock, and increase in their health diseases due to unfavourable environment and psychological depression. The study

### **Economic Impact on Displaced Women...**

observed that women who are self-dependent and earned their livelihood from generations have to forcibly leave their traditional occupation and have to depend on their husband's income due to displacement. After displacement, most of the displaced women lost their socio-economic status which they had earned throughout their life. Women who were the backbone of the family, and who took whole family responsibilities became helpless due to displacement. After the displacement, the social life of women got more affected as they were not the part of compensation and rehabilitation process. So there is a need to especially focus on women and their issues and to prepare such policy so that in future no women may face any kind of socio-economic problems after displacement.

### **Suggestion and Policy Recommendation**

Evidences from the post displacement scenario of two dam projects posit that following measures should be taken up to ease the women issues caused due to dam projects: (i) Before constructing any developmental projects proper survey should be conducted through experts and survey should not be gender biased. (ii) In the process of compensation, resettlement and rehabilitation policies, all the adult female members should be considered as separate entities. (iii) Land should be allotted in the name of displaced women, and widow. (iv) Special attention should be paid to the marginalised sections of displaced women and adult girls. (v) The state government should give special employment package to displaced women and also give special skill training so that they can earn their livelihood through different means in the place of resettlement. (vi) At the resettlement site proper health, education and sanitation should be provided to women. (vii) In the case of displaced families having unmarried daughters, who are not eligible for employment in the project, the rehabilitation package should also include financial assistance for their marriage and education. (viii) The centre and state government should work together for the betterment of displaced women in an empathetic manner.

### **References**

- Ahuja, Ram (2014), *Research Methods*, Rawat Publication, New Delhi.
- Binodini, Ratna and Das, Amiya. P. (2013), Magnitude of Displacement: Implication and Future Solutions, *Economic Affairs*, Vol. 58, No. 2, pp. 129-133.
- Rawat, Rukma (2012), Development, Displacement and its Impact on Rural Women: A Case Study of Oustees of their Dam, *Eastern Anthropologists*. Vol. 65, No. 2, pp. 141-156.
- Thukral, E.G. (1996), 'Development, Displacement and Rehabilitation: Locating Gender', *Economic and Politically Weekly*, Vol. 31, No. 24. pp. 1500-1503.

## **Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal: Evidence from Siliguri of West Bengal**

**Annwasha Chanda\* and Dilip Kumar Chanda†**

*The objective of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) is to seek community participation in education at the school level. This programme has completed its implementation of 12 years. This article aims to evaluate the performance of the Village Education Committee (VEC) in an economically underdeveloped area of Siliguri Mahakuma of West Bengal. It is revealed in the study that the performance of VEC is not up to the mark and members of the VEC have limited awareness about the functioning of SSA.*

### **Introduction**

The Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) is a flagship programme announced by the Central Government of India that aims to provide useful universal elementary education to all the children whose age varies from six to 14 years and bridging the social, regional and gender gaps through the active participation of the community in the management of schools which ultimately ensures the creation of the decentralisation of decision-making process (Mehta, 2006; Mukherjee, 2007).

In response to this announcement, all the states along with the union territories in India have come forward to constitute village education

---

\* The Statesman. E-mail: [anne.swati.chanda@gmail.com](mailto:anne.swati.chanda@gmail.com)

† Professor, Kalipada Ghosh Tarai Mahavidyalaya, Darjeeling. E-mail: [dkc57@rediffmail.com](mailto:dkc57@rediffmail.com)

### Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal...

committees (VEC) under the SSA. The right of children to free and compulsory education Act 2009 (RTE) has made mandatory to ensure the meaningful participation of key stakeholders, particularly local panchayati raj institution, parents and communities in education. SSA is a significant tool to implement the RTE which has created the structures at the village level like VEC and assigned them the responsibility to ensure quality education for the children (Deb, 2015; Sahai, 2014). In some states, VEC is named as School Education Management Committee (SEMC). These community structures play a pivotal role in the development of the village education plan at the micro-level. Under the SSA, the annual work plan and budget are prepared in a participatory planning process by these communities and they take into account local needs and specificity (Dhir, 2006). The VEC is the mediator through which funds from the government flow for education in the villages and it is considered as one kind of mechanism through which planning, implementing and monitoring of public funds so generated are coordinated.

Keeping on view these objectives, this research paper aims to assess the trend of community participation in SSA in the Siliguri Mahakuma Parisad under Darjeeling district of West Bengal where more than 70 per cent population belongs to the Scheduled Caste (SC) and Scheduled Tribe (ST) community. Siliguri Mahakuma is divided into six educational circles, namely Kharibari and Batasi, Siliguri-Naxalbari, Naxalbari, Bidhan Nagar, Phansidewa, and Siliguri West. An empirical study was conducted to assess the role of the Village Education Committee (VEC)/Word Education Committee (WEC) in this area to understand the community participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan.

**Table 1**  
**Selection of Survey Sample**

Sl. No.	Name of the Circle	Total Villages	Sample Villages	VEC Members			Total
				Parents of the School-going Children	PRI Member	School Teachers	
1	Kharibari and Batasi	14	3	6	3	10	19
2	Siliguri - Naxalbari	20	4	8	4	12	24
3	Naxalbari	13	2	6	3	11	20
4	Bidhan Nagar	11	2	4	2	6	12
5	Phansidewa	23	5	10	5	14	29
6	Siliguri West	10	2	4	2	7	13
Total		91	19	38	19	60	117

Source: Field Survey

### **Chanda and Chanda**

A multistage sampling method has been adopted for the selection of villages and respondents for the study. A total of 19 villages were selected from the six educational circles of Siliguri Mahakuma i.e., 20 per cent of the total number of villages in each circle. The respondents for the present study were the members of the VEC/WEC, two out of four, one member of the panchayat/ward - either panchayat pradhan or any member or councilor in case of ward whoever was available and all school teachers as well as headmaster or mistress were covered during the survey. 117 respondents were randomly selected for the study purpose in 2017 from 19 VEC/WEC in 19 sample villages of the six education circles of Siliguri.

#### **Awareness of VEC/WEC Members**

The data collected for this study indicated that more than 69 per cent of all categories of respondents were quite aware of the SSA. In the case of school teachers, 88 per cent told that they were aware of SSA, while in the case of the representatives of panchayat raj institution (PRI) and parents of the school-going children are concerned this percentage was 62 per cent and 54 percent respectively. On the whole, 40 per cent respondents from all categories told that they have no idea about the SSA. Among the respondents who gave their negative opinion about the SSA, in percentage it constitutes the largest in number. It was interesting to note that nearly 24 per cent reported that the meaning of SSA is to provide mid-day meals to the students of government-aided primary schools in the State. Sumita Orao, one tribal parent member in the VEC in Raguram Jote village of Naxalbari circle expressed the view that "I send my son to the local school every day. I do not know about the functioning of SSA. But I know food is prepared at school and the same is distributed among the children in the school".

#### **Micro-Level Planning**

One of the major objectives of the SSA is to prepare a habitation level educational plan through community participation. The SSA has the clear aim of Universalisation of Elementary Education (UEE), and it is mandatory to track the progress of every child in the 0 to 24 age group (Mukherjee, 2007). The preparatory phase directs a process and activity-based organisation of such committee and training of community leaders for better management of schools.

It was revealed from the study that the majority (90.01 per cent) of all categories of respondents (110 out of 117) were not aware of the Micro-level Planning (MLP). And 90 per cent sample school teachers (54 out of 60)

### **Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal...**

were not aware of this component. In some cases, the teachers reported that they were not asked about the MLP by the senior officials whenever they visited the schools. Tublo Murmo, school headmaster of a government-aided school in Howdavita village of Kharibari and Batasi circle commented that "I did not get training on micro-level planning. This is a small village and I know about the details of all the children in this village. All the children regularly come to the school. So, MLP is not required for our school".

### **Awareness on Village Education Committee**

During this study, researchers asked the respondents whether they were aware of the existence of any committee in the village which deals with the issue related to education. Nearly 50 per cent (58 out of 117) of the respondents opined that there was no existence of such type of committee in their village. It is interesting to note that half of the members in the VEC/WEC were not aware that they are the members of the committee. In the case of the headmaster/mistress, 55 per cent (33 out of 60) reported that it was not known to them that they were the convener in VEC. It is irony to note that among the teachers those who knew that they were the member of the VEC reported that the school teachers wrote minutes of the VEC meeting without convening the formal meeting and took signature from the members of the committee privately. They pointed out that they signed the minutes in good faith because they trusted the school teachers. However, the argument of the teachers was different. John Tirkey, a school teacher of a government-aided primary school in Nuni Jote village of Bidhannagar circle said that "the committee members never attended the meeting even after repeated reminders. Because of the pressure from the inspector of school, I was compelled to send the minutes of the meeting without conducting a formal meeting ". It was observed during the survey, that most of the schools in the study area do not maintain minutes of the VEC meetings in their schools. Among the 117 respondents, 58 (49.57 per cent) reported that they were not aware of their membership in the VEC. Subhasis Kirtanya, panchayat president belonging to the Bhatan Jote village of Phansidewa circle said that "I know that I am the chairman of VEC. However, no formal meeting held in the school. The school teachers are very much sincere to look after everything. We always support the school teachers in all respect for the smooth running of the school." It indicates that neither teachers nor the panchayat raj institution member took initiative for conducting a monthly meeting of the VEC.

## Chanda and Chanda

### Availability of Infrastructure

The availability of basic facilities and infrastructure is the basic need at the school level to ensure a better teaching-learning process. It would be a wise decision on the part of the teachers to use teaching-learning materials (TLM) at the time of teaching the children. A student can understand things easily when the teacher uses relevant learning items at the time of teaching the tribal children in the classroom.

**Table 2**  
**Facilities Available in the Schools**

Infrastructure	Response		Infrastructure	Response	
Class Room	Available	74	Toilet facility	Separately for boys & girls	69
	Not Available	18		Common	16
	Total	92		Not available	7
				Total	92
Blackboard	Available	83	Playground	Available	25
	Not available	9		Not available	67
	Total	92		Total	92
Electricity	Available	12	TLM	Available	54
	Not available	80		Not available	14
	Total	92		Total	92
Stationary	Available	92	Rooms for teachers	Available	78
	Not Available	NIL		Not available	14
	Total	92		Total	92
Drinking water	Available	60	Separate classroom	Available	50
	Not available	32		Not available	42
	Total	92		Total	92

Source: Field Survey.

The term TLM refers to a spectrum of educational materials that teachers use in the classroom to support specific learning objectives, as set up in lesson plans. Sanitation and other facilities within the school premises are also important to ensure a healthy environment for learning. The SSA has taken up these issues to be addressed during its implementation. In this relation data collected from the 92 government-aided primary schools in the study area. The facilities in these schools were not satisfactory which is presented in the table.

### Participation of VEC Members

The principal aim of SSA is to encourage the decentralisation of planning and decision making by the VEC/WEC to ensure local participation in school-related activities. To do so, the parents of the school-going children and panchayat members are made part of the VEC at the

### **Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal...**

village level. As a result, it was expected that they would be able to discuss various issues related to education in their village. However, data indicated that more than 75 per cent ( 88 out of 117 ) respondents in the study area reported that they had not even taken part even once in the monthly meeting during their attachment with the VEC as its member.

In this regard, the researcher asked Sri Biplab Ghosh, parent member in VEC in Shishabari village of Siliguri- Naxalbari circle. He commented that "It is the duty and responsibility of the concerned school teacher how to run the school properly. It is not in my knowledge that I am a member of the school committee. No one had informed me about the fact. I was never asked to take part in the meetings."

While sharing this experience of organising committee meetings Ms. Sangaydoma Dukpa school headmistress in Jogivita village of Siliguri West Circle commented that "It is a challenging task to organise the committee meeting. The members never turn up for discussion in the meeting. Even if anything goes wrong with the implementation of the mid-day meal programme, they never come forward to resolve the issue. Most of the time, I take initiative to solve the problem taking the help of the outsiders in the committee". Several respondents in the study area reported that they took part in the education-related activities. Seventy-four respondents out of 117 (63 per cent) told that they do not know how to identify drop out students. 20 respondents out of 117 (more than 17 per cent) expressed that they helped the drop out children for their enrolment in the schools. 10 per cent respondents told that they participated and monitored the mid-day meal programme. In response to the question asked, how she helped the drop out children for their enrolment in the school, Mrs. Ratri Dasgupta, committee member in VEC in Santipur village of Siliguri West circle commented that "there were four boys and three girls in our village who were dropped out. I gave my effort to discuss with their parents many times. I also discussed with the children about their problems. I repeatedly took the initiative to motivate the teachers to enroll these children. Finally, with the help of the teachers and parents, we were able to enroll these children in the nearby Sarada Bidyapith."

### **Financial Resources of School**

As per the regulation of the SSA, every school gets grants for doing its developmental activities. These grants are utilised for serving two types of purposes of the schools. These grants are utilised for the preparation of TLM as well as infrastructural developmental activities of the school.



### **Chanda and Chanda**

Headmasters/headmistress of the concerned schools is entitled to spend these grants with prior consent from the VEC at the monthly meeting.

In the course of the survey, this point was discussed with the community members and it was revealed that most of them were not aware of the financial resources that the school receives. They also pointed out that "the teachers do not show their interest to disclose the financial resources that received for the school and the nature of expenditure the school is going to make." As a result, they believe that school teachers only have a say in decision making over financial resources. Sometimes the school teachers spent the grants without discussing this issue with them. All these facts reveal that the government is trying to make aware of the different groups of our community for their greater participation in school-related activities through various education programmes like SSA but unfortunately policies are being poorly implemented.

#### **Suggestion to Improve the Functioning of VEC/WEC**

During the study, it was asked to the VEC/WEC members to suggest to improve the functioning of the education committee at the village level. They came up with several interesting suggestions. Nearly 20 per cent (24 out of 117) suggested in favour of the organising campaign among the parents to create their awareness so that they can show their interest to take part in school-related activities. Sri Sarat Chandra Ray, Headmaster of Tanika Jote Primary School in Deburam Jote village of Kharibari-Batashi circle who has been working in that area for the last 25 years holds the view that "I have been in working in that area where most of the people belong to the tribal community. Most of them are not aware of the importance of education. Even they are related to the VEC as its member, they are not aware of their roles and responsibility. If campaigning is organised on a large scale among them, awareness will be created about their duties as a member of the committee."

Teachers play an important role in the teaching-learning process in the school. But lack of sincerity about their duty towards the students in the school sometimes may create dissatisfaction among the parents to withdraw their children from the school. In this relation, VEC/WEC should chalk out a mechanism to identify the insincere teacher and to take the corrective step. This view was echoed in the comment of a father of a student belonging to the Scheduled Tribe community. Madhab Oraon, a mason by occupation commented that "my son was the student of class I at Lakshman Singh Jote Primary School. Lack of sound academic atmosphere in the school

### **Community Participation in Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan in West Bengal...**

compelled me to withdraw my son from that school and admitted him in a nearby private English medium school". Most of the VEC members in the study area are daily wage labourers/plantation workers in nearby tea gardens. It may not be possible on their part to attend the VEC meeting. So, it would be better to seek a feasible time from this type of member before fixing the date of the meeting.

It should be the duty of the VEC to monitor the admission of students in the school. Simultaneously, the information should be collected by the VEC about the drop out children and if possible necessary steps should be taken for their re-admission in the school. VEC should take initiative to introduce remedial classes in the school for those students who are not able to clear their doubts in the classroom.

It was found in the study particularly in the tea garden areas where Bengali medium schools are functioning although the majority of the population in these areas are Hindi speaking. In this situation, the Hindi speaking children do not take admission in Bengali medium school or discontinue their studies. To solve this problem VEC should draw the attention of the appropriate authority. This situation was reflected in the comment made by Subhasis Ekka, a Scheduled Tribe man of Pekajote of Naxalbari circle. He commented that "I am a plantation worker. Several tea gardens are surrounding our village. Most of the people in our village are Scheduled Tribe and Hindi speaking. I had the intention to send my children to the nearby primary school. There is one primary school in our village but it is a Bengali medium school. So it was not possible to send my children to school". The special drive should make to identify the out of children in the study area, especially in the tea garden area. To do so special sensitisation programme for VEC is required for awareness generation among the people.

The other suggestions offered by community members are to introduce mid-day meal with milk, fish, meat, etc. as food items daily, making sufficient arrangement of pure drinking water in the school premises, use of TLM materials by the teacher to ensure proper teaching-learning method, provision of better infrastructure at schools and so on. To remove misunderstanding about the receipt of funds from the government, it should be mandatory to display the receipt of funds on the school notice board. VEC is required to be empowered and funded for the appointment of the required number of helpers to the cook/cleaners/sweepers in the schools. All these suggestions indicate that the people of an economically backward area are interested to participate in some way or other in school-

### Chanda and Chanda

related activities. To do so, proper campaigning among the relevant people is necessary for their just participation.

#### References

- Deb, P. and Ghosh, G.S. (2015), 'Reasons behind the Dropout Children in Dooars Area of Jalpaiguri District of West Bengal' *Academica*, Vol. 5, No. 2.
- Dhir, Jhingran and Deepa Sankar (2006), 'Orienting Outlays towards Needs: An Evidence Based Equity Focused Approach to Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan', Mimeo, P. 67.
- Mehta Arun C. (2006), *Progress Towards Universalising Elementary Education, Analytical Report 2005-06*. New Delhi: National University of Education Planning and Administration.
- Mukherjee, N. Anit and Tapas Sen (2007), 'Universalising Elementary Education: An Assessment of the Role of Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan'. *Policy Brief*, New Delhi: National Institute of Public Finance and Policy.
- Sahai, C.S. (2014), 'Mid Day Meal Scheme: Achievement and Challenges', *International Journal of Humanities and Social Science Invention*, Vol. 3, No. 10, pp. 6-9.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 94-106)

## Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism

Pareswar Sahu\* and Motilal Mahamallik†

*This paper examines the issue of state autonomy in Indian federalism. The issue of state autonomy has come to the forefront since independence, there has been no substantial improvement observed until the single political party dominance at the centre. During the single political party dominance rule both at the centre and state, the claim relating to state autonomy was either not so vocal or it was subdued. However, with the emergence of the regional political party in power at the state and in the centre in the form of the coalition government, the issue came to limelight. Accordingly, efforts were taken by the central government, particularly the National Democratic Alliance (NDA) government, to raise the level of state autonomy. In the present scenario, defective reforms instead of increasing the autonomy of the state, the state autonomy has been shrunk over time. Therefore, the structure of the Indian federation is moving towards a competitive frame instead of cooperative federalism.*

### Introduction

Increasing acceptance of a federal form of government across the globe speaks about the confidence of people and political parties on the federal form of government. Further, the rising acceptability of this kind of model after long experimentation with different forms of government in different countries reinforces confidence in it. Any popular form of

---

\* Lecturer in Economics, Barpali College, Barpali (Odisha). E-mail: pareswar.sahu@gmail.com

† Assistant Professor, Institute of Development Studies, Jaipur (Rajasthan).

E-mail: mahamallik@gmail.com

government is not free from limitations. Over time, the federal form of government in India invited valid criticisms relating to its nature of functioning. In a single-party rule when everything looks fine in this form of government, in a multi-party rule conflict of interest comes out prominently. With the increase in representations of regional political parties in the state and the union politics, disagreement between the two became louder. The issue of competitive federalism was not in the policy debate until the representation of a single political party is strong both at centre and states. The discussion on cooperative and competitive federalism is of relatively recent origin. With the changing dynamics of increasing acceptance of regional political parties in power and misuse of institutions by the central government to centralise power attract the interest of policymakers and researchers to examine the importance of cooperative federalism in the country.<sup>1</sup>

In Indian federalism, union and states often interact on three arrangements: (i) administrative, (ii) legislative and (iii) fiscal relation. Over time the union government has been utilising its power to subdue state autonomy. With this background, this paper examines the methods adopted by the union government for constraining state autonomy.

Rising central supremacy in the Indian federal government, even though is an old issue, came to limelight after the non-congress government came to power. The issue further strengthens with the emergence of the regional political party at the state level. The rise of the feeling of regional patriotism strengthens the debate of cooperative vs. competitive federalism. Contradictions became stronger with the rise of regional interest along with regional political parties in power in different states. Even though it is not visible, contradictions observed in issues related to (i) administrative, (ii) legislative, and (iii) fiscal matters between the centre and the state at different points of time. The centre is often using its power to sabotage the state freedom.

Although the issue of state autonomy was at the forefront, no substantial thought has been given either at the level of central government or academic community. Even though the NDA government after assuming power at the centre in 2014 has taken few steps to augment the state autonomy, instead of increasing autonomy, the degree of state autonomy has been shrinking down over the period. Elsewhere it is also mentioned that the rise in central supremacy accentuated soon after the NDA government assumes power in 2014 at the centre (Sharma and Swenden, 2018). The paper is divided into three parts. Theoretical framework and origin of federalism in

## **Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism**

India are explained in Part I. Part II analyses the center-state relation and issues of co-operative federalism in India. A brief concluding remark is presented in Part III.

### **Part I**

#### **Theoretical Framework**

Even though the increasing importance of federalism is of relatively recent origin some sensitive literature is available on its theories in economics. Broadly, three perspectives on federalism are prominently visible: (i) classical Theory, (ii) origin theory, and (iii) functional theory (Paleker, 2006).

The proponents of the classical theory<sup>2</sup> argue that federalism retains its gain when there is a clear division of political power between central and local governments and each level of government is independent of each other. Written and rigid Constitution, independent judiciary and adequate sources of revenue to each level are pre-requisites to ensure the division of power between levels of government in a federal structure. So the proponents of classical theory advocate for a model of dual federalism considering the number of sovereign units of government. They ignore the forces required for the formation and functional aspects of the federation. The consequence leads to failure of the model where there is socio-economic diversity in the country and all governmental units work together for a common purpose.

The origin theory explains the forces and factors necessitates for the Constitution of a federal structure of government. It fails to cover the functional issues. A structure of government cannot function properly to achieve a particular objective when all its levels work independently. It may give rise to competition between the levels when the levels achieve their objective along with the common objective.

Functional theory advocates for interdependence and cooperation between the levels of government protecting the integrity and autonomy of each level to achieve a common goal with changing social, economic and political phenomenon. Using the framework of functional theory, the Indian government tries to enhance the faith of participation of sub-national governments in the decision-making process that strengthens the unity and integrity of the nation.

As the division of power varies across countries, the autonomy of the sub-national governments also changes. The degree of devolution to the sub-national government (state) has a negative correlation with the

centralisation of power. The federation with a high degree of centralisation emerged in America in 1787 and ended with the great depression in 1930. It is the cooperative federalism which could bring its economy out of the economic crisis. With the introduction of globalisation across the world, countries have moved towards a higher degree of power (political, administrative and fiscal) between levels of government through either de-concentration or delegation or devolution or all. Decentralisation gives rise to (i) an increase in economic efficiency, (ii) provision of public goods as per the preference of people, (iii) political participation of the people, and (iv) stability and peace-building (Karmel, 2017). However, the success of decentralisation depends on the degree of cooperation between levels of government, which in turn increases with the protection of autonomy and integrity of all levels of government.

#### **A Brief Origin of Federalism in India**

After Indian independence, despite demand from the various quarter for provincial autonomy and federal system of government, the Constituent Assembly opted for a centralised government with a federal structure due to the rise of local chauvinism at that point of time. Being a democratic structure, there was provision for substantial autonomy to state in normal times except in times of civil, political and health emergency. The rise of local chauvinism in some regions of India was also viewed as the signal of the emergence of regional patriotism. With this, speculations were made for the emergence of regional political parties shortly. In later phases, reorganisation of state based on linguistic and other regional issues may be viewed as the result of strong regional patriotism. Slowly there were growing demands for the creation of new small states and delegation of more powers to the elected bodies at the sub-national and sub-state level functionaries. There was also increasing tension in union-state and state-district relations, especially where there were different political parties at different levels. The sub-national and sub-states level institutions slowly started demanding greater autonomy and a larger share in the financial resources.

Till 1967, the relations between the centre and states continued to be quite smooth because one party was in power both in the centre (Congress) and almost in all states. After this phase, strains appeared because Congress lost power in many states and many coalition governments were formed in India by the opposition parties. In 1977, the Congress lost power at the centre and the Janata Party formed the government at the centre. Soon after the

### **Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism**

assumption of power in the centre, the Janata government dismissed Congress governments in nine states. As a retaliation measure, Congress government also dismissed Janata governments in nine states soon after coming back to power at the centre in 1980. This type of political foul play affects the democratic rights of citizens who voted for economic development and social justice. A series of opposition conclaves took place in different parts of India to register dissatisfactions on present centre-state relation.<sup>3</sup> A vociferous demand for reforms in centre-state relations was made by West Bengal, Jammu and Kashmir, Punjab, Maharashtra, Kerala, Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, etc.

Keeping the facts in background, Justice R.S. Sarkaria Commission<sup>4</sup> was set up by the then Prime Minister Ms. Indira Gandhi<sup>5</sup> and the commission submitted its report in October 1987 to the then Prime Minister Mr. Rajiv Gandhi. The commission advocates for a strong centre to safeguard national unity and integrity and rejected the demand for curtailing powers of the centre. At the same time, the commission also emphasised a supreme centre which had created a great divide between centre and states. In addition to it, the commission gave a series of recommendations. The other key recommendations are as follows: (a) set up a permanent inter-state council called as "Inter-Governmental Council" under Article 263 of the Constitution, (b) use of Article 356 in extreme cases and only as a last resort, (c) further strengthen the All India Services and add more services to them, (d) residuary powers of taxation should be continued to be with centre while other residuary powers should be placed in the concurrent list, (e) President should communicate reasons to state governments when he withholds assent to bills of the state legislature, (f) rename National Development Council as National Economic and Development Council (NEDC), (g) fresh Constitution of Zonal Councils to promote the spirit of federalism, (h) Centre should continue to have powers to deploy armed forces without even consent of states. However, there should be a mechanism to consult the states, (i) Centre should consult the states before making a law on concurrent list, (j) the Constitution should be amended to provide for consultation with Chief Minister in the appointment of the state Governor, (k) Corporation Tax should be included in sharable pool (it was not there at that time), (l) Governor should not be able to dismiss the council of ministers as long as it commands majority in state assembly, (m) Governor's term should be fixed to five years; and it should not be disturbed except for some extremely compelling reasons, (n) no commission of inquiry should be set up against a minister in state unless demand is made by Centre should levy surcharge



### **Sahu and Mahamallik**

only for specific purpose and for strictly a limited period, (o) the commission found division of functions between finance commission and planning commission reasonable and recommended their continuation, (p) steps should be taken to implement three language formula, (q) no autonomy for radio and television but decentralisation in their operations, (r) no change in the role of Rajya Sabha and Centre's power to reorganise the states, (s) the commissioner for linguistic minorities should be activated, (t) in summary, Sarkaria commission did not suggest any drastic changes in federal scheme but favoured several changes to remove irritants in centre-state relations.

The breakthrough in the federal structure of India appeared in 1992 when 73rd and 74th Constitutional Amendment Acts were passed by the Parliament of India. 73rd Amendment Act provided Constitutional status to the rural local governments<sup>6</sup> which are alternatively called Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRIs) and 74th Amendment Act provided the same for the urban local governments.

## **Part II**

### **Centre-State Relation and Issue of Cooperative Federalism**

Center-state relation is reflected in the 7th Schedule of the Constitution of India under three list (i) Union list, (ii) State list and (iii) Concurrent list. The central government has exclusive power over the areas (97 items) included in the union list. The areas enlisted in the state list (66 items) are empowered to the state. Areas covered under the concurrent list (47 items) are empowered to both union and state governments. However, in case of conflicts in the areas of the concurrent list, the union laws prevail over the state. Each list is further categorised into administrative, legislative and financial power.

The law-making, administrative and financial distribution is enshrined under Article 245 to 255, 256 to 263 and 268 to 293 respectively in the Indian Constitution. Any amendment of the Constitution requires a majority of two-third members of Lok Sabha and Rajya Sabha present and voting, ratified by at least one-half of the state legislature and assent of the President of India. During emergencies: (i) national emergencies under Article 352, (ii) state emergencies under Article 356 and (iii) financial emergencies under Article 360 the Centre rules over the state. In case of conflict between the centre and state, the central law prevails. A strong central government is necessary to bring unity and welfare of the nation. But it should respect the will and autonomy of the state for national interest since strength and autonomy go together in cooperation and mutual

### **Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism**

understanding. Even if there is a clear division of powers between the centre and state in three spheres under union, state and concurrent list, co-operation between the centre and the state is crucial in matters relating to concurrent list and of national importance. Constitutional provisions have been made to ensure close coordination between the centre and state under Article 262 and 263. While Article 262 resolves the disputes of the inter-state river valley, an Inter-State Council is established under Article 263 to solve the disputes between states.

### **Legislative Relation between Centre and State**

The Indian Constitution empowers both the centre and state to make laws relating to the area of concern as mentioned earlier. However, often the centre encroaches upon, discourages and hampers in the law-making power of the states. There are areas operated by both the centre and state under the concurrent list. However, if a conflict arises under these areas, the law of the central government prevails. By virtue of this power, the central government often inserts its control over the areas of the concurrent list even if the state is given power relating to it. Apart from this, the centre is empowered to frame laws concerning the area covered under the state list on five grounds: (i) if the council of state declares the necessity on the ground of national interest supported by a two-thirds majority of its members present and voting, (ii) state emergency under Article 356, (iii) declaration of emergency under Article 250, (iv) desire of two or more state legislatures to have a law passed by Parliament under Article 252 and (v) treaties and international agreement. It is observed that by misusing the Article 356, the central government proclaims emergency based on partisan manner. In other words, it declares state emergency immediately without any sufficient ground if the party in power of the state is different from that of the centre and delayed declaration of emergency for the state when the ruling party at both the centre and state is same, even if there is the failure of constitutional machinery (Arora, 2014; Nakade, 1969). This type of situation was frequently visible in the two initial decades of independence and which has reduced to some extent with the emergence of coalition politics at the centre. The emergence of regional political parties in state politics and their support in the central government formation increases the possibilities of state autonomy. Further, the establishment of the National Institute of Transforming India (NITI) created space for the state in the process of national policy-making which has been a longstanding demand for decades. However, the space for the states in the law-making process is merely an ornamental exercise.

**Administrative Relation between Centre and State**

The administrative relationship between the centre and state is enumerated in Part XI, Chapter II of the Constitution of India between Article 256 to 263. As per the enumeration of the relation the dual government is provided for the centre and state. Each level of government exercises administrative power exclusively in respect of the subjects covered in its area. With the expectation of the possibility of disputes between the two governments, constitutional provisions have been made to rectify the disputes and maintain cooperation between levels of government through delegation of powers, central directions, the establishment of All India Services and Inter-State Council (ISC).<sup>7</sup> However, the central government uses these provisions to keep the state under its control curtailing the state autonomy. For example, often the central government is not satisfied with the activities performed by the state with its direction under Article 256 and 257 and state emergency (Article 356) is imposed on the state. Further, Indian civil servants always work in favour of the central government.<sup>8</sup> Under Article 263 the Constitution establishes ISC along with zonal councils to maintain inter-governmental cooperation through consultations and rigorous discussion between the centre and state on policies of national importance. However, the analysis dictates the central supremacy over state administration. Even if each state has its government, its head, Governor, is appointed by the President of India and hence acts as an agent of the central government in the state. Besides this during an emergency, the Governor becomes the real head of the state and acts on the aid and advice of the president.

The constitutional mandate for the state to exercise its executive power without any hindrance in the executive power of the centre provides a chance to the central government to influence the state government power in its favour. By its executive power, the Centre can direct the state government for construction and maintenance of means of communications of national military importance. The central government also deploys central reserve police or paramilitary forces to protect central properties within the area of the state. Article 356 assigns the power to declare a state emergency in a state when that state fails to perform central government directions. The central government has the power to exercise administrative control over the state through the appointment of inquiry commissions against the Chief Minister of a state for investigating the alleged act. So even if ISC includes the Chief Ministers of states, it may always favour the central government.

## **Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism**

### **Financial Relation between Centre and State**

To ensure autonomy and micro-economic efficiency, larger responsibilities are assigned to the state. Further, to maintain stability, efficiency and uniformity in taxation, broad-based taxations are assigned to the central government and immobile taxation assigned to the state. The larger expenditure responsibilities with state and revenue collection responsibility with the centre lead to fiscal imbalances. To reduce these imbalances, the provision of revenue transfers from the centre to state is enshrining in the Constitution. Even though the constitutionally Union Finance Commission (UFC) (Article 280) is entitled to mediation, the central government entrusted the task of revenue transfers from the centre to states to central ministries and Planning Commission (Article 282).<sup>9</sup> Political interference in the process of devolution through mediating institution/s is condemned on the ground of declining state autonomy. After a long criticism on Planning Commission,<sup>10</sup> UFC and Central Ministries are delegated the responsibilities of federal transfer with the replacement of the Planning Commission by NITI Aayog.

Although the UFC was assigned to deal with plan and non-plan transfers, its scope restricted to non-plan account only after 3rd UFC by the direction of the central government. The planned transfer was assigned to the Planning Commission, a political body, which was responsible for the planning process. With the entry of a political body, the political party in power created a space to manipulate the transfer in its favour. Elsewhere, the Planning Commission is criticised for devolution of transfer from the centre to state based on political consideration (Singh and Vasistha, 2004). As the planned transfer, which was assigned to the Planning Commission, is purely discretionary that legitimises the totalitarian status of the authority. As a result, the sacred principle of federal transfer got disturbed. This leads to the iniquitous distribution of federal transfer across states that affect the autonomy of states. Further, when UFC introduced incentives linked restructuring programmes the better off states were encouraged by the conditions of these programmes to harness more federal transfers instead of bringing improvement in fiscal performance.<sup>11</sup> But the poorer states could not encash the benefit of the federal transfer due to the small size of their budget. The disproportionate share of devolution due to a combination of defective conditions of incentive link programme and small size of Budget of poorer state leads to declining state autonomy.

The NDA government initiated audacious fiscal reforms to promote the state's autonomy by restructuring the framework of the transfer system.<sup>12</sup>

### **Sahu and Mahamallik**

Two important steps in this direction were: (i) abolition of the Planning Commission and transfer of its fund disbursement power to Central ministries (Patnaik, 2015); and (ii) modification in the structure and share of general-purpose transfer (share tax) of the UFC. However, these measures did not satisfy the objective for which it was meant. The abolition of the Planning Commission, as desired, to some extent restricted the political affiliation of the channels (BM, 1995). However, the shift of fund disbursement power from the Planning Commission to the Central Ministries had not only increased the size of the central ministry's conditional grants but also reiterated the apprehension of increasing political affiliation. To increase the autonomy of states, the UFC took a remarkable step by raising tax devolution from 32 per cent during 13th UFC to 42 per cent of gross central taxes during the 14th and 15th UFC. However, it could not serve the objective as unfavourable conditions were imposed in its utilisation.<sup>13</sup> Structural reforms were undertaken in order to bring improvement in the functions of UFC incorporating experts and ignoring the retired bureaucrats over the period. But the experts were not free from the political affiliation of the party in power at the centre. This instead of increasing creates all avenues to deteriorate the state autonomy.

### **Part III**

#### **Conclusion**

Co-operative and competitive relations are two extreme features of a federal structure. Moving in the direction of competitive to cooperative federalism is a sign of a mature federal democracy. It is only under cooperative federalism macro-economic efficiency and economic growth can be achieved. In single-party dominance regimes, co-operative and competitive federalism hardly make any difference. However, in multi-party democratic federalism ruled by a coalition party, ensuring cooperative federalism or state autonomy is necessary for economic progress. Few measures are taken in the last two decades are mostly in legislative and fiscal aspects in India. Even though measures were being taken to ensure state autonomy, it seems to be more ornamental and has hardly benefited the nuances of federalism. At this juncture, a relook on the centre-state relation may rectify the relation and will help achieve the objective of economic growth and macro-economic efficiency.

## Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism

### End Notes

1. In a federal structure, close coordination between the levels of government helps to achieve the national objectives.
2. Dicey, Harrison Moore, Jethrow Brown, Bryce, Robert Garran and K.C. (Parlekar S.A., 2006)
3. The first Opposition Conclave was held in Vijaywada in 1983. Fourteen non-Congress parties gathered to raise their concern on the act of Centre for encroaching upon the powers of the states. In the Delhi conclave in 1984, the state had the opinion that Union is only a mother organisation to coordinate the activities of various states. Treating states as branch offices of the centre is not a healthy sign of federalism. In the Srinagar Opposition Conclave, 10 non-Congress parties gathered.
4. In addition to it, M M Punchhi Commission was set up by the UPA Government in 2007 and it gave its recommendations in 2010. Further, different state governments and political parties also constituted commissions or prepared resolutions to address different issues relating to centre-state relations such as (i) Rajamannar Committee, (ii) Anandpur Sahib Resolution, and (iii) West Bengal Memorandum.
5. This commission was appointed by the late Prime Minister, Indira Gandhi, with an eminent judge as chairman and an administrator and an economist as two members named as Justice R. S. Sarkaria Commission. It will look into the Centre-State Relations in India.
6. In India local governments/PRI's comprises of District/Zila Panchayats at the district level, Intermediary/Block/Taluka Panchayats at between district and village levels and Village/Gram Panchayats at village levels. There may be different names for these levels of local governments across states but above-mentioned names are used in most of the states. This will be discussed in detail in the subsequent parts of this section.
7. The president of India issued Inter-State Council order, 1990 on May 28 to set up Inter-State Council comprising the Prime Minister, Chief Ministers of all states and union territories, the administrator of union territories not having a legislative assembly and six members of cabinet rank in the union council of ministers to be nominated by the Prime Minister. Article 258 empowers the president of India to delegate power to the state government or its officers to achieve the national objective. Under Article 256 and 257, the central government may direct the state government to perform certain functions. The Constitution under Article 312 creates "All-India Services" for both the Centre and state for the smooth functioning of both levels of government.
8. While the state is assigned the power to suspend the officials of All India Services, the power of appointment, training, promotion and taking disciplinary action against them are determined by the central government. Although a member of the Indian Administrative Service is appointed in a state where s/he serves under that state government, s/he is responsible for the administration both at the Centre and state.
9. The Planning Commission (PC) was established in India immediately after independence to achieve economic growth and equity through plan development. The PC was constituted in March 1950 under a resolution of the government of India. It consists of Prime Minister as the chairman, Deputy Chairman, Central Cabinet Ministers as ex-officio members and six full-time members. To advise the PC, the National Development Council was established including Prime Minister as the chairman, Chief Ministers of States, Central Cabinet Ministers and Members of PC as members. It was assigned the tasks of assessment and augmentation of material and human capital, plan formulation, fixation of priorities and targets, execution and

### Sahu and Mahamallik

implementation of plans, appraisal and evaluation of plans, finding out of barriers of planning and their remedies and regional balanced development.

10. The Planning Commission is criticised on the ground of: (1) ignorance of task assigned to it and wrong fixation of targets due to inadequate direction from the top (EPW 1968), (2) inadequate project evaluation arrangements at the state level (EPW 1971), (3) introduction of political consideration at every stage of the planning process (EPW 1967), (4) creation of inhibiting attitude for specialists by civil servants (EPW 1971), (5) using as a political pawn (BM 1995), (6) lack of accountability (Arun Maira 2014) and (7) irrelevance of centralised planning in the era of the liberalised economy (CUTS, International 2014; Sanjeev Sabhlok 2009). Its methods of devolution: (1) constancy of grants loans component in the Gadgil formula, (2) coverage of the Gadgil formula to normal central assistance only (around 30% of plan transfers in 2009) (Rao, 2009), (3) no connection of plan transfers to the sectoral composition of planning and (4) defective equity principle (Rao and Sen 1996) are criticised in reducing horizontal imbalance.
11. The UFC introduced Medium Term Fiscal Restructuring Programme (MTFRP) during 2000-01 to 2004-05 and Fiscal Responsibility Budget Management Act (FRBMA) during 2004-05 to 2009-10 to arouse the states to increase their fiscal performance during the 11th and 12th UFC.
12. In first three decades after Indian independence, in principle, states were following the central directives to carry out their economic activities without any hesitation. The directives were mutually acceptable because of the presence of the same political party in power both at the Centre and states. The demand for state autonomy sparks with the withering of the single political party dominance regime at different levels of government in India. With the initiation of coalition government regime in India, the voice of state autonomy started echoing (Bagchi 2003). The gradual rise in the strength of coalition politics expedites the demand of state autonomy. Bringing back the issue of cooperative federalism to the forefront of economic discourse in the 2nd term of NDA government may be viewed as a well thought the political move to prepare the ground to gather the support of states for future political action.
13. The states were asked to use the increased share taxes to meet the revenue expenditure of 24 centrally sponsored schemes and delinked schemes (Reddy 2015).

### References

- Arora, Dolly (2014), 'Trends in Centre-State Relations', *Theme Paper*, New Delhi: Indian Institute of Public Administration.
- Bagchi, Amaresh (2003), Fifty Years of Fiscal Federalism in India: An Appraisal, *Working Paper No. 2*, August, New Delhi: National Institute of Public Finance and Policy.
- BM (1995), 'Using Planning Commission as a Political Pawn', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 30, No. 35, pp. 2160-2162.
- CUTS International (2014), 'Reinventing the Planning Commission: The Great Debate', Jaipur: CUTS International Public Policy Centre.
- Economic and Political Weekly (1967): "Revitalise the Planning Commission", *Economic and Political Weekly*, Correspondent, Vol. 2, No. 3/5, pp. 89-91.
- Economic and Political Weekly (1968): "Planning Commission under Attack", Correspondent, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 3, No. 15, pp. 591-592.
- Economic and Political Weekly (1971a): "Planning Commission and the States", Special Correspondent, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 6, No. 37, pp. 1948.

### Centre-State Relation in India: Issue of Cooperative Federalism

- Economic and Political Weekly (1971b): "Planning Commission Devalued", Correspondent, *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 6, No. 18, pp. 900-901.
- Karnel, Ezra (2017), Centralising Government: What You Need to Know, *Briefing Paper 87*, June, Democracy Reporting International, [http://democracy-reporting.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/DRI-HQ\\_BP-87\\_Decentralising-Government.pdf](http://democracy-reporting.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/08/DRI-HQ_BP-87_Decentralising-Government.pdf), accessed on 8th July, 2019, time 14.54.
- Maira, Arun (2004), 'India's Reluctant Reformers', *Livemint*, March 05.
- Nakade, Shiv Raj (1969), 'Article 356 of the Indian Constitution: Its Use and Abuse', *Journal of Chinese Political Science*, Special Number, (Nov.), P. 122.
- Paleker, S.A. (2006), 'Federalism: A Conceptual Analysis', *The Indian Journal of Political Science*, Vol. 67, No. 2, pp. 303-310.
- Patnaik, Prabhat (2015), 'From the Planning Commission to the NITI Aayog', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 50, No. 4, pp. 10-12.
- Rao, M.G. (2009), A Review of Indian Fiscal Federalism, Report of the Commission on Centre State Relation, Supplementary Volume II, Research Studies, New Delhi: Government of India.
- Rao, M.G. and T K. Sen (1996), *Fiscal Federalism in Theory and Practice*, New Delhi, Indian Council of Social Science Research.
- Reddy, G.R. (2015), 'Finance Commission Proposes the Union Disposes', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 50, No. 26-27.
- Sabhlok, Sanjeev (2009), 'Breaking Free of Nehru: Lets Unleash India' Anthem South Asian Studies, Retrived from <https://www.sanjeev.sabhlokcity.com/breakingfreeofnehru.pdf>
- Sharma, Chanchal Kumar and Wilfried Swenden (2018), 'Modi-fying Indian Federalism? Center-State Relations under Modi's Tenure as Prime Minister', *Indian Politics and Policy*, Vol. 1, No. 1, pp. 51-81.
- Singh, Nirvikar and Garima Vasishta (2004), 'Patterns of Centre- State fiscal Transfers: An illustrative Analysis', *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 39, No. 45.



*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 107-118)

## Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes: An Analysis

Anurodh Godha\*, Aparna Sharma† and Monika Talreja‡

*Entrepreneurial development has become a mass movement in India in the past few years. An effective medium for developing entrepreneurship in the countryside is the Entrepreneurship Development Programme (EDP). A large number of EDP sessions are organised by various agencies to deliver entrepreneurial training to people. Though the EDPs are organised with the intent of inculcating entrepreneurial skills among participants, these programmes do not yield the desired outputs. Today central and state governments are conducting EDPs for potential entrepreneurs. The paper is based on the field survey of 80 women entrepreneurs who had attended EDP training in Rajasthan. The paper also comes up with recommendations to improve the EDP programmes and provides an insight into the existing supportive agencies in Rajasthan for the promotion and development of entrepreneurship.*

### Introduction

Entrepreneurship is the prime key to the economic growth of a country. Development of entrepreneurship leads to rapid industrialisation which is much needed in a developing state. Unemployment has always

---

\* Assistant Professor, School of Commerce and Management, Vardhman Mahaveer Open University, Kota (Rajasthan).

† Research Scholar, Department of Management, Maharshi Dayanand Saraswati University, Ajmer (Rajasthan). E-mail:aparna.sharma218@gmail.com

‡ Research Scholar, Department of Commerce, Vardhman Mahaveer Open University, Kota (Rajasthan). E-mail: monika.talreja01@gmail.com

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

been a matter of concern in Rajasthan, though a precise estimate is difficult to obtain. There has been a constant hike in the labour supply particularly due to the increase in the number of females seeking work. But the demand for employment seekers does not increase simultaneously with the increase in the supply of labour, which leads to a frequent rise in the unemployment rate in the state. Therefore large numbers of unemployed persons are migrating to other cities or abroad for doing jobs. Even though unemployment is at its peak, the people are not ready to opt for entrepreneurship. The reason could be that people in Rajasthan are not entrepreneurial friendly. Even they do not receive support from their family members when it comes to starting a business, especially for women. Hence a large chunk of human resources of the state is left idle without their effective utilisation. Making women self-reliant and empowering them through training and other incentives is the best way to overcome poverty. Traditionally it was considered as a universal fact that entrepreneurs are born i.e., a person is blessed with entrepreneurial skills from birth only. But now it is a well known fact that exclusive training based involvement is fruitful to identify, develop, nurture, and sustain entrepreneurial talent for the industrial development of our state. The insight that women can make significant contributions to the nation has led economists, policymakers and administrators to concoct ways and means of developing planned entrepreneurship with special attention on women. Therefore much central government and state government departments are working in the state for the development of women entrepreneurship.

There are many literatures related to entrepreneurship development and its nuances. Palmer through his study analysed that most of the assistance provided to the entrepreneurs is male-oriented like monetary assistance, technical assistance and training. On the other hand, income creating sources of women have been sidelined. They have been seen totally or unequivocally as having only a little importance in the mainstream of society (Palmer, 1985). Haan described that in countries like Asia and Africa group-based training approach of the International Labour Organisation for self-employment and income generation avail them with new expertise of particular utility in terminal activities to add on in the household income. It raises their income, level of nutrition and contribution to community affairs among women (Haan, 1994). The 2nd OECD Conference (2004) was held in Turkey in which various issues and policies concerning women entrepreneurship were discussed (OECD, 2004). The study of women entrepreneurship is significant for two reasons. Firstly, it is an unexploited

### **Godha, Sharma and Talreja**

source of economic growth. They not only employ themselves but also provides society with different alternative solutions for business, management, etc. The number of women entrepreneurs is still very less. The market still discriminates between the male and female entrepreneurs. Secondly, women have always been neglected in society. Women entrepreneurship is all about building the status of women in the outside. The conference concluded certain policy recommendations in which increasing the women participation in labour force was a matter of key concern. M. Botha, G.H. Nieman and J.J. Van Vuuren in their thesis concluded that the lack of training and education was witnessed as a major barrier in South African Entrepreneurs especially for the niche entrepreneurs (women). Hence the author through their study introduced and evaluated the Women Entrepreneurship Programme (WEP). The WEP evaluated the basis of skill transfer and whether the participant's performance improved after getting the skills or not. The results proved that WEP is effective in imparting training and increasing the business performance traits and also encourages prospective women to open their business ventures (Botha et.al., 2006). Veena S. Samani in her thesis "A Study of Women Entrepreneurs Engaged in Food Processing" threw light on women working in the food processing sector. The findings reveal that most of them in Gujarat are inherited or occupied with unique skills and expertise in preparing food. The enterprise managed by women entrepreneurs is running well whether attached with home or not, further the study highlights their knowledge, attitude, practice and obstacles during their work. Stress was a common hindrance faced by the majority of women (Samani , 2008). Laxmi. B. Parab, R.L. Hyderabad shared her view in the paper "State and Institutional Support for Women Entrepreneurship Development in Dharwad district of Karnataka". The analysis in the paper revealed poor awareness among women about the availability of numerous strategies. It also discloses that women entrepreneurs receiving institutional help and also those not getting any help have earned the same level of profit and depicts the failure of organisations indulged in the development of women entrepreneurs (Parab, 2014).

EDP may be defined as a programme designed to help an individual in strengthening his entrepreneurial motive and in acquiring skills and capabilities necessary for playing his/her entrepreneurial role effectively (Desai, 1991). An EDP is generally categorised into three phases: (i) initial or pre-training phase (ii) training or development phase (iii) post-training or follow-up phase.

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

The first phase comprises of the activities required to launch the training programme such as identification and selection of potential entrepreneurs and providing initial guidance and motivation to the potential and viable entrepreneurs. It includes the following activities: (i) infrastructure development for conducting training programme, (ii) preparation of training module, (iii) collaboration with guest faculties, (iv) designing tools and methods for selecting trainees, (v) formation of the selection committee and public campaign, and (vi) development of application form.

In the second phase, the training programme is implemented to inculcate entrepreneurial skills and motivation among the potential trainees. The training module covers special inputs such as behavioural inputs, business opportunities guidance and technical and managerial input. In this phase, the trainers have to judge how far they became successful in imparting the entrepreneurial pursuits.

The last stage involves the final assessment and evaluation to analyse whether the objectives of the programme have been achieved or not. Each group of EDP training programme is looked after by the trainer by (i) follow up during loan application, (ii) facilitating infrastructures such as land, factory, shed, power, road, etc. and (iii) troubleshooting.

The paper is based on the field survey of 80 women entrepreneurs who had attended the EDP session organised by the different government agencies. Interview method was conducted to collect the data from these women entrepreneurs.

### **Sources of Assistance for Women Entrepreneurs in Rajasthan**

The Government of Rajasthan guides the industrial business units by granting financial support, infrastructure development facilities and training/consultancy services. A group of network institutions like Rajasthan Skill and Livelihood Development Corporation (RDLDC), Rajasthan Financial Corporation (RFC), Small Industries Development Bank of India (SIDBI), Directorate of Industries and Commerce (DIC), Rajasthan State Industrial Development and Investment Corporation (RIICO), National Small Industries Corporation (NSIC), National Bank for Agricultural and Rural Development (NABARD), Khadi and Village Industries Commission (KVIC), Khadi and Village Industries Board (KVIB), MSME Development Institute (SISI), SC/ST Corporations etc., also offers backing support to women entrepreneurs in the Rajasthan regarding the identification, selection,

### **Godha, Sharma and Talreja**

training, consultancy and marketing and loaning facilities on concessional terms.

#### **Rajasthan Financial Corporation (RFC)**

RFC was established under the State Financial Corporation Act in 1951. It was enacted under this act on 17th July 1955 to serve the needs of SME industries in Rajasthan, balanced advancement of industries, promote technological and infrastructure development. It also inspires new entrepreneurs especially women entrepreneurs to set up business houses, showrooms and commercial complex further aims to provide seed capital, setting of new industries, diversification and restoration of existing business up to ₹ 20 crores.

#### **Rajasthan State Industrial Development and Investment Corporation (RIICO)**

RIICO is an important organisation that helps in fostering the growth of industrialisation in the state. It was established in 1969. The main objective of RIICO is to impetus planned industrialisation in the state, further emerged as a multi-faced and dynamic vibrant institution for coping with the industrialisation process and provides complete and innovative means of financing and investment-related services. It is an apex government agency emerged in the availability and development of land for industrial units and providing easy access and prepared to utilise base with a steady framework, supportive infrastructure facilities to large, medium and small scale projects, thereby aims at promoting and accelerating industrial growth of the industrial sector in the state.

#### **Entrepreneurship and Management Development Institute Rajasthan (EMI)**

EMI was set up by the Rajasthan Government and Government of India in collaboration with National and State level Financial Institution. Central Government's Secretary of Labour and Employment, Government of Rajasthan Skill and Livelihood Development Corporation's Director have significant say in its administrations and exercises. EMI goes about as an impetus and a principle foundation to rouse guidance and help future and current business people in their entrepreneurial endeavours through constructive intervention.

#### **Rajasthan Bureau of Industrial Promotion (RBIP)**

RBIP is the investment promotion single-window leeway establishment of the state for providing medium and large scale investment.

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

It works for giving help to the forthcoming investors at the business in the province of Rajasthan in the best conceivable way. Through its persistent endeavours, it has produced a positive domain and eye-catching goal for investors at the state level. On the proposals of the BIP, EDB has been made to function as a research organisation for the state of Rajasthan. The board serves direction for increasing private participation in economic development and advice for increasing the competitive edge of the state. It helps in surveying investment opportunities, making available access to information that is pivotal for the beginning up of a project, assisting the conversion of investment possibilities into concrete investment proposals, supporting site selection and getting infrastructural offices and working together with government officials for required clearances.

### **Micro, Small and Medium Enterprise MSME Development Institute (MSME-DI)**

MSME-DI, Jaipur was started on 14th January 1958, affirmed in promotion and growth of small scale industries in the State of Rajasthan for making available consultancy services, techno-economic and management related services and basic input in the form of information needed to establish new ventures. The entrepreneurs are guided duly to empower them to start their own business.

### **Khadi and Village Industries Commission (KVIC)**

KVIC is conducting multidisciplinary, stipendiary and non-stipendiary training programmes in the short term for the prospective entrepreneurs including women in the state of Rajasthan.

### **Rajasthan Skill and Livelihood Development Corporation**

Rajasthan is the first state in India to establish a mission on livelihoods. To cater to the challenges of unemployment and guarantee gainful and sustainable employment to the youth of the state, the state has established the Rajasthan Mission on Livelihood (RMoL) in September 2004. The objective of the creation of RMoL was to formulate appropriate and innovative strategies to promote and facilitate large scale livelihoods for the poor and vulnerable people of the state. Understanding the importance of skill development as a vehicle for enhancing the employability of the working population, RMoL was rechristened as Rajasthan Mission on Skill and Livelihoods in 2009-10. RSLDC was incorporated as Section 25 Company, a not for profit company, on 17th August 2010 with the Chief

### **Godha, Sharma and Talreja**

Secretary as the Chairman of the Company. As part of its major action, it established a skill training mechanism by involving more than 300 partner agencies to execute the training programme across the State. Through its journey of seven years, it has trained around 85,000 persons by offering 97 courses in 34 sectors (RSLDC).

#### **District Industries Centre (DIC)**

DIC programme was started by the Central Government in 1978 to provide the main point for sponsoring small, tiny, cottage and village industries in a particular region and to make available to them all the required services at one place. DIC is the key agency at the district level which offers all the facilities and support facilities to the individual for setting up medium and small scale ventures. The fundamental motive is to enhance the efficiency and potential of the current business class and setting up new undertakings. The goal of skill development and implant training programmes is to provide training to skilled workers occupied in the small scale industries and to outfit them with better and enhanced generation advances.

#### **Prime Minister Employment Generation Programme (PMEGP)**

The Government of India launched a new credit linked subsidy scheme called PMEGP from 2008-09 by clubbing two schemes PMRY and REGP on 31.3.2008. The Khadi and Village Industries Commission (KVIC) were granted permission and approval for the implementation of the scheme at the national level whereas the state KVIC directorates, State KVIB and DIC and banks function at the State Level.

Eligibility criteria of beneficiaries under PMEGP are: (i) any person above 18 years of age, (ii) there will be no income ceiling, (iii) persons are eligible for establishing project costing ₹ 10 lakhs in the manufacturing sector and above ₹ 5 lakhs in the business sector, (iv) assistance will be available to selected projects (v) beneficiaries of PMEGP, women whether SC/ST/OBC, physically and mentally challenged people eligible for the scheme (MSME Report, 2016).

#### **Training and Development**

Today a large number of government and non-governmental agencies are providing entrepreneurial guidance and assistance for entrepreneurship development and they are growing day by day. With a strong belief that entrepreneurs are not only born but can be trained too, a surfeit of agencies

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

throughout the nation gratifies the needs of the women. These institutions of training and development programmes include two components, (i) the personality development and grooming, attitudinal influences and (ii) business management skills which enable them to learn techniques to manage their business and compete in the market in the long run.

In training and development component women need to be counseled to make them more confident, firm, upgrading and training to grab the opportunities. Hence it is essential that training modules prepared by various agencies should be need-oriented and should focus on making women self-reliant. Support should be minimised at different stages and taken back when these women become self-independent. Mostly the education system from the nascent stage should develop attitudinal and societal change and input a degree of independence, equality and women empowerment. Entrepreneurship as a vehicle has immense potential to make females self-reliant and self-employed and for bringing a change and transformation in society.

### **Findings**

In this study an analysis of the type of training programme attended by women revealed the following: (i) out of the 80 women, (37.2 per cent) have attended the PMEGP programme. The primary reason for attending this training programme was to avail the loan from the bank as the beneficiaries who want to get the loan disbursed from the bank to have to mandatorily undergo two weeks of training. It was very much evident from the fact that the women did not attend the EDP session to inculcate any entrepreneurial skills rather avail the loaning facilities from the bank for which an EDP training certificate is required by the bank as a document proof, (ii) Skill up-gradation and vocational training was attended by (18.79 per cent) and (20.02 per cent) women. Among the 80 women, EDP training is attended by 23.8 per cent of women. The reason for fewer numbers of women attending entrepreneurship development programme is lack of awareness or ignorance about government entrepreneurship development schemes and its concomitant benefits, (iii) 59.56 per cent of women respondents have attended some of the other training programme and the analysis concluded that the training programme initiated by various agencies does not prove to be effective as most of the trainees did not set up their business ventures even after acquiring the business skills, (iv) Although the number of agencies is involved in delivering training to the viable entrepreneurs still some lacunas exists because no follow-up task is



### **Godha, Sharma and Talreja**

undertaken to ensure whether the objectives of the EDP programme is achieved or not. In such a case it is very difficult to reach to any fruitful outcome, (v) To overcome this problem it is essential to look backward and check that how many trainees have started their business enterprise after attending the EDP session. In other words, an evaluation of the EDP training programme is of vital importance for the actual empowerment of women.

Most of the women respondents believed that the selection procedure of the trainees should be based on the capability and interest of the potential entrepreneurs. Several steps have already been taken in this regard but these efforts are confined to some regions and the approach is also a complex one due to the variation in the duration, module content and selection method. Another loophole lies in the follow-up procedure and desirable emphasis over the training programme.

It was also revealed through the analysis that though women have taken a keen interest in training programme yet many of them failed to start their own business due to several reasons such as complex laws of the government, poor availability of infrastructure, lack of government support, unnecessary political intervention, the orthodox mentality of women, lack of coordination between training and officials, several legal formalities and non-conduciveness of the social environment for women entrepreneurs.

Though the local newspapers are flooded with the efforts or initiatives taken by the government to train women and make them independent however it is difficult to find the trainees in reality. Many females want to get the certificate issued without attending any training programme to avail of a loan without realising the actual relevance or utility of training programme or else there are many those who wish to join the training programme but could not do so because of the domestic and work liabilities. In Rajasthan, every year most of the business units are turning sick in the initial years of operation. The main reason behind this is the lack of adequate training and other government support and incentives.

### **Recommendations for Revitalising Training Programmes**

The findings of the study unfold some recommendations to streamlining the entrepreneur development programme.

The training module should cover skill-based components like knowledge about the latest technology, different methods to handle the machine parts and components, techniques for preparing the business plans, marketing and communication skills. The content of the programme should be focused on the knowledge level of the targeted group. The place of

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

training should be within the reach of the women entrepreneurs which means it should not be far away from the city.

Separate batches should be formed for the women who possess prior experience concerning any business activity and those who do not have any knowledge about the business line. A separate course module of EDP should be prepared for meeting the specifications of the programme. Proper balance in developing different training programmes for a different class of entrepreneurs has to be designed by the training institutions. Since a notable portion of women has not attended proper training, their half hearted efforts are proved waste because of a shortage of capital to start an enterprise.

Training in terms of entrepreneurial and managerial skills in the industry will help in accelerating the economic prosperity and promoting entrepreneurship. While preparing the training plan it should be kept in mind that the basic principles of management are common to all whether the trainees are male or female. The only change seen is in the gender of entrepreneurs. Women should be trained on how to overcome the different constraints like financial, institutional, social and environmental problems, etc. Specialised efforts should be made to train women by considering their emotional and physical issues and there is a need to train them on how to maintain a balance between the domestic and business responsibilities.

The following points need to be kept in mind which designing the entrepreneurship development programme curriculum and module:

- (i) women need pre-entrepreneurial guidance. So the training curriculum should contain some database about the pre-entrepreneurial knowledge and awareness;
- (ii) personal attention and awareness are needed by the women to counseling, stress management, communication skills and risk-bearing ability. Hence the curriculum should pay attention to these issues as well;
- (iii) women need a lot of non-technical support like funds, market, raw material and infrastructural support, the module should include all these needs;
- (iv) gender-based training should be imparted which fulfills their socio-economic and religious profile of the people;
- (v) it was observed that the source of knowledge for the women entrepreneurs in their network and they serve as a valuable resource for the promotion and development of women entrepreneurship. Policymakers should foster towards the setting up of PPP model network to increase cooperation and involvement of both the public sector and the private sector at both state and national level and helps the prospective women entrepreneurs in the best possible way;
- (vi) it is also suggested that audio-visual media should be used as an efficient tool to motivate the women to choose entrepreneurship. Stories of successful

### Godha, Sharma and Talreja

women entrepreneurs should be shown to them at training centers, colleges, etc. especially the niche women who have struggled a lot in their life and today their name is shining like a star in the society. They need to learn from such examples not to give up in their life and try to find out the solutions for themselves. These real-life examples will also provide them practical insight and guide them to identify the opportunities in the entrepreneurial career; (vi) only those females should be allowed to participate in the training programmes (EDP) who are serious in opening their business units. Those women who merely attend training sessions just to avail the benefits or the concessions for their family who are already running their business should be given less privilege over other women participants who attend training or EDP for opening their business units in near future; (vii) the structure and content of EDPs after evaluating the regional differences need to be reformed. The programme should have more practical content and needs cooperation from different institutions to make the EDPs a success programme. For conducting EDPs different institutions should come up together and join hands with each other to impart better training and share different practices and experiences with the entrepreneurs.

### Conclusion

A large number of government and non-government agencies have stepped forward to impart the entrepreneurial training to the potential trainees and to mould them into successful entrepreneurs. Although these agencies are imparting training sincerely yet many of the trainees fails to start their venture due to various reasons. Many trainees start their business but after some time they also give up their businesses. All these issues require serious attention from the government as well as training institutes. Evidence collected during the study posits that EDP does not mean training programmes rather training is one of the sub-components of EDP. The parameter for the effective EDP lies from start to end. The supporting agencies need to take effective measures from the beginning to the end i.e., from the selection of women trainees to the follow-up process and counseling them during their initial years of operations after the successful completion of EDPs.

### References

- Botha, M., Ghanieman and Vurren, J. V. (2006), 'Evaluating the Women Entrepreneurship Training Programme: A South African Study'. *International Indigenous Journal of Entrepreneurship, Advancement, Strategy and Education*, retrieved from: <http://www.indigenjournal.com/IJJEASVolIIIss1Botha.pdf>.

### **Self Employment through Women Entrepreneurship Development Programmes...**

- Desai, V. (1991), *Entrepreneurial Development*, Bombay: Himalaya Publishing House.
- Haan, H. (1994), 'Community Based Training for Employment and Income Generation', Geneva: International Labour Organisation.
- Ministry of Skill Development and Entrepreneurship (MSME) (2016), Retrieved from <http://www.skilldevelopment.gov.in/background/html>.
- OECD (2004), 'Promoting Entrepreneurship and Innovative SMEs in a Global Economy – Towards a More Responsible and Inclusive Globalisation: Women's Entrepreneurship: Issues and Policies', Istanbul: Organisation for Economic Co-Operation and Development.
- Palmer (1985), *The Impact of Agrarian Reform on Women, Women's Role and Gender Differences in Development*, Monograph No. 6, West Hartford: Kumarian Press.
- Parab, L.B. (2014), 'State and Institutional Support for Women Entrepreneurship in Dharwad district of Karnataka'. *Pacific Business Review International*, Vol. 7, No. 2.
- Samani, V.S. (2008), *A Study of Women Entrepreneurs Engaged in Food Processing*, Ph.D. Thesis submitted to Saurashtra University.

*Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*

(A Biannual Journal of M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain)

ISSN: 0973-855X (Vol. 24, No. 2, December 2019, pp. 119-123)

*Book Review*

**Labour Market Participation in India:  
A Region and Gender Specific Study**

Arup Mitra and Aya Okada

Springer: Singapore (2018), Pages: 61, Price: Rs. 4750

ISBN 978-981-10-7143-0

**Vinod Sen\***

The labour market is underdeveloped in India especially in terms of participation of women in the labour market, the status of infrastructure, health and urbanisation; which lead to various problems to the economy. This market has widespread regional and gender disparities and the issue chosen by the authors is very much relevant in contemporary India. This study is undertaken by two eminent economists Prof. Arup Mitra, Institute of Economic growth, New Delhi and Prof. Aya Okada, Vice Trustee for International Cooperation and Professor of Political Economy at the Graduate School of International Development, Nayoya University. This joint work states that the labour force participation rate is an important indicator of development, which increases the human capital formation and people can participate in productive activities resulting in a higher level of labour market participation. In this work, they have dealt with very important research and policy questions, how labour market participation can improve with raising labour productivity. They pointed out that since

---

\* Assistant Professor, Department of Economics, Indira Gandhi National Tribal University, Amarkantak (Madhya Pradesh). E-mail: [senvinod79@gmail.com](mailto:senvinod79@gmail.com)

### **Book Review**

the low caste populations do not have access to a higher level of education their absorption in modern labour is less probable. This work also talks about migration, the participation of labour based on caste and employment in the informal sector economy.

This study in the Indian context focuses on the gender-specific labour force participation across regions and attempts to identify the important determinants for the same. Before analysing the Indian situation, the participation rates are examined for various countries in the Asia-Pacific region in this work. In India like many other countries, the female participation rate is significantly lower in comparison with the males. The rural-urban differentials are more pronounced, and the inter-state variations are remarkable in the case of females than males. Even in large cities, female labour participation is lower than the rural areas despite higher levels of education among urban females. However, in terms of inter-spatial (rural/urban/city) variations, the impact of available infrastructure, education, health status and urbanisation on labour force participation of both the gender is quite visible. The authors posit that improved infrastructure, the quantum of investment is expected to shoot up and the accessibility to growth centres offering better livelihood opportunities can perk up labour participation. They argued that while industrialisation and growth in services show a positive effect on labour participation, economic growth unravels a positive impact on urban males only. There is evidence of poverty-induced participation in agricultural activities, suggesting the importance of rural diversification for the creation of productive employment. The authors opined that women's participation in productive activities improves child health significantly. Access of mothers to financial resources enhances the health status of their children. Mother's income improves the nutritional status of children and access to curative health care gets better with female labour participation. On the whole, women's participation in productive activities has a double-sided effect: at first, it raises the household income; and secondly, it contributes to the well-being of the household. These findings are important from the policy point of view because different infrastructure variables are seen to improve both participation and labour productivity. Availability of infrastructure (social, physical and financial) can break the social and cultural barriers and may help women join the labour market, thus enabling them to make a productive contribution to the growth process. Though the level of urbanisation raises the urban female participation rate in an inter-spatial sense, a similar pattern is not evident in the context of rural females (at least

## Sen

at the state level). How urbanisation can generate more employment with positive spillover effects in the rural neighbourhood is an important policy concern at present. It is evident that increased urbanisation ushering in a greater concentration of non-farm activities and holds the potentiality to create employment prospects and resulting in productivity gains.

The Tenth Agriculture Census shows out that women participation in MGNREGS (Mahatma Gandhi National Rural Employment Guarantee Scheme) has increased; the similarly authors also posit that women are mainly homemakers or seasonal workers in the agriculture sector or pursue economic activities as subsidiary workers, may take the opportunity of participating in MGNREGS. They advocated that the number of days of work per household in MGNREGS being only a hundred, it is unlikely to raise the women labour force participation rate as per the usual principal status which considers on 180 days as the benchmark.

The book on labour market participation in India is divided into six chapters. The first chapter of the book provides analytical frameworks of the study, statement of the problem, review of literature, objective of study and methodology adopted to undertake the study. The second chapter of the books examines certain labour market indicators in the Asia-Pacific context. The country-specific figures are considered to delineate a systematic pattern. The third chapter shows the Indian labour market situation, highlighting the regional variations and more importantly, the gender differentials. Authors argue that the lower participation rates of women are instrumental to gender subjugation and suggest that empowerment can be attained through improvement in women labour participation rates. The fourth chapter of the book based on the inter-spatial variation in gender and region-specific participation rate. This chapter attempts to identify the determinants and their differential impact in rural and urban areas. The state and district-specific rates have been analysed in the rural and urban areas separately in this chapter. The fifth chapter of the book analysed issues related to productivity and women participation rates. The final section of the work concludes the study with policy implications.

The strength of the book lies in the analytical frame of the book; it provides data on work participation and review of the literature. This study is motivated by evaluating the facts related to the genesis of the problem of labour force participation rate across regions and gender in India. It is largely a cross-sectional study as the time dimensionality is highly limited. The study envisaged to take the view that differences across the region can be considered as a reflection of long-run changes as regions are unevenly

### Book Review

developed and laggard regions would follow the path of more developed regions in labour market participation. The authors have taken both state and district as a unit of analysis in this study. The database of the study is drawn from the 2011 Census as well as the Annual Surveys of Labour conducted by the Ministry of Labour and Employment for the years 2009-10 to 2014-15. Different correlates which are taken from the Census data as well as other variables mentioned in the appendix of the book.

Analysing the Census data, the study found that the female's labour participation rates are significantly lower than the males. On the other hand, the rural-urban differentials are more pronounced and the inter-state variations are significant in the case of females. This reflects the influence of social, cultural and economic factors on female employment. The authors argue that female participation rates in the urban areas are not necessarily higher than the rural areas, despite higher levels of education and social advancement that urbanisation is expected to usher in urban areas. The finding brings out the inadequacy of growth to usher in gender equality in employment. These findings are important from the policy point of view because a conducive infrastructure is needed to improve both participation and labour productivity among females in India.

The book on *Labour Market Participation in India: A Region and Gender Specific Study* is a good work on women labour participation in India. The strength of the book is that it has covered many issues relating to labour market participation in India, especially with Asia specific perspective. It also inculcates analysis of across the region analysis for female participation in India. The analytical aspect is also up to the mark as the book includes an excellent comparison of data at the intra-state level in India. The language of the book is truly academic and up to the mark. The authors also give some excellent suggestions and recommendations for policy implementation so the regional and gender disparity can be eradicated in the employment scenario in India. Another quality of the book is that it focuses on the gender-specific labour force participation rate across various countries in the Asia-Pacific region. It contains an in-depth analysis of the rural, urban and city-specific participation rates of females and males in India. The book identifies the major determinants of female labour participation related to inter-spatial variations and unfold policy issues related to infrastructure, education, health, diversification away from agriculture and urbanisation.

To sum up, it may be said that this thin book is a good contribution to comprehend the labour market participation in India, especially with a gender perspective. In a nutshell, the study emphasises the point that



### **Sen**

women's participation in productive activities has a double positive impact. Female participation in productive employment not only raises the household income but also contributes to the overall wellbeing of the household. These findings are important from a policy perspective because favourable atmosphere for female participation engenders labour productivity and well being of her family. Authors have lucidly analysed the labour market and its issues in Asia specific regions with specific emphasis on gender perspectives. The book is a good resource for researchers and academicians to comprehend the issues related to labour market participation in India with a gender perspective.

**Statement about Ownership and other Particulars about  
Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences**  
*As Required under Rule 8 of Registration of Newspapers (Central) Rules 1956*

**FORM IV**  
(See Rule 8)

1. Place of Publication : M.P. Institute of Social Science  
Research, Ujjain
2. Periodicity of its Publication : Twice a year
3. Printer's Name : Dr. Yatindra Singh Sisodia  
(Whether citizen of India?) : Yes  
(If foreigner, : N.A.  
state the country of origin)  
Address : 6, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
Ujjain - 456010
4. Publisher's Name : Dr. Yatindra Singh Sisodia  
(Whether citizen of India?) : Yes  
(If foreigner, : N.A.  
state the country of origin)  
Address : 6, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
Ujjain - 456010
5. Editor's Name : Dr. Yatindra Singh Sisodia  
(Whether citizen of India?) : Yes  
(If foreigner, : N.A.  
state the country of origin)  
Address : 6, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
Ujjain - 456010
6. Names and addresses of : M.P. Institute of Social Science  
individuals who own the  
Research  
newspapers and partners  
6, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone  
or shareholders holding  
Ujjain - 456010  
more than one percent of  
the total capital.

I, Dr. Yatindra Singh Sisodia, hereby declare that the particulars given above are true to the best of my knowledge and belief.

**Dr. Yatindra Singh Sisodia**  
Signature of Publisher

## Instructions to Authors

### *Communication*

The M.P. Institute of Social Science Research (MPISSR) welcomes articles of interest representing original work, analytical papers and papers based on review of extensive literature on any aspect of Social Sciences for publication in *Madhya Pradesh Journal of Social Sciences*. All communication should be addressed to the Editor, MPJSS, M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, 6, Prof. Ram Sakha Gautam Marg, Bharatpuri Administrative Zone, Ujjain - 456010.

### *Manuscript*

Article should be double-spaced typewritten on one side of A4 size paper. The length of the article may be 5000 to 8000 words. Article must be accompanied by an abstract of 100 words. Articles should be submitted in softcopy through e-mail at [mpjssujain@gmail.com](mailto:mpjssujain@gmail.com) as well as in hardcopy.

### *Review System*

Every article will be reviewed by a masked peer review by two referees. The criteria used for acceptance of articles are contemporary relevance, contribution to knowledge, clear and logical analysis, fairly good English and sound methodology of research articles. The Editor reserves the right to reject any manuscript as unsuitable in topic, style or form without requesting external review.

### *Spellings*

Use British spellings in all cases instead of American (Concise Oxford Dictionary).

### *Numbers*

Use figures to express all numbers 10 and above. Use words to express numbers lower than 10, and common fractions numbers that begin a sentence/title.

### *Tables*

Type each table on a separate page. Insert a location note at the appropriate place in the text. Minimise the use of tables.

### *References*

All notes and references should be at the end of the article first 'Notes' and then 'References'. Notes should be serially numbered in the text using superscript and the corresponding notes should be listed out separately at the end of the article. References listed at the end should be arranged alphabetically.

## **M.P. Institute of Social Science Research** **Ujjain - 456010 (M.P.)**

---

The M.P. Institute of Social Science Research (MPISSR) is an autonomous, multi-disciplinary centre for research and training of Indian Council of Social Science Research (ICSSR), New Delhi and Ministry of Higher Education, Government of Madhya Pradesh.

Research activities of MPISSR are concerned with issues relating to social, economic, political, cultural, administrative and civic aspects of India in general and Madhya Pradesh in particular. The Institute has been working for the last three decades with an unfettered spirit of exploration, rationality and enterprise to pursue research and training activities for generating understanding, knowledge and linkages between field realities and public policies.

The basic aim of MPISSR is to engage in research on relevant contemporary issues and disseminate the research findings for the enhancement of the existing knowledge and for the well being of the society through policy input. MPISSR has been working on following thematic areas: Panchayat Raj and Rural Development; Studies in Scheduled Tribes and Scheduled Castes; Democracy, Electoral Behaviour, Social Justice and Human Rights; Development and Deprivation; Studies in Education; Gender Studies; Studies in Environment; Information Technology and Society; and New Economic Policy and Society.

MPISSR caters to the needs of policy planners, academia, legislators, non-governmental organisations, researchers, research organisations and functionaries of international organisations. Dissemination of knowledge through research publication; collaborating in research; imparting research training; assisting and advising through policy research and evaluation studies are core activities of the Institute.

MPISSR is registered under section 6 (1) of the Foreign Contribution (Regulations) Act, 1976, Ministry of Home Affairs, Government of India, New Delhi. Donations made to MPISSR are qualified for exemption under section 80-G of the Income Tax Act, 1961.

---

Registered with Registrar of Newspapers for India under no. R.N. 66148/96.  
Printed and Published by Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia  
on behalf of the M.P. Institute of Social Science Research, Ujjain

Editor : Professor Yatindra Singh Sisodia